United States History and Government (Framework)
Draft: 01/04/2019

PLD LEVEL 3—Sufficient for graduation and credit proficiency; student partially meets grade-level expectations

PLD LEVEL 4—Meets framework grade-level expectations at a level demonstrating preparation for entry to Grade 12 social studies courses and on track for an entry level college social science course

CLAIM AND EVIDENCE	NYS Level 2 Descriptor (DRAFT)	NYS Level 3 Descriptor (DRAFT)	NYS Level 4 Descriptor (DRAFT)	NYS Level 5 Descriptor (DRAFT)
CLAIM 1 Students can analyze sources and use evidence to create and analyze discipline-specific arguments (e.g., history, civics, economics, and/or geography).	1.1 Student inaccurately identifies an aspect of a source (format, authorship, historical context, content, purpose, bias, and/or point of view) and describes how it influences the reliability of sources.	1.1 Student identifies an aspect of a source (format, authorship, historical context, content, purpose, bias, and/or point of view) and describes how it influences the reliability of sources, with minor inaccuracies.	1.1 Student identifies an aspect of a source (format, authorship, historical context, content, purpose, bias, and/or point of view) and explains how this factor influences the reliability of sources.	1.1 Student identifies an aspect of a source (format, authorship, historical context, content, purpose, bias, and/or point of view) and evaluates how this factor influences the reliability of sources.

EVIDENCE
● Analysis of sources includes two components:
  A. Analysis of the relevant following aspects of a source and how that analysis affects interpretations of the source:
    i. Format
    ii. Authorship
    iii. Historical Context
    iv. Audience
	1.2 Student inaccurately identifies that evidence from a source that confirms or challenges another source or interpretation.	1.2 Student identifies evidence from a source that confirms or challenges another source or interpretation with minor inaccuracies.	1.2 Student accurately explains how evidence from a source confirms or challenges another source or interpretation.	1.2 Student accurately explains how evidence from a source confirms or challenges another source or interpretation and assesses the reliability of the source considering other available information.

v. Content vi. Purpose vii. Bias viii. Point of View B. Corroboration i. Explaining relationships between multiple sources ii. Explaining the relationship between sources and discipline-specific arguments iii. Reliability of the source(s) in light of analysis	1.3 Student uses irrelevant and or disconnected evidence from multiple sources to support or refute a claim or an argument without reference to perspective or historical context.	1.3 Student uses relevant evidence from multiple sources to support or refute a claim or an argument without reference to perspective or historical context.	1.3 Student uses relevant evidence from multiple sources to support or refute a claim or an argument with reference to perspective and/or historical context.	1.3 Student uses relevant evidence from multiple sources to support or refute a claim or an argument and proposes alternate interpretations, with reference to perspective and/or historical context.
	1.4 Student evaluates a claim or argument using invalid evidence or sources.	1.4. Student evaluates a claim or argument using support from isolated evidence from one or more sources.	1.4 Student evaluates an argument using well-chosen evidence from multiple sources, appropriately considering contradictory evidence.	1.4 Student evaluates an argument using convincing evidence from multiple sources, thoroughly addressing contradictory evidence.
● Creation of discipline–specific arguments (e.g., history, civics, economics, and/or geography) includes: A. An appropriate discipline-specific claim B. Reasoning that supports the claim(s) C. Evidence from source(s) and events to support argument	1.5 Student makes an implausible claim or argument using irrelevant and/or disconnected evidence from sources.	1.5 Student presents a plausible claim or argument using relevant evidence from sources.	1.5 Student constructs a coherent claim or argument using relevant evidence from sources.	1.5 Student constructs a strong, coherent claim or argument by integrating relevant evidence from sources.
	1.6 Student describes the relationship between a given set of sources/documents and may use irrelevant and/or disconnected evidence.	1.6 Student explains how a given set of sources/documents are related, using relevant evidence.	1.6 Student interprets and explains how a given set of sources/ documents are related, using historical context and relevant evidence.	1.6 Student creates a historically accurate interpretation of how a given set of sources/ documents are related, using historical context and relevant evidence.

2

DRAFT

● Analysis of discipline-specific claim(s) or arguments includes: A. Identification of discipline-specific (e.g., history, civics, economics, and/or geography) claim(s) or argument(s) B. Selection and analysis of evidence from source(s) and events to support or refute the claim(s) or argument(s) C. Analysis of validity of the claim(s) or argument(s) considering all available evidence	1.7 Student supports or refutes the validity of a claim/argument by using opinion, or without the support of sources.	1.7 Student supports or refutes the validity of a claim/argument by explaining the reliability of the sources used to make the claim.	1.7 Student evaluates the validity of a claim/argument by analyzing the reliability of sources used to make the claim.	1.7 Student evaluates the validity of a claim/argument by analyzing the reliability of sources used to make the claim and proposes alternative interpretations.

