Educator Diversity Report

Submitted to the Governor and Legislature of the State of New York
December 2019



New York State EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

Knowledge > Skill > Opportunity

Contents

| Exe | ecutive Summary | 6 |
|------|---|------|
| I. | Introduction | . 10 |
| P | Purpose of this Report | . 11 |
| ۵ | Defining Diversity | . 11 |
| F | Research on the Value of Diversity in the Educator Workforce | . 12 |
| ۵ | Data Sources and Limitations | . 13 |
| II. | New York State Educator Diversity Data Findings | . 16 |
| Т | eacher Racial and Ethnic Diversity | . 16 |
| ۵ | Diversity of School Leaders | . 25 |
| Т | eacher and Leader Gender Diversity | . 27 |
| Т | eacher Age | . 31 |
| III. | Hurdles and Challenges on the Pathway to a Career in Education | . 35 |
| P | P-12 Educational Disparities | . 35 |
| E | ducator Preparation | . 37 |
| | Data on Educator Preparation Enrollment by Race and Gender | . 37 |
| | Educator Preparation Program Completion | . 46 |
| | Barriers to Educator Preparation Recruitment and Completion: Discussion | . 48 |
| | Certification Exams | . 51 |
| ŀ | liring | . 55 |
| F | Retention in Employment | . 58 |
| IV. | Recommendations | 61 |
| F | Regents Proposals | 61 |
| V. | A Closer Look at Each Recommendation: Survey Results and Current Efforts | . 63 |
| 1 | . Discuss educator diversity with stakeholders and set an intention to address it | 63 |
| | Survey Suggestions: Intentional Commitments to Diversity to Attract Candidates | . 64 |
| | Current Efforts: Strategic Campaigns | . 68 |
| 2 | Partner to build pathways in your region | . 70 |
| | Survey Suggestions: Expand Early Recruitment and Pipeline Partnerships | . 71 |
| | Current Efforts: "Grow Your Own" Initiatives | . 71 |
| | Current Efforts: Alternative Preparation Pathways, Recruitment from Other Disciplines. | . 76 |
| 3 | 8. Establish supports to enable candidates to clear the hurdles and overcome challenges | 80 |

| Survey Suggestions: Financial Investments | 80 |
|--|-----|
| Survey Suggestions: Encouraging Persistence through Completion | 82 |
| Current Efforts: Supportive Preparation Models | 84 |
| Current Efforts: Teacher Opportunity Corps | 87 |
| Survey Findings: Recruitment of and Support for Paraprofessionals | 89 |
| 4. Take an informed look at recruitment, admissions, and hiring practices | 93 |
| Current Efforts: Recruiting and Hiring Practices | 94 |
| Survey Findings: Educator Preparation Programs Recruitment Practices | 95 |
| Survey Findings: School/District Recruitment and Hiring Practices | 100 |
| 5. Induct, develop, retain, and promote effective educators of color | 102 |
| Survey Suggestions: Improving Working Environments for Educators of Color | 102 |
| Survey Suggestions: Mentorship and Induction | 102 |
| Survey Suggestions: Career Ladders and Financial Incentives | 103 |
| Current Efforts: Retention and Development | 103 |
| Survey Findings: Retention Supports | 104 |
| 6. Ensure transparency, accountability, and research | 107 |
| Current Efforts: Engaging in Research and Information-Sharing | 107 |
| Survey Findings: Tracking Diversity Efforts | 108 |
| Future Research | 111 |
| Next Steps | 111 |
| Acknowledgements | 112 |
| Appendix A: Overview of New York's Teacher Preparation and Certification Process | 113 |
| Appendix B: Publicly Available Data | 117 |
| Appendix C: Literature Review and Examples | 119 |
| Part 1: Current Research | 119 |
| Part 2: Promising Practices and State Policy Examples | 132 |
| Appendix D: New York State's BOCES Regions and Regent Districts | 158 |
| Appendix E: NYSED Educator Diversity Survey | 164 |
| Appendix F: New York State Certification Exam Validation Process | 186 |
| Sources | 193 |
| Endnotes | 198 |

Figures

| Figure 1: New York State's students are growing increasingly diverse. | . 16 |
|--|------|
| Figure 2: Eighty percent of New York State's in-service teachers identify as White | . 17 |
| Figure 3: The diversity of New York State's students and teachers is at an imbalance | . 18 |
| Figure 4: Teacher diversity and student diversity vary widely across districts and regions | . 19 |
| Figure 5: The Big Five cities have some of the highest student and teacher diversity in the stat | |
| · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | |
| Figure 6: Outside of the Big Five cities, there was one teacher of color for every 129 students | |
| color (2011-2017) | |
| Figure 7: Most districts statewide employ less than 5% teachers of color | |
| Figure 8: New York State has increased the number of teachers of color employed statewide. | |
| Figure 9: Teacher of color growth has not kept pace with increasing student of color enrollme | |
| in traditional district schools. | |
| Figure 10: Eighty-five percent of school district leaders identify as White | |
| Figure 11: The diversity gap among school leaders is greater outside of New York City | |
| Figure 12: Male teachers are underrepresented in most teaching assignments | |
| Figure 13: The greatest share of New York State's male educators teach Social Studies | |
| Figure 14: The female teacher workforce is slightly more diverse in New York City | |
| Figure 15: School leaders have a significantly smaller gender gap than in-service teachers in | |
| traditional district schools. | 31 |
| Figure 16: The age of New York State's teacher workforce has experienced little change | |
| Figure 17: Half of New York State teachers are between the ages of 33 and 48 | |
| Figure 18: Overall, the teacher workforce is younger in New York City. | |
| Figure 19: New York State's high school graduation rates are increasing overall. | |
| Figure 20: Three percent of New York State's postsecondary students enroll in educator | |
| preparation programs | 38 |
| Figure 21: Sixty-one percent of educator preparation program enrollees are White | |
| Figure 22: New York has the 7th highest percentage of students of color in educator | |
| preparation programs in the United States | 40 |
| Figure 23: Educator preparation programs are gradually diversifying | |
| Figure 24: The current state of diversity in New York's educator pipeline | |
| Figure 25: New York City has more diverse educator preparation program enrollment than th | |
| rest of the state | |
| Figure 26: Seventy-five percent of pre-service teachers of color are enrolled in programs in N | |
| York City. | |
| Figure 27: New York State's gender gap is growing in its most populated districts. | |
| Figure 28: SUNY institutions have the highest graduation rate for students of color in bachelo | |
| degree programs | |
| Figure 29: The edTPA has an average pass rate of 82% in New York State. | |
| Figure 30: The Educating All Students (EAS) Test has an average pass rate of 96 percent. | |
| Figure 31: Content Specialty Tests (CSTs) have an overall pass rate of 94 percent. | |
| Figure 32: Populations of color are low across Upstate, Central, and Western New York, and | |
| higher in the Lower Hudson, New York City, and Long Island | 57 |
| moner in the Lower Housen, new Fork erey, and Long Bland and and and and and and and and and | , |

| Figure 33: Question #38 Figure 34: Question #40 | |
|--|-----|
| Figure 35: Alternative, IHE-based educator preparation programs are closing the diversity gap |). |
| Figure 36: Most alternative, IHE-based educator preparation programs are located in New Yor City. | rk |
| Figure 37: Question #39 | |
| Figure 38: Question #17, Educator Preparation Deans | |
| Figure 39: Most state-funded diversity programs are located in New York City | 87 |
| Figure 40: Question #33, P-12 Superintendents & BOCES District Superintendents | 90 |
| Figure 41: Question #34 | 92 |
| Figure 42: Question #16, Educator Preparation Deans | 96 |
| Figure 43: Question #14, Educator Preparation Deans | 98 |
| Figure 44: Question #18, Educator Preparation Deans | 99 |
| Figure 45: Question #271 | .01 |
| Figure 46: Question #19, Educator Preparation Deans1 | .05 |
| Figure 47: Question #31, P-12 Superintendents & BOCES District Superintendents | .06 |
| Figure 48: Question #21, Educator Preparation Deans1 | .09 |
| Figure 49: Question #291 | .10 |

Tables

| Table 1: Districts with the highest enrollment of students of color employ the highest number of | of |
|--|----|
| teachers of color | 22 |
| Table 2: New York State's traditional preparation programs enroll 10 times as many students a | IS |
| alternative programs | 78 |

Executive Summary

The goal of improving educational equity has been a focus of the New York State Board of Regents at least as far back as 1978, when the New York State Special Task Force on Equity and Excellence in Education (also known as the Rubin Commission) was appointed to study the issue. In adopting and now implementing New York State's plan under the Every Student Succeeds Act (2017), the Department continually reaffirms its commitment to improving the quality and diversity of the educator workforce as a necessary step on the path toward equity of educational opportunity.

Amid growing recognition of the importance of diversity in New York State's educator workforce, last year the Legislature tasked the Department with preparing a report containing data on the race, ethnicity, gender, and age of the state's educator workforce; an examination of the potential barriers to achieving diversity; current efforts by higher education institutions, schools, and districts to recruit and retain diverse individuals; and recommendations on programs, practices, and policies that could be implemented by schools and educator preparation programs to improve educator diversity.¹ In developing this report, the Department conducted new analysis of existing datasets; consulted with partners to review relevant literature on educator diversity; and reached out to education leaders throughout our P-20 system for their expertise and insights.

As a matter of equity, individuals of color deserve the same access to the education profession as all others. Moreover, a diverse educator workforce is associated with wide-ranging educational benefits for all students—particularly students of color—and for the school environments in which they are employed.

Yet as New York's student population has become increasingly diverse, with the population of students of color topping fifty percent, the racial and ethnic composition of the teacher workforce has remained constant. Eighty percent—or a little over 170,000 of New York's approximately 210,000 teachers—are White, and Latino and Black educators are under-represented. The number of Black or African American teachers has remained relatively steady at approximately 18,000, while the number of Hispanic or Latino teachers increased from 13,877 in 2011-12 to 16,078 in 2016-17.

Teachers of color are underrepresented statewide, but the enrollment of students of color is not evenly distributed across districts. Higher percentages of teachers of color tend to be employed in regions and districts with higher enrollment of students of color. Nevertheless, there is a large gap in the number of teachers of color compared to student of color enrollment. New York City had the lowest average ratio, with 1 teacher of color for every 30 students of color, over the period 2011-2017. Over the same period, the ratio in the Big 4 cities was 1:64; and in the rest of the state, one teacher of color was available for every 129 students of color. In the 2016-17 academic year, more than 200 public school districts did not employ a single teacher of color.

The number of teachers of color in New York State has increased by nearly 1,400 since the 2011-12 academic year. However, this upward trend is not uniform across the state. Most of Upstate, Central, and Western New York have experienced declines in their teacher of color population.

For the 2018-19 academic year, over 200 public school districts employed at least one educator of color in a school leadership position. Statewide, Hispanic or Latino and Black or African American school leaders account for nearly 30% of New York State's school principals and assistant principals, and just under 10% of school district leaders. In 2018-19, 47% of school building leaders in New York City were leaders of color, compared to only 16% in the rest of the state. New York City employed nearly 3 times as many building leaders of color as the rest of the state combined. An overwhelming 91% of school district leaders outside of New York City identify as White.

The gender breakdown of the teaching workforce is consistent across the state and has remained relatively stable for many years, with roughly three female teachers for every male. In the 2017-18 academic year, 48,660 male teachers were employed in the state of New York, compared to 153,488 female teachers. Technology and certain Career and Technical Education teaching assignments are the only fields where a majority of the teachers are male. Almost half of male teachers are concentrated in five teaching assignments: Social Studies (11%), Special Education (10%), Science (9%), Physical Education (9%), and Math (8%). Fifty-seven percent of New York State's P-12 school leaders are women.

Since 2011, the age distribution of New York State's teacher workforce has experienced little change. Roughly 50% of in-service teachers are between the ages of 33 and 48, while only 12% are over the age of 56. The percentage of teachers over age 57 has been gradually declining over the period, while the percentage of teachers under age 32 has risen slightly since 2016-17.

From 2010-11 to 2016-17, the enrollment of White students in New York educator preparation programs fell by nearly 60 percent, while the enrollment of students of color has been far less volatile: Hispanic or Latino enrollment in New York State educator preparation programs dipped 7%, from 6,274 students in the 2010-11 academic year to 5,812 students by the Fall of 2016; Black or African American educator preparation enrollment dropped 29% from 5,442 to 3,879 students; and the enrollment of Multi-Racial students increased over the same time period. As a consequence, the share of educator preparation enrollees of color in New York State has been increasing. In the 2010-11 academic year, only about 25% of enrollees were students of color, compared with 39% in 2016-17. Hispanic or Latino students, in particular, have increased their enrollment share by nearly five percentage points since 2010.

Individuals of color face multiple hurdles and challenges to joining and staying in the educator workforce:

- First, disparities at the P-12 level education such as discriminatory discipline practices, absenteeism, and lower graduation rates negatively influence the likelihood that students of color may choose to pursue a career in teaching.²
- At the postsecondary level, deans cited the high cost of college attendance as the leading barrier to the enrollment and persistence of students of color in educator preparation programs, while P-12 superintendents said the lack of flexibility and supports for candidates in educator preparation programs make it difficult to pursue certification while employed or caring for a family. Indeed, only 5% of educator preparation institutions responding to the Department's survey said they offer supports such as

childcare assistance, and only about one-quarter said they offer flexible course scheduling or cost-of-living assistance, with the goal of retaining students of color.

- Previous research has found that teacher labor markets are predominantly local,³ which may help to explain why educators of color are hired in such small numbers in many small and rural communities upstate, whose populations have very little diversity. However, the local nature of teacher labor markets does not explain the lack of teachers of color in metropolitan and downstate regions, where the vast majority of teacher candidates of color attend preparation programs. Many districts responding to the Department's survey indicated that targeting diverse candidates is simply not a priority. Researchers have argued that the lack of diversity—particularly in school leadership—can itself become an obstacle for hiring educators of color into schools and districts.⁴
- Once teachers of color are hired, they are not being retained at the same rate as White educators. Preliminary analysis found that teachers of color tend to be employed in districts with high overall turnover. In average-need districts, teachers of color had turnover rates 4 percentage points higher than White teachers; and in rural high-need districts, Black or African American teachers had turnover rates 4 percentage points higher than White teachers.⁵

The data trends, hurdles and challenges along the pathway, and national research literature reviewed in the report support six recommendations to improve the diversity of New York State's educator workforce. While this report focuses explicitly on racial/ethnic, gender, and age diversity, these recommendations could apply to other types of diversity, such as linguistic, cultural, religious, functional (i.e., people with disabilities), and socio-economic diversity:

- 1. Discuss educator diversity with stakeholders and set an intention to address it;
- 2. Partner to build pathways in your region;
- 3. Establish supports to enable candidates to clear the hurdles and overcome challenges;
- 4. Take an informed look at recruitment, admissions, and hiring practices;
- 5. Induct, develop, retain, and promote effective educators of color; and
- 6. Ensure transparency, accountability, and research.

Consistent with the legislation that called for this report, the recommendations are aimed at districts, BOCES, and educator preparation institutions. However, this begs the question as to what steps the State itself should be taking. Beginning with Recommendation #1, this report can be viewed as the start of a state-level discussion. *An important next step is for the Board of Regents to articulate its own expectations with respect to the issue of workforce diversity in New York's P-20 education system.*

The 2020-21 Regents Budget and Legislative Priorities include a package of proposals informed by the data and findings illustrated in this report. Several of these proposals are designed to spur the expansion of a network of partnerships among districts, BOCES, and educator preparation programs to provide innovative pathways that support the entry of diverse educators into the profession. The proposals also include funding to help defray the costs of educator preparation and certification.

- \$3 million in new state funding to establish a separately appropriated **Teacher Opportunity Corps II** (TOC II) program. The funding would be used to increase the number of TOC II-funded programs from 16 to 26 and extend coverage throughout the state by awarding competitive grants in each of the ten postsecondary education regions.
- \$2.5 million in new state funding to create innovative birth to grade 3 teacher preparation programs and birth to grade 12 leader preparation advanced certification programs that prioritize the recruitment of historically underrepresented individuals and which will incentivize collaborations between institutions of higher education, school districts, community-based organizations, and health and mental health systems.
- \$2 million in new Teacher Pipeline funding to be competitively awarded for the piloting of **Grow Your Own** programs to address teacher shortages in approved private schools serving students with disabilities and Special Act school districts.
- \$1.2 million in new state funding to triple the number of **certification examination fee waiver vouchers** to assist economically disadvantaged educator candidates in paying for the examinations required for certification.

Examples of current efforts being undertaken at the local, regional, and state levels are collected and described herein, to serve as a resource for those seeking guidance as to what can be done to improve educator diversity in their regions and communities. Despite these bright spots, more intentional and comprehensive approaches are needed to change entrenched practices that perpetuate the status quo.

As the Department continues to implement the commitments in New York's ESSA plan, it will look at the potential to use its own leverage—including data transparency and regulatory authority—to support the efforts being made by districts, BOCES, and educator preparation institutions in pursuit of equity of opportunity and outcomes in New York State's education system.

I. Introduction

The goal of improving educational equity has been a focus of the New York State Board of Regents at least as far back as 1978, when the New York State Special Task Force on Equity and Excellence in Education (also known as the Rubin Commission) was appointed to study the issue. The *Report and Recommendations of the Task Force* (1982) emphasized that disparities in educational services must be diminished "to provide equal educational opportunity for all children regardless of where they live."⁶ Since that time, the Board of Regents and the New York State Education Department ("NYSED" or "the Department") have made strides toward developing and implementing policies that address the role of the educator workforce in ensuring equity of educational opportunity.

In 1999, the Board of Regents strengthened regulations in a move to improve the educator pipeline and ensure that all districts and students have access to effective teachers. The Regulations of the Commissioner require all preparation programs leading to certification in teacher education in New York State to "demonstrate efforts to recruit qualified faculty and student bodies for teaching education from groups historically underrepresented in such programs."⁷ This mandate reflects the State's expectation that educator preparation programs will take active steps toward diversifying the candidates entering the teacher pipeline, and its desire to ensure equitable access to those programs.

In 2015, the New York State Education Department published its *Plan to Ensure Equitable Access to the Most Effective Educators* ("Equity Plan"), outlining a comprehensive initiative to provide all students with equal learning opportunities, defined by access to effective teachers and principals.⁸ As re-emphasized in *New York State's Final Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) Plan* (2017), the Department's paramount goal is "ensuring that all students across New York State regardless of their physical location, acquire the knowledge, skills, and abilities that they need to realize personal success in college, career, and life."⁹ The Department believes that students thrive best in the presence of great teachers and great school leaders and strives to provide all schools and districts with the resources and information they need to give every student in New York State access to a quality education. In adopting and now implementing the ESSA plan, the Department continually reaffirms its commitment to improving the quality and diversity of the educator workforce as a necessary step on the path toward equity of educational opportunity.

In 2018, New York was one of ten states that joined the Council of Chief State School Officers' Diverse and Learner-Ready Teachers (DLRT) Initiative. The objective of the DLRT network is to "revise, enact or remove state policies" to better address the challenges of increasing the racial diversity and cultural responsiveness of the educator workforce.¹⁰ Through New York's participation in the DLRT initiative, the state became part of a learning community and gained access to thought partners with expertise in this policy area. New York State's DLRT team compiled a summary of current policies and programs that support educator diversity and cultural responsiveness and received expert assistance in developing an Educator Diversity Survey¹¹ designed to improve the Department's understanding of statewide diversity efforts and challenges by gathering information from the field. That survey served as a key data-gathering tool for this report.

Purpose of this Report

Amid growing recognition of the importance of diversity in New York State's educator workforce, last year the Legislature tasked the Department with preparing a report providing "an overview of teacher diversity throughout the state."¹² Lawmakers requested, and this report contains:

- Data on the race, ethnicity, gender, and age of the state's educator workforce;
- An examination of the potential barriers to achieving diversity at each point in the pipeline;
- Current efforts by higher education institutions to recruit and retain diverse candidates into educator preparation programs;
- Current efforts by schools and the state to attract, hire, and retain certified teachers who reflect the diversity of our students; and
- Recommendations on programs, practices, and policies that could be implemented by schools and educator preparation programs to improve educator diversity throughout New York State.

In developing this report, the Department conducted new analysis from our student, teacher and leader data collections; consulted with partners to review relevant literature on educator diversity both statewide and nationally; and reached out to education leaders throughout our P-20 system for their expertise and insights.

While lawmakers specifically requested a focus on teacher diversity in New York State, the Department recognizes that the challenge of diversifying the workforce is not exclusive to preand in-service teachers, but also includes school building and district leaders, teaching assistants, teacher aides, paraprofessionals, and many other individuals who make up the State's educator workforce. Analysis of all P-20 educators and school staff is beyond the scope of this report. However, this report includes data and discussions on school leaders and paraprofessionals as critical populations to consider in the diversification of the workforce. The term "educator" will therefore be used to reflect the range of professionals involved in the schooling of New York's students.

The Department's aim was to produce a report that advances the issue of educator diversity in New York State by pulling together relevant information into a single document and identifying promising next steps toward a more diverse workforce and a more equitable education system, while at the same time recognizing that there is still much we need to learn.

Defining Diversity

The Department recognizes that diversity can be defined in many ways. In accordance with the mandates of the statute, this report focuses on the racial, ethnic, gender and age diversity of the New York State educator workforce. The important topics of linguistic, cultural, religious, functional (i.e., people with disabilities), and socio-economic diversity are beyond the scope of analysis for this report. Gender diversity in terms of sexual orientation (i.e., LGBTQ) is also beyond the scope of this report. The Department only collects data on gender as male or female,

therefore "gender" will refer to educators identifying as male or female in this report. However, the recommendations of this report could be applied to all types of educator diversity.

Throughout the report, the term "of color" will be used to specifically account for the racial and ethnic diversity of students and educators, referring to individuals who identify as American Indian or Alaska Native, Black or African American, Hispanic or Latino, Asian or Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islander, or Multi-Racial. The Department arrived at the decision to use the term "of color" in distinguishing racial and ethnically diverse educators following consultation with stakeholders and national experts as well as review of the scholarly literature. Aggregating racial and ethnic data in this manner allows for broader comparisons with New York State's White student and educator populations to reveal general trends and overall imbalances.

Research on the Value of Diversity in the Educator Workforce

As a matter of equity, individuals of color deserve the same access to the education profession as all others. Moreover, a diverse educator workforce has been shown to have wide-ranging educational benefits. This section highlights a few key findings from the scholarly research literature. See Appendix C: Literature Review and Examples, Part 1, for a thorough discussion.

Benefits for all students. Research suggests that having educators of color as professional role models in their school benefits all students in several ways, including reducing the likelihood that they will grow up to harbor implicit bias against individuals from other racial backgrounds. Scholars have found that, controlling for other factors, students rated Latino and Black teachers positively on measures of effective teaching, particularly: holding them to high academic standards, supporting their efforts, helping them organize content, explaining ideas and concepts clearly, and providing useful feedback.¹³

Academic benefits for students of color. Teachers of color have significant long-term positive effects on the academic success of students of color, including improved test scores, identifying more Black students as gifted and talented, higher graduation rates, and greater college aspirations.¹⁴ In higher education, students of color have been shown to demonstrate the same increased achievement and satisfaction as P-12 students when greater diversity and cultural understanding is reflected and embodied in the faculty.¹⁵

Other benefits for students of color. Having a teacher of color is associated with lower rates of chronic absenteeism and suspension, particularly for boys of color. There are various explanations for this. For example, teachers of color may serve as advocates and "cultural translators" for students of color.¹⁶ Easton-Brooks (2019) has suggested that having a same race/ethnicity teacher is comforting at a subconscious level and relieves stress for students of color, thereby supporting their academic success.¹⁷ (It is important to note, however, that the benefits of 'ethnic matching' should not be taken as a call for segregation or homogeneity. Rather, the concept is about what teachers of color can bring to the table to enhance the profession.¹⁸)

Benefits for the education community. Increasing teacher diversity may benefit the schools where they work in several ways. Research shows that the more frequently White teachers work with teachers of color—thus increasing their familiarity with colleagues from other backgrounds—the more likely they are to employ culturally-responsive practices in the

classroom, particularly when further encouraged by their school building and district leaders.¹⁹ Other teachers of color already in the workforce find improved job satisfaction and decreased turnover as a result of a more diverse profession.²⁰ Studies have indicated that teachers of color are more likely to remain in the impoverished, urban schools with the highest proportions of low-income students of color where their presence is needed the most, and where just one teacher of color can have a lasting impact on students of color throughout their academic career.²¹

School leader diversity. New York schools with Latino or Black principals tend to employ greater percentages of Latino and Black teachers, suggesting that school leadership can have an influence on the employment of teachers of color.²² Advocates have suggested that interacting with leaders of color from a young age can help reduce prejudices toward people from different demographic backgrounds and demonstrate to students that people of color can and should hold positions of authority in society.²³ Further, increasing the number of leaders of color in school administration enhances the voice of historically underserved groups in decision-making, thereby bettering the representation of the diverse experiences and histories of all students in teaching and learning.²⁴

Gender diversity. While men tend to dominate the higher levels of education administration and are underrepresented in early childhood and elementary classrooms, relatively little research has been done on the gender gap among teachers. In 2018, Brookings Institute's Brown Center on Education Policy concluded that the dominance of female educators is not cause for concern, but instead may be preferable.²⁵ The Brown Center argued that unless male recruitment into the teaching profession is targeted solely at prospective male educators of color, addressing the gender disparity in education is not a priority, particularly given the greater challenge of improving the racial and ethnic diversity of the field. Gender gaps in academic achievement are small, and current research has yielded only inconclusive results on whether teacher gender impacts student learning.²⁶ However, some studies suggest that the absence of male educators in the classroom can have a detrimental impact on the academic progress and achievement of young boys, suggesting that gender does indeed matter in the teacher workforce.²⁷

Male educators of color. The gender imbalance in the educator workforce leaves students with fewer opportunities to interact with positive male role models, particularly male role models of color.²⁸ Teachers of color of all genders are underrepresented in the educator workforce, but the underrepresentation of male teachers of color is particularly severe. Their absence from the classroom leaves young students of all genders lacking the influence of a greater expanse of strong male models in their lives and education. Young boys of color are especially disadvantaged by the absence of male teachers of color in the classroom because it leaves them with an even lower chance of having a positive role model they can identify with throughout their schooling experience.²⁹ Without enough male teachers in the profession now, few young males are inspired to follow them into the classroom.

Data Sources and Limitations

New York is no different from any other state in the challenge of improving diversity in the workforce. Diversity is a longstanding historical, sociological, and cultural issue. Educator diversity, in particular, has a rich history of racial, ethnic, and gender disparities that continue to

persist state- and nation-wide today. However, a historical discussion on educator diversity is outside the scope of this report. To fulfil the mandates of the statute, this report on educator diversity only includes the most recent data on New York State's educator pipeline and the current efforts districts and educator preparation programs are/were engaged in or pursuing at the time of the report's development.

The Department recognizes that the challenge of educator diversity in New York State is multifaceted. Throughout the educator pipeline, multiple challenges exist at multiple gateways that create barriers for students to persist through preparation programs and for new teachers to remain in their classrooms and schools. The extent of these challenges then varies across individual school districts and educator preparation programs statewide. Acknowledging the depth of the issue, this report focuses on the leading barriers to achieving racial, ethnic, and gender diversity in New York State's educator preparation programs and their subsequent impact on the in-service educator workforce. Further, in alignment with the statutory requirements, this report only contains recommendations for P-12 districts and educator preparation programs.

This report uses the demographic data on New York State's students, teachers and leaders that is collected and published by NYSED.³⁰ NYSED's Personnel Master Files (PMF) contain data on teacher and non-teaching professional staff gender, age, race and ethnicity, and are publicly available through the Department's Information and Reporting Services (IRS) webpage dating back to the 2001 reporting year. All data is collected to meet State and federal reporting requirements and is published in the aggregate, without personally identifiable information such as names, ID numbers, or birthdates, to safeguard the privacy of our students and educators. NYSED publishes student demographic data in its Public School Enrollment files through the IRS webpage. These data sets contain student gender, race and ethnic origin at both the district- and school building-level and date back to the 2011 reporting year. New York State high school student graduation data sets also include student demographic data by gender and ethnicity, publishes higher education graduation data dating back to 2009 that include postsecondary completer and non-completer demographics.

Educators and students in New York State self-identify their race/ethnicity in the Department's data collection. The identification of "White" students and educators in this report therefore refers to individuals who self-identify as White. In conformity with the American Psychological Association (APA) writing style, Black and White racial categories will be capitalized throughout this report. The Department reports Hispanic or Latino student and educator data in a non-duplicative, two-part process. In the Department's data collection, individuals first must report if they identify as Hispanic/Latino or Non-Hispanic/Latino, then report their racial category: American Indian/Alaska Native, Black/African American, Asian or Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islander, or White. If an individual indicates that they identify as Hispanic/Latino, the subsequent racial category they report to the Department is <u>not</u> included in the reported data. The Department will <u>only</u> report this teacher as Hispanic/Latino. In contrast, if a teacher indicates they identify as Non-Hispanic/Latino for their ethnicity, the Department will report the subsequently identified race. Further, if an individual indicates they identify as Non-Hispanic/Latino and then selects more than one racial category, they are reported by the

Department as Multi-Racial. For more information on reporting data to the Department, please visit NYSED's Information and Reporting Services webpage: <u>http://www.p12.nysed.gov/irs/</u>.

To build a better understanding of the systems of supports available for educators across New York State as well as the gaps that may exist, the Department launched an Educator Diversity Survey in the summer of 2019, targeting Pre-Kindergarten (P)-12 superintendents, Boards of Cooperative Educational Services (BOCES) District Superintendents, and educator preparation deans. The participants were asked to respond on behalf of their institutions. The goal of the survey was to collect information on the programs and opportunities available to support the recruitment and retention of teachers and leaders of color in New York State. NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey ("survey") received a 77% response rate and participation from 502 P-12 superintendents, 76 educator preparation program deans, and all 37 BOCES district superintendents by the end of September 2019. The New York City Department of Education (NYCDOE) completed the survey on behalf of all New York City geographic districts. The Department originally planned to launch a broader landscape survey to gain insight from current and future educators at every point along the pipeline. However, the Department was only able to administer a smaller, initial survey in which the participants were asked to respond on behalf of their schools, districts, or institutions. Demographic data on the individual respondents was not collected. The Department recognizes that New York State's district leaders and postsecondary administrators are disproportionately White (see Diversity of School Leaders).

The Department is limited in its ability to provide a fully comprehensive report on the issue of diversity in New York State's educator pipeline. Not all data collected by the State is disaggregated by race or ethnicity and the extent to which diversity data is collected or tracked in individual institutions of higher education or local school districts varies statewide. Educators have the right to decline to identify their race, ethnicity, and/or gender in data collection. The Department does not provide any demographic data that may identify individuals, therefore all data posted by NYSED is aggregate. Prior to the 2018-19 academic year, the Department was not able to provide a complete collection of gendered racial/ethnic data on the state's teachers. Demographic data had instead been submitted into separate collections. The Department does not collect demographic data on postsecondary faculty. New York State's data collection systems are not currently able to track individual educators throughout the entire pipeline; limitations therefore exist in making connections on the persistence and achievement of teachers and school leaders throughout the pipeline relative to their demographics.

The Department publishes the best data we believe to be available based on the data submitted to NYSED by school districts, charter schools, BOCES, institutions of higher education (IHE), and NYSED program offices but makes every effort to ensure that the privacy of our educators is protected in the publication and analysis of our collections. For more information, please visit the NYSED Data Site at <u>data.nysed.gov</u>.

II. New York State Educator Diversity Data Findings

Teacher Racial and Ethnic Diversity

In 2016, the TeachNY Advisory Council determined that almost all classrooms across New York State would experience significant growth in the diversity of the student population.³¹ By June 30, 2017, New York State employed 212,296 public school teachers to teach the 2.6 million public school students enrolled in its 732 districts. Since the 2011-12 academic year, over fifty percent of students enrolled in New York State's schools have been students of color, as seen in Figure 1.

Figure 1: New York State's students are growing increasingly diverse.



New York State's P-12 Student Enrollment by Race and Ethnicity

Source: NYSED Information and Report Services (IRS) Public School Enrollment Files. Data are as of 07-01-2019.

As New York's student population has become increasingly diverse, the racial and ethnic composition of the teacher workforce has remained constant, as shown in Figure 2. Eighty percent—or a little over 170,000 of New York's teachers—are White, and Latino and Black educators are under-represented. The number of Black or African American teachers has remained relatively steady at approximately 18,000, while the number of Hispanic or Latino teachers increased from 13,877 in 2011-12 to 16,078 in 2016-17.





New York State's Teacher Workforce by Race and Ethnicity

Includes charter schools.

Source: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF). Data are as of 07-01-2019.

As demonstrated in Figure 3, these racial and ethnic disparities create a significant imbalance between the diversity of New York State's student population and teacher workforce.

Figure 3: The diversity of New York State's students and teachers is at an imbalance.





Includes charter schools.

Sources: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF). NYSED Information and Report Services (IRS) Public School Enrollment Files. Data are as of 07-01-2019.

For some analyses in this report, the Department aggregated school district data to the regional level. In the charts and maps that follow, the state is divided into 37 BOCES regions plus the "Big Five" city school districts (Buffalo, New York City, Rochester, Syracuse and Yonkers). On subsequent pages, the maps depict the 13 Regents districts. For lists of the school districts located in each of these regions, see Appendix D: New York State's BOCES Regions and Regent Districts.

Both teacher diversity and student diversity vary widely across districts and regions of the state. Figure 4 shows that the Big Five districts and numerous BOCES regions educate substantial percentages of students of color. New York State's teacher workforce is mostly White across all BOCES regions, and higher percentages of teachers of color tend to be employed in regions with higher enrollment of students of color. Outside of the Big Five, nearly all BOCES regions also enrolled a White student majority. Figure 4: Teacher diversity and student diversity vary widely across districts and regions.



In-Service Teachers and P-12 Student Enrollment by BOCES Region and Big Five City, 2016-17

Sources: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF). NYSED Information and Report Services (IRS) Public School Enrollment Files. Data are as of 07-01-2019.

Page 19 of 206

Figure 5 takes a closer look at the Big Five cities, where students of color are enrolled and teachers of color are employed at some of the highest rates in the state. The enrollment of students of color in the Big Five ranged from nearly 78% in Syracuse to nearly 90% in Rochester in the 2016-17 academic year. Teachers of color were employed at a rate of 11% in Syracuse and 14% in Buffalo, while Rochester's teacher of color workforce just exceeded 20 percent. New York City had the most diverse teacher workforce, with almost 42% teachers of color, followed by Yonkers, at almost 28%.

Figure 5: The Big Five cities have some of the highest student and teacher diversity in the state.



Big Five Cities: Racial and ethnic diversity of teachers and P-12 students, 2016-17

Sources: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF). NYSED Information and Report Services (IRS) Public School Enrollment Files. Data are as of 07-01-2019.

Figure 6 shows the ratios of teachers of color to students of color across all BOCES regions and Big Five cities, based on average enrollments from 2011 to 2017. The diversity of New York State's teacher workforce and student enrollment varies significantly across districts. In all BOCES regions, the ratio of teachers of color to students of color is high. The districts in the Oneida-Herkimer-Madison region had the highest average ratio of one teacher of color for every 402 students of color over the six-year time period, while New York City had the lowest average ratio of 1:30. Outside the Big Five cities, one teacher of color was available for every 129 students of color on average over the six year period. By comparison, no individual school district in the state of New York had a ratio of more than 24 White students for every one White teacher.





Based on 2011-17 district school data. Sources: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF). NYSED Information and Report Services (IRS) Public School Enrollment Files. Data are as of 07-01-2019.

The districts with the top 10 highest enrollments of students of color, listed in Table 1, are also among the top 12 districts with the highest numbers of teachers of color. Table 1 shows that most teachers of color and students of color are concentrated in the Big Five cities, except for Syracuse City School District, which, despite having the sixth-highest enrollment of students of color, is not one of the top ten employers of teachers of color.³²

| Top 10 Districts with the Highest Student of Color Enrollment, 2011-17 | | | | | |
|--|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|-------|--|--|
| District | Number of Teachers of Color | Student of Color Enrollment | Ratio | | |
| 1. New York City | 28,963 | 861,880 | 1:30 | | |
| 2. Rochester | 588 | 27,625 | 1:47 | | |
| 3. Buffalo | 475 | 26,664 | 1:56 | | |
| 4. Yonkers | 430 | 21,549 | 1:50 | | |
| 5. Brentwood UFSD | 253 | 17,650 | 1:70 | | |
| 6. Syracuse | 159 | 16,225 | 1:102 | | |
| 7. Newburgh City SD | 186 | 8,984 | 1:48 | | |
| 8. East Ramapo CSD | 160 | 8,309 | 1:52 | | |
| 9. Mount Vernon SD | 282 | 8,110 | 1:29 | | |
| 10. New Rochelle City SD | 178 | 7,932 | 1:45 | | |

Table 1: Districts with the highest enrollment of students of color employ the highest number of teachers of color.

Sources: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF). NYSED Information and Report Services (IRS) Public School Enrollment Files. Data are as of 07-01-2019.

Challenges in recruiting teachers of color are heightened in schools outside of the Big Five cities, particularly in rural high-need districts, where most students of color attend schools without a single teacher of color.³³ Latino and Black students outside of the Big Five are nearly 13 times more likely to have no exposure to teachers of the same race or ethnicity.³⁴ Figure 7 (which again aggregates individual school districts up to BOCES regions) shows that teachers of color are concentrated in the Big Five, Long Island, and Mid-Hudson regions, where student of color enrollment is likewise the highest. In the 2016-17 academic year, no region or city in New York State employed a teacher of color majority. New York City had the highest percentage of teachers of color (42%), Yonkers had 28%, and Rochester had 22%. School districts across three-quarters of BOCES regions employed fewer than 5% of teachers of color.

Figure 7: Most districts statewide employ less than 5% teachers of color.



Source: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF). Data are as of 07-01-2019.

In the 2016-17 academic year, more than 200 public school districts did not employ a single teacher of color.³⁵ Just over 200,000 students—or roughly 8% of the state's student population—were enrolled in these school districts for the 2016-17 academic year. Ninety-one percent of these students identified as White, while nearly 19,000 were students of color, including 3,670 Black or African American and 7,675 Hispanic or Latino students. This translates to 16% of all of New York's White students and 1% of all of New York's students of color enrolled in districts without a single teacher of color for the 2016-17 academic year.³⁶ In that same year, the average number of White teachers per district was 11 times higher than the average number of Black teachers per district and 12 times higher than that of Latino teachers.

The number of teachers of color in New York State has increased by nearly 1,400 since the 2011-12 academic year. However, Figure 8—which aggregates the data to compare across Regent districts³⁷—shows that this upward trend is not uniform across the state. Most of Upstate, Central, and Western New York have experienced declines in their teacher of color population.





Sources: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF). Data are as of 07-01-2019.

The statewide increase in the number of teachers of color has not kept pace with the growth in student enrollment. Figure 9 shows that New York State's student of color enrollment has increased since the 2011-12 academic year, except for in Manhattan, Brooklyn, and the Bronx. Bronx County was the only district that increased the number of teachers of color employed while experiencing a decline in student of color enrollment. Regent districts in Upstate, Central, and Western New York State show lower percentages of populations of color in district schools overall and have seen increases in their student of color enrollment met with declines in the number of teachers of color employed since the 2011-12 academic year. Long Island and the Lower Hudson region have seen increases in both their teacher of color and student of color populations, while Manhattan and Brooklyn were the only areas that have experienced a decline in both student and teacher populations, which has kept their racial and ethnic gaps smaller than the rest of the state.



Figure 9: Teacher of color growth has not kept pace with increasing student of color enrollment in traditional district schools.

Sources: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF). NYSED Information and Report Services (IRS) Public School Enrollment Files. Data are as of 07-01-2019.

Diversity of School Leaders

For the 2018-19 academic year, over 200 public school districts in New York State employed at least one school leader of color as an assistant principal, principal, assistant superintendent, associate superintendent, and/or superintendent.³⁸ Just under 1.8 million students—or roughly 72% of the state's student population—were enrolled in these school districts in the Fall of 2018. Thirty-one percent of these students identified as White, while over 1.2 million were students of color, including 343,671 Black or African American and 602,670 Hispanic or Latino students. This translates to 50% of all of New York's White students and 91% of all of New York's students of color enrolled in districts with at least one school leader of color in the Fall of 2018.³⁹

Out of New York's 12,309 school building and district leaders, 85% of district leaders and 69% of building leaders identified as White in 2018-19, as shown in Figure 10. The diversity gap is wider

among school district leaders than among school building leaders. Hispanic or Latino and Black or African American school leaders account for nearly 30% of New York State's school principals and assistant principals, but just under 10% of school district leaders. In the 2018-19 academic year, 6% of school district leaders identified as Black or African American, compared to nearly 18% of school building leaders.



Figure 10: Eighty-five percent of school district leaders identify as White.

School Building Leaders include Assistant Principals and Principals.

School District Leaders include Assistant, Associate, Deputy, Executive, and Other Superintendents.

Percentages are of races and ethnicities identified. One percent of school leaders did not identify their race or ethnicity in 2018-19. *Source: Unpublished NYSED Data. Data are as of 09-30-2019.*

The diversity gap among school leaders is significantly wider outside of New York City. In 2018-19, New York City employed nearly 3 times as many building leaders of color as the rest of the state combined, as shown in Figure 11. Forty-seven percent of school building leaders in New York City are leaders of color, compared to only 16% of the rest of the state's workforce. An overwhelming 91% of school district leaders outside of New York City identify as White.

Figure 11: The diversity gap among school leaders is greater outside of New York City.



School Building Leaders, 2018-19

School Building Leaders include Assistant Principals and Principals. School District Leaders include Assistant, Associate, Deputy, Executive, and Other Superintendents. Percentages are of races and ethnicities identified. One percent of school leaders did not identify their race or ethnicity in 2018-19. Source: Unpublished NYSED Data. Data are as of 09-30-2019.

Teacher and Leader Gender Diversity

The American teaching workforce has traditionally been female-dominated, and gender disparities persist in New York to this day. The breakdown is consistent across the state and has remained relatively stable for many years, with roughly three female teachers for every male. In the 2017-18 academic year, 48,660 male teachers were employed in the state of New York, compared to 153,488 female teachers.

Male representation in New York State's teacher workforce varies by subject area. Figure 12 shows that Technology and Career and Technical Education are the only teaching assignments that have a majority male teacher workforce. Seventy-seven percent of New York State's Technology and CTE Technical Education teachers were male in the 2017-18 academic year.

Figure 12: Male teachers are underrepresented in most teaching assignments.



Male Teacher Percentages by Teaching Assignment, 2017-18

Source: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF). Data are as of 09-01-2019.

However, Figure 13 shows that Special Education, Social Studies, Science, Mathematics and Physical Education teaching assignments represent greater shares of the overall male in-service teaching population. Eleven percent of New York State's male in-service teachers teach Social Studies, 10% teach Special Education, and 9% teach Science and Physical Education, respectively. For the 2017-18 academic year, Physical Education was the only subject area in which both a significant portion of the overall male teacher population was employed, at nearly 7,400

teachers, and in which male teachers accounted for nearly half of the subject area's workforce, at 45% (Figure 12). In contrast, only 2% of New York State's male in-service teachers are employed in the Technology or CTE Technical Education subject areas, accounting for only 1,740 male teachers statewide.

Figure 13: The greatest share of New York State's male educators teach Social Studies.



Overall Male Teacher Representation by Teaching Assignment, 2017-18

Each subject area under "All Other Subjects" constitutes 2% or less of the overall male in-service population. *Source: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF). Data are as of 09-01-2019.*

In New York City, where teacher diversity is the greatest, the female teacher workforce is somewhat more diverse than the male teacher workforce. Figure 14 shows that, among female teachers, 58% identified as White and 42% identified as of color—a gap of just 16 percentage points. By comparison, 63% of male teachers are White and 37% are of color—a gap of 26 percentage points.

Figure 14: The female teacher workforce is slightly more diverse in New York City.



New York City Diversity of Male and Female In-Service Teachers, 2018-19

Female Male

Percentages are of genders and races/ethnicities reported. Less than 2% of teachers declined to identify their gender and/or race/ethnicity. *Source: Unpublished NYSED Data. Data are as of 09-30-2019.*



New York City Teacher Diversity by Gender, 2018-19

Percentages are of genders and races/ethnicities reported. Less than 2% of teachers declined to identify their gender and/or race/ethnicity. Source: Unpublished NYSED Data. Data are as of 09-30-2019.

In the rest of the state, over 90% of teachers in both genders identified as White, and the percentages of male and female teachers of other races and ethnicities were within one percentage point; meaning, the racial/ethnic diversity gap is equally large among male and female teachers outside of New York City.

Among school leaders—including assistant principals, principals, superintendents, and directors/coordinators—the gender gap is significantly smaller. Figure 15 shows that 57% of New York State's P-12 school leaders are women. In 2016-17, this amounted to roughly 2,000 more female than male school leaders.



Figure 15: School leaders have a significantly smaller gender gap than in-service teachers in traditional district schools.

Does not include charter schools. School Leaders include all grade levels of the following categories: Assistant Principal, Assistant Superintendent, Assistant Director/Coordinator, Deputy or Associate Superintendent, Director/Coordinator, Principal, Independent Superintendent, Supervisor, and Other School Administrators. Source: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF). Data are as of 08/01/2019.

Nationwide, women make up nearly half of all school principals and a majority of administrative positions just below the very top—yet less than one-third of all superintendents are female.⁴⁰ Longstanding stereotypes about traditional gendered roles in society and bias about the ability of women—and particularly women of color—to lead organizations contribute to the persistence of the gender inequities in school leadership, as is true across many industries.⁴¹ Women of color are especially underrepresented in top school leadership roles, with Chiefs for Change finding that only 11% of superintendents are women of color nationwide.⁴²

In Hurdles and Challenges on the Pathway to a Career in Education, we shall see that New York's educator preparation programs are struggling to recruit male candidates into the teacher workforce. As a result, New York State's gender gap is growing in some of its most populated districts.

Teacher Age

Data suggests that the gender disparity of New York State's teacher workforce may be further impacted by the age of teachers across subject areas. Some of the more male-dominated subject

areas also reflected some of the highest ages of in-service teachers, with more than 60% of General Occupational Education and CTE Trade Education teachers over the age of 40 in the 2017-18 academic year. In contrast, more female-dominated subject areas, such as English to Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) where 87% of teachers are female, had over 50% of the workforce under the age of 40 in the 2017-18 academic year.⁴³

Since 2011, the age distribution of New York State's teacher workforce has experienced little change. Figure 16 shows the percentage of teachers age 57 and older has been gradually declining over the period, while percentage of teachers age 32 and under has risen slightly since 2016-17.

Figure 16: The age of New York State's teacher workforce has experienced little change.



In-Service Teacher Age

Source: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF). Data are as of 07-01-2019.

Most teachers in New York State are eligible to retire at the age of 55. Figure 17 shows that 50% of in-service teachers in the 2017-18 academic year were between the ages of 33 and 48, while only 12% were age 57 or over. This age distribution suggests that the state is not facing an impending shortage of teachers due to retirements.



Figure 17: Half of New York State teachers are between the ages of 33 and 48.

Source: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF). Data are as of 07-01-2019.

Recent reports have made the case that retirements leading to new teacher hires may be less frequent in the future, in part, because 35% of teachers work in New York City, where—as shown in Figure 18—the teaching population is relatively young.⁴⁴ Although the rest of the state may have more retirements on the horizon, the Rockefeller Institute concluded that those positions will likely not be refilled, due to declines in student enrollment outside of New York City.⁴⁵

Figure 18: Overall, the teacher workforce is younger in New York City.



2017-18 Teacher Age, New York City compared to Rest of State

New York City
Rest of State

Source: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF). Data are as of 07-01-2019.

The good news is New York State's annual teacher turnover rate has also declined, dropping from 11% in 2015 to 9.57% in 2018.⁴⁶ Data shows that annual teacher turnover rates are mostly consistent across Upstate, Central, and Western New York, and only marginally higher in the Big Four cities and Upper Hudson regions, at closer to 11 percent. Consistent with national literature, the highest turnover rates were found in high-need rural districts and elementary schools in the 2018 reporting year.⁴⁷ The implications of these trends for educator diversity are discussed in the following section.

III. Hurdles and Challenges on the Pathway to a Career in Education

From P-12 classrooms through educator preparation programs and certification and into the labor market, future educators in New York State must clear multiple hurdles and overcome many challenges before joining the workforce. This section will review each step along the path to explore why educators of color are underrepresented in New York State's schools.

Disparities in educator diversity begin in P-12 education and are exacerbated by the high cost of postsecondary education, combined with the societal perception that an education career offers a relatively low return on that investment. In some regions of the state, there is a shortage of options for prospective educators seeking a flexible and supportive pathway that enables them to balance career preparation with the demands of employment and family in order to enter the field. Program completion and certification, however, are not the final challenges educators of color face; there is a need for both educator preparation institutions and P-12 schools to provide communities of support for pre- and in-service educators of color throughout their career, in order to retain them in their chosen profession.



The pathway to becoming an educator begins in the P-12 years, when students are forming their perceptions of schooling and building foundational knowledge and skills. However, studies have shown that students of color face higher rates of chronic absenteeism than their White peers and a higher likelihood of dropping out of school completely. Black or African American students of both genders are more than twice as likely to be suspended from school than any other racial or ethnic group.⁴⁸ Research suggests that these early experiences, in turn, influence the likelihood that students of color may choose to pursue a career in teaching, for two main reasons.

First, the loss of instructional time and resulting achievement disparities contribute to the fact that students of color are, on average, less likely to graduate from high school in four years. In New York State, only 73% of students of color who entered the 9th grade in Fall 2012 graduated from high school in four years, compared to 89% of their White classmates. More than 9,000 students of color had dropped out along the way, and another 19,710 were still enrolled in high school after four years.⁴⁹ Students of color who do enroll in college are also, on average, less likely to earn a bachelor's degree, which is a baseline requirement for teachers in New York State.⁵⁰ National studies have found that White students remain twice as likely to attain a bachelor's degree or higher than Black or Latino students—a gap that has increased since 1980 despite climbing college enrollment of students of color.⁵¹ However, high school attendance and achievement disparities ultimately set students of color apart from their White peers before they even enroll in college.⁵²

Second, national research has suggested that suspensions of students of color may have less to do with misbehavior and, instead, may be instances of discriminatory discipline practices.⁵³ Racial disproportionality in school discipline practices has been documented in the literature as

a highly consistent finding for Black or African American students, though fewer studies have investigated discipline disproportionality among other racial/ethnic groups with consistent results.⁵⁴ For Black or African American students, research shows that such discriminatory practices foster persistent inequities and stratification in schooling that appears to be associated with high school dropout and the overrepresentation of Black or African American students in special education programs.⁵⁵ To the extent that these patterns reflect negative experiences of schooling, such experiences may deter students of color from wanting to pursue a career in the education field.⁵⁶ This cycle has been called one of the leading challenges to achieving educator diversity in New York State.⁵⁷

New York State is making progress in addressing P-12 achievement disparities, however. First, through the state's ESSA Plan, the Board of Regents made creating safe school climates and cultures that are welcoming and free from bias a priority—especially for traditionally marginalized youth, including students of color. To that end, the Department encourages districts to engage in professional development focused on reducing exclusionary discipline practices, among other efforts geared at bettering school climates for all students.⁵⁸

Further, the good news is that high school graduation rates for students of color are on the increase and closing the gap with White students, as shown in Figure 19. In particular, graduation rates for Black or African American and Hispanic or Latino students are on a steady upward trajectory and have each increased by ten percentage points since 2013.



Figure 19: New York State's high school graduation rates are increasing overall.
Educator Preparation

Following high school graduation, the next step along the pathway for future teachers is entry into postsecondary education. Completion of a bachelor's degree is required for the initial certificate, and a master's degree is required for the professional certificate. An analysis of racial and ethnic disparities in overall postsecondary attainment is beyond the scope of this report. However, it is relevant that students of color are less likely to enroll in college when compared to White students and, once enrolled, less likely to complete their bachelor's degree.

Data on Educator Preparation Enrollment by Race and Gender

Educator preparation program enrollment accounts for less than 40,000 students—or around 3 percent—of New York State's total postsecondary enrollment of over 1.1 million students. Figure 20 shows that, in the 2016-17 academic year, only about two and a half percent of New York's American Indian or Alaska Native college students, 2% of Black or African American college students, and 1% of Asian or Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islander college students were in educator preparation programs. By comparison, 3.5% of White and Multi-Racial college students and almost 5% of Hispanic or Latino college students were enrolled in educator preparation programs in 2016-17.





Enrollment in Educator Preparation Programs by Race and Ethnicity, 2016-17

Includes traditional and alternative, IHE-based programs. Percentages are of races and ethnicities reported.

Sources: "Title II Reports: National Teacher Preparation Data." United States Department of Education. Data are as of 07/01/2019 "Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System (IPEDS)." National Center for Education Statistics, United States Department of Education. Collection Years: 2012-2017. Data are as of 07/30/2019.

Students in New York's educator preparation programs are disproportionately White when compared with the college population overall. Figure 21 shows that in 2016-17, only about half of New York college students identified as White, compared to more than 60% of educator preparation enrollees.

Figure 21: Sixty-one percent of educator preparation program enrollees are White.



Includes traditional and alternative, IHE-based programs. Percentages of are races/ethnicities reported. 9% of educator preparation program enrollees did not identify a race or ethnicity for the 2016-17 academic year, not included in the figure. Sources: "Title II Reports: National Teacher Preparation Data." United States Department of Education. Data are as of 07/01/2019. "Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System (IPEDS)." National Center for Education Statistics, United States Department of Education. Collection Years: 2012-2017. Data are as of 07/30/2019.

Compared with other states, New York ranks high in terms of student of color enrollment in educator preparation programs. Figure 22 shows that New York educator preparation programs enroll the 7th highest percentage of students of color in the United States, exceeding the national average of 26%. New York State enrolled the 3rd highest number of students of color nationwide, with 13,117 students in the 2016-17 academic year—only Texas and Arizona enrolled a larger number of students of color in their educator preparation programs that year. Likewise, New York has some of the highest percentages of students of color in each individual racial/ethnic category, when compared with the rest of the country.⁵⁹

Figure 22: New York has the 7th highest percentage of students of color in educator preparation programs in the United States.





Includes traditional and alternative programs. 13% of enrollees nationwide did not report a race or ethnicity nationwide for the 2016-17 academic year. Rounded to the nearest percentage point. Source: "Title II Reports: National Teacher Preparation Data." United States Department of Education. Data are as of 11-26-2019.

Like most states, New York has seen a significant decline in educator preparation enrollment over the past decade⁶⁰ that has only slowed slightly since 2013. Enrollments in New York State's teacher preparation programs experienced a decline of 49% from 2010 to 2015, while program completers fell 39% over the same time period.⁶¹ Since 2016, the decline in enrollment has been even steeper. In the 2016-17 academic year, 37,080 students were enrolled in a New York State educator preparation program—a decline of nearly 50% from the 70,128 students enrolled in the 2010-11 academic year.⁶²

Figure 23 shows that, while the enrollment of White students in New York educator preparation programs fell by nearly 60% between 2010-11 and 2016-17—from just under 50,000 to 20,601—the enrollment of students of color has been far less volatile. Hispanic or Latino enrollment in New York educator preparation programs dipped 7%, from 6,274 students in the 2010-11 academic year to 5,812 students by the Fall of 2016; Black or African American educator preparation enrollment dropped 29% from 5,442 to 3,879 students; and the enrollment of Multi-Racial students increased over the same time period.⁶³

As a consequence, the share of educator preparation enrollees of color in New York State has been increasing. In the 2010-11 academic year, only about 25% of enrollees were students of color, compared with 39% in 2016-17. Hispanic or Latino students, in particular, have increased enrollment share by nearly five percentage points since 2010.

For a comparison of the enrollment of educator preparation students by race and ethnicity in traditional versus alternative, IHE-based programs in New York, see Table 2.





Educator Preparation Program Enrollment by Race/Ethnicity

Includes traditional and alternative, IHE-based programs. Percentages are of races and ethnicities reported. Source: "Title II Reports: National Teacher Preparation Data." United States Department of Education. Data are as of 07/01/2019.

Figure 24 shows the racial and ethnic breakdown of educator preparation program enrollment in New York State, in comparison with the P-12 student population and the population of in-service teachers. Whereas the teacher workforce is 80% White and just 7% Hispanic or Latino and 8% Black or African American, just 61% of educator preparation program enrollees are White. Seventeen percent of educator preparation program enrollees are Hispanic or Latino, 12% are Black or African American, and 7% are Asian or Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islander.

Figure 24: The current state of diversity in New York's educator pipeline.



Percentages of are races/ethnicities reported. Sources: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF). NYSED Information and Report Services (IRS) Public School Enrollment Files. "Title II Reports: National Teacher Preparation Data." United States Department of Education. Data are as of 07-01-2019.

Page 43 of 206

However, the growing diversity of New York State's educator preparation programs is not uniform throughout the state. Figure 25 shows that, in New York City, 56% of educator preparation program enrollees—a majority—are of color. But outside the city, only 20% of enrollees are of color, while 80% identify as White.

Figure 25: New York City has more diverse educator preparation program enrollment than the rest of the state.



2016-17 Educator Preparation Program Enrollment, New York City compared to Rest of State

Includes traditional and alternative, IHE-based programs. Percentages are of races and ethnicities reported. Roughly 11% of NYC pre-service teachers and 7% of pre-service teachers in the rest of the state declined to identify.

Source: "Title II Reports: National Teacher Preparation Data." United States Department of Education. Data are as of 07/01/2019.

Figure 26 shows some of the extent of the regional disparities in diversity across New York State. In 2016-17, about half of the state's educator preparation enrollees attended programs in New York City, as shown in Figure 26, but New York City programs enrolled 75% (9,787) of the state's prospective teachers of color. The regions with the next largest numbers of educator preparation enrollees of color were Long Island, with 851, and the Lower Hudson region, with 686 enrollees in 2016-17.

Figure 26: Seventy-five percent of pre-service teachers of color are enrolled in programs in New York City.



Includes traditional and alternative, IHE-based programs. Percentages are of races and ethnicities reported. Source: "Title II Reports: National Teacher Preparation Data." United States Department of Education. Data are as of 07/01/2019.

The statewide decline in educator preparation program enrollment has seen a significant drop in the number of both male and female candidates entering the teacher pipeline. In the 2010-11 academic year, 16,564 male students were enrolled in an educator preparation program in New York State, while only 8,310 were enrolled in 2016. Female enrollment likewise fell by nearly 50% over the same time period.⁶⁴ Since 2011, the gender makeup of educator preparation program enrollees has remained static, at one male enrollee for every three females, but Figure 27 shows the gender gap in enrollment is widening in some of the state's most populated districts.





Includes traditional and alternative, IHE-based programs. Percentages are of genders reported. Source: "Title II Reports: National Teacher Preparation Data." United States Department of Education. Data are as of 07/01/2019.

New York is not alone in the underrepresentation of male students in educator preparation programs. Nationwide, male representation in educator preparation programs ranges from 17% in Arizona to 30% in North Dakota. In the 2016-17 academic year, the national average was 22 percent.⁶⁵

Educator Preparation Program Completion

The disproportionately low percentage of students of color enrolling in educator preparation programs is compounded by the lower share of students of color who eventually complete these programs. While New York State does not currently collect demographic data on educator preparation program completers specifically, the racial and ethnic diversity of overall postsecondary completers provides some insight into the disparities in the completion of four-year degrees in New York's colleges and universities.

Of the 32,277 students of color who entered a New York State postsecondary institution in the Fall of 2012 seeking a bachelor's degree, only 45% had completed their degree in four years,

compared to 60% of White students. After a total of six years, approximately 38% of the students of color in the Fall 2012 cohort had still not completed their degree, compared to 27% of White students.⁶⁶ Completion rates across all postsecondary degree types reflect a similar imbalance, both nationally and statewide, indicating that institutions are struggling to support students of color through program completion.⁶⁷

Completion rates for students of color seeking a bachelor's degree or equivalent in New York State vary by sector, as shown in Figure 28. SUNY institutions have consistently had the highest 6-year completion rate, reaching 68% for the Fall 2012 cohort. Independent colleges and universities in New York State had a 66% completion rate for students of color in the Fall 2012 cohort, while the rate at City University of New York (CUNY) institutions has remained just under 50 percent.

Figure 28: SUNY institutions have the highest graduation rate for students of color in bachelor-degree programs.



Students of Color Graduating within 6 years with a Bachelor's

Source: NYSED Higher Education 2009-2018 Graduation Data. Data are as of 09-04-2019.

Researchers have found that very small numbers of Hispanic or Latino and Black or African American men complete New York educator preparation programs. Among 2015-16 bachelor's program completers, 131 were Latino men and 49 were Black men. Among 2016 master's programs completers, 215 were Hispanic or Latino men and 145 were Black or African American men.⁶⁸ Further, nearly half of master's level teacher preparation program completers of color in 2016 were concentrated in just seven of the 64 such programs statewide, several of which were CUNY campuses.⁶⁹

Barriers to Educator Preparation Recruitment and Completion: Discussion

College completion rates are low among students of color in general and within educator preparation programs specifically.⁷⁰ Researchers, advocates, and educator preparation program representatives who responded to NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey cite a range of obstacles to recruiting students of color into educator preparation programs and retaining them through completion, including:

- Lack of information about preparation pathways and employment prospects;
- Feeling underprepared for college-level coursework;
- High costs and debt burden associated with attending college and earning a bachelor's and master's degree;
- Lower anticipated career earnings and status in the education profession;
- Family responsibilities and need for childcare;
- Transportation difficulties;
- Dissatisfaction with lack of diversity and encountering "deficit thinking" about their racial, ethnic, linguistic, and cultural differences from faculty and other students, and in schools where student teaching placements are offered.⁷¹

While many of these obstacles are faced by students from all racial and ethnic backgrounds, studies show that students of color are particularly impacted by higher financial burdens and perceptions of biases against their racial/ethnic identities that discourage them from persisting through postsecondary completion, particularly in White-majority institutions.⁷² This section takes a closer look at some of these obstacles, particularly with regard to educator preparation programs.



High Cost of Higher Education, Lower Return on Investment

Deans who responded to NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey cited high college costs as a leading barrier to enrollment and persistence. Some believe that the greatest challenge in recruiting diverse candidates is the high cost of tuition and living expenses over and above what is covered by financial aid. Deans also cited course materials, transportation expenses, and other certification-related costs.

While it is common to think of tuition and exam fees as the most daunting costs, research shows that living expenses typically make up the majority of the cost of college attendance at public institutions.⁷³ Full-time students often receive enough aid to cover much of their tuition and fees but face paying the remaining living expenses out-of-pocket.⁷⁴ See Appendix A: Overview of New York's Teacher Preparation and Certification for a breakdown of the costs associated with becoming a teacher.

Students often choose to increase their workday—and thus their earnings—and reduce their course-load, in an effort to relieve some of the financial pressure they experience.⁷⁵ Taking fewer classes each semester prolongs program completion, sometimes indefinitely, while the interest on their student loan debt continues to accumulate. Students of color are especially affected by the weight of student loan debt, with research showing that Black or African American students, in particular, tend to end up owing more over time than their White peers due to higher undergraduate and graduate borrowing and greater loan interest accumulation.⁷⁶ From 2005 to 2012, the average student loan balance nationally increased by nearly 60% to leave most college students facing a \$25,000 debt as a result of their pursuit of a postsecondary degree.⁷⁷

Scholars suggest that the potential debt burden associated with earning a bachelor's and master's degree leads many college students to choose careers with higher anticipated career earnings, often away from the field of education.⁷⁸ Columbia University's TOC II director, Katherine Ledwell, agrees:

"Some of our TOC students find that, in spite of the 6 points of tuition assistance they receive through TOC, they must take out up to \$100,000 in loans to afford a two-year degree. With a forecasted starting teaching salary of approximately \$60,000, this sets students up for a **crushing** debt-to-income ratio, one that will shape their quality of life for almost the entirety of their careers. If we were able to offer full tuition assistance to TOC students, we suspect that many more teachers from underrepresented backgrounds would complete their teacher education program at Teachers College."

In a 2019 report that explored the possible causes of declining enrollment in educator preparation programs, the Center for American Progress suggested that, "[d]ue to low salaries, difficult working conditions, and a lack of career pathway opportunities, the teaching profession as a whole cannot compare with other high-status professions such as medicine and law."⁷⁹ A few educator preparation program deans commented that "negative publicity surrounding teaching as a profession" and "belittling" of the profession in the media discourage students from enrolling in educator preparation programs, particularly into graduate-level educator pathways. Clarkson's TOC II program director, Nicki Foley, expressed a similar sentiment: "Successful college seniors have many options in this job market. Convincing them to pursue a career in teaching, which may have a lower return on investment than other professions, is challenging."

Stigmas surrounding the teaching profession have been cited as a deterrent for prospective male teachers and teachers of color. Teaching has long been regarded as a female profession with low levels of prestige and status in society. The "glorified babysitter" stigma and other stereotypes surrounding the teaching profession cast a feminine spin on the realities of the career and continue to deter many men from even considering entering the field.⁸⁰ Monroe College has found it particularly difficult to recruit male candidates into their undergraduate Teacher Opportunity Corps II program in early childhood education. "Young men … are typically more drawn to working with older students," writes the program director, Dr. Anne Lillis.



Need for Flexible and Supportive Pathways

When asked for their opinion in NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey, many comments by P-12 superintendents highlighted the lack of flexibility and accessibility of educator preparation programs as barriers, particularly to encouraging paraprofessionals to pursue certification. In addition to citing cost concerns, most respondents suggested that the requirements of teacher certification are not realistic for paraprofessionals aspiring to become classroom teachers and that many districts cannot afford to offer supports. Furthermore, several superintendents perceive effective communication to be lacking, particularly regarding regional employment markets and available pathways.

Year after year, New York's higher education opportunity programs demonstrate that students from all walks of life are able to succeed in college when provided with access and the right

supports. Yet too few educator preparation institutions offer the kinds of flexibility and supports that first-generation college students of color may need, or that would enable candidates to persist while employed or caring for a family (see Figure 38). Only 5% of survey respondents indicated they offer childcare assistance with the goal of retaining students of color, and only about one-quarter offer flexible course scheduling or cost-of-living assistance with the goal of retaining students of color.

"We have a paraprofessional who is certified but needs to complete her student teaching. She can't, however, afford to take time off to student teach."

- New York State P-12 Superintendent

The New York State Association of Teacher Educators (NYSATE) and New York State Association of Colleges for Teacher Education (NYACTE) Fall 2019 conference allotted time for a working/meeting session of the Coalition for Urban Teacher Education & Development (C-UTED) to present a multi-site research study of the experiences of teachers of color in schools and student teaching placements. C-UTED members discussed findings of financial barriers— specifically challenges in finding (and affording) childcare, and the pressing struggle new and prospective teachers of color face in needing to earn an income to support their family and cover the cost of living—all of which deter many candidates from the profession or inhibit their ability to persist through completion.

Finally, the dearth of faculty of color has been cited as a factor in attracting and retaining diverse candidates into educator preparation programs. In 2017, the vast majority of public higher education institutions nationwide employed less than 20% faculty of color—with almost 30 states falling below 10% representation, including the State University of New York system.⁸¹ Literature suggests that faculty of color often struggle with the lack of campus diversity and perceived lack of institutional efforts to diversify their workforce.⁸² Efforts to diversify the racial and ethnic makeup of postsecondary faculties, in fact, have been cited as some of the least successful campus diversity initiatives nationwide.⁸³

Certification Exams

Like most other states—and many other professions—New York has long required prospective teachers to pass a set of exams to demonstrate that they have the essential skills and knowledge in order to become licensed. New York's teacher certification exam requirements are designed to align with the demands of the profession and go through a rigorous validation process to ensure that each test is valid, reliable, and fair for all candidates. For a detailed description of the validation process, see Appendix F: New York State Certification Exam Validation Process.

Teacher candidates in New York State must pass three certification exams: the edTPA, the Educating All Students (EAS) test, and one or more Content Specialty Tests (CST) depending on the candidate's area of certification. It is worth noting that, when the current exams were first implemented—replacing the Assessment of Teaching Skills-Written (ATS-W), the Liberal Arts and Sciences Test, and the old CSTs—they were phased in with a system of "safety nets." For the first three years that the edTPA was required, no one who failed the exam was denied certification; candidates were allowed to take the edTPA's predecessor exam, the ATS-W, which had a 95% pass rate.

The edTPA is a performance-based, subject-specific assessment that requires aspiring teachers to demonstrate readiness to teach through lesson plans designed to support their students' strengths and needs; engage real students in ambitious learning; analyze whether their students are learning; and adjust their instruction to become more effective. Teacher candidates submit unedited video recordings of themselves at work in a real classroom as part of a portfolio that is scored by trained educators. Candidates who do not pass but score within two points of the passing score and can demonstrate that they are prepared to become a teacher of record, can apply for a waiver of the edTPA requirement.

From September 1, 2013 through October 13, 2019, approximately 50,000 pre-service teachers took an edTPA assessment in New York State. Roughly 4,900 edTPA takers did not identify their race/ethnicity. White candidates accounted for 64% of edTPA takers over this six-year period (31,855 takers). Hispanic or Latino candidates had the second highest number of edTPA takers, at 5,171 students, while Black or African American and Asian or Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islander candidates each have had just under 3,000 edTPA takers since 2013. Only 75 American Indian or Alaska Native students have taken the edTPA in New York State over the past six years.

Figure 29 shows that New York State's average edTPA pass rate is 82 percent. Asian or Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islander candidates have the highest pass rate at 87 percent, while Black or African American candidates fall 8 percentage points below the overall average at 74 percent.

Figure 29: The edTPA has an average pass rate of 82% in New York State.



edTPA Pass Rate, 2013-2019

The percentages above reflect candidates' best attempt. A total of 4,940 edTPA takers declined to identify their race/ethnicity. These candidates had an average pass rate of 77 percent, not included in the figure. *Source: Unpublished data, September 01, 2013 through October 13, 2019.*

The Educating All Students (EAS) test assesses candidates' familiarity with research-validated instructional strategies responsive to students with diverse backgrounds and learning needs, including students with disabilities and English language learners; the ability to communicate and collaborate effectively with parents/guardians in support of student learning; and professional responsibilities regarding bullying, student privacy, discipline, etc.

From 2013 to 2019, nearly 87,000 pre-service teachers took the EAS test in New York State. Roughly 6,500 EAS takers did not identify their race/ethnicity. Just over 51,000 White candidates have taken the EAS since 2013, compared to 11,034 Hispanic or Latino candidates, 8,217 Black or African American candidates, and 4,702 Asian or Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islander candidates. Figure 30 shows that New York State's average EAS pass rate is 96 percent. White candidates have the highest pass rate at 98 percent, while Black or African American candidates have the lowest at 89 percent. American Indian or Alaska Native students notably exceed 90% in their population's average pass rate for the EAS test.

Figure 30: The Educating All Students (EAS) Test has an average pass rate of 96 percent.



Educating All Students (EAS) Pass Rates

The percentages above reflect candidates' best attempt. A total of 6,456 EAS takers declined to identify their race/ethnicity. These candidates had an average pass rate of 95 percent, not included in the figure. *Source: Unpublished data, September 01, 2013 through October 13, 2019.*

The Content Specialty Tests (CSTs) assess prospective teachers' subject-matter competence and pedagogical content knowledge; meaning, the skills and strategies used to deliver particular content. CSTs, in total, had just over 93,000 takers since 2013 and an average pass rate of 94 percent. Figure 31 shows that White candidates exceeded the average pass rate by 2 percentage points, while Black or African American students have had an average pass rate of 85 percent. Roughly 7,600 CST takers did not identify their race/ethnicity.

Figure 31: Content Specialty Tests (CSTs) have an overall pass rate of 94 percent.



Content Specialty Tests (CST) Pass Rates

The percentages above reflect candidates' best attempt. A total of 7,627 CST takers declined to identify their race/ethnicity. These candidates had an average pass rate of 92 percent, not included in the figure. Source: Unpublished data, September 01, 2013 through October 13, 2019.

Some survey respondents suggested that the cost of these exams poses a barrier to diversifying the profession. Clarkson University's Assistant Director of the Education Department explains: "What we might call 'start-up' expenses on the path to becoming a professional teacher are disincentives to enter the field," even for individuals who already demonstrate a desire to teach, such as paraprofessionals, teaching assistants, and coaches. "The cost of education *and then* certification are huge hurdles that many prospective teachers cannot overcome," one respondent noted, while another added that "expensive" teaching exams "end up serving as a barrier to minority candidates" in particular. "Some of our TOC students struggle to pass certification exams the first time and then struggle to pay for their second or third attempts," one TOC II director wrote.

For information on the costs of tuition for SUNY and CUNY students, New York State certification exam costs, and some examples of the costs of additional workshops prospective teachers may be required to complete for certification, see Appendix A: Overview of New York's Teacher Preparation and Certification Process. (Note that some of the required workshops can be included as part of an approved preparation program, with no additional fee.) For a brief review of the national literature on this topic, see Appendix C: Literature Review and Examples, Part 1: Current Research. For information on the vouchers that are provided to candidates who have trouble affording the exam fees, see Current Efforts: Supportive Preparation Models.

Hiring

Aspiring teachers are ultimately striving to enter the classroom in their chosen field, yet educators of color are hired in low numbers in many districts. In 2019, educators of color who participated in research conducted by the National Center for Suburban Studies at Hofstra University argued that school districts' current recruitment and hiring systems are "producing and perpetuating an unacceptably low number" of educators of color.⁸⁴ The map in Figure 32 helps to illustrate these disparities. Populations of color are low across Upstate, Central, and Western New York, and higher in the Lower Hudson, New York City, and Long Island. Across the state, there are substantial gaps between the percentage of students of color and the percentage of teachers of color—ranging from a 24-point gap in the North Country to a 38-point gap in the Lower Hudson and Long Island. By comparison, in each region except New York City, the share of educator enrollees of color is within six percentage points of the share of people of color in the general population.

Previous research has found that teacher labor markets are predominantly local. Studies have shown that over 80% of New York State's first year teachers work in a public school less than 40 miles from where they attended high school, while 65% find employment less than 15 miles away. Teacher preferences about place tend to draw them to schools and districts that are near their home regions, or geographically similar to their home regions; meaning, new teachers with rural backgrounds are drawn to rural schools, suburban-to-suburban, and urban-to-urban.⁸⁵ Related to this is the recent finding that, among 2012-2015 bachelor's program completers, 55% of new teachers took jobs in the same region as their educator preparation program. For master's program completers, the percentage jumps to 75% of new teachers employed in the same region as their program.⁸⁶

In NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey, the Department received an especially large number of comments from superintendents of rural or small districts who perceived that the focus of the survey neglected the realities of the challenges they face in recruiting and retaining educators in their schools, regardless of race, ethnicity, or gender. When asked their opinion on improving recruitment efforts for candidates of color, P-12 superintendents emphasized the challenges of regional diversity disparities and limitations they faced in their outreach capacities, highlighting a struggle to incentivize new teachers to seek employment outside of large metropolitan areas of the state.

"To move to a rural area to teach takes a special person if you are not from the area. To increase our diversity pool of candidates the community would need to promote itself to draw people of color and diverse backgrounds. It's not just what we, as a tiny school district, can do."

-Gary Furman, Edmeston Central School District Superintendent

For example, Edmeston Central School District Superintendent Gary Furman remarked that a focus on diversity efforts in staffing neglects the reality that many rural schools in New York State are struggling to find any qualified teachers at all. Located in Otsego County in the 6th Regents District, Edmeston Central School District employed 45 White teachers in the 2016-17 academic year and not a single teacher of color.⁸⁷ However, the district's K-12 student enrollment in that

same year totaled only 398 students, 96% of whom identified as White.⁸⁸ In 2018, Edmeston Central School District was classified as a high need-to-resource capacity (N/RC) rural district in which 40% of enrolled students were eligible for free lunch and further despaired by an 11% annual teacher turnover rate.⁸⁹ In Furman's words, the prospects of recruiting new teachers of any background in Edmeston are bleak:

"We currently have a leave position at the elementary level and have no candidate. We recently interviewed for a secondary math position. We had three applicants, all of whom were unqualified. If Edmeston was located in a small city, urban, or suburban area (even closer than 40 minutes to the nearest small city with stores), we would probably have more candidates to choose from. Yet, this is a serious issue for rural schools which needs to be addressed."

These local teacher markets may help to explain the cyclical challenge in improving the diversity of educator workforce in small and rural communities upstate, whose populations have very little diversity. However, the local nature of teacher labor markets does not explain the lack of teachers of color in metropolitan and downstate districts, where regional populations are more diverse, and teacher candidates of color are enrolled in large concentrations. The aggregate percentages in the map in Figure 32 mask the stark differences in diversity that exist within each region, particularly between cities and their adjacent suburbs. In 2016-17, nine minority-serving institutions⁹⁰ in New York City together enrolled roughly 18% of the statewide prospective teacher of color workforce in the 2016-17 academic year.⁹¹ These nine included several CUNY institutions (City College, Lehman, Medgar Evers, NYC College of Technology, and York) as well as Boricua College, Metropolitan College of New York, Nyack College, and St. Joseph's College. Programs in the Mid-Hudson, Long Island, and New York City regions prepared 92% of all master's program student of color completers in 2015-16.⁹² The lack of diversity in such metropolitan districts, therefore, reflects something other than a shortage of available candidates.

Figure 32: Populations of color are low across Upstate, Central, and Western New York, and higher in the Lower Hudson, New York City, and Long Island.



Sources: NYSED Personnel Master Files (PMF), 2016-17. NYSED Information and Report Services (IRS) Public School Enrollment Files, 2016-17. "Title II Reports: National Teacher Preparation Data." United States Department of Education, 2016-17. "Population Data and Projections." New York State Department of Labor, 2009. Data are as of 07-01-2019.

Many of the comments from P-12 superintendents indicated a possible conflict in targeted efforts to recruiting and retaining educators of color: namely, that targeted practices conflict with their equity efforts that strive for the "best" candidates and supports for "all" employees, regardless of color. Superintendents specified district practices of advertising broadly to recruit

any and all available candidates for their open positions. Several further emphasized that they stood by their policy of being "equal opportunity" employers that would hire the "best" candidate for the position, regardless of demographics. However, many districts indicated that targeting diverse candidates is simply not a priority.

The National Center for Suburban Studies pointed out that the lack of diversity—particularly in school leadership—can itself become an obstacle for "One challenge districts face is the shortage of diverse candidates that express interest with districts that are perceived as "homogeneous." Diverse candidates do not apply or "walk past" recruiting tables for districts which may be considered as lacking diversity"

-New York State P-12 Superintendent

hiring educators of color into schools and districts.⁹³ In 2018-19, school districts in New York State without a school leader of color employed 42 times as many White teachers as teachers of color,

on average.⁹⁴ In contrast, the districts with at least one school leader of color—including all New York City school districts—employed 3 times as many White teachers as teachers of color, 7 times as many White teachers as Black or African American teachers, and 8 times as many White teachers as Hispanic or Latino teachers. However, outside of New York City, districts with at least one school leader of color employed, on average, 8 times as many White teachers as teachers of color, with 23 times as many White teachers as Black or African American American teachers and 17 times as many White teachers as Hispanic or Latino teachers in the 2018-19 academic year.⁹⁵

Retention in Employment

Research shows that teaching has long had a higher turnover rate than most other occupations, particularly within the first few years novice teachers are on the job, with the result that large numbers of teachers leave the profession prior to retirement.⁹⁶ According to recent research, fewer than one in five bachelor's program completers and a little over one in three master's program completers take jobs in New York State public schools and remain there for three consecutive years.⁹⁷

Preliminary analysis of 2017-18 and 2018-19 school year data⁹⁸ by The Education Trust–New York found that teacher turnover rates tend to be higher among teachers of color when compared to their White peers.⁹⁹ Across the 347 districts considered in their analysis, 22% of Black or African American teachers did not return to the classroom following the 2017-18 academic year, compared to 19% of Hispanic or Latino teachers, 18% Asian or Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islander teachers, 17% American Indian or Alaska Native teachers, and 13% of White teachers.¹⁰⁰

The analysis found that teachers of color are more likely to work in districts with higher overall turnover. Specifically, they found that, within New York City, the geographic districts that employed the highest percentages of Black or African American or Hispanic or Latino teachers had higher overall turnover rates, at roughly 20 percent. Among each race and ethnicity, they found that teacher turnover is significantly higher in New York City than any other part of the state considered in their analysis.¹⁰¹

Disaggregating the data by district type, teachers of color had a turnover rate 1-2 percentage points higher than their White peers in New York City, Buffalo, Yonkers, and urban/suburban high-need districts, but experience the same turnover rates in rural high-need and low-need districts. Teacher of color turnover has the largest gap with their White peers in average-need districts, at 13% compared to 9% of White teachers. Among individual races and ethnicities, Black or African American teachers experience some of the highest turnover rates across all but low-need districts. In New York City and in rural high-need districts, Black or African American teachers 4 percentage points higher than White teachers.¹⁰²

In 2017, Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond found that the highest possible district salary that a teacher could expect to earn over the course of their career could be a predicter of teacher turnover, after controlling for district type, class size, and other school factors.¹⁰³ Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond's (2017) analysis showed that teachers that could only expect to earn a salary of up to \$60,000 had a predictive turnover rate that was 31% higher than those that could expect to earn upwards of \$78,000 at the highest end of district salary schedules nationwide. In

contrast, the beginning salary for new teachers was not found to be predictive of turnover. For the most part, these trends appear to hold true within the state of New York. For the 2017-18 academic year, the National Education Association (NEA) found that New York had the highest teacher salaries in the country at \$84,227—exceeding the national average by more than \$20,000.¹⁰⁴ However, average teacher salaries vary dramatically across the state, ranging from as low as \$40,116 to as high as \$130,144 among individual districts in 2017-18.¹⁰⁵

Mostly consistent with Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond's (2017) findings, regions of New York that average higher salaries in the 95th percentile tend to correlate with lower turnover rates. For the 2017-18 academic year, low-need and urban/suburban high-need districts in New York averaged salaries at the higher end of the salary schedule (i.e., 95th percentile) that exceeded \$100,000 and saw turnover rates under 10% for the 2018 reporting year. In contrast, the large cities of Syracuse, Rochester and Buffalo had lower salaries in the 95th percentile, averaging around \$85,000, and higher turnover rates, between 12- and 14-percent for the same year. Yonkers City School District led the state in both highest teacher salaries—averaging \$118,982 overall and \$140,422 in the 95th percentile—and lowest turnover rate, at 6% in 2018.¹⁰⁶

Rural high-need districts and New York City, however, do not support the correlation between anticipated earnings and teacher turnover to the same extent. New York's rural high-need districts averaged some of the lowest salaries across the spectrum for the 2017-18 academic year but a lower turnover rate than Syracuse, Rochester, Buffalo and New York City in 2018. In contrast, New York City districts had some of the highest turnover rates among traditional school districts statewide (16%) yet teacher salaries reaching as high as \$113,762 in Manhattan for 2017-18,¹⁰⁷ suggesting that, while anticipated earning may be a major factor in teacher retention, salaries alone do not determine a teacher's willingness to stay in the district or overall profession.