DRAFT

CLAIM 2 Students can analyze how historic events are related chronologically and the historic, political, social, economic, and/or geographic causes and effects of those events. **EVIDENCE** ● Analysis includes identification and explanation of: 　A. Continuity and change over time 　B. Long-term and proximate factors that influenced changes over time (e.g., ideas, individuals, groups, technological developments, physical settings) 　C. Causes and effects using historic, political, social, economic, and/or geographic lenses 　D. Characteristics of historical time period(s)	2.1 Student identifies a time period, but inaccurately defines the historical, political, social, economic, and/or geographic characteristics associated with the period.	2.1 Student identifies a time period and defines the historical, political, social, economic, and/or geographic characteristics associated with the period.	2.1 Student identifies a time period or periods and categorizes events that are associated with that period or periods, including historical, political, social, economic, and/or geographic characteristics.	2.1 Student identifies a time period or periods and categorizes events that are associated with that period or periods, explaining her/his reasoning including historical, political, social, economic, and/or geographic characteristics.
	2.2 Student identifies events in chronological sequence with minor inaccuracies.	2.2 Student identifies related events in chronological sequence.	2.2 Student identifies and describes related events in chronological sequence.	2.2 Student identifies and analyzes related events in chronological sequence.
	2.3 Student confuses the historic, political, social, economic, and/or geographic factors (e.g., ideas, individuals, groups, technical developments, physical settings) that influence change and/or continuity within a time period.	2.3 Student identifies the historic, political, social, economic, and/or geographic factors (e.g., ideas, individuals, groups, technical developments, physical settings) that influence change and/or continuity within a time period with minor inaccuracies.	2.3 Student identifies and explains the historic, political, social, economic, and/or geographic factors (e.g., ideas, individuals, groups, technical developments, physical settings) that influence change and/or continuity within a time period.	2.3 Student evaluates the historic, political, social, economic, and/or geographic factors (e.g., ideas, individuals, groups, technical developments, physical settings) that influence change and/or continuity within a time period.

4

DRAFT

E. Turning points and their impact	2.4 Student defines the concept of a turning point.	2.4 Student defines the concept of a turning point and identifies a specific turning point.	2.4 Student identifies a specific turning point and provides evidence of subsequent changes.	2.4 Student identifies a specific turning point, provides evidence of subsequent changes, and evaluates the significance of those changes.
	2.5 Student confuses cause and/or effect using a single historic, political, social, economic, and/or geographic lens.	2.5 Student distinguishes between cause and effect using a single historic, political, social, economic, and/or geographic lens, as appropriate.	2.5 Student identifies causes and effects for events using historic, political, social, economic, and/or geographic lenses, as appropriate.	2.5 Student identifies and explains causes and effects for events in the context in which they occur, using historic, political, social, economic, and/or geographic lenses, as appropriate.
	2.6 Student confuses short-term and/or long-term causes and effects.	2.6 Student identifies short-term and long-term causes and effects for events, using historic, political, social, economic, and/or geographic lenses as appropriate, with minor inaccuracies.	2.6 Student analyzes short-term and long-term causes and effects using historic, political, social, economic, and/or geographic lenses, as appropriate.	2.6 Student analyzes and evaluates short-term and long-term causes and effects using multiple disciplinary lenses, as appropriate.

5

CLAIM 3
Students can analyze how the context of time and place affect discipline-specific (e.g., history, civics, economics, and/or geography) issues and events, and compare issues and events across time and place.
 	
EVIDENCE
● Analysis includes:
  A. Connection of historical developments to specific circumstances of time and place
  B. Connection of historical developments to broader regional, national, or global processes and patterns (e.g., colonization, revolution, constitutional change, expansion, nationalism, industrialization, urbanization, sectionalism, imperialism, social and
	3.1 Student places events in an inappropriate context of time and place.
	
	3.2. Student identifies similarities *or* differences between issues, historical developments, and/or events in different geographic and cultural contexts with inaccuracies.
	
	3.3 Student compares issues or events, making errors and/or drawing inaccurate conclusions.
		3.1 Student places issues and events in the context of time and place with minor inaccuracies.
		
		3.2. Student identifies similarities *and* differences between issues, historical developments, and/or events in different geographic and cultural contexts with minor inaccuracies.
		
		3.3 Student compares issues or events, with minor inaccuracies.
			3.1 Student describes issues and events in the appropriate context of time and place.
			
			3.2 Student identifies and explains similarities and differences between issues, historical developments, and/or events in different geographic and cultural contexts.
			
			3.3 Student compares and/or analyzes issues or events with detail and accuracy.
				3.1 Student explains issues and events in the appropriate context of time and place.
				
				3.2 Student identifies and analyzes similarities and differences between issues, historical developments, and/or events in different geographic and cultural contexts.
				