Need for Community of Support

Carver-Thomas & Darling-Hammond (2017) found that school leadership could be a determinant in turnover, with teachers more than twice as likely to leave the district or profession entirely if they strongly believe that their administration is unsupportive, in terms of lacking the "ability to encourage and acknowledge staff, communicate a clear vision, and generally run a school well."¹⁰⁸ Scholars point out that even teachers who do not leave the profession but do leave the district create additional costs and disruptions in the schools they leave behind, which can negatively impact student learning and achievement.¹⁰⁹

Research shows that teachers certified in higher demand certification subjects are more likely to stay in the classroom once employed. Around 60% of candidates prepared in New York's traditional educator preparation programs are early childhood and elementary education teachers, who are among the least likely to stay in the classroom for three consecutive years.¹¹⁰

In contrast to traditional educator preparation programs, New York State's alternative, IHE-based programs prepare around 60% of their enrollees for middle and high school teaching credentials.¹¹¹ Research suggests that more comprehensive preparation pathways for

prospective teachers encourages higher retention rates once they enter the classroom.¹¹² Studies have found that more effective teachers are more likely to stay in their initial public schools and in the teaching profession, compared to less effective teachers who demonstrate higher mobility rates.¹¹³ However, scholars have also suggested that turnover trends may have less to do with insufficient preparation and are more a consequence of inadequate support when first entering the classroom.¹¹⁴ Mentoring and formal induction programs are often cited in the literature as critical supports for novice teachers, though the content, structure and duration for optimal effectiveness of such programs likely varies across individual schools.

Most P-12 superintendents that commented in NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey indicated that their retention practices were not targeted at any specific demographic. To improve retention, superintendents suggested that recruiting candidates in the first place was a larger issue, particularly in districts that offer lower pay than found in larger metropolitan areas. However, when educators of color are successfully brought into a school, several superintendents believed that affinity peer support groups play a significant role in their willingness to stay. Respondents commented that any new supports or efforts would be beneficial for all prospective and new

educators regardless of race or ethnicity—if they could find their way into the pipeline. Several superintendents indicated that they have not even had any candidates of color apply to their vacancies. Thus, while superintendents emphasized that they would be supportive of any new teachers who joined their faculty, the reality for many districts is that they cannot retain educators they do not have.

"I don't think retention would be an issue if we could find the candidates."

> -New York State P-12 Superintendent

Retention of diverse faculty is a significant challenge in institutions of higher education as well. Recent research by Professor Nakia Gray-Nicolas and her colleague Angel Miles Nash finds that black women joining the faculty of educational leadership programs experience isolation and marginalization. For example, early-career faculty reported that colleagues actively discouraged them from pursuing the research topics that they saw as most relevant and potentially fruitful. Furthermore, because they are from an underrepresented population, these individuals reported facing extra demands, such as being asked to serve on committees, be photographed for marketing materials, and serve as mentors to students of color.¹¹⁵ Such demands may impact employment retention by reducing the amount of time that faculty can spend on the research and publishing activities that are crucial to attaining tenure.

Trower & Chait (2002) suggest that the challenge of retaining a diverse postsecondary faculty is tied to an unaccommodating institutional culture that includes subtle "norms that undercut efforts at diversity," such as the relative values assigned to research pursuits and gender- or race-based stereotypes.¹¹⁶ Women and minorities, who are underrepresented in both postsecondary leadership and faculty, then lack the leverage needed to change and eliminate these cultural biases. As a result, more women and minorities leave the academy before completing their probationary period when compared to their White, male colleagues, citing limited opportunities to participate in decision-making, research that is "trivialized or discounted," and a lack of mentorship and support as reasons for their early departure.¹¹⁷

IV. Recommendations

The data trends, hurdles and challenges along the pathway, and national research literature reviewed in the preceding discussion support six recommendations for districts, BOCES, and educator preparation institutions to improve the diversity of New York State's educator workforce. While this report focuses explicitly on racial/ethnic, gender, and age diversity, these recommendations could apply to other types of diversity, such as linguistic, cultural, religious, functional (i.e., people with disabilities), and socio-economic diversity:

- 1. Discuss educator diversity with stakeholders and set an intention to address it;
- 2. Partner to build pathways in your region;
- 3. Establish supports to enable candidates to clear the hurdles and overcome challenges;
- 4. Take an informed look at recruitment, admissions, and hiring practices;
- 5. Induct, develop, retain, and promote effective educators of color; and
- 6. Ensure transparency, accountability, and research.

Consistent with the legislation that called for this report, the recommendations are aimed at districts, BOCES, and educator preparation institutions. However, this begs the question as to what steps the State itself should be taking to address the issues raised in the foregoing pages. Beginning with Recommendation #1, this report can be viewed as the start of a state-level discussion of the issue of workforce diversity in New York's P-20 education system. As a next step, it is important for the Board of Regents to set an intention to address this issue, and to clearly articulate its expectations for the Department and the field.

Regents Proposals

The 2020-21 Regents Budget and Legislative Priorities include a package of proposals informed by the data and findings illustrated in this report. Several of these proposals are designed to spur the expansion of a network of partnerships among districts, BOCES, and educator preparation programs to provide innovative pathways that support the entry of diverse educators into the profession. The proposals also include funding to help defray the costs of educator preparation and certification.

 The Board and the Department are proposing to expand the Teacher Opportunity Corps II (TOC II) program that is currently funded as part of My Brother's Keeper (see Current Efforts: Teacher Opportunity Corps). The Department is requesting \$3 million in new state funding to establish a separately appropriated TOC II program to increase the number of certified educators of color in the state of New York by expanding the pipeline of diverse students, increasing the participation rate of historically underrepresented and economically disadvantaged individuals in teaching careers, and heightening the retention of culturally responsive educators in schools and districts. The funding would be used to increase the number of TOC II-funded programs from 16 to 26 and extend coverage throughout the state by awarding competitive grants in each of the ten postsecondary education regions.

- The Regents recommend funding be allocated to create research-based, innovative, highquality birth to grade 3 teacher preparation programs and birth to grade 12 leader preparation advanced certification programs that prioritize the recruitment, access, and quality preparation of 240 of New York State's historically underrepresented and underserved teachers and leaders. These programs will serve as transformation models through collaborations between institutions of higher education, school districts, community-based organizations, health and mental health systems, and teacher and leader candidates. The Department is requesting \$2.5 million in new state funding to establish these programs which will support candidates through program completion, certification, and mentored first-year novice teaching experiences. Through the allotment of \$1.2 million each year for four years to establish birth to grade 3 teacher preparation programs, \$1.2 million each year for two years to establish birth to grade 12 leader preparation programs, and \$100,000 annually for the staff costs to implement these initiatives, the Department believes that recommendations from these initiatives applied to statewide preparation programs will benefit New York State by exceptionally preparing diverse teachers and leaders who reflect the communities, cultures, and languages of the children and families they serve.
- The Department is seeking to expand the number of qualified individuals who may fill a teaching position at 853 Schools, Special Act School Districts, and private preschool Special Class and Special Class in an Integrated Setting programs by providing \$2 million in new Teacher Pipeline funding to be competitively awarded for the piloting of Grow Your Own programs. These Grow Your Own programs would be required to recruit a diverse pool of prospective candidates from local communities to work in an approved program, receive training and professional development, and obtain fiscal assistance for tuition and related teacher preparation expenses, thereby addressing teacher shortages in approved private schools serving students with disabilities and Special Act school districts while also diversifying the pool of qualified educators available for these positions.
- To promote teacher diversity and support candidates in clearing one of the hurdles to joining the teaching profession, the Regents recommend expanding the provision of certification examination fee waiver vouchers to assist economically disadvantaged educator candidates in paying for the examinations required for certification. In the most recent year, the Department provided 3,000 vouchers, or enough to assist 1,000 candidates across the State through one full set of exams. This is a small fraction of the over 12,000 candidates who complete teacher preparation programs each year. The Department is requesting \$1.2 million in new state funding to support the tripling of the number of vouchers distributed annually, thus enabling the Department to provide 9,000 vouchers to assist economically disadvantaged educator candidates each year.

V. A Closer Look at Each Recommendation: Survey Results and Current Efforts

The following sections will discuss the above recommendations for districts and educator preparation in turn, looking at relevant survey findings and providing concrete examples of current efforts.

Over the decades, countless state and local initiatives have aimed to build and strengthen New York's educator workforce to better serve our state's increasingly diverse student population and address inequities in our schools. However, most of these policies and initiatives are relatively indirectly related to the issue of educator diversity and are therefore beyond the scope of this report. This section will focus on efforts designed to acknowledge, enhance, and expand diversity in the educator workforce.

Evaluating the effectiveness of the examples gathered here is beyond the scope of this report. Those considering emulating any of these approaches are encouraged to consider whether they have yielded or are likely to yield positive results in terms of their impact on the educator workforce and student outcomes.

As discussed earlier in the Data Sources and Limitations section, NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey was explicitly designed to better understand the systems and supports in place for the recruitment and retention of educators of color. As a result, the Department did not collect findings and suggestions on improving the gender or age diversity of New York's educator workforce from our P-20 leaders, and most of the efforts discussed below focus on racial and ethnic diversity.

1. Discuss educator diversity with stakeholders and set an intention to address it

As outlined in this report's introductory section, "Purpose of this Report," a diverse educator workforce has been shown to benefit <u>all</u> students in our increasingly diverse society. Developing a shared understanding of the value of educator diversity is essential to establishing a commitment to take action. These kinds of conversations are occurring in some places around the state, as discussed below, but clear expectations have not been established at the level of state policy. Equity of access to the education profession is intrinsically valuable and aligned with the Board of Regents' goal in New York's ESSA Plan to "support educator excellence and equity through the entire continuum of recruitment, preparation, induction, professional learning, evaluation, and career development."¹¹⁸ The Board of Regents should go a step further and articulate explicit expectations to guide subsequent efforts by the Department and in the field. In this way, the Board of Regents can model the behavior it expects of school boards and higher education leaders.

Within their regions, BOCES district superintendents can encourage local school boards to talk about the value of educator diversity and establish policies to address the issue, as several cities and communities have already done with notable success (see Current Efforts: Strategic Campaigns). Leaders of the higher education sectors can do the same with their campus presidents. All educator preparation programs should develop short-term and long-term recruitment plans and enrollment goals that focus on the certification shortage areas in their regions. Opening up discussions on the diversity of their programs or workforce is the simple starting point for initiating change.

Survey Suggestions: Intentional Commitments to Diversity to Attract Candidates

NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey¹¹⁹ revealed that educator preparation institutions show a high level of support for this recommendation, while the P-12 sector remains somewhat skeptical. Figure 33 shows that more than two thirds of educator preparation deans believe that intentional commitments to diversity would help to attract more candidates of color into educator preparation programs, compared with only about a quarter of P-12 superintendents ("districts") and one third of BOCES District Superintendents.

Figure 33: Question #38

In your opinion, which of the following would help to improve the recruitment of educator candidates of color into educator preparation programs?



NYSED Educator Diversity Survey, 2019

The final section of NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey was composed of optional questions for respondents to share their opinion on the supports they felt educator candidates of color need most to enter and persist through the pipeline. These optional questions received a 93% response rate from survey participants overall. Respondents were asked to select all that apply.

Figure 34 shows that an overwhelming majority of educator preparation program deans and a slight majority of BOCES District Superintendents believe that a district/school commitment to diversity, equity, and inclusion would most help to improve the recruitment and retention of educators of color in districts and classrooms, as do 40% of local superintendents. A 2019 Hofstra University report, which drew on interviews with three dozen Black and Latinx education professionals on Long Island, lends support to this recommendation.¹²⁰

Figure 34: Question #40



NYSED Educator Diversity Survey, 2019

The final section of NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey was composed of optional questions for respondents to share their opinion on the supports they felt educator candidates of color need most to enter and persist through the pipeline. These optional questions received a 93% response rate from survey participants overall. Respondents were asked to select all that apply.

Current Efforts: Strategic Campaigns

Many school districts, higher education institutions, and education stakeholders and advocacy groups have brought the issue of educator diversity to the fore and established it as a priority. The following notable examples demonstrate that not only is the issue acknowledged to be important; setting an intention to address it is a key first step toward improvement.

Examples at the statewide level:

- New York State's Council on School Superintendents (NYSCOSS)—established a core value of "helping ensure gender, racial and economic equality among those serving as superintendent" and charged its <u>Commission on Diversity & Inclusivity</u> with advancing this work. The Council's Commission will focus on racial equity by gathering and reviewing relevant research and identifying promising strategies through collaborative and sustained efforts to support the success of diverse superintendents.
- New York State United Teachers (NYSUT)—<u>"Take a Look at Teaching"</u> summits bring stakeholders together to discuss educator diversity in urban, suburban, and rural communities across the state. NYSUT's campaign focuses on highlighting how rewarding a career in education can be and encouraging prospective educators into the profession.
- The State University of New York (SUNY)—<u>TeachNY</u> is a multi-phase effort launched in the Spring of 2014, initially supported by a NYSED grant funded through Race to the Top. The TeachNY Roundtable, led by SUNY's then-Chancellor Nancy Zimpher and NYSED's then-Commissioner MaryEllen Elia and comprised of representatives from key stakeholder groups, was charged with building support for interagency collaboration to improve educator preparation. In 2017, SUNY's Board of Trustees adopted the <u>SUNY</u> <u>TeachNY Policy</u>, the first bullet point of which expresses SUNY's commitment to:

"Promote entry of a **diverse** and talented pool of prospective teachers and school/district leaders through comprehensive recruitment strategies that leverage both local and statewide assets, such as the following: intra-campus recruitment through the faculties of arts and sciences and other disciplines as well as campus-based programs (e.g., Educational Opportunity Programs); partnerships with P-12 schools (e.g., teacher academies in high schools); agreements with community colleges and technical colleges; and connections with business/industry and community-based organizations (e.g., related to those seeking to transition careers)."¹²¹

The TeachNY Roundtable also served as a foundation for the establishment of the New York State Teacher Table in 2018, which was intended to continue conversations around teacher recruitment and retention.

Examples at the regional level:

• **Capital Region**—Questar III BOCES's Academy for Educational Careers has developed a detailed plan for recruiting a diverse population into the teaching profession, including working with partners in K-12 and higher education to identify and address barriers to entering the teaching profession; launching teacher appreciation and advertising

campaigns that showcase teachers from diverse backgrounds and portray them as community role models; and numerous other action steps.

• **Central New York**—Syracuse Central School District (SCSD) set a strategic goal:

"By 2022: Refine our practices to recruit employees who are representative of the diversity of our district, utilizing a multi-pronged approach that results in increases to staff diversity through new hiring and internal promotion."

New York City—The City University of New York (CUNY) is committed to enacting a <u>vision</u> of diversity through its mission for "genuine participative membership" in a pluralistic community that exemplifies "the benefits that accrue when diversity and inclusion are integral components of an institution's educational philosophy and core mission." CUNY outlined a strategy for building the diversity of the University, founded on four principles:

1. Engendering values and implementing policies that enhance respect for individuals and their cultures promotes excellence and an inclusive educational experience;

2. Diversifying the University's workforce strengthens the institution, encourages the exchange of new ideas, and enriches campus life;

3. Cultivating diversity and combating bigotry are an inextricable part of the educational mission of the University; and

4. Fostering tolerance, sensitivity, and mutual respect throughout CUNY is beneficial to all members of the University community.

In their respective strategic plans, New York's neighbors to the east, **Connecticut** and **Massachusetts**, have each set the intention to diversify their educator workforce and are putting in place various laws, policies, and resources in support of their goals and objectives. For example:

- Massachusetts started with articulating a theory of action and ensuring a shared vision and shared language, then proceeded to set goals for improving workforce share, retention rates, and educator experiences as measured using surveys.
- As part of its Influence 100 campaign, Massachusetts has identified 31 districts that want to engage in intentional strategy development and execution around diversifying their educator workforce and is providing them with a robust array of technical and strategic support, including a community of practice that meets quarterly for two years, and exposure to cutting-edge national thought leadership.
- A Connecticut statute enacted in 2018 (PA 18-34) requires school districts to become more intentionally focused on developing and implementing a plan to diversify their educator workforce, and the <u>Connecticut State Department of Education's (CSDE) Talent</u> <u>Office</u> is developing and piloting an online guidebook designed to support districts in this work.
- To support the state's five-year plan to recruit, develop, and retain a highly-effective, diverse workforce, the CSDE, in collaboration with the Center for Public Research and

Leadership at Columbia Law School, has created an online resource library called <u>EdKnowledge</u>, where school districts, charter schools, educator preparation programs, and partner organizations throughout the state can submit models of success to be shared. The result is like a website version of the sections of this report cataloguing current efforts and listing resource documents.

2. Partner to build pathways in your region

Researchers have concluded that the preference new teachers demonstrate in seeking careers close to home suggests the potential benefits of local recruitment and training to attract more candidates into the teaching profession.¹²² To this end, the education sector should learn from and accelerate adoption of promising pathways approaches that have been evolving in other workforce sectors such as health, manufacturing, and technology. The core design elements, adapted from work by MDRC,¹²³ include:

- Focus on the shortage areas;
- Employer engagement to ensure aligned, connected programs;
- Transparent pathways and employer-validated credentials.

Employers—in this case, school districts and BOCES—need to partner with educator preparation institutions to:

- ✓ analyze their region's current and projected educator workforce needs, including the need to increase educator diversity;
- ✓ communicate those regional needs to students who are seeking career guidance;
- ✓ work in partnership to ensure that the region offers a comprehensive network of educator preparation pathways—including "Grow Your Own", alternative programs, and sustainably funded residencies—whose curricula are aligned with school districts' needs;
- ✓ collaborate to design and implement high quality work-based learning (i.e., student teaching and other clinical practice opportunities) for prospective educators.

In recent years, the Department has taken steps to incentivize and require partnerships between districts and educator preparation institutions. For example, the student teaching regulations recently adopted by the Board of Regents require partnership Memoranda of Understanding between districts and educator preparation institutions. Additionally, many of the State's grant programs require that applicants develop proposals in partnership between a district and an educator preparation program.

Consistent with these policies, educator preparation programs should develop articulation agreements with all community colleges in their regions to identify students enrolled in community college who may be interested in pursuing a career in education and provide them with an academic roadmap, specialized guidance, and support to successfully enter a preparation program and persist through certification. Further, educator preparation programs should consider actively recruiting beyond their regional feeder high schools to expand their outreach, and all institutions of higher education offering programs leading to certification should direct

resources that support the implementation of the educator preparation program's recruitment plans.

Survey Suggestions: Expand Early Recruitment and Pipeline Partnerships

The results of NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey indicate significant support for expanding early recruitment and Grow Your Own initiatives. When asked what would help improve the recruitment of candidates of color into educator preparation pathways, around 70% of educator preparation deans expressed support for early recruitment efforts, and 52% of superintendents agreed that recruitment of future educators should begin in middle or high school, as seen earlier in Figure 33.

Most survey respondents indicated support for expanding partnerships, particularly partnerships between and with postsecondary institutions to establish strong transfer pipelines. Sixty-four percent of educator preparation institution respondents also expressed support for expanding partnerships with community-based organizations for recruitment (see Figure 33).

Further, New York City, Buffalo, and now Long Island have Grow Your Own pathways for paraeducators, but such opportunities are not widely available. Two-thirds of educator preparation institutions and BOCES District Superintendents would support strengthening such cooperative approaches (see Figure 33).

Current Efforts: "Grow Your Own" Initiatives

Districts and educator preparation institutions in several New York regions and neighboring states have established cooperative approaches to recruiting local, qualified individuals into educator preparation programs. These initiatives, often called "Grow Your Own" programs, focus on identifying individuals within local communities who would make effective teachers and providing exposure and pathways into the field, generally through established partnerships with educator preparation programs. Grow Your Own programs reflect the racial and linguistic diversity of their local regions and are tailored to meet the needs of the communities they serve.¹²⁴ They differ from other alternative pathways because of their explicit commitment to bringing new, underrepresented minority group candidates–who are often first-generation college students—into the teaching profession.¹²⁵ Research has found that participants in such initiatives have a higher likelihood of working in their local region following graduation.¹²⁶

Recently, the New York Association of Colleges of Teacher Education and the New York State Association of Teacher Educators began affording time and space at their annual conference for meetings of the Coalition of Urban Teacher Education and Development (C-UTED), a working group focused on issues in urban teacher education and development. Coalition members come primarily from upstate communities, ranging from Poughkeepsie and Utica to Syracuse and Buffalo. In 2019, C-UTED led a plenary session moderated by Marcelle Haddix, chair of the Reading and Language Arts department in the Syracuse University School of Education. The topic was how policies and programs in teacher education intersect with the goals of increasing teacher diversity and improving the conditions of schooling in urban areas. The discussion focused on the logistics, challenges, and benefits of collaboration between educator preparation programs and urban schools and districts. Panelists noted that a shared commitment to addressing districts' educational needs has led to multilateral Grow-Your-Own partnerships among entities that would ordinarily be viewed as competitors. For example, SUNY Oswego and Syracuse University both partner with Syracuse City School District in a strategic initiative aimed at increasing teacher diversity, as highlighted below.

Efforts to recruit P-12 students into education pathways range from Educators Rising chapters to formal CTE programs. Superintendents indicated that because Grow Your Own programs prepare candidates for the local educational environment, educators are more inclined to return and stay. Many educator preparation deans also indicated that early recruitment efforts were especially relevant for improving the diversity of the pipeline, particularly among urban youth. Several educator preparation programs say they have outreach programs targeted at middle and high school students, with the goal of attracting more students into the educator workforce.

- **Capital Region**—Questar III BOCES's Academy for Educational Careers is a program focused on preparing students for a career in education, developed with the intention of attracting minority students into the field. The program is conducting targeted recruitment in districts with large populations of minority students and English Language Learners. In the early grades, the program is working to develop workshops and events to expose students to education as a profession and get them involved in their own schools with their current teachers. At the high school level, seniors are given the opportunity to spend a half-day at the University at Albany and complete college courses directly applicable to a variety of educational careers, including the content required for Level 1 Teaching Assistant certification. Along with coursework, participating students will also engage in hands-on experiences, such as observations and internships, while being supported for a successful transition from high school to college.
- **Central New York**—Ithaca City School District identifies current high school students with the potential to make good teachers, then supports them with mentoring and tracks them throughout their college careers. The district's fundraising arm is developing an Aspiring Educators Award Program, which will provide college scholarships to these candidates.¹²⁷

Syracuse City School District is partnering with two different educator preparation institutions to create supportive <u>Pathways for Teachers</u>:

- SUNY Oswego—recruits diverse candidates from Syracuse-area high schools, prepares them for initial certification, and places students in high-need schools to complete internships.
- Syracuse University—partnered with SCSD to provide free master's degrees to urban educators who commit to teaching for 5 years in Syracuse schools.
- Hudson Valley—Marist College has an ongoing partnership with the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education's Holmes Cadet Program, which strives to diversify the teacher pipeline. In support of this goal, Marist College's Education Department hosts groups of schoolchildren from a local elementary school to expose them to college campuses and encourage them to consider teaching as a career, particularly among students from underrepresented groups.¹²⁸
Marist College has also developed a thriving partnership with the Beacon City School District, known as the Beacon Learn, Educate, Aspire, and Diversify (LEAD) Scholars Program. The LEAD Scholars Program began as a Grow Your Own initiative to encourage underrepresented high school students to enter college and, ideally, pursue teacher education.¹²⁹

- Long Island—The Education Academy is a partnership between Baldwin Union Free School District and Molloy College's School of Education that provides a pathway for diverse students to become educators on an accelerated track. The goal of the program is to prepare future teachers who are representative of the diversity of the community and who will eventually return as certified teachers for Baldwin schools. Through the partnership, Baldwin High School students have the opportunity to begin their career as an educator in the 9th grade, continue their experiences through grade 12, and then enter Molloy College with sophomore standing. Students "participate in collaborative, rigorous, purposeful, differentiated, and student-centered experiences within the field of education" during the program. The Education Academy pathway is designed to support these students through New York State teacher certification and bring them back to the community as qualified educators, while also allowing Molloy College teacher candidates to be immersed in K-12 school cultures as part of the partnership.
- New York City—The Borough of Manhattan Community College's (BMCC/CUNY) Teacher Education department's grant-funded partnership with P.S. 125 (the Ralph Bunche School) has transformed P.S. 125 into a more diverse, progressive, model school, while also providing BMCC's underserved teacher education students with field experiences in a more diverse setting. Through this comprehensive partnership, BMCC teacher education faculty mentor P.S. 125 in-service teachers, while BMCC teacher education students complete their fieldwork in a diverse district. Preliminary results from the three-year program have shown that four-year retention increases by ten percentage points, on average, among students who complete their fieldwork in a diverse setting. A goal of the partnership is to improve the pipeline for underserved community college students to become New York City teachers.

Columbia University's partnership with the Harlem schools has the "long-term goal of building a two-way pipeline: connecting Teachers College graduates with teaching positions in Harlem schools *and* connecting Harlem children, educators, and community members with access to (and a voice within) the Columbia University system."

Today's Students Tomorrow's Teachers (TSTT) launched a <u>Male Teacher of Color Initiative</u> in the Fall of 2012 to increase the number of male teachers in the workforce by improving high school graduation rates and college preparation in partner schools at the Bronx Academy for Health Careers, the Eagle Academy for Young Men, and the Leadership Academy for Young men in Rochester City. Through this initiative, TSTT provides "a unique and exceptional set of services and educational activities" to ensure these students graduate from high school and are prepared for postsecondary education. NYC Leadership Academy (NYCLA) was selected by the state of Massachusetts "to support and develop a racially and ethnically diverse cohort of aspiring district leaders" as part of the Massachusetts Department of Elementary and Secondary Education's Influence 100 pilot project, launched on October 11, 2019. Influence 100 aims to increase the diversity of superintendents in Massachusetts by building the capacity of a racially and ethnically diverse group of educators aspiring to enter a district leadership role within the next 5 years. NYCLA is working with Massachusetts state officials to develop an "equity-infused leadership curriculum" for participants in this 2-year fellowship program, which includes support for earning Massachusetts superintendent certification.

Western New York—Seeking to create a sustainable grow-your-own pathway, SUNY Buffalo State partnered with Buffalo Public Schools to create a CTE program called <u>Urban Teacher Academy</u>, which they plan to submit to NYSED for formal approval once the full four-year curriculum is finalized and reviewed. In its second year, the program increases student exposure to the teaching profession with the goal of developing "a diverse generation of educators." Participating high school students complete the workshops required for teacher certification¹³⁰ and earn 3 to 12 college credits in courses such as "School and Society" and "Nature and Needs of Students with Special Needs." Program coordinators are seeking to encourage participants to eventually enroll in a teacher preparation program at Buff State, where they hope to offer grant-subsidized on-campus housing and create a "living learning community."

Rochester City School District's <u>Teaching and Learning Institute</u> (TLI) has operated out of East High School for over 20 years. TLI is tailored for students interested in pursuing a career in education with a stated objective of diversifying the local teacher market by preparing students from the community for entry into the educator workforce. TLI exposes high school students to teaching experiences and a rigorous curriculum prior to postsecondary enrollment while also engaging these youth in active involvement with the local community, including field studies within the Rochester City School District and panel discussions on Urban Education.

In **Massachusetts**, the <u>InSPIRED Fellowship</u> provides \$1,500 stipends to current educators who are selected based on their ability to connect with students in their school community (e.g., because of roots in the community, language skills, or having been a first-generation college student) and their commitment to increasing the racial and ethnic diversity of the teacher workforce by recruiting high school and college students into the teaching profession. Fellows participate in outreach meet-ups and follow-up communication with student recruits. In addition to recruiting potential educators, the program aims to increase the retention rates of current educators committed to a culturally responsive and diverse workforce.

Partnerships to create pathways for paraprofessionals, teacher aides and teaching assistants have been created in several places around New York State:

• **Central New York**—Roberts Wesleyan College partners with Monroe-2-Orleans BOCES and area districts to offer an accelerated *Pathway to Teaching* program for non-

traditional students, including career changers and teaching assistants, that provides flexibility for students to complete the program while continuing to earn an income.

- Long Island—Western Suffolk BOCES is in the early stages of implementing a state-funded Teacher Diversity Pipeline Pilot designed to develop an innovative, supportive pathway for teacher aides and teaching assistants to become certified teachers, thereby increasing the diversity of the teaching force in high-need districts and schools in the region. The first cohort of students will begin in January 2020.
- **New York City**—CUNY's <u>Leap to Teacher</u> program provides the following supports to para-educators pursuing teacher certification:
 - Free CUNY entrance exam preparation classes;
 - Credit-bearing enhanced English and math classes;
 - Academic and career advisement;
 - Tutoring, writing support, and free certification preparation workshops;
 - Career advisement;
 - Assistance with financial aid and grant opportunities; and
 - Information on NYCDOE vouchers and reimbursement program.

The United Federation of Teachers' <u>Career Training Program</u> provides eligible paraprofessionals with the opportunity to complete teacher preparation and certification requirements. Benefits offered include:

- Tuition for up to 6 credits per semester for undergraduate study;
- Graduate tuition reimbursement;
- 2.5 hours per week of release time;
- Summer stipend;
- 40-day paid leave of absence to complete student teaching; and
- Up to \$400 to reimburse the cost of certification exams.
- Western New York—SUNY Buffalo State actively works to recruit talented paraprofessionals, teacher aides, and teaching assistants who are working in local classrooms and support them along the path to teacher certification. The Buffalo Urban Teachers Pipeline Residency Program, which was recently awarded a half million dollars in state funding, has recruited 27 individuals into the undergraduate-level and 16 into the graduate-level program. The program provides flexibility in course scheduling and incorporates the "real time" field work of paraprofessionals into the curriculum, thereby allowing these future teachers to pursue certification without surrendering their placements in classrooms. Drawing on local talent increases the likelihood that these new teachers will choose to stay in Buffalo Public Schools, thus supporting retention and improving the quality of the local teacher workforce.

Western Suffolk BOCES's and Buffalo's state-funded Teacher Diversity Pipeline programs for teacher aides and teaching assistants are included on the map in Figure 39.

Current Efforts: Alternative Preparation Pathways, Recruitment from Other Disciplines

Educator preparation programs in New York State are also recruiting across disciplines and other institutions to encourage students who have not self-selected into an educator preparation program to consider a career in teaching. Clarkson University, Manhattan College, and NYC Teaching Fellows each have educator preparation programs that recruit candidates from other careers and professions into the teacher workforce. Teachers College has been working to improve access to teacher pathways for students who may be considering a career in teaching, but not yet enrolled in an educator preparation program. Through its Teaching Residents at Teachers College (TR@TC) program, Teachers College has established a partnership with John Jay College of Criminal Justice to expose students to the teaching profession. Suzanne Pratt, codirector of TR@TC, explains that John Jay "undergraduate students are able to participate in TR@TC summer programming" through this partnership, in which they work "alongside NYC public school teachers to enact hands-on field-based learning with high school students" and consider whether the teaching "pathway is a good fit for them." Further, Pratt explains that partnering with neighboring programs allows Teachers College to "prioritize local students who want to contribute to their local communities" thereby strengthening the local teacher labor market and increasing the likelihood that these new teachers will stay in the local schools throughout their careers.

New York State provides multiple pathways to licensure for teaching candidates, including a system of transitional certificates, which provide opportunities for alternative routes into teaching often for individuals with advanced degrees and career-changers, such as:

- 1. Transitional A Certification for individuals in a specific career and technical title with requisite occupational experience
- 2. Transitional B Certification or Alternative Preparation Programs, which are the equivalent of traditional preparation programs but offered in a different format
- 3. Transitional C Certification for individuals with a graduate-level degree and enrolled in a graduate-level preparation program
- 4. Transitional G Certification for college professors with graduate degrees in the STEM fields and successful experience teaching at the collegiate level

These alternative teacher preparation program pathways are equivalent to New York State's traditional programs in content but offered in a different format with the goal of increasing the number of qualified teachers in hard-to-staff subject areas. Compared to traditional educator preparation programs, New York State's alternative, IHE-based educator preparation programs¹³¹ have made significant gains in closing the racial/ethnic gap among enrollees. Figure 35 shows that in the 2016-17 academic year, the majority of alternative, IHE-based educator preparation program enrollees were students of color, with nearly 50% of enrollment composed of Black or African American and Hispanic or Latino students combined.

Figure 35: Alternative, IHE-based educator preparation programs are closing the diversity gap.



Percentages are of races and ethnicities reported. Missing data on alternative, IHE-based programs compared to traditional educator preparation programs for the 2012-13 academic year. Source: "Title II Reports: National Teacher Preparation Data." United States Department of Education. Data are as of 07/01/2019.



Percentages are of races and ethnicities reported. Missing data on alternative, IHE-based programs compared to traditional educator preparation programs for the 2012-13 academic year. Source: "Title II Reports: National Teacher Preparation Data." United States Department of Education. Data are as of 07/01/2019.

Page 77 of 206

However, Table 2 shows traditional educator preparation programs in New York State enroll more than 10 times as many students as alternative, IHE-based programs. In the 2016-17 academic year, New York State's alternative educator preparation programs enrolled only 3,021 students compared to the 30,697 students in traditional educator preparation programs. Despite Black or African American and Hispanic or Latino pre-service teachers accounting for nearly 50% of alternative program enrollment combined, New York State's traditional programs still enroll nearly six times as many Black or African American and Hispanic or Latino pre-service teachers accounting for nearly 50% of alternative program enrollment combined, New York State's traditional programs still enroll nearly six times as many Black or African American and Hispanic or Latino students as alternative, IHE-based programs.

| Alternative, IHE-based Educator Preparation Program Enrollment | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|-------------------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------|--|-------|--------------|--|--|--|--|--|
| Year | American Indian or Alaska Native | Black or African American | Hispanic or Latino | Asian or Native Hawaiian / Pacific Islander | White | Multi-Racial | Sum Total of Identified Races/Ethnicities | | | | |
| 2010-11 | 15 | 439 | 444 | 260 | 2,334 | 131 | 3,623 | | | | |
| 2011-12 | 19 | 401 | 405 | 299 | 2,169 | 84 | 3,377 | | | | |
| 2013-14 | 7 | 365 | 219 | 85 | 944 | 27 | 1,647 | | | | |
| 2014-15 | 7 | 507 | 352 | 155 | 1,070 | 76 | 2,167 | | | | |
| 2015-16 | 4 | 622 | 535 | 144 | 1,140 | 173 | 2,618 | | | | |
| 2016-17 | 7 | 746 | 736 | 174 | 1,203 | 155 | 3,021 | | | | |

Table 2: New York State's traditional preparation programs enroll 10 times as many students as alternative programs

| Traditional Educator Preparation Program Enrollment | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|-------------------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------|--|--------|--------------|--|--|--|--|
| Year | American Indian or Alaska Native | Black or African American | Hispanic or Latino | Asian or Native Hawaiian / Pacific Islander | White | Multi-Racial | Sum Total of Identified Races/Ethnicities | | | |
| 2010-11 | 177 | 5,003 | 5,830 | 2,772 | 47,060 | 690 | 61,532 | | | |
| 2011-12 | 149 | 4,815 | 6,035 | 2,599 | 38,216 | 948 | 52,762 | | | |
| 2013-14 | 109 | 3,414 | 5,285 | 2,075 | 23,921 | 669 | 35,473 | | | |
| 2014-15 | 111 | 3,217 | 4,895 | 2,016 | 22,301 | 991 | 33,531 | | | |
| 2015-16 | 116 | 3,564 | 5,308 | 2,431 | 21,293 | 1,466 | 34,178 | | | |
| 2016-17 | 107 | 3,133 | 5,076 | 2,168 | 19,398 | 815 | 30,697 | | | |

Missing data on alternative, IHE-based programs compared to traditional educator preparation programs for the 2012-13 academic year. Source: "Title II Reports: National Teacher Preparation Data." United States Department of Education. Data are as of 07/01/2019.

Alternative, IHE-based preparation programs that provide a flexible pathway for career changers are accessible downstate and in Western New York but limited—if not entirely absent—in other regions of the state. Figure 36 shows that 12 of the 19 alternative preparation program providers in 2016-17 were located in New York City. For the 2016-17 academic year, four Regent districts did not contain an alternative program provider.





Source: "Title II Reports: National Teacher Preparation Data." United States Department of Education. Data are as of 07/01/2019.

One such program, the <u>New York City Teaching Collaborative</u>, has as its stated purpose to prepare "individuals from diverse backgrounds to teach in high-need schools." The program includes residency-style training with mentor teachers and four months of intensive coaching prior to placement as teacher of record. According to the program website, a "cohort model provides a tight-knit community of support from other teachers."

Significant funding exists through the Teachers of Tomorrow program to reimburse the educational expenses of teachers who pursue alternative pathways, but few are able to take advantage of this opportunity in most parts of the state.

In neighboring **Connecticut**, the state's partnership with the U.S. Department of Education's Teach.org initiative has been successful at increasing the enrollment of candidates of color, particularly in alternative preparation programs.

3. Establish supports to enable candidates to clear the hurdles and overcome challenges

Educator preparation programs across New York State need to become more focused on ensuring that students of color persist through program completion and certification. No candidate should feel unsupported or unable to succeed in their programs, placements, and certification exams. To that end, educator preparation programs and their broader institutions of higher education need to be accountable for the persistence of students of color through student teaching, program completion and certification, as well as their success in finding employment and their smooth induction into the profession.

Districts and schools need to ensure that their counseling staff is aware of the kinds of programs that students may be eligible for if they enroll in an educator preparation program, such as teacher loan forgiveness programs. In turn, potential enrollees should be made aware of any programs they may be eligible for, such as TOC II or HEOP, which can help provide the necessary academic and financial support to help ensure their success, especially students who may not otherwise be admitted.

Survey Suggestions: Financial Investments

The cost of education has been consistently cited as a leading barrier to entry and hurdle to completion of educator preparation programs and certification in New York State—and nationwide. For many prospective educators, particularly candidates of color, the ability to pay has served to deter even those with a desire to teach from pursuing certification, or from considering additional certification as a future school leader. Research suggests that from local districts to State leaders, all levels of decision-making should consider pursuing options for alleviating the financial burden of completing an educator preparation program that prevent students from all backgrounds from entering the teaching profession.¹³²

The largest state-level program targeting educators, Teachers of Tomorrow, provides high-need school districts \$25 million annually in tuition reimbursement and other incentives to lure teachers of shortage subjects, but the legislation and application materials for this program currently do not mention diversity.

In NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey, educator preparation deans were especially adamant about financial investments in encouraging students of color to enter educator preparation programs, with 91% indicating that financial incentives for the candidates in the form of scholarships, stipends, or loan forgiveness would benefit recruitment efforts (Figure 33). Eighty-seven percent of responding educator preparation deans suggested that exam fee waivers would support candidates of color in completing certification (see Figure 37).

When asked their opinion on improving the retention of educator candidates of color through educator preparation program completion and certification, educator preparation deans indicated supports were needed across the board. Ninety-three percent of educator preparation deans believed that tuition support and/or loan forgiveness would again be most beneficial, as seen in Figure 37. P-12 superintendents and BOCES District Superintendents likewise cited tuition support as the top area for improvement.

In your opinion, which of the following would most help to improve the retention of educator candidates of color through educator preparation program completion and certification?



NYSED Educator Diversity Survey, 2019

The final section of NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey was composed of optional questions for respondents to share their opinion on the supports they felt educator candidates of color need most to enter and persist through the pipeline. These optional questions received a 93% response rate from survey participants overall. Respondents were asked to select all that apply.

The Learning Policy Institute found that several states are taking steps to support students of color into educator preparation programs and through completion through financial investments in the form of service scholarships and loan forgiveness programs. **North Carolina** recently relaunched its Teaching Fellows Program, which is a service scholarship that provides over \$8,000 annually to fellows for four years in exchange for a 4-year commitment to teach. North Carolina's Teaching Fellows Program was previously in operation from 1986 to 2015, during which time it prepared 11,000 teachers, disproportionately representing males, teachers of color, and math and science teachers, with high retention rates among graduates of the program. For more information on national efforts see Appendix C: Literature Review and Examples, Part 2: Promising Practices and State Policy Examples.

Survey Suggestions: Encouraging Persistence through Completion

In 2016, the TeachNY Advisory Council suggested that campuses should strive to be flexible and innovative, so they can schedule and structure classes, labs, and field experiences in ways that make preparation programs more attractive and accessible.¹³³ NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey revealed that 64% of educator preparation deans and 51% of District Superintendents expressed support for improving the flexibility of course scheduling and delivery, as seen earlier in Figure 37. Survey respondents also expressed strong support for improving mentoring and coaching programs for retaining candidates of color through program completion and certification, with roughly 80% of both educator preparation deans and District Superintendents and just over 50% of P-12 superintendents selecting mentorship/coaching as a needed improvement (see Figure 37).

Figure 37 also shows that 62% of District Superintendents and 85% of educator preparation deans believed that partnerships between programs and school districts that provide direct employment pipelines would most help to improve the retention of educator candidates of color through program completion and certification. Eighty-one percent of deans further indicated that improving culturally relevant and responsive services, content, and pedagogy in educator preparation programs would support the persistence of educators of color through program completion. Roughly 50% of District Superintendents and 28% of P-12 superintendents agree, though they express less support for improving postsecondary faculty diversity. In contrast, 65% of educator preparation deans felt faculty diversity needed to be addressed to support future educators of color (see Figure 37).

However, only 37% of educator preparation deans indicated that postsecondary faculty diversity is a focus for preparing and retaining educators of color through program completion in their programs or institutions. Figure 38 shows that educator preparation programs most commonly offer academic advising and support, such as tutoring, to candidates of color, as well as culturally responsive content and field placements within districts committed to diversifying their workforce. Fifty-seven percent of educator preparation deans indicated that tuition scholarships and loan forgiveness were also used to encourage students of color persistence through program completion and certification.

Figure 38: Question #17, Educator Preparation Deans

Which of the following does your program use with the goal of preparing and retaining educator candidates of color through program completion and certification?



Responses listed highest-to-lowest by "Students of Color" Respondents were asked to select all that apply NYSED Educator Diversity Survey, 2019 One respondent suggested that enrollment needs to increase in teacher preparation programs in order to encourage more candidates outside of their regional markets: "If the volume of candidates [is] low, there are fewer candidates willing to relocate to suburban school districts away from large metropolitan areas." Alongside the emphasis on reinvigorating regional teacher markets, another respondent added that educator preparation programs should focus on "the untapped opportunity with current NYS residents" to improve the flow of educators through the pipeline.

One survey respondent suggested that the State could play a role in encouraging more candidates into educator preparation programs through clearer communication of pathways and requirements for educators, while other superintendents suggested that New York State certification requirements should be restructured and adjusted to make entry into the teacher workforce more feasible, noting that stringent and changing certification requirements "inhibits people from pursuit of educational careers" and the teacher workforce could benefit from allowing "professional experience to qualify in place of Educational degrees."

Current Efforts: Supportive Preparation Models

Most educator preparation institutions indicate that they provide some form of targeted supports for students of color, as seen earlier in Figure 38. Supportive preparation models include, but are not limited to, stipended residency programs. The most commonly provided supports include academic advising and support; culturally relevant services and content; field placements in districts that are committed to diversity; scholarships and loan forgiveness; and mentorship and coaching. The following examples demonstrate various ways by which districts and institutions of higher education are supporting pre-service and prospective educators through preparation programs.

• **Statewide**—Bank Street College of Education's strives to find financial support for prospective teachers to engage in high-quality paid clinical residencies through *Prepared to Teach*—*NY*, a nationwide network aimed at addressing diversity and quality issues throughout the educator pipeline.¹³⁴

To defray exam costs for economically disadvantaged candidates, the Department allocates 3,000 free exam vouchers annually to educator preparation programs across the state (1,000 vouchers for each of the three required exams). If the Department becomes aware of a student struggling to pay for the assessments, vouchers can also be provided directly. Furthermore, over half of educator preparation institutions indicated that they sponsor exam fee or fingerprinting cost waivers or stipends for their students (see Figure 44).

 Capital Region—The College of St. Rose's evidence-based Academic Coaching for Educator Success (ACES) program works to identify and provide GPA supports to students struggling to meet the minimum requirements for persistence in educator preparation programs based on the belief that many of these students may have left high school with inadequate preparation.¹³⁵ The University at Albany's School of Education has instituted the <u>Touhey Family Fellows</u> <u>Program</u> "to aid the Albany area in diversifying the teaching and counseling professions." The program is intended to create a pipeline of graduates with underrepresented backgrounds to pursue advanced degrees in education and mental health then, ideally, enter the Albany public school system. Fellows are each provided \$1,000 over two semesters to help with tuition costs while they receive the mentoring of graduate students and collaboration with School of Education faculty, among other experiences and supports. Faculty director Tammy Ellis-Robinson describes the program as:

"K-12 educators, University faculty, graduate students and undergraduates working together to promote and provide supportive, effective and equitable educational experiences through mentorship and reciprocal engagement."

- Capital Region & North Country—<u>The Classroom Academy</u> is a pilot teacher residency program funded with a grant from the National Education Association, designed to advance effective teaching, student learning, and financial sustainability. The program has a unique partnership model that is based in shared governance and collective ownership so that districts have an equal voice at the table with institutions of higher education. Partners have included SUNY Plattsburgh, Washington-Saratoga-Warren-Hamilton-Essex BOCES, and five districts in the Capital Region and North Country as the program was being piloted. For the 2019-20 academic year, The Classroom Academy expanded its partnerships to add SUNY Empire State College and The Sage Colleges as well as engage a highly diverse urban district.
- **Central New York**—The University of Rochester's accelerated program for aspiring teachers lacking classroom experience targets improvements in culturally responsive practices and effective approaches to all students' needs.¹³⁶
- New York City—Monroe College has developed an approach they say has been successful in enabling TOC II candidates to pass their certification exams before graduation. This multi-pronged system includes the following elements:
 - requiring that students take the exams according to a clear timeline, correlated with when the content is taught, in order to move forward;
 - creating learning communities to support studying for the exams;
 - $\circ~$ providing multiple supports to build students' math skills in preparation for the Content Specialty Test; and
 - establishing the expectation that students who do not pass on the first attempt will persevere and re-take the exams.
- North Country & Western New York—SUNY's Native American Initiative works to recruit and retain Native American students into higher education through a postsecondary consortium between SUNY Fredonia and SUNY Potsdam. These programs in Western New York and the North Country have come together with the support of SUNY System Administration to address the specific educational needs of Native American students

through a focus on student support services, such as campus and community involvement, student development, counseling, networking, and academic support.¹³⁷

Certain financial aid and educational opportunity programs can help candidates pay for certification exams as well. For example, the Higher Education Opportunity Program (HEOP) can cover certification exam costs for undergraduates. HEOP is designed to support academically and economically disadvantaged students and does not have any specific diversity focus.¹³⁸ However, while HEOP students are not identified by race or ethnicity, three-quarters of the students served are Black or African American or Hispanic or Latino, making the program a notable resource for students of color.

- Western New York—Canisius College's <u>Western New York Teacher Residency</u>, a master's level program in which more than half of the enrollees are of color, provides a range of supports for participants, including:
 - a scholarship that covers 30% of graduate tuition;
 - a "living wage stipend" of approximately \$20,000, provided through partnerships with <u>local charter schools</u>;
 - childcare during evening classes;
 - tutoring;
 - discounted on-campus housing;
 - \circ $\;$ priority hiring status upon completion of the program; and
 - membership in TeachersConnect, an online peer network for teachers to share ideas, ask questions, and collaborate with other teachers and provide support and resources to help teachers succeed in the classroom.

In **Massachusetts**, the <u>Boston Teacher Residency (BTR)</u> program, formed in 2002, set the commitment to graduating cohorts comprised of 50% people of color. BTR was designed and implemented to address pressing issues in Boston's teacher pipeline, including:

- A shortage of people of color entering the teacher workforce;
- Teacher shortages in high-need areas, such as Math, Science, Special Education, and English to Speakers of Other Languages; and
- High turnover of novice teachers entering Boston Public Schools.

BTR current graduates are 49% people of color, with 35% identifying as Black or Latinx. Residents engage in a year-long mentoring experience while receiving a living stipend, tuition remittance, and ongoing professional development, and commit to teaching in Boston Public Schools for three years. BTR residents have proven to be far more likely to remain in Boston Public Schools after three years, with 71% of graduates continuing to teach in these schools through year six. BTR residents were also found twice as likely to be rated as "Exemplary" in Massachusetts in 2014-15.¹³⁹

Current Efforts: Teacher Opportunity Corps

Since 1987, New York State's Teacher Opportunity Corps (TOC) program has awarded grants to educator preparation institutions to increase the number of historically underrepresented and economically disadvantaged individuals in teaching careers. TOC programs accomplish this goal by conducting targeted recruitment and providing financial and other supports. With increased funding of \$3 million per year under New York State's *My Brother's Keeper* initiative, there are now 16 Teacher Opportunity Corps II (TOC II) programs serving more than 500 teacher candidates at the undergraduate and graduate level. Figure 39 shows that 9 of the 16 TOC II programs are located in New York City.

Figure 39: Most state-funded diversity programs are located in New York City



Source: New York State Education Department.

The program requires participating educator preparation institutions to partner with local education agencies so that candidates can complete their internships in high-need schools. In the most recent academic year, TOC II programs had partnerships with more than 50 schools and districts throughout the state. Responding to NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey, Clarkson

University reported that its most successful recruitment mechanism has been its partnership with a local district committed to increasing the recruitment and retention of teachers of color. Through these partnerships, Clarkson has been particularly successful in attracting men of color into the teaching profession.

Ideally, these programs work with their institution's admissions office to offer TOC II funding to eligible candidates at the admission point, with the goal of attracting students of color to enroll in the institution and opt for an educator preparation program. TOC II's intentional approach can be a selling point for candidates. "In each and every recruitment effort," said one TOC II program director in responding to NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey, "we emphasize the spirit of TOC, which ... is support and affirmation for students of color and students from backgrounds that are underrepresented in New York State. When prospects understand that the TOC program is truly here to affirm their experiences and support them [in the program] and beyond, we find that they are eager to apply." The next step is to "meet with prospects one on one" and "take the time to learn about their goals and co-determine whether TOC might be a fit for their program and their schedule."

Even with state funding and an explicit goal of recruiting candidates of color, however, it can be challenging to do so. "We've discovered that some of our TOC applicants do not have reliable access to a computer during TC's summer break, which limits their ability to respond to emails regarding their TOC application," wrote Columbia University Teachers College's TOC II director. The solution, she has found, is to be persistent and take a personalized approach to outreach. "On multiple occasions, a direct phone call has given us access to an engaged and talented applicant who we otherwise would have assumed was uninterested in the program."

Once candidates enroll in TOC II, they receive a range of supports to encourage program completion. For example, SUNY Oswego's TOC II program provides tuition assistance, a stipend for books, transportation or travel reimbursement for clinical experiences, support to pay for certification exams, and other services.¹⁴⁰

TOC II provides students and recent graduates with a variety of support. Survey respondents pointed to personalized mentoring, group programming that is responsive to their graduates' interests and needs, and other supports to ensure that new teachers successfully transition into the classroom and are encouraged to stay. One key component is a mentor from the college and/or P-12 school. Dennis Richmond, Jr., a recent Sarah Lawrence graduate, credits his family and his TOC II mentor/host teacher for providing him with the support necessary to complete his studies.

"Mr. Curtis is a phenomenal educator. He has a huge grasp on technology, he understands each of his student's motivation, <u>and</u> he's an author. In fact, he's an award-winning author. Between my family and Mr. Curtis, **I felt, and I continue to feel, unstoppable as an educator**."

—Dennis Richmond, Jr., Sarah Lawrence TOC II graduate

Survey Findings: Recruitment of and Support for Paraprofessionals

Paraprofessionals, teacher aides, teaching assistants, substitute teachers, and coaches have been cited as critical populations that should be targeted for recruiting new teachers and supporting them through certification because they already possess a desire to teach and experience in schools and classrooms.

P-12 districts and BOCES regions are working to encourage paraprofessionals, teacher aides, and teaching assistants, and experienced substitute teachers to pursue teacher certification, as well as in-service teachers to pursue leader certification. NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey revealed that 97% of BOCES regions encourage paraprofessionals and/or teachers to pursue additional certification and career advancement. P-12 superintendents largely cited salary adjustments or financial incentives/tuition reimbursement, in-service credit attainment, mentoring and learning opportunities as available supports for educators to pursue career advancement through teacher or leader certification. Some districts explained more structured practices, such as credit attainment, while others suggested that supports were offered informally as needed.

Most of the support offered, however, is limited to mentorship/coaching, as seen in Figure 40. Over 50% of respondents indicated that mentorship is available to employees pursuing teacher certification, while the second highest support offered—flexible scheduling—is only offered by 22% of responding districts and BOCES regions combined. In contrast, financial support in any form are among the lowest options offered, with childcare and cost of living assistance not offered by any responding district or BOCES region statewide.

Figure 40: Question #33, P-12 Superintendents & BOCES District Superintendents

What supports does your district/school/BOCES offer to paraprofessionals [of color] to pursue teacher certification and/or teachers [of color] to pursue building or district leader certification?



NYSED Educator Diversity Survey, 2019

Schools, districts and preparation programs alike should ensure that their paraprofessionals, teacher aides, teaching assistants, and coaches have the support, opportunities, and flexibility they need to pursue teacher certification without having to give up their current sources of income. Likewise, in-service teachers pursuing additional or leader certification need to be afforded the same support.

Several educator preparation programs and districts across New York State are already making efforts to recruit and support these individuals through program completion and certification. Eighty-six percent of districts stated that they encourage current staff to pursue initial or additional certification and a majority of P-12 superintendents and District Superintendents indicated that financial supports for these individuals would be most effective in encouraging them to pursue teacher certification, as well as for certified teachers to pursue building or district leader certification, as seen in Figure 41.

Further, 62% of District Superintendents and nearly 50% of P-12 superintendents indicated that improving mentorship programs would benefit the persistence of professionals seeking initial or additional certification. Figure 41 shows that pathway supports into institutions of higher education was also considered an important area for improvement by District Superintendents, who indicated roughly two-thirds support for strengthening partnerships.

In your opinion, what supports would be most effective to encourage paraprofessionals [of color] to pursue teacher certification and/or teachers [of color] to puruse building or district leader certification?



Responses listed highest-to-lowest by "Districts" Respondents were asked to select all that apply NYSED Educator Diversity Survey, 2019 Nationally, **California** had a successful Paraprofessional Teacher Training Program in operation from 1995 to 2011 that prepared a total of 1,708 paraprofessionals for in-service teaching. Sixty-five percent of these graduates were candidates of color and bilingual and 92% were still employed in California public schools by the 13th year of the program's operation. In 2016 and 2017, California invested \$45 million in a revived "California Classified School Employee Teacher Credentialing Program" which is currently training 2,250 classified staff to become teachers. More than 50% of these enrollees identify as Black or Latino.¹⁴¹

4. Take an informed look at recruitment, admissions, and hiring practices

In 2019, educators of color participating in research conducted by the National Center for Suburban Studies at Hofstra University pointed out: "There's a need [for school districts] to recognize and address the attitudes, policies, politics and culture[s] that prevent the hiring and retention of minority teachers and administrators."¹⁴² Local schools and districts need to ensure their recruitment and hiring practices are culturally responsive and informed by best practices. Research shows that intentional preparation and hiring practices matched with ongoing support throughout the pipeline can improve the diversity of the teacher workforce by bringing more educators of color into the profession and encouraging them to stay.¹⁴³ However, these supports must begin with taking an informed look at current practices and being open to change.

Educators of color participating in research conducted by the National Center for Suburban Studies suggested that districts need to "do more than the minimum and get a little creative" to attract, recruit and retain educators of color.¹⁴⁴ Schools and districts that are overwhelmingly White and simply do not have educators of color applying to vacancies in their districts¹⁴⁵ need new approaches to incentivizing educators of color to break the mold and enter their schools with the confidence that these schools and districts will accept and support them throughout their career.

In a workgroup session at the 2019 NYSATE/NYACTE conference, C-UTED members discussed the fact that students of color need to see themselves in the teacher workforce. It was further suggested that having faculty of color and culturally-responsive faculty in educator preparation programs has positive effects on students of color's persistence and completion, because such faculty understand what students of color need and make them feel as though they belong in the program and classroom.

The role of leadership in hiring is critical. "In order for educator diversity to increase," says Brooklyn assistant principal Princess Francois, "it begins with having at least a few [educators of color] in a position to make [hiring decisions]. That will ultimately become a continuous cycle of leaders of color hiring teachers of color who can best serve our diverse population of students."

Educator preparation programs likewise need to take stock of their own diversity, how their institutions function, and if they are being intentional about bringing in and retaining people of color. IHEs can follow these same recommendations with their own faculty recruitment, interview, and hiring practices, as well as with their admissions and student support practices, to support diversity.¹⁴⁶ Educator preparation programs can also provide critical support for districts

struggling to attract any applicants of color by establishing pathways and partnerships and encouraging their graduates to consider these schools for future employment.

Current Efforts: Recruiting and Hiring Practices

There are numerous examples of higher education institutions and school districts taking steps to improve the diversity of their faculty and staff:

• **Statewide**—SUNY publishes an annual Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Data Brief to report on meeting its inclusion and diversity goals. SUNY also awards a series of diversity scholarships and grants to students statewide each year through its Graduate Diversity Fellowship Program, Empire State Diversity Honors Scholarship Program, Diversity Abroad Honors Scholarship Program, and Doctoral Diversity Fellowships in STEM.¹⁴⁷

For the 2017 academic year, SUNY reported that only 8% of their postsecondary faculty were teachers of color—positioning New York State's postsecondary education system as next to last in faculty diversity nationwide.¹⁴⁸ With these findings, in 2019 SUNY announced the start of its new diversity initiative: Promoting Recruitment, Opportunity, Diversity, Inclusion, and Growth (PRODI-G). <u>PRODI-G</u> aims to address the challenge of racial, ethnic and gender diversity among postsecondary faculty in SUNY institutions with the ambitious goal of doubling the number of historically underrepresented faculty at SUNY within the next decade, under the belief that "[i]ncreasing the representation of faculty members who understand, and have overcome, race- and gender-based barriers and biases is important to the success and well-being of our students."¹⁴⁹ The program is designed to increase racial and ethnic representation of overall postsecondary faculty, as well as specifically increase the number of women from all racial/ethnic backgrounds teaching science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM).

SUNY also has a highly competitive Faculty Diversity Program, which awards salary support for campuses to recruit outstanding, historically underrepresented scholars into their faculty.¹⁵⁰

- Capital Region—Schenectady City School District's school board created a new position focused on recruitment and diversity and charged that person with building relationships with historically black colleges and universities. The district also began tracking and publishing annual data on the diversity of new hires and retained staff in the district.¹⁵¹
- **Central New York**—Ithaca City School District's superintendent and school board have made increasing staff diversity a goal in their strategic plan.¹⁵²
- Long Island—Valley Stream Central School District 30 in Long Island has made diversity an explicit district objective, with goals of representation and inclusiveness consistently stated across the district's strategic plan, mission statement, and vision statement to ensure the longevity of its focus in district operations. In pursuit of such aims, Valley Stream 30 has been targeting "institutional roadblocks" such as hiring committees, whose diversity or lack thereof can influence the successful recruitment of teachers of color into the district.¹⁵³

- New York City—CUNY recognizes that a significant gap exists between the student diversity and faculty diversity on most of its campuses, despite 37% of its faculty having a minority background—twice the national average.¹⁵⁴ Still, the likelihood that a classroom on a CUNY campus is being led by a Black faculty member is only 12% and drops further to a 10% likelihood for Hispanic faculty members.¹⁵⁵ José Luis Cruz, Executive Vice Chancellor and Co-chair of the University's Faculty Diversity Working Group, points to the limited availability of faculty of color and slow pace of faculty openings across CUNY campuses as some of the barriers to diversifying their postsecondary faculty.¹⁵⁶ However, CUNY has been proactive in supporting its diverse faculty and emphasizing its commitment to diversity and inclusion through several initiatives, including:
 - <u>Diversifying CUNY's Leadership: A CUNY-Harvard Consortium</u>—a professional development program launched in 2017 in partnership among CUNY, the Harvard Graduate School of Education, and the Harvard Club of New York. The program is for CUNY faculty and staff interested in careers in higher education leadership with the aim of cultivating a diverse group of future leaders.
 - <u>CUNY Faculty Diversity Dialogues</u>—forums for CUNY administration, faculty and staff to build awareness around issues related to diversity and inclusion, including discussions on efforts to increase diversity through faculty and staff recruitment, retention and advancement.

Survey Findings: Educator Preparation Programs Recruitment Practices

Many educator preparation deans indicated that recruitment of students of color was centralized at the institution level, rather than targeted at attracting candidates of color specifically into the teaching profession. Twenty percent of respondents stated that they do not conduct any specific activities to recruit educator candidates of color, of which 43% indicated that recruitment is undertaken at the institution level through a centralized office and 14% indicated that they either do not have funding for targeted recruitment activities or do not target recruitment to specific groups.

As shown in Figure 42, NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey found that recruitment practices in higher education institutions are typically intended for all students, rather than targeted at students of color. Among those respondents who did indicate that their program or institution conduct targeted recruitment of students of color, the most common practice (41%) was having program representatives visit P-12 schools with the goal of recruiting students of color. Twenty-eight percent indicated they use flexible admissions practices with the goal of recruiting students of color.

Figure 42: Question #16, Educator Preparation Deans

Which of the following methods does your institution / program use with the goal of recruiting educator candidates [of color]?



Responses listed highest-to-lowest by "Students of Color" Respondents were asked to select all that apply NYSED Educator Diversity Survey, 2019 NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey found that 65% of educator preparation institutions track the success of their efforts to recruit and/or prepare and retain educator candidates of color. Several educator preparation deans commented that their programs participate in intentional recruitment efforts and activities to bring more students of color into the teacher pipeline. Figure 43 shows that educator preparation programs most commonly employ recruitment activities that target students already on campus.

Figure 43: Question #14, Educator Preparation Deans

Which of the following activities or programs does your educator preparation program conduct with the goal of recruiting educator candidates of color?



Respondents were asked to select all that apply NYSED Educator Diversity Survey, 2019

New York State's educator preparation programs are not only preparing future educators for the profession, but also supporting their entry into the field. Many educator preparation deans indicated they provided pre-service teachers with job-seeker preparation, such as mock interviews and placement support, while others cited partnerships with schools for placement and hiring preferences. Some programs commented that they waited for local school districts to share openings that can passed along to graduating seniors. Figure 44 shows that most of the supports offered to help students prepare for certification and secure job placements are folded into the program requirements or centralized within the institution.

What supports does your institution / program offer to help

Figure 44: Question #18, Educator Preparation Deans



Percentage of Respondents

Respondents were asked to select all that apply NYSED Educator Diversity Survey, 2019

Responses

Survey Findings: School/District Recruitment and Hiring Practices

Promising pre-service recruitment strategies and high-quality preparation supports work to bring diverse educators into the teaching profession. However, New York State's educator workforce will only diversify if these novice teachers successfully find their way into schools and classrooms statewide and are encouraged to stay.

NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey revealed that 37% of P-12 superintendents do not undertake any specific recruitment activities for educators of color, as shown in Figure 45. However, many other educators are actively working to improve the quality of New York State's educator pipeline and the attractiveness of the teaching profession for prospective teachers. Nearly half of all P-12 superintendents stated that they have consulted with peers on best practices for recruiting educators of color. Most P-12 superintendents cited informal conversations, networking, and outreach to colleges and state or national consultants as pathways to improving their knowledge and training on the most effective approaches for recruiting educators of color. One district indicated that meeting with "current staff of color" further supported their recruitment practices and options. BOCES support and resources were central to many of these outreach efforts, particularly through Teacher Recruitment and Diversity Recruitment Fairs. Seventeen percent of P-12 superintendents and 31% of BOCES District Superintendents indicated that they have requested support to improve their practices.

BOCES District Superintendents also commented on active efforts to ensure that advertisements for school/district job postings reach candidates of color and that local districts are consciously working to eliminate implicit biases from hiring processes. NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey revealed that many P-12 districts are engaged in dedicated and active efforts to improve the

cultural responsiveness of their teachers, as well as their hiring practices and school climates. Some districts commented that they have hired school equity or diversity leaders or reached out to other human resource consultants to support their efforts in improving their school climates and policies. Others stated that they have convened diversity task forces and advisory councils to review their current practices and make recommendations.

To complement the efforts of educator preparation

"We anticipate convening a Diversity Task Force for the 2019-2020 school year and thus we plan to track the success of our district's efforts to recruit educators of color."

> -New York State P-12 Superintendent

programs in supporting new teachers' entry into the field, 76% of BOCES District Superintendents and 38% of P-12 superintendents indicated that they attend postsecondary events at institutions of higher education with diverse student populations to recruit educators of color into their schools and districts, as seen in Figure 45. Further, many P-12 superintendents cited creating materials, such as job postings or school webpages, that reflect a commitment to diversity in their districts.





■ BOCES ■ Districts

Responses listed highest-to-lowest by "Districts" Respondents were asked to select all that apply NYSED Educator Diversity Survey, 2019

5. Induct, develop, retain, and promote effective educators of color

"From my personal experience, there is a different set of experiences you face as an educator and school leader of color. It was instrumental to receive that unique [mentoring] support from someone who looks like me and faced very similar experiences."

-Princess Francois, Assistant Principal and 2019 Milken Educator Award Recipient

For any new educator, it is important to know that they will be welcomed, respected, and supported in the workplace. This is particularly important for educators of color entering an environment where they may feel different and isolated. To improve the retention of high-quality educators of color in the profession, local schools, districts, BOCES, and educator preparation programs need to collaborate to strengthen and expand their mentoring programs and induction supports, be committed to improving the working environment for educators of color and provide career ladders to extend leadership opportunities and pathways to effective educators of color.

Survey Suggestions: Improving Working Environments for Educators of Color

Culturally responsive school climates and thriving peer support networks can attract educators of color into districts and schools and encourage them to stay. Nearly 50% of District Superintendents and 33% of P-12 superintendents indicated that increasing the diversity of school district and/or building leadership would most help improve the recruitment and retention of educators of color in districts and classrooms, while almost 60% of district superintendents also indicated that culturally relevant professional development and curricula would further improve the working environment for educators of color (Figure 34).

Peer support networks, such as affinity peer support groups and cohorts, were also cited by survey respondents as beneficial for helping educators of color enter and persist in districts and classrooms. As seen earlier in Figure 34, 59% of District Superintendents and 45% of P-12 superintendents supported such strategies.

Survey Suggestions: Mentorship and Induction

Scholars suggest that school districts would benefit from stronger new teacher induction programs and ongoing mentorship to support the retention of teachers of color.¹⁵⁷ In New York State, new teachers are required to complete a one-year mentorship upon hire in any district. New York State's ESSA Plan (2017) emphasized the need to improve the consistency and quality of the required mentoring statewide and NYSED's call to districts and BOCES to develop mentoring programs with differentiated supports to enable new teachers and school leaders to succeed.¹⁵⁸ Nearly 80% of educator preparation deans and District Superintendents and 59% of P-12 superintendents believed that mentorship and/or coaching would most help to improve the recruitment and retention of educators of color in districts and classrooms (Figure 34).

Several states have comprehensive new induction system in operation nationwide. **Delaware**, for example, requires all new teachers participate in a 4-year induction and mentoring program in order to advance their license. Delaware's Comprehensive Induction Program includes weekly

meetings, eight observed lessons each year for the first two years, and annual participation in evidence-based professional learning, among other features under a \$300,000 annual appropriation. In 2013-14, Delaware's Department of Education created a competitive grant program to incentivize innovation in the mentoring program; the first five rounds have seen \$1 million awarded to district and charter schools to fund the "development and/or delivery of innovative induction models for new educators."¹⁵⁹

Iowa also has a comprehensive new teacher induction system following the adoption of their Teacher Quality Act in 2001, which expanded teacher induction statewide and made it a requirement for second-tier teacher licensure. Iowa's Mentoring and Induction Program now involves roughly 3,000 first- and second-year teachers annually. The program is structured to provide "evidence-based minimum induction requirements but broad flexibility in program design" to enable schools and districts to tailor the program to meaningful activities that are responsive to their local contexts. The state distributes \$1,300 to districts and Area Education Agencies for each first- and second-year teacher, of which \$1,000 goes toward mentor stipends and the remaining goes toward program costs. Over \$4 million was allocated statewide in the 2016-17 fiscal year.¹⁶⁰

Survey Suggestions: Career Ladders and Financial Incentives

As stated in New York State's ESSA Plan (2017), a key factor in retaining new teachers and school leaders as well as increasing their effectiveness in the classroom and district is the provision of continuous supports.¹⁶¹ The Department believes that retaining effective educators requires providing meaningful opportunities for leadership and advancement throughout their careers that recognize and reward excellence and enhance educator success.¹⁶²

Fifty-four percent of District Superintendents, 40% of P-12 superintendents, and over 60% of educator preparation deans believed that teacher leadership opportunities would help to improve the recruitment and retention of educators of color in districts and classrooms. Nearly half of District Superintendents and P-12 superintendents and 72% of educator preparation deans indicated that financial incentives such as longevity bonuses would be most beneficial for recruitment and retention. Educator preparation deans likewise indicated strong support (68%) for cost of living assistance, such as transportation, housing and childcare, though less than 20% of District Superintendents and P-12 superintendents agreed (Figure 34).

Current Efforts: Retention and Development

 New York City—For postsecondary faculty, CUNY launched the <u>Mellon Faculty Diversity</u> <u>Career Enhancement Initiative</u> in 2017 to support sustained mentorship for junior faculty, enhance prospects for tenure and promotion, and increase overall faculty retention rates. CUNY also established the <u>Diversity Projects Development Fund</u>, administered by the University Advisory Council on Diversity, to support educational projects, scholarly research and other initiatives that promote multiculturalism, diversity and inclusion, affirmative action and nondiscrimination, and hosts a biennial <u>Faculty Diversity and</u> <u>Inclusion Conference</u> in which faculty "develop constructive actions for positive change in the belief that diversity in all its manifestations is a driver of success for the CUNY community." Each of these are geared toward CUNY's continued pursuit of building and sustaining a diverse community of students and educators.

The American Museum of Natural History's (AMNH) <u>Masters of Arts in Teaching</u> program is designed to address the shortage of Earth Science teachers in high-need schools. The program has successfully recruited diverse candidates into New York's schools, 30% of which are people of color, 44% male, and 35% career-changers including military veterans. Ninety-four percent of teachers from AMNH's first three cohort remained in the profession for more than 3 years. AMNH's urban residency program draws on research for diversifying the workforce and supporting teachers of color with a focus on retention through:

- High retention supportive pathways, which includes recruitment from HBCUs and LatinX serving institutions, a full fellowship and 3-year living stipend, and a fullyear mentored teaching experience; and
- Comprehensive induction supports for 2 years, including co-curriculum design, on-site observations and engagement, and paid induction meetings to ensure that graduates are able to attend.

In **Massachusetts**, as part of the state's Influence 100 campaign, each participating district selects one aspiring superintendent as an "Influence 100 Fellow". Fellows engage in monthly leadership development programming focused on understanding racial identity development, political navigation, negotiation, working with a school board, and building a multi-racial professional network. National and local speakers and experts are invited to each session, expanding Fellows' professional networks.

Survey Findings: Retention Supports

NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey found that institutions and/or programs offer supports evenly to both novice (0-3 years) and veteran teachers (4+ years), most commonly in the form of invitations to participate in alumni events or online information sharing, as seen in Figure 46.

Figure 46: Question #19, Educator Preparation Deans



Which of the following does your institution / program offer to its graduates [of color]?

Responses listed highest-to-lowest by "Novice Teachers (0-3 years)" Respondents were asked to select all that apply NYSED Educator Diversity Survey, 2019

The most common supports offered by districts and BOCES regions are mentorship/coaching and formal induction programs, as seen in Figure 47. Just over 20% of districts said they do not offer any retention supports.

Page 105 of 206

Figure 47: Question #31, P-12 Superintendents & BOCES District Superintendents

What supports does your district/school/BOCES offer with the goal of retaining educators of color?



Responses listed highest-to-lowest by "Teachers of Color" Respondents were asked to select all that apply NYSED Educator Diversity Survey, 2019

6. Ensure transparency, accountability, and research

Advocates have argued that, to improve equity in the teacher workforce, New York State must improve "data transparency, availability, and usefulness" throughout the teacher pipeline to encourage informed decision-making and support information-sharing efforts, such as statewide hiring needs and partnership opportunities.¹⁶³ For example, in a December 2019 report, "What to Make of Declining Enrollment in Teacher Preparation Programs," the Center for American Progress (CAP) called for more detailed data collection on teacher supply and demand within each state, such as teacher vacancies, hiring needs, and turnover.¹⁶⁴ Too little is known about why students enroll in teacher preparation programs and how the enrollment varies among student groups (e.g., racial, ethnic, gender, age groups) which, in turn, hampers the design and implementation of effective policy solutions.¹⁶⁵

In New York State, increased data transparency on topics such as the diversity of students and faculty, educator preparation program job placement rates, district hiring needs, employee satisfaction, and retention rates will facilitate research and enable informed decision-making by students, prospective educators, administrators, and policymakers. Furthermore, data transparency is an essential step toward assessing progress and establishing accountability for results.

Current Efforts: Engaging in Research and Information-Sharing

Most of the data needed to analyze educator diversity in New York State is already posted on NYSED's Data Site and available for researchers, practitioners, and the public to download. For more information on the data collections used in the development of this report see Appendix B: Publicly Available Data. Each BOCES and Big Five school district should undertake a predictive two-year and four-year analysis of the future demand for certified teachers in their region. Such analysis should take into account past teacher turnover, impending teacher retirements by subject area, and census data to determine future enrollment. This analysis should be provided to all educator preparation programs in the region, to support their recruitment efforts; and to all guidance counselors, to make high schoolers aware of potential job opportunities.

Around New York State and across the nation, much work is being done to improve transparency, accountability, research, and the sharing of promising practices to support the diversification of the educator workforce. For example:

- Capital Region—Questar III BOCES's Academy for Educational Careers has engaged a representative to reach out and work with local school counselors and teachers in diverse districts to complete a study looking at local barriers that are preventing students from entering the educational career field. Questar III is already using the preliminary, anecdotal findings of the study to launch a "teacher appreciation" campaign in partnership with school superintendents and administrators, intended to portray teachers as role models and improve student perceptions of the teaching profession.
- **Capital Region & North Country**—With its latest round of funding, The Classroom Academy has extended its work to focus on improving educator diversity with an emphasis on research, including:

- Assembling a diverse leadership team of P-20 practitioners that includes African Americans, an immigrant from West Africa, a Latinx, an LGBTQ representative, and postsecondary faculty from historically Black colleges and universities to:
 - Explore strategic recruitment and retention/support strategies for diverse candidates in crafting a sustainable model; and
 - Identify the aspects needed for candidates to be fully prepared to teach diverse student populations.
- Extending their research to include additional classrooms with diverse students; and
- Engaging in a knowledge scan and capture of their current work to identify gaps and develop resources and technical assistance for future partnerships.
- The American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education (AACTE) has recently made strides in addressing the shortage of special education teachers of color through information-sharing efforts, explaining that educators need to take the time "to strategize and do something that's sustainable and ensure that every child has a profession-ready teacher... who also reflects our demographics in America."¹⁶⁶ AACTE plans to "publish case studies of different recruitment and retention tactics" nationwide to make information and resources about best practices available for all institutions of higher education so programs "can adapt tactics that fit within their local context."¹⁶⁷
- The U.S. Department of Education, in partnership with Microsoft, has developed the Teach.org online recruitment platform, which is being used by Connecticut, North Carolina, and several large cities to improve the transparency of the educator certification process. Connecticut officials say that the <u>TeachCT</u> site—which provides career roadmaps, a searchable database of preparation programs, an application checklist, chat support, and other tools—has been successful in reaching potential educators of color.

Several organizations are actively researching the issue of educator diversity here in New York State, such as the Coalition of Urban Teacher Education and Development (C-UTED) and The National Center for Suburban Studies at Hofstra University. In 2019, The Education Trust—New York published an Educator Diversity Playbook as a tool for school district leaders who are interested in improving diversity, equity, and inclusion in their schools and central offices. P-12 districts and educator preparation programs can capitalize on the great work being done by these organizations and use these resources to improve their efforts to attract, recruit, prepare, and retain educators of color statewide.

Survey Findings: Tracking Diversity Efforts

NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey found that 25% of P-12 districts and 65% of educator preparation programs track the success of their efforts to recruit educators of color. Figure 48 shows that 60% of the educator preparation programs that track the success of their efforts collect completion rate data of candidates of color, 55% collect admission rates, and 48% collect certification rate and matriculation rate data on candidates of color.
Figure 48: Question #21, Educator Preparation Deans



What data do you collect related to recruiting and/or preparing and retaining educator candidates of color?

Respondents were asked to select all that apply. NYSED Educator Diversity Survey, 2019

In P-12 districts and BOCES, Figure 49 shows that just over 10% of respondents who track the success of their efforts to recruit educators of color into their districts or BOCES collect data to analyze the alignment of the diversity of their educator workforce with that of their student populations. Eighteen percent of P-12 superintendents further indicated they collect data on the hiring rates of candidates of color in their districts.

Figure 49: Question #29



What data do you collect related to recruiting educator candidates of color?

Respondents were asked to select all that apply. NYSED Educator Diversity Survey, 2019

The above findings from NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey show promising efforts to improve the transparency and accountability of districts and educator preparation programs in the recruitment of educators of color into the teaching profession, but more progress must be made. P-12 districts and BOCES in particular need to improve their data collections and efforts to track the success of their recruitment strategies and hiring practices to support continued research into the challenge of educator diversity in New York State.

Future Research

In 2009, the report of the American Educational Research Association (AERA) panel on research and teacher education concluded that the field of education would benefit from studies that examine "what teacher candidates actually learn, how their learning is played out in practice in K-12 schools and classrooms, and how this influences pupils' learning—all within the context of varying resource allocation, schools, communities, and programs."¹⁶⁸ Only through ongoing research can we begin to understand "who is attracted to teaching, who prepares to teach, where they teach, and how long they stay"¹⁶⁹ as well as the impact of preparation programs on teacher quality and student outcomes and the impact of policy decisions on educational equity.

This report reveals several findings of interest for further research. Particularly important in these efforts is a focus on educator demographics, including baseline comparisons across other disciplines and professions to begin to understand the lack of diversity in the educator workforce and its policy implications, the preparation and persistence of teachers of color throughout the educator pipeline, and the dynamics of hiring, supporting and retaining educators of color.¹⁷⁰ According to the AERA panel's report, spearheading such research initiatives will take strategic investments and partnerships among institutions of higher education, schools and districts, and research and policy institutes with a focus on increasing shared knowledge of the important features of educator preparation programs and their connections with student outcomes.¹⁷¹

To that end, educational stakeholders in New York should continue to engage in, facilitate, and support ongoing research on the diversity of the State's educator workforce and build on the findings of this report for the betterment of our schools, teachers, and students.

Next Steps

Some progress is being made in addressing the issue of workforce diversity in New York's education system, but more intentional and comprehensive efforts are needed to change entrenched practices that perpetuate the status quo.

The Department envisions that the data, recommendations, and examples collected here will serve as a resource not only to the Legislature, which commissioned this report, but to districts, BOCES, and educator preparation entities who are seeking guidance as to what they can do to improve educator diversity in their regions and communities. Because of the need for funding to launch innovative and supportive partnership programs and to defray the costs that can deter diverse candidates from joining the profession, the 2020-21 Regents Budget and Legislative Priorities include a package of proposals for improving the diversity of New York State's educator workforce, informed by the findings of this report (see Regents Proposals). As an important next step, the Board of Regents should articulate its own expectations, to guide further action by the field.

As the Department continues to implement the commitments in New York's ESSA plan, it will look at the potential to use its own leverage—including data transparency and regulatory authority—to support the efforts being made by districts, BOCES, and educator preparation institutions in pursuit of equity of opportunity and outcomes in New York State's education system.

Acknowledgements

The Department could not have produced this report without the support and contributions of countless individuals and organizations. While it is impossible to acknowledge everyone who contributed, and any list will inevitably omit important names, the Department would like to recognize some of those who assisted in developing the Department's Educator Diversity Survey, providing feedback on the November 2019 presentation to the Board of Regents, and producing this report.

Conference of Big 5 School Districts Council of Chief State School Officers Early Childhood Blue Ribbon Committee Workforce Focus Group Educators4Excellence Educator Preparation Sector Liaisons from CICU, SUNY, and CUNY Education Trust—New York Learning Policy Institute New York State Association of Small City School Districts New York State Council of School Superintendent's Commission on Inclusivity and Diversity New York State's Diverse and Learner-Ready Teachers team: Jaime Alicea, Superintendent, Syracuse Central School District Emily Haines, Teacher, New York City Department of Education Angelique Johnson-Dingle, District Superintendent, Western Suffolk BOCES Deb Shanley, Professor, CUNY Brooklyn College New York State School Board Association New York State United Teachers Professional Standards and Practices Board for Teaching Regional Education Laboratory, Education Development Center School Administrators Association of New York State WestEd

Special thanks to Nicole Lennon, a doctoral student in the University at Albany Educational Policy and Leadership program, who worked countless hours on all aspects of the report.

The Department would also like to thank the P-12 superintendents, BOCES District Superintendents, and educator preparation program deans who responded to the Educator Diversity Survey.

Any errors in the data and/or information contained within this report are the sole responsibility of the Department and should not be attributed to any individual or organization named herein.

Appendix A: Overview of New York's Teacher Preparation and Certification Process

In New York State, there are multiple pathways to becoming a certified teacher, including: 1) a registered New York State traditional undergraduate or graduate teacher preparation program that leads to teacher certification, 2) a registered "alternative" teacher preparation program, also offered through a New York State institution of higher education (IHE), but with characteristics that distinguish it from "traditional" programs, and 3) individual transcript evaluation. For more information on these and additional pathways, please visit the Office of Teaching Initiatives' (OTI) website at http://www.highered.nysed.gov/tcert/certificate/pathways.html.