				3.3 Student compares and analyzes issues or events in depth and with accuracy.

economic changes, and globalization) through a historic, political, social, economic, and/or geographic lens ● Comparison includes: Similarities and differences between events and perspectives through a historic, political, social, economic, and/or geographic lens			

7

CLAIM 4
Students can analyze important constitutional and civic issues in historic and present settings, various attempts to address those issues, including possible alternate courses of action, and discuss, or when applicable, demonstrate an informed course of action.
 	
EVIDENCE
● Analysis includes
   A. Identification and explanation of important civic and constitutional issues
   B. Summary of evidence using disciplinary lenses (e.g., historic, political, social, economic, and/or geographic) to evaluate the issue(s)
   C. Identification and explanation of questions related to the issue(s) or the course(s) of action
   D. Connection of the issue(s) to civic action
	4.1 Student partially identifies an issue with some inaccuracies.
	
	4.2 Student incompletely researches an issue with minimal and/or inaccurate detail and support and may confuse causes and effects.
	
	4.3 Student identifies a course of action with inaccuracies and limited detail.
	
	4.4 Student describes how a course of action was effective or ineffective with inaccuracies and in limited detail.
		4.1 Student identifies and describes an issue with minor inaccuracies.
		
		4.2 Student minimally researches an issue and describes the historic and/or contemporary causes or effects with minor inaccuracies.
		
		4.3 Student describes a course of informed action noting some consequences.
		
		4.4 Student explains how a course of action was effective in addressing a civic or constitutional issue in limited detail.
			4.1 Student identifies and summarizes an issue.
			
			4.2 Student researches an issue and applies disciplinary lenses to explain the historic and/or contemporary causes and effects, with supporting arguments and details.
			
			4.3 Student explains various courses of informed action, noting relevant individuals, groups, and/or roles of vested interests, and the long- and/or short-term consequences.
			
			4.4 Student discusses the extent to which various courses of action were effective in addressing a historic and/or current civic or constitutional issue in detail.
				4.1 Student identifies and effectively explains an issue in depth.
				
				4.2 Student researches an issue and applies disciplinary lenses to analyze the historic and/or contemporary causes and effects with supporting arguments and significant detail.
				
				4.3 Student evaluates various courses of informed action in depth, noting relevant individuals, groups, and/or roles of vested interests, and the long- and short-term consequences.
				
				4.4 Student analyzes the extent to which various courses of action were effective in addressing a historic and/or current civic or constitutional issue with substantial detail.

E. Identification and explanation of the course(s) of action to address the issue(s) at a local, state, national, and/or interdependent-global level	4.5 Student describes a course of action that demonstrates civic responsibility in historical or present settings with little depth and with inaccuracies.	4.5 Student explains a course of action that demonstrates civic responsibility in historical or present settings with little depth and few inaccuracies.	4.5 Student discusses various courses of action that demonstrate civic responsibility in historical or present settings with some depth.	4.5 Student evaluates various courses of action that demonstrate civic responsibility in historical or present settings in depth.
F. Evaluation of consequences (benefits and costs) of taking action to address the issue(s) ● Discussion and demonstration includes: 　A. Evidence of proposing and/or carrying out the recommended course of action to address the issue(s) 　B. Participation in activities (e.g., debate, negotiation, editorials, raising awareness, influencing others) that focus on the issue(s) 　C. Reflection on consequences (the benefits and costs) of the course(s) of action taken	4.6 Student describes citizens' rights, roles, and/or responsibilities through weak development of an argument/presentation/ project on historic and/or current events with inaccuracies.	4.6 Student explains citizens' rights, roles, and/or responsibilities through limited development of an argument/presentation/ project on historic and/or current events with few inaccuracies.	4.6 Student discusses citizens' rights, roles, and/or responsibilities through developing an argument/presentation/ project on historic and/or current events.	4.6 Student evaluates citizens' rights, roles, and/or responsibilities through developing a convincing argument/ presentation/project on historic and/or current events.
	4.7 Student proposes and/or takes action that does not relate to an issue and information gathered.	4.7 Student proposes and/or takes informed action in the local, state, national, and/or global community, demonstrating civic responsibility.	4.7 Student proposes and/or takes informed action in the local, state, national, and/or global community, demonstrating civic responsibility.	4.7 Student proposes and/or takes informed action in the local, state, national, and/or global community, demonstrating civic responsibility.

9

	4.8 Student does not engage target audience.	4.8 Student minimally engages the target audience through an appropriate course of informed action.	4.8 Student engages the target audience and/or community in some ways through an appropriate course of informed action.	4.8 Student engages the target audience and/or community in significant ways through an appropriate course of informed action.
	4.9 Student minimally reflects on informed course of action through written, visual, or verbal means.	4.9 Student reflects on informed course of action through written, visual, or verbal means.	4.9 Student reflects on informed course of action with analysis and detail through written, visual, or verbal means.	4.9 Student effectively reflects on informed course of action with significant analysis and detail through written, visual, or verbal means.

10