Prospective teachers who already hold a bachelor's or master's degree in a subject area of the New York State certificate sought may enroll in an alternative teacher preparation program at a New York State IHE and be recommended for Initial and/or Professional teacher certification upon program completion. These programs often attract individuals who have prior work experience but are seeking a new career, commonly referred to as "career-changers". The goal of these alternative preparation programs is to increase the number of qualified teachers in hard-to-staff subjects and geographic areas.¹⁷²

New York State Teacher Certification Requirements

For more detailed information on NYS teacher certification requirements, please visit our certification help page at: <u>http://eservices.nysed.gov/teach/certhelp/CertRequirementHelp.do</u> Selected certification requirements, depending on the pathway to certification, are listed below.

| Initial Certification – Selected Requirements | | | | |
|--|----------------|--|--|--|
| Requirement | Cost | Description | | |
| Complete a NYS Registered Teacher Preparation Program (traditional or alternative) | Varies | "Registered program" means a teacher preparation program that has been approved in advance by the New York State Education Department as containing the studies required for certification as a New York State educator. You may review a list of these approved, registered programs through our Inventory of Registered Programs. | | |
| Institutional Recommendation for Certification | Not applicable | This refers to an online statement from a New York State institution of higher education that has a registered teacher preparation program. Through the statement, the institution recommends a candidate for certification. | | |

| NYS Teacher Certification Exam – <u>Educating All</u> <u>Students (EAS) Test</u> | \$92 | The EAS test assesses candidates' familiarity with research-validated instructional strategies responsive to students with diverse backgrounds and learning needs. Competencies assessed include diverse student populations, students with disabilities, English language learners, teacher responsibilities, and school-home relationships. | |
|---|---|--|--|
| NYS Teacher Certification Exam – <u>Content Specialty</u> <u>Test (CST)</u> | Up to \$179 each | Offered in specific subjects, the CST consists of selected-response items and 1-3 constructed-response items, depending on the test. The purpose of the test is to assess knowledge and skills in the subject of the certificate sought. | |
| <u>edTPA</u> | \$300 | Through this national performance assessment, individuals demonstrate their readiness to teach by planning lessons that support their students' strengths and needs, teaching the lessons in an educational setting, and assessing their students' learning. The assessment requires candidates to videotape their work with students and reflect on their teaching. | |
| Dignity for All Students Act (DASA) workshop | \$70 - \$100, depending on the approved provider; or incorporated into a NYS registered teacher preparation program with no additional fee | Individuals must complete the Dignity for All Students Act (DASA) training workshop for educator certification in New York State. The training addresses harassment, bullying, and discrimination prevention and intervention in schools. The length of the training is at least six clock hours, with at least three clock hours completed in-person (not online). | |
| School Violence Prevention and Intervention Workshop | Approximately \$30- \$50, depending on the approved provider; or incorporated into a NYS registered | Individuals must complete at least two clock hours of coursework or training in school violence prevention and intervention. | |

| | teacher preparation program with no additional fee | | | |
|--|--|---|--|--|
| Child Abuse Identification and Reporting Workshop | Approximately \$30- \$50, depending on the approved provider; incorporated into a NYS registered teacher preparation program with no additional fee | Individuals must complete at least two clock hours of coursework or training regarding the identification and reporting of suspected child abuse or maltreatment. | | |
| Coursework or Training in the Needs of Children with Autism | Approximately \$30- \$50, depending on the approved provider; or incorporated into a NYS registered teacher preparation program with no additional fee | Individuals applying for the following certificate titles must complete at least three clock hours of course work or training in autism: Students with Disabilities, Deaf and Hard of Hearing, Blind and Visually Impaired, and Speech and Language Disabilities. | | |
| Fingerprint Clearance | \$101.75 | All individuals applying for certification must be cleared by the New York State Education Department through a fingerprint-supported criminal history background check. This includes all applicants for certification, as well as all prospective employees of school districts, charter schools and boards of cooperative educational services (BOCES). | | |
| NYSED Application Evaluation Fee | \$50-\$100, depending on the pathway | Individuals apply for certification through the online <u>TEACH system</u> . | | |
| Professional Certification – Requirements to Progress | | | | |
| from the Initial Certificate to the Professional Certificate | | | | |
| Requirement | Description | | | |
| Classroom Teaching Experience | Teachers must have 3 years of paid, full-time acceptable teaching experience. | | | |

| Mentored Experience | "Mentored experience" refers to the guidance and professional support that experienced, certified teachers provide to new teachers in their first year of teaching in a public school. | | |
|---|---|--|--|
| Master's Degree and 12 Graduate Semester Hours in the Content Core | Teachers must complete: a New York State registered graduate educator preparation program; a master's or higher degree program in the content core of the Initial certificate or in a related content area; or a master's or higher degree program in any field, provided that the candidate has completed at least 12 semester hours of graduate study in any combination of content core of the Initial certificate or content-linking pedagogy (teaching methods) of the content core of the Initial certificate. | | |
| INS Permanent Residence or U.S. Citizenship | Individuals with United States Citizenship, Permanent Resident status or a valid DACA or similar relief from deportation status can qualify for a Professional certificate. | | |

| In-State Tuition Costs for New York State Residents Public Colleges/Universities, Fall 2019 | | | | | |
|--|---------------|-----------------|---------------|--|--|
| Institution | Level | Cost per credit | Cost per year | | |
| SUNY | Undergraduate | \$295 | \$7,070 | | |
| SUNY | Graduate | \$471 | \$11,310 | | |
| CUNY | Undergraduate | \$305 | \$6,930 | | |
| CUNY | Graduate | \$470 | \$5,545 | | |

For more information please visit:

- SUNY Tuition & Financial Aid at <u>https://open.suny.edu/content/tuition-financial-aid</u>
- CUNY Tuition & Fees at https://www.cuny.edu/financial-aid/tuition-and-college-costs/tuition-fees/#1452182717032-f3e8599c-3e15

Appendix B: Publicly Available Data

NYSED is committed to making data available and easy to use. This following links to publicly reported educational data are provided so all interested parties can be better informed as they work to advance student achievement.

Teachers

Gender, race, and ethnicity is self-reported by individual teachers at the district level; therefore, teachers have the right to decline to identify their gender and/or race/ethnicity. For the 2018-19 academic year, fewer than 2% of teacher declined to identify their gender, race and/or ethnicity.

The Personnel Master File ("PMF") is a P-12 system that collects and reports data for approximately 200,000 New York State teachers and 30,000 non-teaching professionals. Data are collected to meet State and federal reporting requirements and, when available, reported in the New York State Report Cards and in the Statistical profiles.

"Personnel Master File (PMF)." <u>http://www.p12.nysed.gov/irs/pmf/</u>

Teacher/Leader Gender & Age Data:

- 2017-18 Personnel Master File Teaching and Non-Teaching Statistical Runs
- 2016-17 Personnel Master File Standard Statistical Runs
- 2016-17 Non-Teaching Professional Statistical Runs
- 2015-16 Personnel Master File Standard Statistical Runs
- 2015-16 Non-Teaching Professional Statistical Runs
- Archive of Statistical Runs 2000-1 through 2014-15

Teacher/Leader Race & Ethnicity Data:

- Teacher Race Ethnicity Data 2001-2017
- Other Professional Staff Race Ethnicity Data 2001-2017

P-12 Students

"Public School Enrollment." <u>http://www.p12.nysed.gov/irs/statistics/enroll-n-staff/home.html</u> <u>Student Gender & Race/Ethnicity Data:</u>

- FINAL District Level Data by Grade 2018-19
 District Enrollment Gender
 - o District Enrollment Gender
 - District Enrollment Race and Ethnic Origin
- FINAL District Level Data by Grade 2017-18
 - District Enrollment Gender

- District Enrollment Race and Ethnic Origin
- Archive: FINAL Enrollment Data 2011-2017

"NY State Graduation Rate Data: 4 Year Outcomes as of June." NYSED Data Site. <u>https://data.nysed.gov/gradrate.php?year=2018&state=yes</u>

Postsecondary Students

Postsecondary Student Data:

• 2009-2018 Graduation Data

"Higher Education Graduation Data." <u>http://www.nysed.gov/information-reporting-services/higher-education-graduation-data</u>

United States Department of Education Title II Data:

Educator Preparation Programs and Enrollment. <u>https://title2.ed.gov/Public/Home.aspx</u>

Appendix C: Literature Review and Examples

Recruiting and Retaining Teachers of Color: Current Research and Policy Examples Learning Policy Institute August 2019

The following memo (Part 1) provides a review of the research literature exploring the benefits of a linguistically and racially-diverse teacher workforce and the current barriers that exist both in recruiting and retaining more teachers of color in the educator workforce. In addition to the literature review, the memo also includes a series of policy opportunities and specific state examples aligned with current programs and policy across New York (Part 2). Part 1 draws heavily on a recent Learning Policy Institute report entitled, <u>Diversifying the Teaching Profession: How to Recruit and Retain Teachers of Color</u>.¹

Part 1: Current Research

Why a Racially and Linguistically Diverse Teacher Workforce Matters

Impact on Academic Outcomes

A growing body of research demonstrates that teachers of color provide benefits to all students, especially to students of color. Studies have found that teachers of color boost the academic performance of students of color; teachers' influences include improved reading and mathematics test scores, graduation rates, and aspirations to attend college.² For example, one analysis of test score data from the Tennessee STAR class size study found that Black elementary students with Black teachers had reading and math test scores 3 to 6 percentile points higher than students without Black teachers and that gains in test scores accumulated with each year students were in a class with a race-matched teacher.³ Another recent reanalysis of the same data found that being taught by a teacher of color can also have significant long-term academic benefits. That study found that Black k–3 students assigned to a Black teacher in their first year

¹ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). *Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color*. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

² Dee, T. (2004). Teachers, race and student achievement in a randomized experiment. *The Review of Economics and Statistics, 86*(1), 195–210; Gershenson, S., Hart, C. M. D., Lindsay, C. A., & Papageorge, N. W. (2017). *The long-run impacts of same-race teach- ers.* Bonn, Germany: IZA Institute of Labor Economics. Discussion Paper Series; See also: Clotfelter, C. T., Ladd, H. F., & Vigdor, J. L. (2007). Teacher credentials and student achievement: Longitudinal analysis with student fixed effects. *Economics of Education Review, 26*(6), 673–682; Goldhaber, D., & Hansen, M. (2010). Race, gender, and teacher testing: How informative a tool is teacher licensure testing? *American Educational Research Journal, 47*(1), 218–251; Egalite, A. J., Kisida, B., & Winters, M. A. (2015). Representation in the classroom: The effect of own-race teachers on student achieve- ment. *Economics of Education Review, 45*, 44–52.

³ Dee, T. (2004). Teachers, race and student achievement in a randomized experiment. The Review of Economics and Statistics, 86(1), 195–210.

of the STAR program were 15% less likely to drop out of high school and 10% more likely to take a college entrance exam.

Longitudinal data from North Carolina showed similar long-term benefits. Black students who were assigned to a class with a Black teacher at least once in 3rd, 4th, or 5th grade were less likely to drop out of high school and more likely to aspire to go to college. Having at least one Black teacher in grades 3 to 5 cut the high school dropout rate in half for Black boys. Black boys from low-income families who had at least one Black teacher in grades 3 to 5 were 39% less likely to drop out of high school than those who had never had a Black teacher. For Black students identified as "persistently low-income"—those who receive free or reduced-price lunch every year of grades 3 through 8—having a Black teacher increased their intentions of going to college by 19%, and by 29% for Black boys specifically.⁴ In other words, the benefit of having a Black teacher for just 1 year in elementary school can persist over several years, especially for Black students from low-income families. Notably, Black teachers tended to have similar, though somewhat smaller, effects on non-Black students.

Other studies of North Carolina student standardized test performance have also found positive, though smaller, effects of teachers of color on the student test scores of students of color.⁵ Scholars have found similar patterns in higher education. For example, underrepresented community college students of color (Black, Latinx, Native American, and Pacific Islander students) fared better when taught by an underrepresented faculty of color.⁶ They were more likely to pass a class and earn a B or higher than underrepresented students of color in classes taught by White faculty.

Impact on Other Measures of Student Success

In addition to academic benefits, students of color can experience social and emotional benefits from having teachers of color. A study using longitudinal data on North Carolina k–5 students and teachers between 2006 and 2010 found that students with teachers of another race had more unexcused absences and an increased likelihood of being chronically absent than students with race-matched teachers. In particular, boys of color taught by White teachers were even more likely to be chronically absent, and to experience more suspensions than other students.⁷

⁴ Gershenson, S., Hart, C. M. D., Lindsay, C. A., & Papageorge, N. W. (2017). The long-run impacts of samerace teachers. Bonn, Germany: IZA Institute of Labor Economics. Discussion Paper Series.

⁵ Clotfelter, C. T., Ladd, H. F., & Vigdor, J. L. (2007). Teacher credentials and student achievement: Longitudinal analysis with student fixed effects. Economics of Education Review, 26(6), 673–682; Goldhaber, D., & Hansen, M. (2010). Race, gender, and teacher testing: How informative a tool is teacher licensure testing? American Educational Research Journal, 47(1), 218–251; Egalite, A. J., Kisida, B., & Winters, M. A. (2015). Representation in the classroom: The effect of own-race teachers on student achievement. Economics of Education Review, 45, 44–52.

⁶ Fairlie, R. W., Hoffmann, F., & Oreopoulos. P. (2014.) A community college instructor like me: Race and ethnicity interactions in the classroom. American Economic Review, 104(8): 2567–2591.

⁷ Holt, S. B., & Gershenson, S. (2015). The impact of teacher demographic representation on student attendance and suspensions. Bonn, Germany: IZA Institute of Labor Economics. Discussion Paper Series

More recently, a similar study of North Carolina elementary, middle, and high school students found that Black students with more Black teachers were less likely to experience exclusionary discipline; that is, suspension and expulsion. This was especially true in incidents that required subjective judgement (e.g. "willful defiance").⁸ Non-Black students also had lower likelihoods of discipline when taught by a Black teacher, though the effect was less extreme than for Black students.

Scholars suggest that there might be a variety of reasons for the positive educational experiences students of color often have when taught by teachers of color: Teachers of color have a role model effect, whereby students of color identify with seeing people of color in professional roles. Teachers of color can also undermine stereotype threat (i.e. the phenomenon of underperforming because of feeling stereotyped as an underperformer) by demonstrating that they see students of color as capable, and they typically have higher expectations for students of color than do White teachers. Teachers of color often function as cultural translators and advocates for students of color because they have multicultural awareness, and they tend to provide superior quantity and quality of instructional support than White teachers to students of color.⁹

⁸ Lindsay, C. A., & Hart, C. M. D., (2017). Exposure to same-race teachers and student disciplinary outcomes for Black students in North Carolina. Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis, 39(3): 485–510.

⁹ Auerbach, S. (2007). From moral supporters to struggling advocates: Reconceptualizing parent roles in education through the experience of working-class families of color. Urban Education, 42(3), 250–283; Guarino, C. M., Santibañez, L., & Daley, G. A. (2006). Teacher recruitment and retention: A review of the recent empirical literature. Review of Educational Research, 76(2), 173–208; Boser, U. (2011). Teacher diversity matters: A state-bystate analysis of teachers of color. Washington, DC: Center for American Progress; Evans, M. O. (1992). An estimate of race and gender role model effects in teaching high school. The Journal of Economic Education, 23(3): 209–217; Clewell, B. C., & Villegas, A. M. (1998). Diversifying the teaching force to improve urban schools: Meeting the challenge. Education and Urban Society, 31(1), 3–17; Quiocho, A., & Rios, F. (2000). The power of their presence: Minority group teachers and schooling. Review of Educational Research, 70(4), 485–528; Villegas, A. M., & Lucas, T. F. (2004). Diversifying the teacher workforce: A retrospective and prospective analysis. Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education, 103, 70–104. 22. Steele, C. M. (1997). A threat in the air: How stereotypes shape intellectual identity and performance. American Psychologist, 52(6), 613–629; Dee, T. (2004). Teachers, race and student achievement in a randomized experiment. The Review of Economics and Statistics, 86(1), 195–210. 23. Fox, L. (2015). Seeing potential: The effects of student-teacher demographic congruence on teacher expectations and recommendations. AERA Open; Ouazad, A. (2014). Assessed by a teacher like me: Race and teacher assessments. Education Finance and Policy, 9(3), 334–372; Gershenson, S., Holt, S. B., & Papageorge, N. W. (2015). Who believes in me? The effect of student-teacher demographic match on teacher expectations. (Upjohn Institute Working Paper 15–231). Kalamazoo, MI: W. E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research; Baron, R. M., Tom, D. Y. H., & Cooper, H. M. (1985). Social class, race and teacher expectations. In J. B. Dusek (Ed.), Teacher expectations (pp. 251–269). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates; Tenenbaum, H. R. & Ruck, M. D. (2007). Are teachers' expectations different for racial minority than for European American students? A metaanalysis. Journal of Educational Psychology, 99(2): 253–273; Downey, D. B., & Ainsworth-Darnell, J. W. (2002). The search for oppositional culture among Black students. American Sociological Review, 67(1), 156–164. 24. Warikoo, N. (2004). Race and the teacher-student relationship: Interpersonal connections between West Indian students and their teachers in a New York City high school. Race Ethnicity and Education 7(2): 135–147; King, S. H. (1993). The limited presence of African-American teachers. Review of Educational Research, 63(2), 115–149; Irvine, J. J. 1990). Black students and school failure: Policies, practices, and prescriptions. Westport, CT: Praeger; Achinstein,

Studies also suggest that all students, including White students, benefit from having teachers of color because they bring distinctive knowledge, experiences, and role modeling to the student body as a whole. Students of color and White students both report having positive perceptions of their teachers of color, including feeling cared for and academically challenged. A study using the MET database analyzed the perceptions of students in grades 6 to 9 of Black, Latinx, and White teachers along seven outcome measures, which included feeling cared for and academically challenged, among others. The researchers consistently found that students expressed more favorable perceptions of Black and Latinx teachers than of White teachers. Latinx teachers were almost always rated higher than White teachers across all seven measures. Students rated Black teachers higher on three of seven measures, and Black students reported especially favorable attitudes toward Black teachers across all outcome measures. Asian American students also rated Black teachers higher on most of the outcome measures. In demonstrating the positive perceptions students have of teachers of color, these studies suggest that all students can benefit from a more diverse teacher workforce. Other research has found that overall ratings of teachers on this survey can predict student learning gains for those who responded to the survey, as well as for other students in the class.¹⁰

Research on implicit bias has found that when individuals of diverse racial and ethnic backgrounds have childhood interactions with individuals of other racial backgrounds, including friends, caretakers, neighbors, and classmates, they are less likely to hold implicit biases in adulthood than those who have had less interracial contact in childhood. Businesses appreciate the importance of hiring employees who can work well with others in a diverse and global society. In an amicus brief to the Supreme Court, several leading American companies, including Apple, Walmart, Shell Oil, and others, argued that employees educated in more diverse learning environments are "better able to work productively with business partners, employees, and clients in the United States and around the world; and they are likely to generate a more positive work environment by decreasing incidents of discrimination and stereotyping."¹¹ In turn, being taught by a diverse teacher workforce works towards this end as well; it can help all students develop dispositions that prepare them for civic life and the workforce.

B., Ogawa, R. T., Sexton, D., & Freitas, C. (2010). Retaining teachers of color: A pressing problem and a potential strategy for "hard-to-staff" schools. Review of Educational Research 80(1), 71–107; Villegas, A. M., & Irvine, J. J. (2010). Diversifying the teaching force: An examination of major arguments. Urban Review 42(3), 175–92. 25. Cherng, H.-Y. S., & Davis, L. A. (2017). Multicultural matters: An investigation of key assumptions of multicultural education reform in teacher education. Journal of Teacher Education. 26. Casteel, C. A. (1998). Teacher-student interactions and race in integrated classrooms. Journal of Educational Research, 92(2), 115–120; Taylor, M. C. (1979). Race, sex, and the expression of self-fulfilling prophecies in a laboratory teaching situation. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 37(6), 897–912

¹⁰ Cherng, H.-Y. S., & Halpin, P. F. (2016). The importance of minority teachers: Student perceptions of minority versus White teachers. Educational Researcher, 45(7), 407–420; Irvine, J. J. (1988). An analysis of the problem of disappearing Black educators. Elementary School Journal, 88(5), 503–514; Raudenbush, S. W., & Jean, M. (2014). To what extent do student perceptions of classroom quality predict teacher value added? In T. J. Kane, K. A. Kerr, & R. C. Pianta (Eds.), Designing Teacher Evaluation Systems. San Francisco, CA: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

¹¹ Brief of Fortune-100 and other leading American businesses as amici curiae in support of respondents in *Fisher v. University of Texas at Austin.* (2015).

Impact on the Field

Most of the literature explores the impact teachers of color have in directly affecting students, but there is also some evidence to suggest that increasing teacher diversity may also benefit teachers of color already in the field. In several qualitative studies, teachers of color expressed feelings of isolation, frustration, and fatigue when they were one of few teachers of color in their schools. This finding suggests that increasing the diversity of the teaching force may also benefit students indirectly if it helps to improve teacher satisfaction and decrease teacher turnover, a key contributor to teacher shortages and school instability.¹²

In addition, teachers of color are a resource for students in hard-to-staff schools. Many teachers of color report feeling called to teach in low-income communities of color, positions that are often difficult to fill.¹³ Currently, three in four teachers of color work in the quarter of schools serving the most students of color nationally. Teachers of color play an important role in filling gaps in these schools, and whether they decide to remain in teaching has significant impacts on students of color.¹⁴

What are the barriers for recruiting and retaining teachers of color?

Barriers to recruiting teachers of color exist at each stage of the teacher pipeline, beginning at the k–12 level with academic performance and attendance. According to data from the National Center for Education Statistics, reading and mathematics scores on the National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP) have increased for students across the board since the early 1990s, but Native American, Black, and Latinx students still score below their White and Asian American peers with growing achievement gaps.¹⁵ In 2013, Native American, Alaska Native, and Pacific Islander students were the least likely of all student groups to have perfect attendance, and Native American and Alaska Native students had the highest rate of chronic absenteeism. In 2012, the percentage of Black boys and girls who had ever been suspended was more than twice the rates for boys and girls in other racial and ethnic groups. It is important to note that these suspension rates, which lead to higher dropout rates, are not because of greater misbehavior but

¹² Simon, N. S., & Johnson, S. M. (2015). Teacher turnover in high-poverty schools: What we know and can do. Teachers College Record, 117(3), 1–36; Griffin, A., & Tackie, H. (2016). Through our eyes: Perspectives and reflections from Black teachers. Washington, DC: The Education Trust.; Ingersoll, R. M. (2001). Teacher turnover and teacher shortages: An organizational analysis. American Educational Research Journal, 38(3), 499–534; Ronfeldt, M., Loeb, S., & Wyckoff, J. (2013). How teacher turnover harms student achievement. American Educational Research Journal, 50(1), 4–36; Sutcher, L., Darling-Hammond, L., & Carver-Thomas, D. (2016). A coming crisis in teaching? Teacher supply, demand, and shortages in the U.S. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

¹³ Villegas, A. M., & Irvine, J. J. (2010). Diversifying the teaching force: An examination of major arguments. Urban Review, 42(3), 175–192.

¹⁴ Carver-Thomas, D., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2017). Teacher turnover: Why it matters and what we can do about it. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

¹⁵ Sutcher, L., Darling-Hammond, L., & Carver-Thomas, D. (2016). A coming crisis in teaching? Teacher supply, demand, and shortages in the U.S. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

due to discriminatory discipline.¹⁶ High school dropout rates have fallen since 2013, but dropout rates for Native American and Latinx students remain among the highest (12% and 13%, respectively). Dropout rates are especially high for Latinx and Pacific Islander students born outside the U.S. (22% and 13%). As such, the lower levels of academic performance and attendance sets students of color apart from White students even before attending college.

Obstacles to Completing College

Unfortunately, even after matriculation, college completion rates are low among students of color who enroll in college generally and education programs specifically. Data from the U.S. Department of Education shows that Black, Latinx, Pacific Islander, and Native American or Alaska Native college students are less likely than students overall to graduate within 6 years. Nationally, 40% of full-time students who began any bachelor's programs in 2008 at 4-year colleges graduated within 4 years, and 60% graduated within 6 years. However, fewer than 25% of Black or Native American or Alaska Native students graduated within 4 years, and just 41% graduated within 6 years. For Latinx students, 54% graduated within 6 years, and 50% of Pacific Islander students graduated within 6 years.¹⁷

Students of color attempting to complete bachelor's degrees face several challenges. Scholars have cited increased financial burdens as a key contributor to reduced college completion among students generally, claiming that this leads students to work more and take fewer classes.¹⁸ In addition, research finds that students of color are often discouraged from completing their degrees due to factors including being underprepared for college-level coursework caused by a lack of exposure in high school, family responsibilities, transportation difficulties, dissatisfaction with the lack of faculty diversity, and the difficulty of being in an environment that does not

¹⁶ Gilliam, W., Maupin, A., Reyes, C., Accavitti, M., & Shic, F. (2016). Do early educators' implicit biases regarding sex and race relate to behavior expectations and recommendations of preschool expulsions and suspensions? New Haven, CT: Yale University Child Study Center, 1–18; Finn, J. D., & Servoss, T. J. (2014). Misbehavior, suspensions, and security measures in high school: Racial/ ethnic and gender differences. Journal of Applied Research on Children: Informing Policy for Children at Risk, 5(2), 1–50; Losen, D. J. (2014). Closing the School Discipline Gap: Equitable Remedies for Excessive Exclusion. New York, NY: Teachers College Press; Pappas, L. (2018). When students of different ethnicities are suspended for the same infraction is the average length of their suspension the same? New York, NY: New York Independent Budget Office. Goff, P. A., Jackson, M. C., Di Leone, B. A. L., Culotta, C. M., & DiTomasso, N. A. (2014). The essence of innocence: Consequences of dehumanizing Black children. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 106(4), 526–545; Epstein, R., Blake, J. J., & Gonzalez, T. (2017). Girlhood interrupted: The erasure of Black girls' childhood. Washington, DC: Georgetown University Law Center on Poverty and Inequality; U.S. Government Accountability Office. (2018). K–12 education: Discipline disparities for Black students, boys, and students with disabilities. Washington, DC: Author.

¹⁷ Executive Office of the President (2012). Investing in our future: Returning teachers to the classroom. Washington, DC: Executive Office of the President, https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/sites/default/ files/Investing_in_Our_Future_Report.pdf (accessed 2/3/17).

¹⁸ Hanushek, E. A., Kain, J. F., & Rivkin, S. G. 2004. Why Public Schools Lose Teachers. The Journal of Human Resources, 39(2), 326–54. Scafidi, B., Sjoquist, D. L., &. Stinebrickner, T. R. 2007. "Race, Poverty, and Teacher Mobility." Economics of Education Review, 26(2), 145–59.

reflect or respect their culture or experience.¹⁹ A study of Native American college student completion issues recommends that colleges consider embedding Native cultures, family support, quality interactions with faculty, mentoring, and student engagement in academic life to better support these students.²⁰

Low college completion rates for students of color are not inevitable. Some schools are successfully helping candidates of color to complete college and pursue education degrees. According to a survey of teacher preparation programs (TPPs) administered by the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education (AACTE) in 2009–10, Minority-Serving Institutions (MSIs) successfully produced a more diverse candidate pool than Predominantly White Institutions (PWIs).²¹ Additionally, teachers of color who attended an MSI were more likely to graduate with a bachelor's degree from a school or department of education compared to teachers of color who attended a PWI.²² It is possible that the structure of education programs and the supports provided at MSIs make teaching seem more attractive to college students of color and make completing college more manageable.

The Impact of Student Debt on Teacher Preparation Enrollment and Completion

¹⁹ Allensworth, E., Ponisciak, S., & Mazzeo, C. 2009. The Schools Teachers Leave: Teacher Mobility in Chicago Public Schools. Consortium on Chicago School Research. Chicago, IL; Boyd, D., Grossman, P., Ing, M., Lankford, H., Loeb, S., & Wyckoff, J. 2011. The Influence of School Administrators on Teacher Retention Decisions. American Educational Research Journal, 48(2), 303–33; Loeb, S., Darling-Hammond, L., & Luczak, J. 2005. How Teaching Conditions Predict Teacher Turnover in California Schools. Peabody Journal of Education, 80(3), 44–70; Johnson, S. M., Kraft, M. A., & Papay, J. P. 2012. How Context Matters in High-Need Schools: The Effects of Teachers' Working Conditions on Their Professional Satisfaction and Their Students' Achievement. Teachers College Record, 114 (100306), 1–39; Ladd, H. F. 2011. Teachers' Perceptions of Their Working Conditions: How Predictive of Planned and Actual Teacher Movement? Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis, 33(2), 235–61; Marinell, W. H., & Coca, V. M. 2013. Who Stays and Who Leaves? Findings from a Three-Part Study of Teacher Turnover in NYC Middle Schools. New York: The Research Alliance for New York City Schools; Goldring, R., Taie, S., Rizzo, L., Colby, D., & Fraser, A. (2013). User's Manual for the 2011–12 Schools and Staffing Survey Volume 6: Public and Private School Teacher Data Files (NCES 2013–335). U.S. Department of Education. Washington, DC: National Center for Education Statistics. Retrieved from http://nces.ed.gov/pubsearch.

²⁰ Ingersoll, R., Merrill, L., & May, H. (2014). What are the effects of teacher education and preparation on beginning teacher attrition? Research Report (#RR-82). Philadelphia: Consortium for Policy Research in Education, University of Pennsylvania; Henke, R., Chen, X., & Geis, S. (2000). Progress through the Teacher Pipeline: 1992–93 College Graduates and Elementary/Secondary School Teaching as of 1997. Postsecondary Education Descriptive Analysis Report. U.S. Department of Education. Washington, DC: National Center for Education Statistics.

²¹ Podolsky, A., & Kini, T. (2016). How effective are loan forgiveness and service scholarships for recruiting teachers? (policy brief). Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

²² Baugh, W. H., & Stone, J. A. (1982). Mobility and Wage Equilibration in the Educator Labor Market. Economics of Education Review, 2(3), 253–274; Murnane, R. J., & Olsen, R. J. (1990). The effects of salaries and opportunity costs on length of stay in teaching: Evidence from North Carolina. The Journal of Human Resources, 25(1), 106–124; Loeb, S., Darling-Hammond, L., & Luczak, J. (2005). How Teaching Conditions Predict Teacher Turnover in California Schools. Peabody Journal of Education, 80(3), 44–70; Ondrich, J., Pas, E., & Yinger, J. (2008). The determinants of teacher attrition in upstate New York. Public Finance Review, 36(1), 112–144.

The increasing debt burden of college may play a role in declining interest in pursuing education careers. The average student loan balance increased nearly 60% between 2005 and 2012 to about \$25,000.²³ College students' potential debt burdens influence their decisions about what profession to enter; they are less likely to pursue education careers or take other low-paying jobs after graduation when they expect to incur more debt.²⁴ This is especially true for students of color. According to a study of college loan debt, even with the same expected debt burden and post-graduation salary, undergraduate and graduate Black, Latinx, and Asian American students were more likely than White students to report that loans limited their choice of educational institution, and Latinx students were most likely to report feeling limited by loans.²⁵ Black students were more likely to report that they wished they had borrowed less to fund their postsecondary education, that they changed their career plans because of their loans, or that their loan payments were burdensome.

Student loan debt is much greater for Black students than for White students, and both the amount of debt and the gap between Black and White borrowers grows substantially over time. Based on an analysis of administrative loan data and Department of Education Baccalaureate and Beyond data, Black undergraduates graduate with about \$7,400 more debt than White graduates, but have more than \$25,000 more debt than White graduates 4 years after graduation.²⁶ The gap more than quadruples over 12 years, with Black graduates owing \$43,000 more than White graduates.²⁷ This debt gap between Black and White college graduates is due to greater undergraduate borrowing, greater graduate school borrowing, and greater loan interest accumulation when interest accrues faster than loan payments are made. While Latinx college students tend to borrow about as much as White borrowers, their loan default rates are about twice as high, suggesting that even the same debt amount presents a greater relative burden. Rising tuition and the high cost of student loans can dissuade students of color from pursuing careers in education.²⁸

 ²³ For a comprehensive review, see Simon, N. S., & Johnson, S. M. (2015). Teacher turnover in high-poverty schools: What we know and can do. Teachers College Record 117(030308), 1–36; See also Borman, G. D., & Dowling, N. M. (2008). Teacher attrition and retention: A meta-analytic and narrative review of the research. Review of Educational Research, 78(3), 367–409; Loeb, S., Darling-Hammond, L., & Luczak, J. (2005). How Teaching Conditions Predict Teacher Turnover in California Schools. Peabody Journal of Education, 80(3), 44–70.
 ²⁴ Simon, N. S., & Johnson, S. M. 2015. "Teacher turnover in high-poverty schools: What we know and can do." Teachers College Record 117(030308), 1–36.

²⁵ Grissom, J. A. (2011). Can Good Principals Keep Teachers in Disadvantaged Schools? Linking Principal Effectiveness to Teacher Satisfaction and Turnover in Hard-to-Staff Environments. Teachers College Record, 113(11), 2552–2585. See also Podolsky, A., Kini, T., Bishop, J., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2016). Solving the teacher shortage: How to attract and retain excellent educators. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

²⁶ Podolsky, A., Kini, T., Bishop, J., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2016). Solving the teacher shortage: How to attract and retain excellent educators. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

²⁷ Sutcher, L., Darling-Hammond, L., & Carver-Thomas, D. (2016). A coming crisis in teaching? Teacher supply, demand, and shortages in the U.S. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

²⁸ Eger, A. (2015, September 21). Teachers struggle with low pay, working conditions: Teachers turn to extra jobs, soup kitchens to get by. Tulsa World.

Insufficient Teacher Preparation

High-quality teacher preparation is key to teacher retention. Teachers who enter the field with little preparation are two to three times more likely to leave their schools than those who had comprehensive preparation.²⁹ However, teachers of color are more likely to enter the profession through an alternative certification pathway than are White teachers, a trend that has increased over the past several years.

State data reported in compliance with Title II of the Higher Education Act show that enrollments in both traditional and alternative certification programs have been declining over the last decade, but candidates of color were 44% more likely to enroll in an alternative certification program in 2014–15 than in 2008–09. In 2014–15, more than one in five candidates of color enrolled in an alternative certification program, compared to about one in 10 White candidates.³⁰ While variation exists in the quality of preservice preparation of alternative certification programs, these teachers, on average, complete less coursework and have had little or no student teaching. With this less supportive launch into the profession, teachers entering through alternative pathways are more likely to leave their schools or leave the profession than teachers certified through traditional pathways.

For Black teachers, alternative certification has become increasingly common. Black teachers have about the same average age and teaching experience as other teachers, but Black teachers in their first year in 2012 were three-and-a-half times more likely to have no student teaching experience than all other first-year teachers (28.2% versus 7.9%), a discrepancy driven by disproportionate entry through alternative certification routes and emergency hiring. Nearly half of newly hired Black teachers were certified through an alternative pathway, compared to just 22% of all other first-year teachers.³¹

Teacher licensure exams

Among the many requirements teacher candidates must fulfill (including earning a bachelor's degree, student teaching, and completing teacher training), most states require that teacher candidates demonstrate subject-matter competence by passing standardized exams, the most common of which is the Praxis series of teacher licensure exams. About two thirds of states include satisfactory performance on the Praxis as a requirement for a teaching credential.³²

Several other states require a passing score on their own state-specific standardized exams, such as the Oklahoma Subject Area Test (OSAT) and the Georgia Assessments for the Certification of

²⁹ Boser, U., & Straus, C. (2014). Mid- and late-career teachers struggle with paltry incomes. Washington, DC: Center for American Progress.

³⁰ Greenstone, M., & Looney, A. (2013). Rising student debt burdens: Factors behind the phenomenon. Washington, DC: The Hamilton Project, The Brookings Institution.

³¹ Podolsky, A. & Kini, T. (2016). How effective are loan forgiveness and service scholarships for recruiting teachers? (policy brief). Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

³² Wiswall, M. (2013). The dynamics of teacher quality. Journal of Public Economics, 100, 61–78.

Educators (GACE). The Praxis I exam is meant to assess high school-level mathematics, reading, and writing skills and can be used for entry into a TPP or for state teacher licensure.³³ Praxis II exams measure subject-specific content knowledge, general pedagogy, and content-specific pedagogy and are used to meet state licensure requirements.³⁴

Black and Latinx teacher candidates disproportionately fail these standardized exams.³⁵ Historically, the disparities in failure rates have been large. A 1985 report by the Educational Testing Service—maker of the National Teacher Examination (NTE) that later became Praxis—estimated that based on the lowest and highest passing scores in each state, between 31% and 70% of Black teacher candidates would be disqualified from teaching. Between 15% and 45% of Latinx candidates would be disqualified. In contrast, only 2% to 14% of White candidates would fall short of passing.³⁶ More than a decade later, an examination of 1998–99 Praxis scores in states across the country found that Latinx, Black, and Asian American test takers had lower average scores and lower pass rates than White test takers.³⁷ That analysis found a gap in pass rates as high as 38 percentage points.

In addition, the cost of teacher licensure exams, which ranges from \$100 to \$300 each, can be particularly burdensome to low-income students. Some teacher candidates may have to pay to take several different basic skills, pedagogy, and subject-matter exams to earn their certification.

³³ Boston Teacher Residency. (2016). "The BTR Impact." Retrieved from http://www.bpe.org/bostonteacherresidency/about/impact; National Center for Teacher Residencies. (2016). 2015 Network Impact Overview. Chicago; Guha, R., Hyler, M., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2016). Teacher residencies: Building a high-quality, sustainable workforce. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute; Solomon, J. (2009). The Boston Teacher Residency: District-Based Teacher Education. Journal of Teacher Education, 60(5), 478–488.

³⁴ Commission on Teacher Credentialing, California School Paraprofessional Teacher Training Program. An Annual Report to the Legislature as Required by SB 1636 (Sacramento, CA: Author, 2008), accessed August 10, 2016, http://www.ctc.ca.gov/reports/PTTP_2008_LegRpt.pdf; Podolsky, A., Kini, T., Bishop, J., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2016). Solving the teacher shortage: How to attract and retain excellent educators. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

³⁵ Nettles, M. T., Scatton, L. H., Steinberg, J. H., & Tyler, L. L. (2011). *Performance and passing rate differences of African American and White prospective teachers on Praxis examinations*. Princeton, NJ: Educational Testing Service; Professional Educators Standards Board (2018). Testing Barriers in Washington State. Olympia, WA: Author; National Research Council. (2001). *Testing teacher candidates: The role of licensure tests in improving teacher quality*. Committee on Assessment and Teacher Quality, K. J. Mitchell, D. Z. Robinson, B. S. Plake, & K. T. Knowles (Eds.). Washington, DC: National Academy Press; Cole, B. P. (1986). The Black educator: An endangered species. *Journal of Negro Education, 55*(3), 326–334.

³⁶ Goertz, M. E., & Pitcher, B. (1985). *The impact of NTE use by states on teacher selection*. (RR-85-1). Princeton, NJ: Educational Testing Service.

³⁷ National Research Council. (2001). *Testing teacher candidates: The role of licensure tests in improving teacher quality.* Committee on Assessment and Teacher Quality, K. J. Mitchell, D. Z. Robinson, B. S. Plake, & K. T. Knowles (Eds.). Washington, DC: National Academy Press.

These costs are amplified for teachers who do not pass their exams initially and must pay to retake them.³⁸

Since 2014, many states have begun to incorporate performance assessment, such as Praxis Performance Assessment for Teachers and edTPA, into their licensure processes, either as standard requirements or as optional substitutions for traditional tests. These newer assessments typically require teaching candidates to develop portfolios of work that include unit plans, videos of their instruction, evaluation of student work, and written reflections that connect their teaching practice to theory. They are designed to more authentically evaluate candidates' readiness for teaching, and indeed, initial research finds that teacher candidates' scores on the performance assessment often predict their students' academic gains.

Initial data suggest that performance assessments may reduce barriers to entry into the profession for teachers of color. A study of the Performance Assessment for California Teachers (PACT) found no disparities in pass rates between candidates of color and White candidates.³⁹ An analysis of 2013 field test results for the edTPAfound that there was relatively small variation in the average scores of test takers by race, ethnicity, and primary language. Further, the study found that there was greater variation in scores within subgroups than between subgroups.⁴⁰ A 2014 study by edTPA found that while the average score for Black teachers was somewhat lower than for White teachers, the gaps were smaller than those found in more traditional teacher licensure exams.⁴¹ A later study of the edTPA in Washington found no disparities in pass rates between Black and White candidates, but slightly higher failure rates for Latinx candidates.⁴²

These results are significantly better than the outcomes of traditional multiple-choice teacher exams, and they are arguably more important because they deal with the actual ability of candidates to teach. For example, research on beginning teacher performance assessments, such as PACT, Connecticut's Beginning Teacher Educator Support and Training Program (BEST), and edTPA suggests that, like the National Board assessment, teacher candidates' scores on the performance assessment predict their students' gains on standardized tests.⁴³ In addition, a study

 ³⁸ Kolman, J. S., Gellert, L. M., & McLurkin, D. L. (2017). Lifting gates and building skills: Preparing diverse candidates to pass new certification exams. In E. Petchauer & L. Mawhinney (Eds.), *Teacher education across minority serving institutions: Programs, policies, and social justice.* New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press.
 ³⁹ Darling-Hammond, L. (2010). *Evaluating teacher effectiveness: How teacher performance assessments can*

measure and improve teaching. Washington, DC: Center for American Progress.

⁴⁰ edTPA. (2013). *2013 edTPA Field test: Summary report.* Stanford, CA: edTPA.

⁴¹ edTPA. (2015). *Educative assessment & meaningful support: 2014 edTPA administrative report*. Stanford, CA: edTPA.

⁴² Goldhaber, D., Cowan, J., & Theobald, R. (2017). Evaluating prospective teachers: Testing the predictive validity of the edTPA. *Journal of Teacher Education*, *68*(4), 377–393.

⁴³ Darling-Hammond, L. (2010). Evaluating teacher effectiveness: How teacher performance assessments can measure and improve teaching. Washington, DC: Center for American Progress; Wilson, M., Hallam, P. J., Pecheone, R., & Moss, P. A. (2014). Evaluating the validity of portfolio assessments for licensure decisions. Education Policy Analysis Archives, 22(6); edTPA. (2015). Educative assessment & meaningful support: 2014 edTPA administrative report. Stanford, CA: edTPA; Goldhaber, D., Cowan, J., & Theobald, R. (2017). Evaluating prospective teachers: Testing the predictive validity of the edTPA. Journal of Teacher Education, 68(4), 377–393.

from North Carolina's early implementation of the edTPA suggests that future teachers of color who score higher on the performance assessment also have higher value-added estimates and evaluation ratings.⁴⁴ These assessments also function as learning tools, and they have been found to develop teachers' skills and increase their effectiveness as they learn to demonstrate the ability to plan and implement curriculum, address a range of student needs, instruct effectively, and assess student learning to improve instruction.⁴⁵

Challenging Teaching Conditions

Once teachers of color enter the classroom, the teaching conditions they encounter can discourage them from staying at the same school or even staying in the profession. This is important because three in four teachers of color work in the quartile of schools that serve the most students of color. Scholars have noted that schools that serve the most students of color often contend with a range of challenges, including accountability pressures and a lack of resources and support.⁴⁶ Teachers citing a lack of administrative support, in particular, were more than twice as likely to leave their school or teaching entirely.⁴⁷ For teachers of color, specifically, an analysis of 2011–13 nationally representative teacher survey data found that turnover was strongly associated with a lack of classroom autonomy and school influence.⁴⁸

Effective school leaders can influence several teaching conditions in a school and can help create environments in which teachers of color want to continue to teach. Unfortunately, many school leadership training programs do not prepare principals to be effective in all the roles they must play. A 2005 study of school administrator training programs found that these programs were considered among the weakest U.S. education school programs.⁴⁹ Clinical training requirements, for example, varied considerably between programs, with some requiring as few as 45 hours at a school site and others requiring as many as 300. Many prospective principals reported that their coursework failed to prepare them for the realities of leading a school.⁵⁰ While some

⁴⁴ https://publicpolicy.unc.edu/files/2018/07/edTPA-ResearchBrief-2018-r3 Final.pdf

⁴⁵ Darling-Hammond, L. (2010). *Evaluating teacher effectiveness: How teacher performance assessments can measure and improve teaching.* Washington, DC: Center for American Progress.

⁴⁶ Simon, N. S., & Johnson, S. M. (2015). Teacher turnover in high-poverty schools: What we know and can do. *Teachers College Record, 117*(3), 1–36; Ingersoll, R., & May, H. (2011). *Recruitment, retention and the minority teacher shortage. CPRE Research Report #RR-69.* Philadelphia, PA: Consortium for Policy Research in Education, University of Pennsylvania; Ronfeldt, M., Loeb, S., & Wyckoff, J. (2013). How teacher turnover harms student achievement. *American Educational Research Journal, 50*(1), 4–36.

⁴⁷ Carver-Thomas, D., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2017). *Teacher turnover: Why it matters and what we can do about it.* Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute

⁴⁸ Ingersoll, R., & May, H. (2016). *Minority teacher recruitment, employment, and retention: 1987 to 2013.* (Research brief). Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁴⁹ Levine, A. (2005). *Educating school leaders*. Princeton, NJ: The Education Schools Project; see also Fry, B., Bottoms, G., & O'Neill, K. (2005). *The principal internship: How can we get it right?* Atlanta, GA: Southern Regional Education Board.

⁵⁰ The Wallace Foundation. (2016). *Improving university principal preparation programs: Five themes from the field.* New York, NY: The Wallace Foundation.

programs have improved since then, there are still many administrators who do not get the benefit of strong preservice preparation.

Studies also suggest that teachers of color experience unique adverse teaching conditions regardless of the quality of the schools in which they teach. In a qualitative study of Black teachers across the U.S., many reported facing racial discrimination and stereotyping in their schools. Many respondents said their colleagues lacked respect for their expertise as educators, and they were often pigeonholed as disciplinarians.⁵¹ For some Black teachers, that might mean they were assigned disciplinary roles instead of other leadership roles they might be more interested in, such as roles recognizing their content expertise. In other cases, they might be criticized by school leaders or colleagues if they do not embody the disciplinarian persona expected of them.⁵² Teachers also reported that they felt obligated to take on additional responsibilities to support their Black students who might not otherwise receive the support they needed. While most Black educators described feeling called to the profession to improve schooling experiences for students of color, the added workload outside of teaching could contribute to increased turnover.

In a qualitative study of Latinx teachers, many Latinx teachers also reported being viewed as inferior to other teachers or being beneficial only for Latinx students.⁵³ Some also reported receiving criticism from other teachers and school leaders when they embedded culturally relevant materials into their curricula or allowed or encouraged students to speak Spanish in the classroom. Many bilingual teachers discussed wanting to support their schools, students, and families by helping with translation but also described the added burden of being expected to do so.

School Closures

Even for teachers of color committed to continuing to teach in their schools, district and state policies can increase turnover rates. In 2012, in an era of school closings and layoffs in many cities, the rate of involuntary turnover was much higher for Black teachers than for all other teachers, constituting nearly a third of all Black teacher turnover. Disproportionately high rates of involuntary turnover among Black teachers were the result of Black teachers involuntarily leaving the profession and moving schools. Twelve percent of Black teachers who left the profession did so involuntarily, compared with 10% of teachers overall.⁵⁴ And while about 30%

⁵¹ Griffin, A., & Tackie, H. (2016). *Through our eyes: Perspectives and reflections from Black teachers*. Washington, DC: The Education Trust.

⁵² Brockenbrough, E. (2015). "The discipline stop": Black male teachers and the politics of urban school discipline. *Education and Urban Society*, *47*, 499–522.

⁵³ Griffin, A. (2018). *Our stories, our struggles, our strengths: Perspectives and reflections from Latino teachers.* Washington, DC: The Education Trust.

⁵⁴ Sutcher, L., Darling-Hammond, L., & Carver-Thomas, D. (2016). *A coming crisis in teaching? Teacher supply, demand, and shortages in the U.S.* Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

of all movers left their schools involuntarily, the number was greater for Black teachers, with over 50% doing so.⁵⁵

Teacher layoffs during the recession and school closings in urban districts were largely due to both declining enrollments and sanctions for schools with low test scores under No Child Left Behind.⁵⁶ Decreases in the numbers of Black teachers have been proportionally much greater than decreases in the size of the overall teaching force in these cities. In New Orleans, more than 7,000 teachers—most of whom were Black—were fired en masse after Hurricane Katrina. They were replaced by predominantly young, White teachers brought in to teach in the charter schools that replaced the district schools.⁵⁷ As a result, the number of Black teachers there declined by more than 62%. In other major cities, the decline in the number of Black teachers ranges from 15% to 39%.⁵⁸

A report on One Newark, a school restructuring plan led by the New Jersey Department of Education to improve Newark Public Schools, found that schools targeted for closure, turnaround, or replacement by charter schools in 2012–13—processes often involving massive staffing changes—served higher shares of Black children and were disproportionately staffed by Black and Latinx teachers. They were not, however, necessarily the worst-performing schools.⁵⁹ Based on the analysis in the report, Black teachers were twice as likely to have to reapply for a teaching position as were White teachers in similar school settings. Latinx and Native American teachers also were more likely to have their employment disrupted. The teachers employed in charter schools in the district were far more likely to be White than Black, Latinx, or Native American and were more likely to have less than 5 years of experience.

Part 2: Promising Practices and State Policy Examples

Increasing the number of teachers of color in the workforce requires both intentional preparation, and hiring, and providing them with ongoing support to overcome the barriers to recruitment and retention described above. Fortunately, programs and initiatives across the country provide evidence that an intentional and sustained approach to recruiting and retaining

⁵⁵ Goldring, R., Taie, S., & Riddles, M. (2014). *Teacher attrition and mobility: Results from the 2012–13 Teacher Follow-up Survey.* Washington, DC: National Center for Education Statistics; Carver-Thomas, D., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2017). *Teacher turnover: Why it matters and what we can do about it.* Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁵⁶ Executive Office of the President. (2012). Investing in our future: Returning teachers to the classroom. Washington, DC: Executive Office of the President. <u>https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/sites/default/</u><u>files/Investing_in_Our_Future_Report.pdf</u> (accessed 8/7/19).

⁵⁷ Holley-Walker, D. (2007). The Accountability Cycle: The Recovery School District Act and New Orleans' charter schools. *Connecticut Law Review, 40*(1), 125–163; Ciolino, M. S., Kirylo, J. D., Mirón, L., & Frazier, K. (2015). Education reform in New Orleans: Voices from the recovery school district. In L. Mirón, B. R. Beabout, & J. L. Boselovic (Eds.), *Only in New Orleans: School Choice and Equity Post-Hurricane Katrina*. Rotterdam, Netherlands: Sense Publishers.

⁵⁸ Bond, B., Quintero, E., Casey, L., & Di Carlo, M. (2015). *The state of teacher diversity in American education.* Washington, DC: Albert Shanker Institute.

⁵⁹ Weber, M., Baker, B., & Oluwole, J. (2014). *"One Newark's" racially disparate impact on teachers.* New Brunswick, NJ: New Jersey Education Policy Forum.

teachers of color can be successful. This section describes policy strategies aimed at overcoming barriers to recruiting and retaining teachers of color and provides examples of how they have been implemented. These strategies include building high-retention pathways into the profession, supporting new teachers of color both once they enter the profession and throughout their careers, and increasing the capacity of school leaders to create working environments that are both supportive and affirming for teachers of color.

Build High-Retention, Supportive Pathways Into Teaching

Given the evidence that teacher turnover is a primary driver of shortages of teachers of color, it is critical that policies are tailored not only to recruit new teachers, but to retain them for the long haul. Research shows that improving teacher retention begins with high-quality teacher preparation; however, in many cases, teachers of color are more likely to begin teaching without having completed comprehensive preparation. This is not surprising, given the cost of traditional TPPs and the debt burden faced by college students of color. Enrollments in alternative certification programs have increased for teachers of color, but the vast majority of new teachers are still educated through traditional TPPs at colleges and universities.

Changes to admissions policies and student financial support can help mitigate the need for candidates of color to enter teaching through alternative certification pathways by increasing access to high-quality teacher preparation institutions. Increased access to high-quality preparation can improve the chances of teachers of color feeling successful in the classroom and continuing to teach long term.⁶⁰ By underwriting the cost of completing a high-quality TPP, state and local policymakers can encourage more students of color to pursue a teaching career—and to do so through a high-quality program. Among the high-retention pathways into teaching are increasing access to comprehensive preservice preparation through service scholarship and loan forgiveness programs, teacher residencies, and Grow Your Own programs. Other measures, such as inclusive admissions policies, course articulation agreements, ongoing mentoring and support, and accreditation and licensure policies can help increase access to high-retention pathways into teaching for teachers of color.

Service Scholarships and Loan Forgiveness Programs

Many states are working to support candidates of color by underwriting the cost of teacher preparation. **Service scholarship and loan forgiveness programs** cover or reimburse a portion of

⁶⁰ We define high-quality preparation as teacher preparation that offers the pedagogical theory and opportunities for clinical application that prospective teachers need for long-term success in the classroom. A study by Ingersoll, Merrill, and May of beginning teacher turnover found that those first-year teachers who had entered the classroom having received the most comprehensive preparation—five or more teaching methods courses, preparation in using instructional materials, learning theory or child psychology courses, conducting classroom observations, and at least a semester of student teaching with feedback—were two to three times less likely to leave the profession after the first year than those who received little preparation to teach before entering the classroom. Ingersoll, R., Merrill, L., & May, H. (2014). *What are the effects of teacher education and preparation on beginning teacher attrition?* Philadelphia: Consortium for Policy Research in Education, University of Pennsylvania.

tuition costs in exchange for a commitment to teach in high-need schools or subject areas, typically for 3 to 5 years. These programs are effective at recruiting teachers, especially when they underwrite a significant portion of educational costs.⁶¹ A recent study of the correlation between financial incentives and teacher diversity found that the availability of loan forgiveness in a district was associated with an increase in teachers of color of nearly 4 percentage points—25% more than the average district.⁶² Many states have made recent substantial investments in teacher service scholarship and loan forgiveness programs as a strategy both to address teacher shortages as well as diversify the teacher workforce.⁶³ For example, this year California invested nearly \$90 million in creating a new teacher service scholarship program, providing grants of up to \$20,000 per teacher.

One of the most lauded service scholarship programs was the recently relaunched **North Carolina Teaching Fellows Program**, a highly selective scholarship program that provides fellows up to \$8,250 annually for up to 4 years to attend an approved North Carolina university in exchange for a commitment to teach in the state for at least 4 years. From 1986 to 2015, the program recruited nearly 11,000 candidates into teaching,⁶⁴ and fellows were far more likely to continue teaching in North Carolina public schools than teachers credentialed through other programs. The program expanded the teaching pool by bringing a disproportionate number of males, teachers of color, and math and science teachers into the profession.⁶⁵ Though briefly discontinued due to budget cuts, the state has recently restarted the program and has invested \$6 million to begin supporting 160 candidates each year beginning in 2018–19.⁶⁶

Several states currently offer service scholarship or loan forgiveness programs specifically targeted to increasing the number of teachers of color. **Minnesota's Collaborative Urban and Greater Minnesota Educators of Color Program** is a grant program that funds four of the state's urban TPPs and, beginning in 2018, offers additional grants on a competitive basis.⁶⁷ The four universities that are longtime recipients of this funding offer supports to teacher candidates of color that include subsidized tuition, mentoring, exam preparation, and stipends for candidates

⁶¹ Podolsky, A., Kini, T., Bishop, J., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2016). Solving the teacher shortage: How to attract and retain excellent educators. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁶² Hansen, M., Quintero, D., & Feng, L. (2018). Can money attract more minorities into the teaching profession? Washington, DC: Brookings Institution.

⁶³ Espinoza, D., Saunders, R., Kini, T., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2018). *Taking the long view: State efforts to solve teacher shortages by strengthening the profession*. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁶⁴ Podolsky, A., & Kini, T. (2016). How effective are loan forgiveness and service scholarships for recruiting teachers? (Policy brief). Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁶⁵ Henry, G. T., Bastian, K. C., & Smith, A. A. (2012). Scholarships to recruit the "best and brightest" into teaching: Who is recruited, where do they teach, and how long do they stay? Educational Researcher, 41(3), 83–92.

⁶⁶ North Carolina Teaching Fellows. (2017). The program. https://ncteachingfellows.com/the-program/.

⁶⁷ Minnesota Department of Education. (n.d.). Collaborative Urban and Greater Minnesota Educators of Color Program, Introduction memo. https://education.mn.gov/mdeprod/groups/educ/documents/grant/bwrl/mdcx/~edisp/mde071939.pdf.

who are student teaching.⁶⁸ Two of the Minnesota partner universities offer programs tailored to candidates of East African and Southeast Asian descent, specifically. Together, the state's four long-term partners have prepared a quarter of the state's current workforce of teachers of color.

The Oregon Teacher Scholars Program (OTSP) provides scholarships to teacher candidates who are linguistically or ethnically diverse and enrolled in an approved licensure program. The program awards \$5,000 per year per student for up to two years to be used for education expenses such as tuition, books, gas money to support travel to teaching practicum locations, test prep materials, and living costs. In addition to linking scholars from across the state, OTSP also provides students with networking opportunities and connects them with paid professional development events and conferences. The state's Educator Equity Advisory Group has indicated the need to create a parallel program that supports linguistically and ethnically diverse school leaders.⁶⁹ Additional state scholarship, the Tennessee Minority Teaching Fellows Program, and the Kentucky Academy for Equity in Teaching. These programs offer candidates \$3,000 to \$5,000 per year for two to four years in exchange for a commitment to teach, often for the number of years they received funding.⁷⁰

New York

New York currently has a number of programs in place that offer financial support to individuals pursuing teaching, including those pursuing certification in subject areas facing persistent shortages across the state.⁷¹ In addition, the creation of the **Excelsior Scholarship program**, which provides tuition-free college access to two- and four-year degree programs for individuals coming from families making less than \$125,000 a year (up from the initial threshold of \$110,000), opens the potential to subsidize teacher training for a larger population of future New York teachers.⁷² The budget for FY 2019 includes \$118 million to support an estimated 27,000 students.⁷³ It should be noted that early reporting suggests current requirements around continuous enrollment and credit accumulation may serve as barriers to access and suggest an opportunity to consider how the program could be tailored to meet the needs of more students

program.html; https://education.ky.gov/teachers/div/Pages/Kentucky-Academy-for-Equity-in-Teaching----KAET.aspx?fbclid=IwAR0oIxvMZFEYxkRlkTuAXOS1B67WgaPeN8ZnqtFnrSvmANoiiYvpTIzexws.

⁶⁸ Augsburg University. (January 2018). EAST program interim progress report, 2017–2019 CUE funding cycle. https://www.leg.state.mn.us/docs/2018/mandated/180369.pdf.; Concordia University, University of St. Thomas & Hamline University. (January 2018). Collaborative Urban Educator Grant Program Legislative Report. https://www.leg.state.mn.us/Irl/mndocs/mandates_detail?orderid=9959.

⁶⁹ https://www.oregon.gov/eac/Documents/2019%20Educator%20Equity%20Report.pdf

⁷⁰ See: <u>http://www.ffmt.org</u>; <u>https://dhe.mo.gov/ppc/grants/minorityteaching.php</u>; <u>https://www.tn.gov/collegepays/money-for-college/loan-forgiveness-programs/minority-teaching-fellows-</u>

⁷¹ <u>NYS Masters-in-Education Teacher Incentive Scholarship Program;</u> <u>Teach NYC Graduate Scholarship Program;</u> <u>NYS Math & Science Teaching Incentive Program:</u>

⁷² https://www.ny.gov/sites/ny.gov/files/atoms/files/ExcelsiorScholarship_Toolkit.pdf

⁷³ http://www2.cuny.edu/wp-content/uploads/sites/4/page-assets/about/administration/offices/budget-and-finance/FY2019-State-Enacted-Budget-Analysis-w-CITY-EXEC-Final.pdf

from low-income families.⁷⁴ Further, considering how Excelsior and other programs could be leveraged and extended to support the recruitment and retention of teachers of color could be an important step in addition to considering where remaining gaps in access to funding might also be filled by more targeted incentives for future teachers of color.

Teacher Residencies

Teacher residencies—modeled on medical residencies—are another promising high-retention approach to preparing teachers of color. Teacher residencies are partnerships between districts and universities that subsidize and improve teachers' training to teach in high-need schools and in high-demand subject areas.⁷⁵ Participants spend a year working as apprentices with highly-effective mentor teachers, while completing related coursework at partnering universities that earns them a credential and a master's degree. During this time, residents receive financial support, often in the form of a stipend and tuition assistance. They commit to teaching an additional three to five years in their district, with ongoing mentoring support.

The residency model, which provides comprehensive preparation, improves upon alternative certification programs in a few ways. Teacher residents gain extensive classroom experience by learning from an accomplished veteran teacher in a high-need school before becoming solely responsible for their own class. This increases their chances of success in the classroom and gives the residency program an opportunity to assess residents' performance before entrusting them with students of their own. The service commitment has the dual effect of filtering out candidates not willing to make a serious commitment to teach and ensuring that they continue to teach in high-need schools as their effectiveness increases.⁷⁶ It also allows the partnering school district to closely shape the type of coursework and other preparation the residents receive, so that residents fully understand the local district context. The residency model helps new teachers build strong relationships by clustering cohorts in university classes and school sites, and by providing ongoing mentoring and support once residents become teachers. Thus, residents can collaborate with and support one another through the challenges of being novice teachers.⁷⁷

Research on teacher residency programs shows that they are effective both in bringing more teachers of color into the profession and in preparing them to stay for the long term. Nationally,

74

http://www.ihep.org/sites/default/files/uploads/docs/pubs/ihep_state_free_college_ny_excelsior_scholarship.pdf ; https://www.gothamgazette.com/opinion/8025-the-ups-and-downs-of-excelsior-scholarship-s-freshman-yearand-what-comes-next; https://www.democratandchronicle.com/story/news/politics/albany/2019/04/10/freesuny-tuition-new-enrollment-data-shed-light-excelsior-program/3413358002/;

https://www.nytimes.com/2017/08/25/nyregion/excelsior-college-scholarship-program-new-york.html ⁷⁵ Guha, R., Hyler, M. E., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2016). The teacher residency: An innovative model for preparing teachers. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁷⁶ Wiswall, M. (2013). The dynamics of teacher quality. Journal of Public Economics, 100, 61–78; Kini, T., & Podolsky, A. (2016). Does teaching experience increase teacher effectiveness? A review of the research. Palo Alto: Learning Policy Institute.

⁷⁷. Guha, R., Hyler, M. E., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2016). The teacher residency: An innovative model for preparing teachers. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

about 49% of residents are people of color. That is the same as the proportion of public school students of color and far more than the 20% of teachers who are people of color nationally.⁷⁸ Principals find graduates of residency programs to be well prepared, and in many cases to be better prepared than typical new teachers. In addition, a review of residency program evaluations shows that residents tend to have much higher retention rates over time than non-resident teachers.⁷⁹

In Massachusetts, the **Boston Teacher Residency** (BTR) has committed to graduating cohorts comprising 50% people of color. With 49% of current graduates identifying as people of color and 35% identifying as Black or Latinx, BTR has just about met that commitment.⁸⁰ BTR residents are far more likely to continue teaching in Boston Public Schools than other new teachers: 71% of BTR graduates continued teaching in the district through year 6, compared to just 51% of their peers. Evidence also suggests that BTR graduates are very strong teachers. In 2014–15, BTR graduates were twice as likely to be rated "Exemplary" as other Massachusetts teachers.

Other residency programs can be found in urban and rural communities throughout the country.⁸¹ Two thirds of **San Francisco Teacher Residency** (SFTR) residents identify as people of color, compared to 49% of the San Francisco Unified School District (SFUSD) teacher workforce, and graduates of the program have impressive retention rates once they enter the field.⁸² After 5 years, 80% of SFTR graduates are still teaching in SFUSD, compared to just 38% of beginning teachers hired by SFUSD and 20% of Teach for America corps members placed in the district. One hundred percent of principals in SFUSD reported the residents were more effective than other beginning teachers. Below are some examples of state programs helping to grow the number of new teachers entering the profession through high-quality residencies.

Pennsylvania

Consistent with its ESSA state plan, Pennsylvania recently launched a \$2 million competitive grant program to support the growth of teacher (and leader) residencies in the state in order to improve educator recruitment, preparation, and retention and increase the diversity of the educator workforce.⁸³ The program is designed to support both undergraduate and post-

⁷⁸. Guha, R., Hyler, M. E., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2016). The teacher residency: An innovative model for preparing teachers. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁷⁹ Guha, R., Hyler, M. E., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2016). The teacher residency: An innovative model for preparing teachers. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute; National Center for Teacher Residencies. (2016). 2015 Network Impact Overview. Chicago: National Center for Teacher Residencies; Solomon, J. (2009). The Boston Teacher Residency: District-based teacher education. Journal of Teacher Education, 60(5), 478–488; Sloan, K., & Blazevski, J. (2015). New Visions Hunter College Urban Teacher Residency: Measures of success. Bloomington, IN: Rockman.

 ⁸⁰ Boston Teacher Residency. (2016). Impact. http://www.bpe.org/boston-teacher-residency/about/impact/.
 ⁸¹ Guha, R., Hyler, M. E., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2016). The teacher residency: An innovative model for preparing teachers. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁸² Learning Policy Institute. (2016). Teacher Residencies in California (Policy brief). Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁸³ <u>https://www.education.pa.gov/Teachers%20-%20Administrators/Teacher%20Quality/Pages/Innovative-</u> <u>Teacher-and-Principal-Residency-Programs-Grant.aspx</u>

graduate residency programs and provides implementation or expansion grants of up to \$750,000 and planning grants of up to \$75,000. Reflecting some of the key characteristics of strong residencies described above, educator preparation programs must apply in partnership with high-need LEAs, creating opportunities for new and strengthened partnerships across the state, and programs must provide a full year clinical residency as well as financial support that "eliminates or significantly reduces" the financial burden for candidates. Following up on the state's initial investment, Pennsylvania's governor recently committed an additional \$2.1 million to fund grants for the program's second year.⁸⁴

California

In response to severe teacher shortages, the California legislature recently invested \$75 million to fund teacher residency programs in special education, bilingual education, and STEM—the subjects where the state's shortages are greatest.⁸⁵ The program, which launched in 2018–19, provides grant funding of \$20,000 per teacher, matched by districts, and will fund more than 3,500 new teachers in the state committed to serving in the sponsoring district for at least four years following the residency.⁸⁶

Texas

In 2013, Texas enacted legislation to create a state teacher residency program and provide candidates with a yearlong subsidized apprenticeship during which they take courses while working in the classroom alongside an expert teacher.⁸⁷ In exchange for the comprehensive, district-based preparation, participants commit to teach in a hard-to-staff school for four years. In its fourth year of operation the state-funded residency program was preparing 36 candidates annually through an intensive and highly-focused preparation program. The program was funded with an investment of nearly \$1.3 million in the 2016–17 biennium, and grew to include two Texas universities partnering with four school districts across the state, including Dallas Independent School District.⁸⁸ Unfortunately, the Texas legislature did not fund the residency program in the current 2018–19 biennium. Early evidence from the program points to residents' success in raising achievement in fifth and eighth grade science.⁸⁹

Louisiana

In 2016, the Louisiana Board of Elementary and Secondary Education formally adopted regulations requiring a year-long residency as a pathway to licensure.⁹⁰ The state intends to use

⁸⁴ <u>https://www.media.pa.gov/Pages/Education-Details.aspx?newsid=682</u>

⁸⁵ <u>https://www.ctc.ca.gov/docs/default-source/educator-prep/grants/rfp-teacher-residency-10-12-18-final.pdf</u>

⁸⁶ <u>https://www.ctc.ca.gov/educator-prep/grant-funded-programs/teacher-residency-grant-program</u>

⁸⁷ <u>https://capitol.texas.gov/tlodocs/83R/billtext/html/HB01752I.htm</u>

⁸⁸ <u>https://www.dallasteacherresidency.org/</u>

⁸⁹ <u>http://www.thecb.state.tx.us/reports/pdf/9129.pdf</u>

⁹⁰ <u>https://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/default-source/teaching/teacher-preparation-transition-guide.pdf?sfvrsn=12; https://www.doa.la.gov/osr/lac/28v45/28v45.doc</u>

Title II funds to support its ongoing effort to develop and implement these yearlong teacher residencies.⁹¹ Additionally, Louisiana committed to funding university administration costs related to the implementation of year-long residencies, a \$2,000 stipend for candidates completing yearlong residencies, and a \$1,000 stipend for mentor teachers hosting yearlong residents. Given the scale and challenge of building residencies across an entire teacher preparation system, the state has committed funding to ensure support is available to ease this transition. In total, \$7.3 million will be used as transitional funding through 2019 for university administration costs, teacher resident stipends, and mentor teacher stipends and training. The sources of funding will include IDEA and Title II dollars, in addition to state funds. Funding for rural school systems and their preparation partners will come through a portion of the Department of Education's five-year, \$66.8 million Teacher Incentive Fund (TIF) grant. Louisiana also plans to use the state's Title II set-aside to support stipends and training for mentor teachers.

New York

As New York works to implement the recently extended student teacher experience,⁹² teacher residency models offer an opportunity to build reciprocal partnerships between pk-12 districts and preparation programs and create rich learning experiences for teacher candidates prior to taking on their own classroom. Further, a recent report from the current New York City comptroller, Scott Stringer, proposes a model residency program and highlights the potential of high-quality paid residencies to help stem the high rates of teacher turnover impacting early career teachers and teachers working in schools primarily serving students of color and students from low-income families.⁹³

Grow Your Own Programs

Grow Your Own programs recruit teacher candidates from nontraditional populations who are more likely to reflect local diversity and are more likely to continue to teach in their communities. These candidates include high school students, paraprofessionals, after-school program staff, and other community members.⁹⁴

South Carolina

The **South Carolina Teacher Cadet** program, which offers a yearlong course for college credit to 2,700 high school students each year, has more than 60,000 graduates over 30 years. One in five

⁹¹ <u>https://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/default-source/louisiana-believes/louisianas-essa-state-plan.pdf?sfvrsn=23</u>

⁹² http://www.regents.nysed.gov/common/regents/files/419hea2.pdf

⁹³ https://comptroller.nyc.gov/wp-content/uploads/documents/Teacher-Residencies.pdf

⁹⁴ Reininger, M. (2012). Hometown disadvantage? It depends on where you're from: Teachers' location preferences and the implications for staffing schools. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis, 34*(2): 127–145; Boyd, D., Lankford, H., Loeb, S., & Wyckoff, J. (2005). Explaining the short careers of highachieving teachers in schools with low-performing students. *American Economic Review, 95*(2), 166–171; Clewell, B. C., & Villegas, A. M. (2001). *Absence unexcused: Ending teacher shortages in high-need areas*. Washington, DC: Urban Institute.

cadets goes on to earn a teacher certification at a cost of just \$100 per student.⁹⁵ In 2016–17, more than a third of the students who completed the cadet program were students of color.⁹⁶ By comparison, fewer than 20% of the state's traditional TPP enrollees in 2014–15 were students of color.⁹⁷

Colorado

Another such program, **Pathways2Teaching** (P2T), based in Colorado, is working to increase teacher diversity by offering programs to high school students in low-performing schools that emphasize the role of teachers in advancing social justice. High school participants, mostly students of color, engage in weekly field experiences building elementary students' literacy skills. They earn college credit for the course and receive support throughout the college search and application process. As of 2013, 100% of the first P2T cohort were taking college courses and 18% had declared an education major, exceeding national averages.⁹⁸

California

<u>California's Paraprofessional Teacher Training Program</u>, funded from 1995–2011, provides an example of the effectiveness of GYO programs in growing and retaining a more diverse teaching force: 65% of the program's participants were people of color and bilingual.⁹⁹ By its 13th year of operation, sponsors reported that of the 1,708 program graduates, 92% had remained California public school employees.¹⁰⁰ In 2016 and 2017, California invested \$45 million in a revived version of the program, the <u>California Classified School Employee Teacher Credentialing Program</u>,¹⁰¹ which is training 2,250 classified staff members to become teachers. More than half of new program participants are Latino or Black.

Washington

99 https://www.ctc.ca.gov/docs/default-source/commission/reports/pttp 2008 legrpt.pdf

⁹⁵ Podolsky, A., Kini, T., Bishop, J., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2016). *Solving the teacher shortage: How to attract and retain excellent educators.* Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁹⁶ Teacher Cadets. (2017). Research. <u>https://www.teachercadets.com/research.html</u> (accessed 8/7/19).

⁹⁷ U.S. Department of Education, Higher Education Act Title II State Report Card System. (2015). Enrollment, by state, by gender and race/ethnicity. <u>https://title2.ed.gov/Public/DataTools/Tables.aspx</u> (accessed 8/7/19).

⁹⁸ Tandon, M., Bianco, M., & Zion, S. (2014). Pathways2Teaching: Being, and becoming a "Rida." In C. E. Sleeter, L. I. Neal, & K. K. Kumashiro (Eds.), *Addressing the Demographic Imperative: Recruiting, Preparing, and Retaining a Diverse and Highly Effective Teaching Force* (pp. 111–125). NY: Routledge.

¹⁰⁰ Commission on Teacher Credentialing. (2008). *California School Paraprofessional Teacher Training Program: An annual report to the legislature as required by SB 1636*. Sacramento, CA: Commission on Teacher Credentialing. <u>http://www.ctc.ca.gov/reports/PTTP_2008_LegRpt.pdf</u>. (accessed 12/20/17).

¹⁰¹ California Commission on Teacher Credentialing, Educator Preparation Committee. (2017). *Update on State-Funded Grant Programs*. Sacramento, CA: California Commission on Teacher Credentialing.

https://www.ctc.ca.gov/docs/default-source/commission/agendas/2017-12/2017-12-3b.pdf?sfvrsn=894e57b1_2 (accessed 4/27/18).

The **Recruiting Washington Teachers** (RWT) program represents the state's effort to create a more diverse teacher workforce through high school teacher pathways and other Grow Your Own programs.¹⁰² Established in 2007, the goal of this program is to prepare a diverse group of future educators who more closely reflect the state's student population.¹⁰³ RWT is a high school teacher academy program that helps students to explore cultural identity and educational opportunities through the lens of the teaching profession.

By supporting participants as they complete high school, apply to and attend college, the RWT program strengthens the pathway from high school to teaching, with the goal that students will become not only certified teachers, but also education leaders who make a difference in their communities. RWT has provided ongoing funding for "learning laboratories"—partner school sites which have developed model curriculum, implementation resources, and professional development tools that are made available for any school interested in establishing a teacher academy. Each learning laboratory site includes partnerships between local teachers, districts, and higher education institutions to provide guidance and support to students.

Initial research on the Recruiting Washington Teachers program suggests that the program is succeeding in recruiting students of color, multilingual students, and students who will be the first generation in their family to attend college. Surveys of program participants also suggest that the RWT program is increasing participants' interest in teaching as a career, with about half of the RWT respondents (54%) reporting that their participation in the program had increased their interest in a teaching career.¹⁰⁴ While currently only anecdotal evidence exists showing the impact of RWT on teacher recruitment in the sponsoring districts,¹⁰⁵ future evaluation plans—made possible by improvements to student data tracking—will allow the state to track program participants' postsecondary trajectory and, hopefully, career choices.¹⁰⁶

To further diversify the teaching workforce, a Bilingual Educators pilot initiative is currently underway with grant awards of \$450,000 for the 2018–19 school year.¹⁰⁷ The project aims to recruit, prepare, and mentor bilingual high school students, in order to ready them to become future bilingual teachers and counselors in the state. Similar to RWT, pilot sites selected through

¹⁰² <u>https://www.pesb.wa.gov/pathways/rwt/</u>

¹⁰³ Washington Professional Educator Standards Board. (n.d.). Recruiting Washington Teachers. <u>http://pathway.pesb.wa.gov/future-educators/rwt</u> (accessed 12/12/17).

¹⁰⁴ Geiger, B., & Hougan. (2017). *Recruiting Washington Teachers: 2016–2017 annual report*. Olympia, WA: Professional Educator Standards Board. <u>https://drive.google.com/file/d/1tn7nCYz-</u> OfFcY697LhHr30D1pHJU0ioc/view (accessed 07/08/18).

 ¹⁰⁵ Simmons, A. (February 12, 2018). Teacher recruitment starting in high school. Marin County, California: Edutopia. <u>https://www.edutopia.org/article/teacher-recruitment-starting-high-school</u> (accessed 07/20/18)
 ¹⁰⁶ Geiger, B., & Hougan, E. (2017). Recruiting Washington teachers: 2016–17 annual report. Olympia, WA: Professional Educators Standards Board.

 ¹⁰⁷ State of Washington Professional Educators Standards Board. (n.d.). Recruiting Washington Teachers.
 <u>http://pathway.pesb.wa.gov/future-educators/rwt</u> (accessed 12/4/17); State of Washington Professional
 Educators Standards Board. Recruiting Washington Teachers – Bilingual Educators Initiative: Grant awards 2018–2019. https://docs.google.com/document/d/1Yxx_llhKBqMViwlOMjfL3Fc7lEPbhhUVUuCbmul_W-c/edit (accessed 6/28/18).

the competitive grant application process will serve as learning laboratories to develop best practices and resources to share across the state.

Finally, the state is pairing these efforts with targeted financial incentives to encourage school staff to pursue their certification. The <u>Pipeline for Paraeducators Conditional Loan Scholarship</u> <u>Program</u> (Parapipeline Program) provides financial support (up to \$4,000 in exchange for a two year teaching service commitment) to classified instructional staff with at least three years of classroom experience to pursue their Associate of Arts (AA) degree in order to qualify, enroll in, and complete an Alternative Route program.¹⁰⁸

New York

For New York, the current landscape of grow your own models and programs funded through initiatives like the My Brother's Keeper Teacher Opportunity Corps and NYC Men Teach presents an opportunity for a broader, more aligned statewide push to grow and connect such efforts in the service of building a more robust pipeline of future teachers of color.

Course Articulation Agreements and 2+2 Preparation Programs

Mississippi

Teacher preparation programs can also increase recruitment efforts by partnering with community colleges to create degree articulation agreements. Further, for rural communities that often find themselves far from a four-year university, local community colleges can support the teacher pipeline through innovative programs that leverage these articulation agreements such as Mississippi's **2 + 2 program**.¹⁰⁹ The partnership between Hinds Community College (HCC) and Delta State University (DSU) offers junior and senior level courses for a bachelor's degree in Elementary Education and the Childhood Development Program. Central Mississippi area students who wish to complete their Elementary Education degree can take classes at a designated Hinds campus, by way of traditional classroom, video conferencing and online options.¹¹⁰ Because of the large number of students of color enrolled in community colleges— over 40% by some estimates—such partnerships have the potential to attract more candidates of color to the teaching profession.¹¹¹

Montana

¹⁰⁸ Professional Educator Standards Board, Pipeline for Paraeducators Conditional Loan Scholarship. (2018). <u>https://www.pesb.wa.gov/paraeducator-board/paraeducator-board-grant-programs/pipeline-for-paraeducators-conditional-loan-scholarship/</u> (7/23/18).

¹⁰⁹ <u>http://www.mde.k12.ms.us/docs/state-superintendent/mississippi-essa-consolidated-state-plan-usde-v5-2018-03-26-final-with-sigs_20180329.pdf?sfvrsn=2</u>

¹¹⁰ <u>https://www.hindscc.edu/programs-of-study/2-plus-2</u>

¹¹¹ https://trends.collegeboard.org/sites/default/files/trends-in-community-colleges-research-brief.pdf

Stone Child College (SCC) is a tribal community college of the Chippewa Cree Tribe in Montana. The college offers associate degrees in early childhood education and elementary education. These degrees simultaneously prepare candidates for employment as paraprofessionals and for transfer to a 4-year education program. Through an articulation agreement with Montana State University-Northern (MSU-Northern), all education courses required by SCC are accepted at MSU-Northern.¹¹² Because community colleges often serve students of color, they can be a useful source for diversifying the pool of aspiring teachers.

Hawaii

In Oahu, Hawaii, high-need communities across the island have faced ongoing shortages of qualified educators. Historically, they have relied on importing teachers from the mainland to fill positions in their hard-to-staff schools. Responding to the challenge of finding a sustainable solution to staffing needs, **Leeward Community College** established 2+2 teacher preparation partnerships with local partner institutions of higher education to "home grow" teachers from within their communities, where shortages are most acute.

As the community college partner, Leeward prepares candidates during their first 2 years of preparation. Leeward's intensive Associate in Arts in Teaching (AAT) degree offers candidates—predominately from underrepresented communities, and Native Hawaiian communities in particular—the option to become paraeducators or to continue to a 4-year university seeking teacher licensure. Numerous field experiences, practical case studies, and multilayered supports are hallmarks of the program. Program Coordinator Roberta Martel articulated their focus on putting the candidate at the center of their work, explaining, "We understand that life gets in the way sometimes, especially [for students from] hard-to-serve communities. We don't water down anything that we do, but we do provide safety nets." These supports take the form of peer mentors for struggling students, dedicated counselors committed to the success of each student, and multiple submissions of case study work to ensure students understand content deeply. In this way, Leeward strives to nurture each aspiring teacher it enrolls, hoping they will show the same care to students in their future classrooms. Importantly, Leeward has seen ballooning enrollment over the past decade—from 24 to 500 students—in a period when teacher preparation enrollment is declining nationally.

North Carolina

Halifax County Schools in North Carolina has also struggled with acute teacher shortages and poor teacher retention. As a rural district hours from traditional TPPs, the county has in the past relied on alternative certification programs to fill shortage positions. However, they found that the high turnover rates of those teachers made that an unsustainable solution. To combat this challenge, **Elizabeth City State University** (ECSU) established a 2+2 program partnership that supports students during the last 2 years of their teacher preparation, despite being nearly 100 miles from Halifax County. ECSU faculty travel to the county to offer classes on-site at the local

¹¹² Stone Child College. (n.d.). AA general studies—Teacher education option: Elementary education. http:// www.stonechild.edu/images/PDFs/DegreesOffered/AA/Elementary_Education.pdf.

community college, and they offer virtual classes as well. Students, nearly all of whom are candidates of color, graduate from the 2+2 program having earned a bachelor's degree and certification for elementary teacher licensure. By extensively tying academic coursework to fieldwork, the program stresses immersing candidates in the rural communities in which they will teach. For example, the methods courses for each subject area require students to engage for 10–30 hours in multiple clinical settings; through observations, interviews, and shadowing of skilled teachers, candidates can connect coursework content to what occurs in schools. All of this comes before the 1-year clinical experience that occurs in candidates' senior year. After graduation, ECSU offers all graduates an "Educational Warranty Program," whereby they can seek individualized coaching and mentoring support from ECSU clinical faculty for up to 3 years.

New York

While New York appears to have a robust infrastructure connecting community colleges and 4year teacher preparation programs through the State University of New York (SUNY) system,¹¹³ it might be worth considering how to ensure these types of partnerships are supporting a more targeted approach to supporting the state's educator workforce needs, possibly through increased focus on recruiting and preparing future teachers of color and addressing persistent shortage areas throughout the state.

New Teacher Induction

Induction often includes being matched with a veteran mentor teacher and can also include seminars, classroom assistance, time to collaborate with other teachers, coaching and feedback from experienced teachers, and reduced workloads. Induction is especially effective when teachers participate in a comprehensive set of induction activities. Research points to several key elements of high-quality induction programs that are most strongly associated with reduced levels of turnover. These include having a mentor from the same field, having common planning time with other teachers in the same subject, having regularly scheduled collaboration with other teachers, and being part of an external network of teachers.¹¹⁴ A national study of induction programs found that beginning teachers who receive a comprehensive set of induction supports—including the elements above—stay in teaching at rates more than twice those of teachers who lack these supports.¹¹⁵ However, only a small proportion of teachers receive this comprehensive set of supports.¹¹⁶ There is also great variability in the quality of these programs. High-poverty schools tend to have weaker induction programs that must serve a greater number

¹¹³ <u>https://www.suny.edu/media/suny/content-assets/documents/teachny/FINAL-NYS-Teacher-Preparation-and-Development.pdf</u>

¹¹⁴ Ingersoll, R. M., & Smith, T. M. (2004). Do teacher induction and mentoring matter? *NAASP Bulletin 88*(638), 28–40.

¹¹⁵ Ingersoll & Smith, Do teacher induction and mentoring matter? 28–40.

¹¹⁶ Podolsky, Kini, Bishop, & Darling-Hammond, *Solving the teacher shortage*.
of novice teachers, and these are also schools in which resources are less available and early career teachers generally face more complex and diverse student needs and challenges.¹¹⁷

Texas

An analysis of the **Texas Beginning Educator Support System** (TxBESS) found that participants left teaching at significantly lower rates than did nonparticipating novice teachers in the state. The analysis also found improved retention rates among participants teaching in schools serving students of color and students from low-income families, where attrition rates tended to be quite high and where teachers of color are most likely to teach.¹¹⁸ The finding suggests that teachers of color, in particular, could benefit from participating in strong induction programs.

Delaware

Delaware has implemented a multiyear induction program to support and retain excellent educators. The state requires that all new teachers participate in a 4-year induction and mentoring program to advance their license.¹¹⁹ The **Comprehensive Induction Program** (CIP), as the program is known, began during the 1994–1995 school year as a pilot mentoring program in three districts, and was redesigned and expanded statewide 10 years later.¹²⁰ The redesigned program requires a number of activities characteristic of high-quality induction:

- weekly meetings between mentor and novice teachers, including face-to-face conversations to provide real-time support,
- eight lesson observations (4 observing and 4 being observed) each of the first two years, and
- participation in evidence-based professional learning each year of the program, including professional learning communities specifically for new teachers.¹²¹

The annual appropriation for CIP is \$300,000.¹²²

¹²⁰ <u>https://www.doe.k12.de.us/domain/185</u>; Raffel, J. A., Holbert. R. R., Curtis, K. A., Middlebrooks, A., Noble, A., & O'Malley, F. (2007). *Delaware's new teacher mentoring/induction program: Initiation, implementation, and integration*. Newark, DE: University of Delaware.

¹¹⁷ Kardos, S. M., & Johnson, S. M. (2010). New teachers' experiences of mentoring: The good, the bad, and the inequity. *Journal of Educational Change 11*(1), 23–44.

¹¹⁸ Ingersoll, R. M., & Strong, M. (2011). The impact of induction and mentoring programs for beginning teachers: A critical review of the research. Review of Educational Research, 81(2), 201–233.

¹¹⁹ Delaware Professional Standards Board. (n.d.). Delaware administrative code: Title 14 education, 1503 educator mentoring. <u>http://regulations.delaware.gov/AdminCode/title14/1500/1503.pdf</u> (accessed 12/12/17).

¹²¹ Delaware Professional Standards Board. (n.d.). Delaware administrative code: Title 14 education, 1503 educator mentoring. <u>http://regulations.delaware.gov/AdminCode/title14/1500/1503.pdf</u> (accessed 12/12/17); Delaware Department of Education. (n.d.). Comprehensive induction program: Program requirements. <u>https://www.doe.k12.de.us/Page/3569</u> (accessed 12/8/17).

¹²² S. B. 285, 148th Gen. Assem., Reg. Sess. (De. 2017), 211.

More recently, the Delaware Department of Education of Education (DDOE) created a competitive grant program to incentivize innovation in the state mentoring program. Beginning in the 2013–2014 school year, DDOE began offering competitive grants to fund development and/or delivery of innovative induction models for new educators.¹²³ In the first five rounds of the grant, DDOE awarded around \$1 million to districts and charter schools.¹²⁴

Delaware's commitment to and continuous improvement of its induction and mentoring for new teachers appears associated with improved teacher practice as well as teacher retention. According to a 2017 statewide survey of teachers, 78% agreed or strongly agreed that the additional support they received as a new teacher improved their instructional practice, 79% agreed or strongly agreed that the additional support helped them to impact their students' learning, and 71% agreed or strongly agreed that the induction supports were important in their decision to continue teaching at their current school.¹²⁵

Iowa

lowa has a long history of prioritizing teacher induction. In 2001, the Iowa legislature enacted the Teacher Quality Act, expanding teacher induction statewide and making it a requirement for second-tier teacher licensure.¹²⁶ Since then, the **Iowa Mentoring and Induction** (M&I) program has grown and now annually involves approximately 3,000 first and second year educators across the state.¹²⁷ M&I seeks to increase student achievement by promoting excellence in teaching and increasing the retention of promising beginning teachers.¹²⁸ Successful completion of an induction program is also a requirement for Iowa teachers to advance to the career-level teaching certificate.¹²⁹ Iowa supports the program by distributing \$1,300 to districts and Area Education Agencies (AEAs) for each first- and second-year educator, with \$1,000 of each payment going toward mentor stipends and the remainder toward program costs. For FY 2016–2017, over \$4 million was allocated to the statewide mentoring program.¹³⁰

¹²⁶ S. F. 476, 79th Leg., Gen. Sess. (la. 2001).

¹²⁷ <u>https://www.educateiowa.gov/pk-12/educator-quality/mentoring-induction-beginning-educators</u>
 ¹²⁸ Iowa Department of Education. (n.d.). Mentoring and induction for beginning educators.

¹²³ Delaware Department of Education. (September 1, 2017). Delaware consolidated state plan under the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA), 75. Dover, Delaware: Delaware Department of Education.

https://www.doe.k12.de.us/cms/lib/DE01922744/Centricity/Domain/425/DE consolidatedstateplan.FINAL%20cle an%20090117.pdf (accessed 5/23/18).

¹²⁴ Personal phone call with Jon Neubauer, Education Associate Delaware Department of Education (2018, February 1). For an earlier total, see New Teacher Center. (2016). *State policy review: New teacher induction Delaware*. Santa Cruz, CA: New Teacher Center.

¹²⁵ TELL Delaware. (2017). Result details: TELL Delaware. <u>https://telldelaware.org/results/report/590/172027</u> (accessed 12/8/17).

https://www.educateiowa.gov/pk-12/educator-quality/mentoring-induction-beginning-educators (accessed 11/20/17).

¹²⁹ S. F. 476, 79th Leg., Gen. Sess. (la. 2001).

¹³⁰ Ia. Code. § 284.13 (2017).

lowa's M&I framework is intended to provide local districts the flexibility to design programs responsive to their contexts. By stipulating minimum levels of beginning teacher support, including release time to design lessons and plan with a mentor, opportunities to observe experienced teachers, and constructive feedback on instruction,¹³¹ state law provides general outlines that districts can use to structure their induction programs. However, it is the responsibility of districts to design programs that engage teachers in meaningful activities that support the Iowa teaching standards and meet beginning educators' personal and professional needs. Iowa's M&I structure—providing evidence-based minimum induction requirements but broad flexibility in program design—offers benefits in terms of district tailoring and appears to have long-standing support in the state.

Connecticut

Connecticut established a statewide, district-driven teacher induction program for all new teachers—the <u>Teacher Education and Mentoring</u> (TEAM) program—beginning in 2009.¹³² TEAM aims to provide a non-evaluative system of support focused on professional growth and reflective practice. As part of the program each new teacher is paired with a mentor who coaches and guides him through the first two years of the profession—typically providing 1–2 hours of individualized support per week.¹³³ Beginning teachers complete five modules: classroom environment, planning, instruction, assessment, and professional responsibility. Each module includes a deliberate process of goal setting, implementing new learning in the classroom, and receiving feedback on changes in teaching practice and student outcomes.

Research suggests TEAM supports are benefitting beginning Connecticut teachers. A 2013 evaluation of TEAM using survey evidence of participants found that participation in the program contributed to beginning teachers' sense of development and their decision to stay in the profession and their district.¹³⁴ Surveyed beginning teachers overwhelmingly identified numerous aspects of the program as positively impacting their practice, including reflections with their mentors on teaching effectiveness, discussions regarding how to establish safe and productive classrooms, and strategizing how to use assessment data to make instructional decisions.

Additionally, approximately 78% of surveyed beginning teachers either agreed or strongly agreed that their TEAM mentor had a positive influence on their decision to continue teaching. This latter result suggests that induction programs that offer mentoring can benefit teacher retention. Unfortunately, as of writing, funding for the TEAM program had recently been cut at the state

¹³¹ S. F. 476, 79th Leg., Gen. Sess. (la. 2001).

¹³² P. A. 09-6, 2009 Leg., Spec. Sess. (Ct. 2009); Connecticut Department of Education. (n.d.). Teacher Education and Mentoring (TEAM) program. <u>http://portal.ct.gov/SDE/TEAM/Teacher-Education-And-Mentoring-TEAM-Program</u> (accessed 5/22/18).

¹³³ Bozack, A., Freilicher, T., & Salvaggio, A. N. (2013). *Teacher education and mentoring program evaluation report*. <u>http://www.cea.org/issues/news/2013/mar/04/pdf/TEAM-Report-2-15-13.pdf</u> (accessed 12/12/17).

¹³⁴ Bozack, A., Freilicher, T., & Salvaggio, A. N. (2013). *Teacher education and mentoring program evaluation report*. <u>http://www.cea.org/issues/news/2013/mar/04/pdf/TEAM-Report-2-15-13.pdf</u> (accessed 12/12/17).

level.¹³⁵ While it remains to be seen how districts will continue their support for this program at the local level (given state mandates), the model provides a promising blueprint for states seeking to build a comprehensive mentoring and new teacher support program.

New York

While New York currently requires mentoring for the first year of teaching, the state's ESSA plan indicates a need to improve the overall consistency and quality of programs across the state.¹³⁶ Particularly, the state's desire to increase funding for induction programs, improve the quality of mentor selection and training, and increase the length of time new teachers receive support can bolster efforts to support the retention of teachers of color through comprehensive and responsive induction supports. In addition, the current Mentor Teacher Internship Program and the NYC Men Teach Program offer opportunities to envision a statewide model that is responsive to the specific needs of new teachers of color.¹³⁷

Ongoing mentoring and support for candidates and teaches of color

In addition to creating systems at the state level that can increase access to quality induction programs and mentoring for all teachers, providing targeted and responsive supports to new teachers of color should also be a part of any state efforts to ensure induction supports help increase the retention of new teachers of color.

Call Me MISTER (Mentors Instructing Students Toward Effective Role Models), founded at Clemson University in 2000 and active in several other colleges throughout the South, works to increase the pool of Black male teachers through a comprehensive system of supports that includes loan forgiveness, mentorship, academic and peer support, preparation for state licensure exams, and assistance with job placement. Participants commit to teaching in a local school for each year they receive financial support. The program maintains contact with graduates, and graduates are expected to become mentors to new program participants. Of the approximately 150 participants who have graduated since 2004, 100% remain in education and 95% are teaching in South Carolina schools, far exceeding national retention rates.¹³⁸

Other initiatives—such as the Sherman STEM Teacher Scholars Program at the University of Maryland, Baltimore County, and the Montclair State University Teacher Education Advocacy

¹³⁵ Moran, J. D. (2017). Summary of the Teacher Education and Mentoring (TEAM) Program. Hartford, CT: Connecticut General Assembly, Office of Legislative Research. <u>https://www.cga.ct.gov/2017/rpt/pdf/2017-R-0306.pdf</u> (accessed 5/22/18); H. B. 1502, 2017 June Spec. Sess., (Ct. 2017).

 ¹³⁶ New York State Education Department. (2018). New York consolidated state plan under the Every Student
 ^{Succeeds} Act (ESSA). Albany, NY: New York State Education Department, 154; <u>Mentor Teacher Internship Program</u>
 ¹³⁷ NYC DOE launched NYC Men Teach Program, aims to increase men of color in city classrooms through
 ^{engagement}, recruitment, and support of candidates before entering classroom. Mentorship in first year of
 ^{teaching} through NYC DOE, NYC Men Teach offers two years (plus training on SEL and cultureally responsive
 ^{teaching} practices). "A total of 68% of NYC DOE Participant Survey respondents who are current teachers stated
 ^{that} support from a NYC Men Teach mentor teacher was important or very important."

¹³⁸ Cary, N. (2016, April 27). Call Me MISTER goes to Washington. Greenville News. http://www.greenvilleonline.com/story/news/education/2016/04/27/call-me-mister-goes-washington/83591664/.

Center—are also working to provide support to teacher preparation candidates, including academic coaching, mentoring and advising, and peer support. Also building on the success of the Call Me MISTER peer support model, **The Fellowship: Black Male Educators for Social Justice** is a professional membership organization designed to build and strengthen networks of Black male educators. Through The Fellowship, which is based in Philadelphia, more than 600 current and prospective Black male educator members are expected to mentor at least one high schooler or college student, or a man who is considering a mid-career switch to teaching. That mentorship might include tutoring, offering professional guidance, or providing technical assistance to those seeking help with entering the field. In addition, The Fellowship hosts an annual conference and a career fair that offers résumé feedback, mock interviews, advice from career advisers, and opportunities to meet with potential employers.

The **Black Teacher Project** (BTP), a nonprofit based in San Francisco, Oakland, and New York City, has a two-pronged approach to sustaining Black teachers.¹³⁹ First, the organization offers opportunities for personal and professional growth, such as book clubs, inquiry groups to work through a problem of practice, a fellowship program, social activities, and wellness workshops. Second, BTP is working with districts, such as Oakland Unified School District, to help shift the environment from one that teachers want to leave to one where teachers want to stay. For example, BTP offers "Hiring Black Teachers 101," a workshop that gets at the heart of how hiring practices can be more inclusive of prospective Black teachers. The group has also partnered with the district to walk teachers through the teacher credentialing process and to offer tutoring for teacher licensure exams. Micia Mosely, founder of the Black Teacher Project, says of the BTP participants, "Being a part of the BTP community and receiving supports has literally kept them in the classroom. They wanted to leave and then realized they just needed a community." Other programs, such as Boston's Male Educators of Color, similarly build community and facilitate mentorship for male teachers of color.¹⁴⁰

Teacher Preparation Accreditation and Licensure Policies

Tennessee

States can create incentives for increasing enrollments of candidates of color by implementing **data monitoring policies** for TPPs. In Tennessee, for example, the State Board of Education revised the state's Teacher Preparation Report Card in 2016.¹⁴¹ Each TPP (also known as educator preparation programs, or EPPs) receives an overall score and several subscores, including one for candidate profile. The candidate profile score is based, in part, on the percentage of program completers who are non-White. Title II of the Higher Education Act requires that all states report on the racial and ethnic diversity of teacher preparation enrollees; however, they are not

¹³⁹ Interview with Micia Mosely, founder of the Black Teacher Project, March 2018.

¹⁴⁰ Iasevoli, B. (April 25, 2017). Boston launches program to retain and groom minority teachers. Bethesda, MD:

Education Week. https://www.edweek.org/ew/articles/2017/04/26/boston-program-supports-maleeducators-of-color.html.

¹⁴¹ State Collaborative on Reforming Education. (2016). Prepared for day one: Improving the effectiveness of earlycareer teaching. Nashville, TN: State Collaborative on Reforming Education.

required to report on the diversity of program completers. Tennessee is unique in requiring and monitoring that data point, which is a better indicator of the supply of teachers of color than is enrollment data. TPPs may be more likely to actively recruit and support candidates of color because their performance on that indicator impacts the program's standing in the state, and they are required to report this data to meet state accreditation requirements.

Oregon

Oregon has sought to create partnerships across state agencies and built a coalition focused on increasing teacher diversity statewide. The initial focus of these efforts has centered around data collection and the publication of annual Educator Equity Reports. By law, the Chief Education Office, the Higher Education Coordinating Commission, the Oregon Department of Education, and the Teacher Standards and Practices Commission are required to jointly create an annual report on the Educators Equity Act. In 2015, the Oregon Senate passed SB 3375 requiring all teacher preparation programs to develop plans to promote the recruitment and preparation of diverse educators.¹⁴² The state's 2019 report on the progress of these efforts highlights an increase in teacher preparation enrollment for future teachers of color rising from 17.3% in 2016-2017 to 23.9% in 2017-2018.¹⁴³

California

In addition to collecting data on both the recruitment and retention of a diverse candidate pool through preparation, states can also work to collect survey data from candidates and from their future employers in schools and districts on the quality of candidate experience in preparation. The specific survey questions could seek to understand how prepared candidates feel to lead culturally responsive and identity affirming classrooms and how supported candidates of color felt throughout the teacher preparation experience. <u>California currently uses</u> surveys of all program graduates about their opportunities to learn, their student teaching experience, and how well their program prepared them in many areas of teaching. Candidates complete these after they have finished their training, as they apply for their initial credential. Two years later, they complete another survey about both their preparation and their induction experience as they apply for their clear credential. California also surveys mentor teachers and employers about the quality of candidates and programs, using all of these data in its program accreditation process. It has ensured high survey response rates (more than 90%) by requesting program graduates to complete the survey online as they submit their online application for their teaching credential.¹⁴⁴

New York

¹⁴² https://www.oregon.gov/eac/Documents/2019%20Educator%20Equity%20Report.pdf ¹⁴³ https://www.oregon.gov/eac/Documents/2019%20Educator%20Equity%20Report.pdf

¹⁴⁴ Commission on Teacher Credentialing. (2017). Credential program completer surveys. https://www.ctc.ca.gov/educator-prep/completer-surveys.

While current Federal Title II reporting requirements provide data on the race and ethnicity across teacher preparation enrollment in New York, the state could take advantage of additional indicators to support a more robust understanding of how teacher candidates of color are progressing through teacher preparation programs. Specifically, as suggested in a recent report from Educators For Excellence, there is an opportunity for New York to expand the collection of data on current teacher preparation programs. Understanding the demographics of teacher preparation completers, along with collecting survey data from candidates and their future employers, could provide additional insights into how best to support candidates of color into and through preparation across the state.¹⁴⁵

Supports for Licensure Assessments

As previously highlighted, the cost of teacher preparation licensure assessments can serve as a barrier to future teachers of color.¹⁴⁶ States seeking to address the impact of assessment fees are considering different ways to alleviate the financial burden that may come with several different licensure exam requirements.

Washington

In addition to recent changes in the state's basic skills requirement for entry into a preparation program, Washington provides programs with an allocation of vouchers for covering the costs of the state's required teacher licensure assessments, including the edTPA performance assessment. Each program is allocated a certain number of vouchers for the WEST-B, WEST-E/NES, and edTPA test takers. Programs may purchase additional vouchers to provide candidates with full or partial credit toward fees for test registration and preparation resources.¹⁴⁷

New York

New York has taken steps in recent years to address barriers in the state's current teacher preparation assessment policies that hinder the growth of a diverse teacher workforce. This has included statewide implementation of a teacher preparation performance assessment (the edTPA), the inclusion of a safety net route to provide flexibility during early implementation of the performance assessment, and the elimination of the state's Academic Literacy Skills Test.¹⁴⁸ As part of edTPA implementation, the state has provided a limited number of vouchers to

<u>S.PL.pdf#page=1</u>; https://www.pesb.wa.gov/preparation-programs/assessments/

¹⁴⁵ Educators For Excellence New York.(2019). Ready for day one and beyond. New York, NY: Educators for Excellence New York. https://e4e.org/what-we-do/policy-solutions/ready-day-one-and-beyond

 ¹⁴⁶ Kolman, J. S., Gellert, L. M., & McLurkin, D. L. (2017). Lifting gates and building skills: Preparing diverse candidates to pass new certification exams. In E. Petchauer & L. Mawhinney (Eds.), *Teacher education across minority serving institutions: Programs, policies, and social justice.* New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press.
 ¹⁴⁷ <u>http://lawfilesext.leg.wa.gov/biennium/2019-20/Pdf/Bills/House%20Passed%20Legislature/1621-</u>

¹⁴⁸ http://www.highered.nysed.gov/tcert/certificate/certexamsafetynetedtpa.html, and basic skills removal exam; https://www.chalkbeat.org/posts/ny/2017/03/13/new-york-officials-vote-to-eliminate-controversial-literacy-exam-for-prospective-teachers/

programs to help offset the costs of the exam.¹⁴⁹ There remain additional opportunities to leverage efforts that exist in more limited programs like NYC Men Teach by combining both financial support and targeted certification exam preparation for teacher candidates of color. Further, there remain opportunities to explore the ways vouchers are awarded within programs to ensure they are reaching candidates with the greatest need.¹⁵⁰

Improve School Teaching Conditions Through Improved School Leadership

Teaching conditions, and administrative support particularly, play a key role in teachers' retention decisions. Recent evidence shows that administrative support is especially critical in improving the retention of teachers of color. An analysis of national data from select years between 1999 and 2011 found that teachers of color in schools in which 90% of the teaching staff or more were White were far more likely to switch schools than their White peers if they perceived a lack of administrative support. However, their retention decisions were similar to White teachers when they felt strong administrative support in their schools.¹⁵¹ Strong school leaders may be addressing some of the challenges teachers of color report experiencing when they are among few teachers of color on staff. Districts can provide training for school administrators so they can create work environments that encourage teachers of color to stay.

Even if teachers are prepared for the challenges of teaching, undesirable teaching conditions can drive them to other schools or out of the profession entirely. School administrators are responsible for making hiring decisions, being instructional leaders, setting norms for students and staff, nurturing a positive and encouraging culture, keeping schoolwide systems running smoothly, and more.¹⁵² When they are not able to do those things well, the consequences are teaching and learning environments that make it difficult for teachers of color to stay. Poor school leadership more than doubles the likelihood that teachers, in general, will move or leave their classrooms and schools.¹⁵³

Some university-district partnerships have made progress in training effective school principals by actively recruiting talented future administrators, and especially those who have demonstrated a commitment to working in hard-to-staff schools. A review of the nationally recognized educational leader cohort program at **Delta State University** (DSU) in the Mississippi

¹⁴⁹ <u>http://www.highered.nysed.gov/pdf/edtpamythsvsfactsfinal.pdf</u>

¹⁵⁰ <u>http://www.nea.org/home/63423.htm</u>;

https://www.warner.rochester.edu/files/research/files/2016edTPAreport.pdf.

¹⁵¹ Bednar, S., & Gicheva, D. (2017). Workplace support and diversity in the market for public school teachers. Education Finance and Policy. (Forthcoming).

¹⁵² Darling-Hammond, L., LaPointe, M., Meyerson, D., Orr, M. T., & Cohen, C. (2007). Preparing school leaders for a changing world: Lessons from exemplary leadership development programs. Stanford, CA: Stanford University, Stanford Educational Leadership Institute; National Policy Board for Educational Administration. (2015). Professional standards for educational leaders 2015. Reston, VA: National Policy Board for Educational Administration. (2015). Administration.

¹⁵³ Carver-Thomas, D., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2017). Teacher turnover: Why it matters and what we can do about it. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

Delta, for example, found that the program partnered with local school districts to recruit excellent teachers with strong school leadership potential into a well-supported principal training program, and that half of their recruits each year were Black.¹⁵⁴ Most of the teachers had been working in the Delta—a mostly rural region plagued by poverty and racial segregation—and they had undergone a demanding selection process to be nominated for the program by their district. With state, federal, district, and university funding, DSU funds its full-time paid internships at school sites. This joint investment of funds allows well-qualified candidates to participate regardless of their financial means. According to DSU, 85% of all graduates hold administrative positions in Delta schools and districts.¹⁵⁵

In-service leadership training can also make a difference in teacher retention. An analysis of the **McREL Balanced Leadership Development Program** (McREL BLDP), a program that focuses on principals developing 21 leadership responsibilities over 10 two-day cohort-based sessions, found that it resulted in a 7-point reduction in teacher turnover in schools that fully participated in the intervention (and a 23-point reduction in principal turnover).¹⁵⁶

North Carolina

The **North Carolina Principal Fellows Program** offers \$20,000 annually in scholarship loans to attract outstanding aspiring principals to the field, providing two years of preparation that encompasses both coursework and a yearlong, full-time internship under the mentorship of an expert principal.¹⁵⁷ In exchange, principal candidates commit to four years of service as a principal or an assistant principal in one of the state's public schools.¹⁵⁸ The program has trained more than 1,200 Principal Fellows since its inception in 1993; as of 2007, more than 12% of the state's principals and assistant principals were graduates of the program.¹⁵⁹ Research on the effectiveness of graduates who go on to serve in schools found that Fellows have more positive impacts on student absences, teacher retention, and school working conditions than other University of North Carolina Master of School Administration graduates and all other North Carolina principals.¹⁶⁰ Nearly 90% of Principal Fellows graduated and completed their four-year

¹⁵⁴ LaPointe, M., Davis, S., & Cohen, C. (2007). School leadership study: Developing successful principals (Case study series: Principal preparation at Delta State University—A bold strategy to improve practice). Stanford, CA: Stanford University, Stanford Educational Leadership Institute.

¹⁵⁵ Delta State University. (2018). Master of education in educational administration and supervision. http://www.deltastate.edu/education-and-human-sciences/teacher-education-research-leadership/ master-education-educational-administration-supervision/.

¹⁵⁶ Jacob, R., Goddard, R., Kim, M., Miller, R., & Goddard, Y. (2015). Exploring the causal impact of the McREL Balanced Leadership Program on leadership, principal efficacy, instructional climate, educator turnover, and student achievement. Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis, 37(3), 314–332.

¹⁵⁷ Darling-Hammond, *The flat world and education*. For additional information about the North Carolina Principal Fellows Program, see http://www.ncpfp.org/.

¹⁵⁸ Darling-Hammond, *The flat world and education*.

¹⁵⁹ Darling-Hammond, LaPointe, Meyerson, Orr, & Cohen, *Preparing school leaders for a changing world*; The North Carolina Principal Fellows Program, http://www.ncpfp.org/. Accessed on August 10, 2016.

¹⁶⁰ Bastian, K. C. & Fuller, S. C. (2015). *The North Carolina Principal Fellows program: A comprehensive evaluation*. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill Education Policy Initiative at Carolina; University of

service commitment.¹⁶¹ Currently, the state plans to invest \$3.2 million a year over the next two years in the program.¹⁶²

Tennessee

Tennessee's ESSA state plan lays out a comprehensive vision for leadership preparation and support across the state and contains many promising leadership investments.¹⁶³ Among other things, the state will utilize the Title II leadership set-aside to support leader residency programs in high-need districts through competitive grant opportunities. The state will also pursue and support districts with an interest in applying for additional grant dollars through ESSA's Title II, Part B Teacher and School Leader Incentive Fund Grant to establish residency programs for both teachers and leaders in high-need schools. Additionally, Tennessee will use set-aside funds for leader development to create four-year statewide and regional leadership pipeline programs aligned with effective research-based program components that produce transformational school leaders. These pipeline programs will be partnership-led, innovative, and high impact, and will serve to increase the supply of high-quality school leaders across the state.¹⁶⁴

North Dakota

North Dakota is using ESSA as an opportunity to create multi-tiered leadership support to develop principals as effective leaders. One tier involves implementation of a Leadership Academy to ensure that North Dakota principals have the resources and support they need to be effective leaders. The Leadership Academy will provide professional support, professional development, career ladder opportunities, assistance with administrator shortages, and support to address administrator retention in an effort to ultimately raise student achievement. Training will be unique to the principal and focused on higher-level perspectives of leadership. The academy will also serve as a resource for comprehensive and targeted support schools (i.e.,

North Carolina Academic and University Programs Division. (2015). Great teachers and school leaders matter. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina. <u>http://ncpfp.northcarolina.edu/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/UNC-</u><u>Academic-and-University-Programs-Annual-Report-2015.pdf</u> (accessed 4/28/18).

¹⁶¹ Bastian, K. C. & Fuller, S. C. (2015). *The North Carolina Principal Fellows program: A comprehensive evaluation*. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill Education Policy Initiative at Carolina.

¹⁶² Data from current operations appropriations: Fiscal Years 2017–2019, North Carolina Office of State Budget and Management. Retrieved from <u>https://files.nc.gov/ncosbm/documents/files/2017-19_Certified_U10_UNCGA.pdf</u> (accessed 4/27/18).

¹⁶³ Tennessee Department of Education. (March 21, 2018). Tennessee consolidated state plan under the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA). Nashville, TN: Tennessee Department of Education, 268–272. https://www.tn.gov/content/dam/tn/education/documents/TN_ESSA_State_Plan_Approved.pdf (accessed

^{05/18/18).}

¹⁶⁴ Tennessee Department of Education. (March 21, 2018). Tennessee consolidated state plan under the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA). Nashville, TN: Tennessee Department of Education, 268–272. <u>https://www.tn.gov/content/dam/tn/education/documents/TN_ESSA_State_Plan_Approved.pdf</u> (accessed 05/18/18).

schools designated as in need of improvement pursuant to ESSA) in an effort to promote and build capacity in specific aspects of leadership.¹⁶⁵

North Dakota's planned leadership support also includes implementing and expanding a firstyear principal mentorship program with the goal of providing a mentor to all new administrators. This program has two main objectives: to increase the effectiveness of new administrators and to decrease principal turnover in rural and struggling schools.¹⁶⁶ Mentors are trained and assigned to new principals and conduct, at a minimum, two site visits during the school year along with weekly meetings. Mentorship will not be a stand-alone effort; instead, it is tied to ongoing professional development directly related to the knowledge necessary to be an effective leader. This layering of support aligns with research highlighting the importance of field-based coaching and learning that connects directly with a new leader's practice.¹⁶⁷ Delivered to provide ongoing skill development for principals, the professional development will include a series of modules delivered at the regional level.

New York

New York's efforts to improve principal preparation through the Principal Preparation Project indicate a need to build robust clinical opportunities for leaders and to ensure they have quality mentoring experiences both within and beyond preparation.¹⁶⁸ It may be that efforts to expand teacher residencies could compliment or inform how principal residencies might be scaled and seeded across the state. In addition, the focus on teacher clinical training in recent revisions to state regulations could be carried into the leader preparation space as well.

Financial Incentives for Teacher Expertise and Leadership

Some states have boosted teacher compensation while raising teacher quality by providing state stipends for teachers earning National Board Certification (NBC). The well-respected National Board Certification process allows applicants to demonstrate teaching expertise through a rigorous, standards-based performance assessment requiring submission of a teaching portfolio, videos of teaching, reflections on teaching, lesson plans, and evidence of student learning. Numerous research studies have found that teachers who earn National Board Certification (NBCTs) are, on average, more effective teachers (as measured by their students' test score gains)

 ¹⁶⁵ North Dakota Department of Public Instruction. (April 30, 2018). North Dakota consolidated state plan under the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA). Bismarck, ND: North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 96.
 <u>https://www.nd.gov/dpi/uploads/1494/ND_ConsolidatedStatePlan_4302018.pdf</u> (accessed 05/18/18).
 ¹⁶⁶ North Dakota Department of Public Instruction. (April 30, 2018). North Dakota consolidated state plan under the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA). Bismarck, ND: North Dakota Department of Public Instruction, 97.
 <u>https://www.nd.gov/dpi/uploads/1494/ND_ConsolidatedStatePlan_4302018.pdf</u> (accessed 05/18/18).

¹⁶⁷ Sutcher, L., Podolsky, A., & Espinoza, D. (2017). *Supporting principals' learning: Key features of effective programs*. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

¹⁶⁸ http://www.nysed.gov/common/nysed/files/principal-project-phase-2-final-report-with-appendices.pdf

than non-NBCTs with similar experience.¹⁶⁹ Beyond supporting individual teacher expertise, promoting NBC among teachers of color offers an opportunity to grow the pool of quality mentors positioned to support future teachers of color across the state. Joined with supports to improve school leadership, this focus on teacher leadership can help create supportive working environments and build high-retention career pathways for teachers of color in all schools.

Over half of states offer stipends to teachers who have earned National Board Certification as a strategy to retain effective teachers and reward them for their expertise, including **Kentucky**, **Maine**, and **Wyoming**.¹⁷⁰

In an effort to increase the number of NBCTs working in the highest-need schools, a number of states provide additional incentives to NBCTs working in these schools, which are typically schools with the fewest resources and lease desirable working conditions and often are experiencing teacher shortages. It is in these schools where additional teacher expertise and leadership is most needed:

In 2017, Arkansas passed <u>Act 937</u> which significantly increases the stipend amount for teachers holding National Board Certification in a high-poverty school in a high-poverty district (defined as 70% or more of students eligible for free or reduced price lunch).¹⁷¹ For teachers currently holding National Board Certification, stipend amounts remain the same—\$5,000 a year for 10 years—but the terms have changed. For teachers receiving their National Board Certification after January 1, 2018, the amount now varies depending on the type of school where they teach. \$2,500 will be awarded to NBC teachers in non-high-poverty schools (for 5 years), \$5,000 for teachers in a high-poverty school that is not in a high-poverty district (10 years). Given that the average salary for an Arkansas teacher with 15 years of experience is \$38,150,¹⁷² this stipend is a sizable, carefully-crafted incentive to boost the number of expert teachers in the highest-need schools.

¹⁶⁹ Cowan, J., & Goldhaber, D. (2016). National Board Certification and teacher effectiveness: Evidence from Washington State. *Journal of Research on Educational Effectiveness* 9(3): 233–258; Goldhaber, D., & Anthony, E. (2007). Can teacher quality be effectively assessed? National Board Certification as a signal of effective teaching. *The Review of Economics and Statistics* 89(1), 134–150; Chingos, M. M., & Peterson, P. E. (2011). It's easier to pick a good teacher than to train one: Familiar and new results on the correlates of teacher effectiveness. *Economics of Education Review* 30(3), 449–465; Clotfelter, C. T., Ladd, H. F., & Vigdor, J. L. (2010). Teacher credentials and student achievement in high school: A cross-subject analysis with student fixed effects. *Journal of Human Resources* 45(3), 655–681.

¹⁷⁰ National Board for Professional Teaching Standards. (2017). State incentive chart. <u>http://www.nbpts.org/wp-content/uploads/state_incentive_chart.pdf</u> (accessed 1/24/18).

¹⁷¹ S. B. 555, 91st Leg., Reg. Sess.(Ar. 2017).

¹⁷² Arkansas Department of Education. (2017). Teacher salary schedule analysis 2017-2018. Little Rock, AR: Arkansas Department of Education. <u>http://www.arkansased.gov/divisions/fiscal-and-administrative-</u> <u>services/publication-and-reports/report_categories/salary-reports</u> (accessed 4/27/18).

- In 2018, Alabama doubled its stipend—from \$5,000 to \$10,000—for NBCTs teaching in high-need, low-performing, or low graduation rate schools.¹⁷³
- The state of Washington offers a similar incentive. For the 2017–18 school year, NBC teachers were eligible for a \$5,892 bonus. In addition, NBC teachers in under-resourced schools—such as elementary schools with 70 percent of students from low-income backgrounds—are eligible for an additional bonus of \$5,000 a year.¹⁷⁴ Washington funded these bonuses at \$62.6 million for FY 2018.¹⁷⁵

New York

While New York does not currently offer compensation for teachers who earn NBC,¹⁷⁶ the state does provide support for certification fees through the Albert Shanker grant program which provides reimbursement to first-time candidates who achieve NBC.¹⁷⁷ Future efforts to support high-quality clinical experiences during preparation and increase access to robust induction supports for new teachers of color could be bolstered by building instructional expertise and teacher leadership through participation in the NBC process.

¹⁷³ HB 175, 2018 Leg., Reg. Sess. (Al. 2018).

 ¹⁷⁴ Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction. (December, 2016). National Board Certified Teachers.
 <u>http://www.k12.wa.us/certification/nbpts/TeacherBonus.aspx</u>. For the relevant statute, see Wa. Code § 392-140-973 at http://apps.leg.wa.gov/wac/default.aspx?cite=392-140-973 (accessed 4/27/18).

¹⁷⁵ Sub. S. B. 5883, 65th Leg., 3rd Spec. Sess. (Wa. 2017), 218.

¹⁷⁶ National Board for Professional Teaching Standards. (2017). State incentive chart. <u>http://www.nbpts.org/wp-content/uploads/state_incentive_chart.pdf</u> (accessed 7/30/19).

¹⁷⁷ http://www.nysed.gov/postsecondary-services/albert-shanker-grant-program

Appendix D: New York State's BOCES Regions and Regent Districts

For more information on New York State's BOCES regions, please visit: <u>https://www.boces.org/</u>

| BOCES Region | Component Districts |
|---|---|
| | Long Island |
| Nassau | Baldwin, Bellmore, Bellmore-Merrick CHSD, Bethpage, Carle Place, East Meadow, East Rockaway, East Williston, Elmont, Farmingdale, Floral Park-Bellerose, Franklin Square, Freeport, Garden City, Glen Cove, Great Neck, Hempstead, Herricks, Hewlett-Woodmere, Hicksville, Island Park, Island Trees, Jericho, Lawrence, Levittown, Locust Valley, Long Beach, Lynbrook, Malverne, Manhasset, Massapequa, Merrick, Mineola, New Hyde Park-Garden City Park, North Bellmore, North Merrick, North Shore, Oceanside, Oyster Bay-East Norwich, Plainedge, Plainview-Old Bethpage, Port Washington, Rockville Centre, Roosevelt, Roslyn, Seaford, Sewanhaka, Syosset, Uniondale, Valley Stream #13, Valley Stream #24, Valley Stream #30, Valley Stream CHSD, Wantagh, West Hempstead, Westbury |
| Suffolk County One (Eastern Suffolk) | Amagansett, Bay Shore, Bayport-Blue Point, Brentwood, Bridgehampton, Brookhaven-Comsewogue, Center Moriches, Central Islip, Connetquot, East Hampton, East Islip, East Moriches, East Quogue, Eastport-South Manor, Fire Island, Fishers Island, Greenport, Hampton Bays, Hauppauge, Islip, Little Flower, Longwood, Mattituck-Cutchogue, Middle Country, Miller Place, Montauk, Mount Sinai, New Suffolk Common, Oysterponds, Patchogue-Medford, Port Jefferson, Quogue, Remsenburg-Speonk, Riverhead, Rocky Point, Sachem, Sag Harbor, Sagaponack Common, Sayville, Shelter Island, Shoreham-Wading River, South Country, Southhampton, Southold, Springs, Three Village, Tuckahoe Common, Wainscott Common, West Islip, Westhampton Beach, William Floyd |
| Suffolk County Two (Western Suffolk) | Amityville, Babylon, Cold Spring Harbor, Commack, Copiague, Deer Park, Elwood, Half Hollow Hills, Harborfields, Huntington, Kings Park, Lindenhurst, North Babylon, Northport-East Northport, Smithtown, South Huntington, West Babylon, Wyandanch |
| Lower Hudson Valley | |
| Putnam-Northern- Westchester | Bedford, Brewster, Briarcliff Manor, Carmel, Chappaqua, Croton- Harmon, Garrison, Haldane, Hendrick Hudson, Katonah-Lewisboro, |

| | Lakeland, Mahopac, North Salem, Ossining, Peekskill, Putnam Valley, Somers, Yorktown | |
|---|---|--|
| Rockland | Clarkstown, East Ramapo, Haverstraw-Stony Point, Nanuet, Nyack, Pearl River, South Orangetown, Suffern | |
| Westchester (Southern Westchester) | Ardsley, Blind Brook-Rye, Bronxville, Byram Hills, Dobbs Ferry, Eastchester, Edgemont, Elmsford, Greenburgh, Harrison, Hastings- on-Hudson, Irvington, Mount Pleasant, Mount Vernon, New Rochelle, Pelham, Pleasantville, Pocantico Hills, Port Chester-Rye, Rye, Rye Neck, Scarsdale, Tarrytown, Tuckahoe, Valhalla, White Plains | |
| | Special Act Districts: Abbott, Greenburgh Eleven, Greenburgh Graham, Greenburgh- North Castle, Hawthorne-Cedar Knolls, Mount Pleasant-Blythedale, Mount Pleasant-Cottage | |
| | Non-Component Districts: Mamaroneck, Yonkers | |
| Mid-Hudson | | |
| Dutchess | Arlington, Beacon, Dover, Hyde Park, Millbrook, Pawling, Pine Plains, Poughkeepsie, Red Hook, Rhinebeck, Spackenkill, Wappingers, Webutuck Central | |
| Orange-Ulster | Chester, Cornwall, Florida, Goshen, Greenwood Lake, Highland Falls/Fort Montgomery, Kiryas Joel, Marlboro, Middletown, Minisink Valley, Monroe-Woodbury, Newburgh, Pine Bush, Port Jervis, Tuxedo, Valley Central, Warwick Valley, Washingtonville | |
| Sullivan | Eldred, Fallsburg, Liberty, Livingston Manor, Monticello, Roscoe, Sullivan West, Tri-Valley | |
| Ulster | Ellenville, Highland, Kingston City, New Paltz, Onteora, Rondout Valley, Saugerties, Wallkill, West Park | |
| Capital District / North Country | | |
| Albany-Schoharie- Schenectady- Saratoga (Capital Region) | Albany City, Berne-Knox-Westerlo, Bethlehem, Burnt Hills-Ballston Lake, Cobleskill-Richmondville, Cohoes City, Duanesburg, Green Island, Guilderland, Menands, Middleburgh, Niskayuna, North Colonie, Ravena-Coeymans-Selkirk, Rotterdam-Mohonasen, Schalmont, Schenectady City, Schoharie, Scotia-Glenville, Sharon Springs, Shenendehowa, South Colonie, Voorheesville, Watervliet | |

| Clinton-Essex- Warren-Washington (Champlain Valley) | AuSable Valley, Beekmantown, Chazy, Crown Point, Elizabethtown- Lewis, Keene, Moriah, Northeastern Clinton, Northern Adirondack, Peru, Plattsburgh City, Putnam, Saranac, Schroon Lake, Ticonderoga, Westport, Willsboro | |
|---|---|--|
| Franklin-Essex- Hamilton | Brushton-Moira, Chateaugay, Lake Placid, Long Lake, Malone, Raquette Lake, St. Regis Falls, Salmon River, Saranac Lake, Tupper Lake | |
| Hamilton-Fulton- Montgomery | Greater Amsterdam, Broadalbin-Perth, Canajoharie, Edinburg Common, Fonda-Fultonville, Fort Plain, Gloversville, Greater Johnstown, Lake Pleasant, Mayfield, Northville, Oppenheim- Ephratah-St. Johnsville, Piseco Common, Wells, Wheelerville | |
| Rensselaer- Columbia-Greene (Questar III) | Averill Park, Berkshire, Berlin, Brunswick (Brittonkill), Cairo- Durham, Catskill, Chatham, Coxsackie-Athens, East Greenbush, Germantown, Greenville, Hoosic Valley, Hoosick Falls, Hudson City, Kinderhook-Ichabod Crane, Lansingburgh, New Lebanon, North Greenbush Common, Rensselaer City, Schodack, Taconic Hills, Troy City, Wynantskill | |
| St. Lawrence-Lewis | Brasher Falls, Canton, Clifton-Fine, Colton-Pierrepont, Edwards- Knox, Gouverneur, Hammond, Harrisville, Hermon-DeKalb, Heuvelton, Lisbon, Madrid-Waddington, Massena, Morristown, Norwood-Norfolk, Ogdensburg, Parishville-Hopkinton, Potsdam | |
| Washington- Saratoga-Warren- Hamilton-Essex | Argyle, Ballston Spa, Bolton, Cambridge, Corinth, Fort Ann, Fort Edward, Galway, Glens Falls City ,Glens Falls Common, Granville, Greenwich, Hadley-Luzerne, Hartford, Hudson Falls, Indian Lake, Johnsburg, Lake George, Mechanicville, Minerva, Newcomb, North Warren, Queensbury, Salem, Saratoga Springs City, Schuylerville, South Glens Falls, Stillwater, Warrensburg, Waterford-Halfmoon, Whitehall | |
| Central Region | | |
| Herkimer-Fulton- Hamilton-Otsego | Central Valley, Dolgeville, Frankfort-Schuyler, Herkimer, Little Falls City, Mount Markham, Poland, Richfield Springs, Van-Hornesville- Owen D. Young, West Canada Valley | |
| Jefferson-Lewis | Adirondack, Alexandria, Beaver River, Belleville Henderson, Carthage, Copenhagen, General Brown, Indian River, Inlet Common, LaFargeville, Lowville Academy & Central, Lyme, Sackets | |

| | Harbor, South Jefferson, South Lewis, Thousand Islands, Town of Webb, Watertown City |
|--------------------------------------|---|
| Madison-Oneida | Camden, Canastota, Hamilton, Madison, Morrisville-Eaton, Oneida, Rome, Stockbridge Valley, Vernon-Verona-Sherrill |
| | Non-Component Districts: New York State School for the Deaf (NYSSD) |
| Oneida-Herkimer- Madison | Brookfield, Clinton, Holland Patent, New Hartford, New York Mills, Oriskany, Remsen, Sauquoit Valley, Utica City, Waterville, Westmoreland, Whitesboro |
| | Mid-State |
| Cayuga-Onondaga | Auburn, Cato-Meridian, Jordan-Elbridge, Moravia, Port Byron, Skaneateles, Southern Cayuga, Union Springs, Weedsport |
| Onondaga-Cortland- Madison | Baldwinsville, Cazenovia, Chittenango, Cincinnatus, Cortland, DeRuyter, East Syracuse Minoa, Fabius-Pompey, Fayetteville- Manlius, Homer, Jamesville-DeWitt, LaFayette, Liverpool, Lyncourt, Marathon, Marcellus, McGraw, North Syracuse, Onondaga Central, Solvay, Tully, West Genesee, Westhill |
| Oswego | Altmar-Parish-Williamstown, Central Square Central, Fulton City, Hannibal, Mexico Academy & Central, Oswego City, Phoenix, Pulaski Academy & Central, Sandy Creek Central |
| Tompkins-Seneca- Tioga | Candor, Dryden, George Junior Republic, Groton, Ithaca, Lansing, Newfield, South Seneca, Trumansburg |
| | Mid-Southern Tier |
| Broome-Delaware- Tioga | Binghamton, Chenango Forks, Chenango Valley, Deposit, Harpursville, Johnson City, Maine-Endwell, Newark Valley, Owego- Apalachin, South Mountain-Hickory Common, Susquehanna Valley, Tioga, Union-Endicott, Vestal, Whitney Point, Windsor |
| Delaware-Chenango- Madison-Otsego | Afton, Bainbridge-Guilford, Delaware Academy, Downsville, Franklin, Gilbertsville-Mount Upton, Greene, Hancock, Norwich City, Otselic Valley, Oxford Academy, Sherburne Earlville, Sidney, Unadilla Valley, Unatego, Walton |
| Otsego-Delaware- Schoharie-Greene | Andes, Charlotte Valley, Cherry Valley Springfield, Cooperstown, Edmeston, Gilboa-Conesville, Hunter-Tannersville, Jefferson, |

| (Otsego-Northern Catskills) | Laurens, Margaretville, Milford, Morris, Oneonta City, Roxbury, Schenevus, South Kortright, Stamford, Windham-Ashland-Jewett, Worcester | |
|---|---|--|
| Schuyler-Steuben- Chemung-Tioga- Allegany (Greater Southern Tier) | Addison, Alfred-Almond, Arkport, Avoca, Bath, Bradford, Campbell- Savona, Canaseraga, Canisteo-Greenwood, Corning-Painted Post Area, Elmira City, Elmira Heights, Hammondsport, Hornell City, Horseheads, Jasper-Troupsburg, Odessa-Montour, Prattsburgh, Spencer-Van Etten, Watkins Glen, Waverly | |
| | Mid-West | |
| Genesee-Livingston- Steuben-Wyoming (Genesee Valley) | Alexander, Attica, Avon, Batavia City, Byron-Bergen, Caledonia- Mumford, Dansville, Elba, Geneseo, Keshequa Central, LeRoy, Letchworth, Livonia, Mount Morris, Oakfield-Alabama, Pavilion, Pembroke, Perry, Warsaw, Wayland-Cohocton, Wyoming, York | |
| Monroe One | Brighton, East Irondequoit, East Rochester, Fairport, Honeoye Falls- Lima, Penfield, Pittsford, Rush-Henrietta, Webster, West Irondequoit | |
| Monroe Two-Orleans | Brockport, Churchville-Chili, Gates Chili, Greece, Hilton, Holley, Kendall, Spencerport, Wheatland-Chili | |
| Ontario-Seneca- Yates-Cayuga-Wayne (Wayne Finger Lakes) | Bloomfield, Canandaigua City, Clyde-Savannah, Dundee, Gananda, Geneva City, Gorham-Middlesex, Honeoye, Lyons, Manchester- Shortsville, Marion, Naples, Newark, North Rose-Wolcott, Palmyra- Macedon, Penn Yan, Phelps-Clifton Springs, Red Creek, Romulus, Seneca Falls, Sodus, Victor, Waterloo, Wayne, Williamson | |
| Western Region | | |
| Cattaraugus- Allegany-Erie- Wyoming | Allegany-Limestone, Andover, Belfast, Bolivar-Richburg, Cattaraugus-Little Valley, Cuba-Rushford, Ellicottville, Fillmore, Franklinville, Friendship, Genesee Valley, Hinsdale, Olean Schools, Portville, Randolph Academy, Randolph, Salamanca, Scio, Wellsville, West Valley, Whitesville, Yorkshire-Pioneer | |
| Erie One | Akron, Alden, Amherst, Cheektowaga, Cheektowaga Sloan, Clarence, Cleveland Hill, Depew, Frontier, Grand Island, Hamburg, Hopevale, Kenmore-Tonawanda, Lackawanna, Lancaster, Maryvale, Sweet Home, Tonawanda, West Seneca, Williamsville | |

| Erie Two- Chautauqua- Cattaraugus | Bemus Point, Brocton, Cassadaga Valley, Chautauqua Lake, Clymer, Dunkirk Public Schools, East Aurora, Eden, Falconer, Forestville, Fredonia, Frewsburg, Gowanda, Holland, Iroquois, Jamestown Public Schools, Lake Shore, North Collins, Orchard Park, Panama, Pine Valley, Ripley, Sherman, Silver Creek, Southwestern, Springville-Griffith Institute, Westfield |
|---|---|
| Orleans-Niagara | Albion, Barker, Lewiston-Porter, Lockport, Lyndonville, Medina, Newfane, Niagara Falls, Niagara-Wheatfield, North Tonawanda, Royalton-Hartland, Starpoint, Wilson |

For information about New York State's Regent Districts representatives, please visit: <u>https://www.regents.nysed.gov/members/findrep-list</u>

| Regent District | Counties |
|--------------------|---|
| 1 st | New York |
| 2 nd | Kings |
| 3 rd | Albany, Columbia, Greene, Rensselaer, Schoharie, Sullivan, Ulster |
| 4 th | Clinton, Essex, Franklin, Fulton, Hamilton, Montgomery, Saratoga, Schenectady, St. Lawrence, Warren, Washington |
| 5 th | Herkimer, Jefferson, Lewis, Oneida, Onondaga, Oswego |
| 6 th | Broome, Chemung, Chenango, Cortland, Delaware, Madison, Otsego, Schuyler, Tioga, Tompkins |
| 7 th | Cayuga, Livingston, Monroe, Ontario, Seneca, Steuben, Wayne, Yates |
| 8 th | Allegany, Cattaraugus, Chautauqua, Erie, Genesee, Niagara, Orleans, Wyoming |
| 9 th | Dutchess, Orange, Putnam, Rockland, Westchester |
| 10 th | Nassau, Suffolk |
| 11 th | Queens |
| 12 th | Bronx |
| 13 th | Richmond |

Appendix E: NYSED Educator Diversity Survey

Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New York State

Survey Introduction

New York strives to provide equitable access to excellent teachers who reflect the diversity of our students. The goal of this survey is to collect information on the programs and opportunities available to support the recruitment and retention of teachers and leaders of color in New York State. In analyzing your responses, we hope to build an understanding of the system of supports as well as gaps that may exist. Your participation will also inform the Teacher Diversity Report that the State Education Department will deliver to the legislature, as mandated in the 2018-19 Enacted Budget.

We will not attribute responses to any individual, district, or institution without express permission.

The survey has 15-20 questions, with an estimated response time of 20 minutes. Thank you in advance for your participation. If you have any questions, don't hesitate to contact DLRTsurvey@nysed.gov.

Key definitions:

• "educators" = P-12 teachers and school district/building leaders and other school-based professionals (school psychologists, counselors, and social workers)

• "of color" = for the purposes of this survey, this term refers to individuals who identify as American Indian / Alaska Natives, Asian, Black/African American, Hispanic/Latino/a, and/or Native Hawaiian / Other Pacific Islander.

A note on terminology: We recognize that diversity can be defined in many ways. We arrived at the decision to use the term "of color" in distinguishing diverse educators for the purposes of this survey following consultation with a range of stakeholders. Despite differences in opinion, we chose the term "of color" to specifically account for the racial and ethnic diversity of New York State's educator workforce to best inform the development of the Teacher Diversity Report, as mandated by the 2018-19 Enacted Budget. You will have the opportunity at the end of the survey to provide additional descriptive information about yourself to better capture the expanse of teacher and leader diversity across New York State. We will not attribute these responses to any individual without express permission.

* 1. We are asking that you provide this information to assist us in ensuring the accuracy of the survey data collected for the development of the Teacher Diversity Report, as mandated by the 2018-19 Enacted Budget. We will not attribute responses to any individual or institution without express permission.

| Name | |
|---------------|--|
| Organization | |
| Title / Role | |
| Email Address | |
| Phone Number | |

* 2. Which of the following best describes your current role?

You will be directed to survey questions based on the role you choose.

✓ P-12: School district/BOCES administrator or designee

 \bigcirc Higher education: Educator Preparation administrator or designee

 \bigcirc Alternative educator preparation program administrator or designee

igsirclesize None of the above

Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New York State

Alternative Educator Preparation Programs

Reminder of key definitions:

• "educators" = teachers and school district/building leaders and other school-based professionals

(school psychologists, counselors, and social workers)

· "of color" = for the purposes of this survey, this term refers to individuals who identify as

American Indian / Alaska Natives, Asian, Black/African American, Hispanic/Latino/a, and/or Native Hawaiian / Pacific Islander as well as individuals who identify as multiracial

* 3. Which of the following statements best describes the work of your organization to prepare and/or **recruit** educators of color?

We offer an alternative educator preparation pathway leading to certification

We offer an alternative pathway to the classroom that does not lead to certification

We actively conduct outreach / advertising to recruit candidates of color to careers in education

None of the above

Other (please specify)

| Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New York State | | |
|---|--|--|
| Alternative Educator Preparation Programs | | |
| * 4. Which of the following statements best describes the work of your organization to support pre- and in-service | | |
| educators of color? | | |
| We provide wrap-around supports (e.g., financial support, mentoring, peer networks) for teacher and leader candidates enrolled in educator preparation programs | | |
| We support candidates of color in successfully obtaining NYS educator certification | | |
| We provide supports to educators of color currently working in schools | | |
| None of the above | | |
| Other (please specify) | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |

Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New York State

Alternative Educator Preparation Programs

| * 5. Which of the following statements best describes the work of your organization to advocate for diversity in the | |
|--|--|
| educator workforce? | |
| We provide resources / training on recruiting and retaining educators of color | |
| We are an advocacy organization with an interest in educator diversity | |
| We advocate for State funding to support the recruitment and retention of educators of color | |
| We have an organizational commitment to diversity, equity, and inclusion in schools | |
| We conduct research related to the educator workforce in NYS | |
| None of the above | |
| Other (please specify) | |
| | |

* 6. What strategies does your program use with the goal of recruiting educator candidates of color? (Select all that

| apply) | |
|--|--|
| Targeted recruitment in high schools | |
| Targeted recruitment in community colleges | |
| Targeted recruitment with minority-serving undergraduate institutions (e.g., HBCU) | |
| Targeted recruitment with community-based organizations | |
| Partner with institutions of higher education | |
| Host and/or offer space for informational sessions | |
| We do not conduct specific activities to recruit educator candidates of color | |
| I don't know | |
| Other (please specify) | |
| | |
| | |

Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New York State

Alternative Educator Preparation Programs

* 7. Which of the following methods does your organization use with the goal of recruiting educator candidates of color? (Select all that apply)

| (Select un that apply) | |
|--|---|
| Direct mail flyers / letters / posters | Partnership with postsecondary institutions to offer services |
| Representation of or invitation to educators of color on website | Invite candidates to visit program |
| Email Online promotion (e.g., social media) | College fairs (high school students) |
| Local newspaper, TV and/or radio promotion | Graduate school / career fairs (college students) |
| Program representatives visit schools (P-12) | Career fairs (adults / career changers) |
| Program representatives visit campuses (postsecondary) | I don't know |
| Other (please specify) | |
| | |
| | |

| * 8. What supports does your program offer to help secure job placements? (Select all that apply) One-on-one counseling / advising |
|--|
| Career fairs |
| Career development staff |
| Field placements leading to employment |
| Connecting students with school district representatives |
| Centralized job opportunity postings (e.g., shared on a website, through listservs) |
| I don't know |
| We do not offer supports in securing job placements |
| Other (please specify) |
| |

Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New York State

Alternative Educator Preparation Programs

* 9. Which of the following does your program use with the goal of **retaining** candidates / educators of color through educator preparation program completion and certification? (*Select all that apply*)

| Tuition scholarships / loan forgiveness | Program sponsors exam fee / fingerprinting cost waivers or stipends |
|--|---|
| Cost of education assistance (e.g., textbooks, technology) | Certification preparation support (e.g., tutoring) |
| Cost of living assistance (e.g., transportation, housing) | Job seeker support (e.g., resume help, interview practice) |
| Childcare assistance | Postsecondary faculty diversity |
| Mentorship / coaching | Culturally relevant / responsive services, content, and |
| Peer support network (i.e., affinity peer support groups, cohorts) | pedagogy |
| Academic advising and support (e.g., tutoring) | Field placements within districts committed to diversifying their workforce |
| Flexible course scheduling / delivery method (e.g., online) | Partnerships with school districts to provide direct employment pipeline |
| | l don't know |
| Other (please specify) | |
| | |

* 10. Which of the following does your program use with the goal of **retaining** educators of color in **districts and classrooms**? (*Select all that apply*)

| Financial incentives (e.g., longevity bonuses) |
|--|
| Cost of living assistance (e.g., transportation, housing, childcare) |
| Mentorship / coaching |
| Peer support network (i.e., affinity peer support groups, cohorts) |
| Job seeker support (e.g., resume help, interview practice) |
| Teacher leadership opportunities |
| Flexible teaching schedules |
| Communication network (e.g., Facebook group, LinkedIn, listserv) |
| Culturally relevant / responsive curricula and professional learning opportunities |
| I don't know |
| Other (please specify) |
| |

Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New York State

Alternative Educator Preparation Programs

| * 11. What types of resources / training do you offer to support the recruitment and retention of educators of color? |
|---|
| (Select all that apply) |
| Professional learning for higher education faculty |
| Professional learning for school and district leaders (including HR directors) |
| Host job fairs / recruitment events |
| Sponsor professional networks / events |
| Policy / best practices research |
| Other publications / guides |
| We do not offer resources or training |
| I don't know |
| Other (please specify) |
| |

| * 12. How do you make candidates of color and othe | r potential partners aware of | your work? (Select all that apply) |
|--|-------------------------------|------------------------------------|
|--|-------------------------------|------------------------------------|

| 12 | How do you make candidates of color and other pole | iitidi | a partners aware of your work? (Select un that apply) |
|---------|--|--------|--|
| | Mail / posters | | Partnership with educator preparation programs |
| | Email | | Partnership with P-12 schools |
| | Social media | | We do not advertise to candidates of color or other potential partners |
| | Partnership with unions | |] I don't know |
| | Partnership with community groups | | |
| | Other (please specify) | | |
| | | | |
| * 13. F | How are your program's activities funded? (Select all the State resources Federal resources | hat a | apply) |
| | Private foundations | | |
| | Local government (e.g., city, county, etc.) | | |
| | I don't know | | |
| | Other (please specify) | | |
| | | | |

Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New York State

Higher Education / Preparation Programs - Recruiting Educators of Color

The following questions ask you to think about the strategies and approaches that your institution / educator preparation program uses to recruit educator candidates of color.

Reminder of key definitions:

• "educators" = teachers and school district/building leaders and other school-based professionals

(school psychologists, counselors, and social workers)

• "of color" = for the purposes of this survey, this term refers to individuals who identify as American Indian / Alaska Natives, Asian, Black/African American, Hispanic/Latino/a, and/or Native Hawaiian / Other Pacific Islander.

Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New York State

Higher Education / Preparation Programs - Recruiting Educators of Color

* 14. Which of the following activities or programs does your educator preparation program conduct with the goal of

| recruiting educator candidates of color? | (Select | all that a | pply) |
|--|---------|------------|-------|
|--|---------|------------|-------|

| Тан | rgeted recruitment in high schools | Recruit returning service veterans and/or their spouses |
|----------|--|--|
| Tar | rgeted recruitment at community colleges | 4+1 Master's degree pathway for our undergraduates |
| | rgeted recruitment with minority-serving undergraduate stitutions (e.g., HBCUs) | Teacher Opportunity Corps |
| Tar | rgeted recruitment with community-based organizations | Partner with an opportunity program on campus (e.g., EOP, College Discovery, HEOP, SEEK) |
| Re | ecruit paraprofessionals in P-12 schools | Partner with diverse student initiatives/associations on campus (e.g. Black Male Initiative at CUNY) |
| | cruit students already on campus who have not self- lected into educator preparation programs | We do not conduct specific activities to recruit educator |
| | cruit our undergraduate students and/or young alumni into Ir graduate programs | candidates of color I don't know |
| Other (p | please specify) | |

| Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New York State |
|---|
|---|

Higher Education / Preparation Programs - Recruiting Educators of Color

* 15. You indicated that your institution / program does **not** undertake specific activities with the goal of **recruiting** educator candidates of color. Why not? (*Select all that apply*)

| Recruitment is undertaken at the institution level (e.g., G | Central Office of Admissions), not the Department level |
|---|---|
| - | |

We do not target recruitment to specific groups

We do not have funding for recruitment activities

The diversity of our students is already representative of our goals for diversity in the educator workforce

Recruitment of students of color is not an institutional priority

| 1 | don't | know |
|---|-------|------|
| | | |

Other (please specify)

* 16. Which of the following methods does your institution / program use with the goal of **recruiting** educator candidates? (*Select all that apply*) *Please indicate whether these apply to students of color and/or all students.*

| | Students of color | All students |
|--|-------------------|--------------|
| Direct mail flyers / letters / posters | | |
| Email | | |
| Representation of or invitation to educators of color on website | | |
| Online promotion (e.g., social media) | | |
| Local newspaper, TV and/or radio promotion | | |
| Program representatives visit schools (P-12) | | |
| Program representatives visit campuses (postsecondary) | | |
| Partnership between / with postsecondary institutions to offer a direct pipeline (e.g., transfer, 4+1 Master's programs) | | |
| Flexible admissions practices | | |
| Invite candidates to visit program | | |
| College fairs (high school students) | | |
| Graduate school / career fairs (college students) | | |
| Career fairs (adults / career changers) | | |
| l don't know | | |
| Other (please specify) | | |
| | | |

Higher Education / Preparation Programs - Retaining Educators of Color

The following questions ask you to think about the strategies and approaches that your educator preparation program uses to prepare and retain teacher and leader (educator) candidates of color.

* 17. Which of the following does your program use with the goal of preparing and **retaining** educator candidates of color through **program completion and certification**? (*Select all that apply*) *Please indicate whether these apply to students of color and/or all students.*

| | Students of color | All students |
|--|-------------------|--------------|
| Tuition scholarships / loan forgiveness | | |
| Cost of education assistance (e.g., textbooks, technology) | | |
| Cost of living assistance (e.g., transportation, housing) | | |
| Child care assistance | | |
| Mentorship / coaching | | |
| Peer support network (i.e., affinity peer support groups, cohorts) | | |
| Academic advising and support (e.g., tutoring) | | |
| Flexible course scheduling / delivery method (e.g., online) | | |
| Postsecondary faculty diversity | | |
| Culturally relevant / responsive services, content, and pedagogy | | |
| Field placements within districts committed to diversifying their workforce | | |
| Partnerships with school districts to provide direct employment pipeline | | |
| l don't know | | |
| Other (please specify) | | |
| | | |

* 18. What supports does your institution / program offer to help students prepare for certification and secure job

| plac | ements? (Select all that apply) | | |
|------|--|----|--|
| | Program sponsors exam fee / fingerprinting cost waivers or | S | chool of education career development staff |
| | stipends | | entralized campus career development staff |
| | Certification preparation support (e.g., tutoring) | | |
| | | S | tudent teaching experiences leading to employment |
| | Job seeker support (e.g., resume help, interview practice) | Сс | entralized job opportunity postings (e.g., shared on a |
| | One-on-one counseling / advising | | vebsite, through listservs) |
| | School district representatives visiting campus | v | Ve do not offer support for job preparation and placements |
| | Career fairs | I | don't know |
| | Other (please specify) | | |
| | | | |

* 19. Which of the following does your institution / program offer to its graduates? (Select all that apply) Please indicate if these are offered to novice teachers and/or veteran teachers.

| | Novice teachers (0-3 years) | Veteran teachers (4+ years) |
|--|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Mentorship / coaching | | |
| Formal induction program (i.e., comprehensive supports during first year(s) of teaching) | | |
| Invitation to mentor pre- service teachers | | |
| Peer support network | | |
| Targeted professional learning opportunities | | |
| Invitation to pre-service professional learning opportunities | | |
| Invitations to attend Department events (e.g., guest lectures) | | |
| Invitations to speak at events as alumni | | |
| Communication network (e.g., Facebook group, LinkedIn, listserv) | | |
| Continued access to career development support (e.g., resume help, interview practice) | | |
| Centralized job opportunity postings (e.g., shared on a website, through listservs) | | |
| l don't know | | |
| Other (please specify) | | |
| | | |

* 20. Do you track the success of your efforts to recruit and/or prepare and retain educator candidates of color?

O_{Yes}

ONO

I don't know

Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New York State

Higher Education / Preparation Programs

* 21. What data do you collect related to recruiting and/or preparing and retaining educator candidates of color? (Select

| all that apply) | |
|--|--|
| Admission rates of candidates of color | Job placement rates of candidates of color |
| Matriculation rates of candidates of color | Survey data from prospective students |
| Persistence rates of candidates of color | Survey data from enrolled students |
| Completion rates of candidates of color | Survey data from alumni |
| Certification rates of candidates of color | I don't know |
| Other (please specify) | |
| | |

| Rec | ruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New | Yorl | < State |
|---------|---|-------|--|
| Higher | Education / Preparation Programs | | |
| * 22. V | Nhat funding sources does your institution / program u | se to | support activities to recruit and/or prepare and retain |
| educ | cator candidates of color? (Select all that apply) | | |
| | State resources | | Internal funding from a program budget (e.g., school of education) |
| | Federal resources | | Alumni contributions |
| | Private foundations | | Union / district support (i.e., contractual arrangements) |
| | Local government (e.g., city, county, etc.) | | I don't know |
| | Internal funding from the central university/college administration | | |
| | Other (please specify) | | |
| | | | |

23. Educator preparation program offerings (Select all that apply)

| Undergraduate teacher preparation |
|------------------------------------|
| Graduate teacher preparation |
| School building leader preparation |
| School district leader preparation |
| School counseling |
| School psychology |
| Social work |
| None of the above |
| |

* 24. Institution Name:

25. Higher Education Sector

Private not-for-profit

🕖 For-profit

26. Institution Type

Associate degree granting institution (i.e., community college)

 \bigcirc Associate and baccalaureate degree granting institution

) Baccalaureate college

Baccalaureate and master's degree granting institution

Doctoral degree granting institution

Research university

Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New York State

P-12 Respondents

Reminder of key definitions:

• "educators" = teachers and school district/building leaders and other school-based professionals

(school psychologists, counselors, and social workers)

• "of color" = for the purposes of this survey, this term refers to individuals who identify as

American Indian / Alaska Natives, Asian, Black/African American, Hispanic/Latino/a, and/or Native Hawaiian / Pacific Islander as well as individuals who identify as multiracial

The following questions ask you to think about the strategies and approaches that your district/school/BOCES uses to recruit educators of color.

| * 27. | What does your district/school/BOCES do with the goal | of recr | uiting educators of color? (Select all that apply) |
|-------|---|----------------|--|
| | Partner with institutions of higher education to recruit more students of color into educator preparation programs | | Recruit from other districts with diverse educator workforces |
| | | | Create materials (e.g., job postings, district website) that |
| | Recruit / attend career fairs at institutions of higher education with diverse student populations | | reflect a commitment to diversity |
| | | | Partner with a community-based / non-profit organization that |
| | Exam fee / fingerprinting cost waivers or stipends | | focuses on recruitment and retention of educators of color |
| | Offer employment to pre-service candidates of color who are in the district for field placements and clinical experiences, | | We do not undertake specific recruitment activities targeting educators of color once they are certified |
| | Offer incentives to our paraprofessionals to seek certification | | l don't know |
| | Offer incentives to our teachers to seek leader certification | | |
| Oth | er (please specify) | | |
| | | | |

* 28. Do you track the success of your district/school/BOCES's efforts to recruit educators of color?

 $\bigcirc_{\rm Yes}$

No

🕖 I don't know

| Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New Y | ork State |
|--|---|
| P-12 Respondents * 29. What data do you collect related to recruiting educator ca Application rates of candidates of color Hiring rates of candidates of color Demographic data on candidates recruited | Survey in-service educators of color Compare the diversity of our educators to that of our students in the hopes of bringing them into closer alignment We do not collect data related to recruiting educator |
| Demographic data on our applicants and hires Survey candidates who do not accept job offers Other (please specify) | candidates of color |
| Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New Y | ork State |
| P-12 Respondents * 30. What information or training have you sought out on the color? (Select all that apply) Consulted with peers on best practices Requested support from a statewide organization (e.g., NYSC) | |

Read about evidence-based best practices in trade publications

Attended events based on improving recruitment of educators of color

Have not sought out information or training

Other (please specify)

Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New York State

P-12 Respondents

The following questions ask you to think about the strategies and approaches that your district/school/BOCES uses to retain educators of color.

* 31. What supports does your district/school/BOCES offer with the goal of retaining educators of color? (Select all

| | Distance in distants | | a subject of the second state | | or building leaders |
|-------------------------------|----------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|
| $T n \alpha T \alpha n n N N$ | υραςο ιπαικατο | <i>ωποτηρη τηρ</i> ςτιη | nnrt ic nttoron tr | , <i>toarnor</i> c ana | 'nr niilliaina ibaabrc |
| | I ICUSC IIIUICULC | whether the sub | | , ובתנוובוש תוות/ | |
| | | | | | |

| | Teachers of color | Leaders of color |
|---|-------------------|------------------|
| Mentorship programs / coaching | | |
| Formal induction program (i.e., comprehensive supports during first year(s) of teaching) | | |
| Peer support network (i.e., affinity peer support groups, cohorts) | | |
| Cost of living assistance (e.g., transportation, housing, childcare) | | |
| Culturally relevant / responsive curricula and professional learning opportunities | | |
| Loan forgiveness programs | | |
| Communication network (e.g., Facebook group, LinkedIn, listserv) | | |
| Inter-visitation options for collaborative learning / support (within the school or in other districts) | | |
| Social opportunities for faculty and staff (e.g., after-school networking events) | | |
| We do not offer retention supports | | |
| l don't know | | |
| Other (please specify) | | |
| | | |

* 32. Does your district/school/BOCES encourage paraprofessionals to pursue teacher certification and/or teachers to pursue building or district leader certification?

⊖_{Yes} ⊖_{No}
Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New York State

P-12 Respondents

* 33. What supports does your district/school/BOCES offer to paraprofessionals to pursue teacher certification and/or teachers to pursue building or district leader certification? (Select all that apply) Please indicate the certification supports accordingly

| | Pursuing teacher certification | Pursuing leader certification |
|--|--------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Tuition scholarships / loan forgiveness | | |
| Cost of education support (e.g., textbooks, technology) | | |
| Cost of living assistance (e.g., transportation, housing) | | |
| Childcare assistance | | |
| Mentorship / coaching | | |
| Peer support network (i.e., affinity peer support groups, cohorts) | | |
| Flexible scheduling | | |
| Exam fee / fingerprinting cost waivers or stipends | | |
| Certification preparation support (e.g., tutoring) | | |
| Job seeker support (e.g., resume help, interview practice) | | |
| Partnerships with institutions of higher education | | |
| l don't know | | |
| Other (please specify) | | |
| | | |

Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New York State

| D 4 2 | Design and states | |
|-------|-------------------|--|
| P-12 | Respondents | |

34. In your opinion, what supports would be most effective to encourage paraprofessionals to pursue teacher

| certification and | l/or teachers | to pursue building o | r district leader certification? | (Select all that | : apply) |
|-------------------|---------------|----------------------|----------------------------------|------------------|----------|
|-------------------|---------------|----------------------|----------------------------------|------------------|----------|

| Tuition scholarships / loan forgiveness | Flexible scheduling |
|--|---|
| Cost of education support (e.g., textbooks, technology) | Exam fee / fingerprinting stipends |
| Cost of living assistance (e.g., transportation, housing) | Job seeker support (e.g., certification preparation, resume help, interview practice) |
| Childcare assistance | Partnerships with institutions of higher education |
| Mentorship programs / coaching | l don't know |
| Peer support network (i.e., affinity peer support groups, cohorts) | |
| Other (please specify) | |
| | |
| | |

* 35. District Name (or BOCES Name):

Recruiting and Retaining Educators of Color in New York State-

All Respondents

36. Are you familiar with the following initiatives / organizations that recruit, retain, and/or support educators in New York? *Please select all of the initiatives / organizations that you have heard of from the list below:*

| Academy for Teachers | Teach for America | |
|---|---|------------------|
| American Talent Initiative (Quality Bronx Talent Initiative) | Teach Like a Champion | |
| Black Male Initiatives (CUNY) | Teacher Centers | |
| Black Teacher Project | Teacher Leader Quality Pa | rtnership |
| Career Training Program | Teacher Opportunity Corp Brother's Keeper) | s (My |
| Center for Professional Education of | Teaching Matters | |
| Teachers (New Teacher Network) | Teachers of Tomorrow | |
| CIT Program (Bronx) | TNTP (The New Teacher P | roject) |
| CTE Program (Syracuse CSD) | Today's Students Tomorro | ow's Teachers |
| Educators for Excellence NY | Troops to Teachers | |
| Educators Rising | Urban Community Teache | r Project (CUNY) |
| EduColor | Urban Fellowship Program | n (Syracuse) |
| Empire Teaching Fellows | I am not aware of any of t | hese programs |
| ExpandED Schools | | |
| Leap to Teacher (CUNY) | | |
| National Board Council of NY | | |
| National Writing Project | | |
| New Leaders | | |
| New Teacher Center | | |
| NYC Teaching Academies | | |
| NYC Teaching Collaborative | | |
| NYC Teaching Fellows Program | | |
| NYC Young Men's Initiative: NYC Men Teach | | |
| NYS Master Teacher Program | | |
| NYS Mentor Teacher Internship Program | | |
| Powerful Educators (Putnam/Westchester) | | |
| SUNY Urban Teacher Education Center | | |

37. Please list any other programs or initiatives of which you are aware that recruit, retain, and support teachers and leaders in NYS:

Γ

Т

| 38. colo | In your opinion, which of the following would h or into educator preparation programs ? (Select all t | - | o improve the recruitment of educator candidates of apply) |
|-------------|---|---|---|
| | Recruitment of future educators beginning in middle school or high school | | Explicit institutional / programmatic commitment to the value of diversity |
| | Encouraging P-12 students to tutor young students / shadow teachers | | Diverse institutional leadership and faculty |
| | Grow Your Own initiatives (i.e., local cooperative actions/approaches to supporting recruitment of qualified educators) | | Financial support for recruiting students into educator preparation programs (e.g., marketing) Financial incentives for candidates (e.g., scholarships, |
| | Dedicated recruitment personnel in educator preparation programs | | stipends, loan forgiveness) School of education input into admissions decisions |
| | Training for higher education administrators and/or faculty on recruitment strategies | | Partnerships with/between postsecondary institutions (e.g., transfer pipelines to recruit current or graduating students into |
| | Recruitment of immigrant / international candidates | | educator preparation programs) |
| | Affirmative action and/or quotas | | Partnerships with/between community-based organizations with expertise in recruitment and retention |
| | Flexible admissions practices | | I don't know |
| | Other (please specify) | | |
| | | | |

39. In your opinion, which of the following would most help to improve the **retention** of educator candidates

| of color through educator preparation program completion and certification? (Select all that apply) | | | |
|---|---|--|--|
| Tuition scholarships / loan forgiveness | Exam fee / fingerprinting cost waivers or stipends | | |
| Cost of education assistance (e.g., textbooks, technology) | Certification preparation support (e.g., tutoring) | | |
| Cost of living assistance (e.g., transportation, housing) | Job seeker support (e.g., resume help, interview practice) | | |
| Child care assistance | Postsecondary faculty diversity | | |
| Mentorship / coaching | Culturally relevant / responsive services, content, and pedagogy | | |
| Peer support network (i.e., affinity peer support groups, cohorts) | Field placements within districts committed to diversifying their workforce | | |
| Academic advising and support (e.g., tutoring) | Partnerships with school districts to provide direct | | |
| Flexible course scheduling / delivery method (e.g., online) | employment pipeline | | |
| | I don't know | | |
| Other (please specify) | | | |

40. In your opinion, which of the following would most help to improve the **recruitment and retention** of educators of color in **districts and classrooms**? (*Select all that apply*)

| Financial incentives (e.g., longevity bonuses) | Flexible teaching schedules |
|--|--|
| Cost of living assistance (e.g., transportation, housing, | District/building leader diversity |
| childcare) Mentorship / coaching | Communication network (e.g., Facebook group, LinkedIn, listserv) |
| Peer support network (i.e., affinity peer support groups, cohorts) | Culturally relevant / responsive curricula and professional learning opportunities |
| Job seeker support (e.g., resume help, interview practice) | District / school commitment to diversity, equity, and inclusion (e.g., strategic plan, mission statement) |
| Teacher leadership opportunities | l don't know |
| Other (please specify) | |

Appendix F: New York State Certification Exam Validation Process

Constructing tests that are valid, reliable, and fair for all candidates

The validation process used by the New York State Education Department (NYSED) and our test contractor follows professionally accepted procedures for developing valid, reliable, and fair tests as described in the AERA, APA, and NCME *Standards for Educational and Psychological Testing* (2014). The validation process focuses primarily on establishing that the content of the tests is appropriate for the purpose of the testing program. In addition, NYSED and test vendor have established a process that ensures all test questions contain appropriate content that is aligned to the test framework (developed from the New York State Teaching and Learning Standards), and are accurate, job-related, and fair for all candidates. The process ensures that test items do not contain language or content that might disadvantage or offend an examinee because of her or his gender, race, nationality, national origin, ethnicity, religion, age, sexual orientation, disability, or cultural, economic, or geographic background.

The steps taken by NYSED and our test vendor to ensure validity are outlined below.

New York State Teacher Certification Examination (NYSTCE) Test Development Process

The NYSTCE tests are custom-developed with extensive involvement of New York State educators. The collaborative NYSTCE test development process involves the combined expertise of New York State classroom educators and administrators, educator preparation faculty, psychometric experts, researchers engaged in the study of teaching and learning, and NYSED policy and program personnel. Public school educators and teacher preparation program faculty play critical roles in the test development process. This document outlines the major test development milestones and the role of educators in the process.

Stage 1: Planning and Framework

> Job Analysis and Identification of Standards

- An analysis of the jobs of educators in New York State and the identification of the standards for student learning and teacher performance (e.g. NYS Learning Standards, NYS Teaching Standards, relevant national/professional standards) that define those jobs and serve as the foundation for test development.
- The Job Analysis Task Force helps NYSED design and execute a job analysis study of the current and future jobs of educators in New York State to inform the development of the new NYSTCE exams. The job analysis task force identifies the knowledge, skills, and abilities (KSAs) that are essential to be an effective educator in New York State.

> Development of Draft Framework

- In close collaboration with the NYSED and educators, a draft framework is developed that defines the KSAs that will be measured by the exam. The draft framework is based on results from the Job Analysis, standards, regulations, and policies that are central to the job of teaching in New York State.
- After the preliminary test framework is prepared by the vendor, subsequent reviews are completed by NYSED curriculum and policy specialists prior to review by bias and content review committees.

> Draft Framework Review Conference

- Bias Review Committee
 - The Bias Review Committee is comprised of NYSED content experts,P-12 educators and Institutions of Higher Education (IHE) faculty members.
 - The purpose of the Bias Review Committee is to review the test framework for sensitivity and fairness and to help ensure the test framework is free from bias.
 - During their review, the committee confirms that the test framework does not include language or content that might disadvantage or offend an examinee because of her or his gender, race, nationality, national origin, ethnicity, religion, age, sexual orientation, disability, or cultural, economic, or geographic background.

• Content Review Committee

- The Content Review Committee is comprised of NYSED content experts, P-12 educators and Institutions of Higher Education (IHE) faculty members.
- The role of the Content Review Committee is to review test framework for content appropriateness, including alignment to standards, accuracy, job-relatedness, and freedom from bias.

Job Analysis Surveys

 To confirm the validity of the framework competencies, surveys are distributed to public school educators certified in New York State and to college faculty who are involved in educator preparation programs. The Job Analysis Survey is designed to collect data. This data includes the critical tasks that are performed by educators on the job, including the importance of these tasks relative to the job as reflected in the test framework competencies.

Linking Study

• The committee is comprised of P-12 educators and IHE faculty members.

 The committee evaluates the relationship between important KSAs identified by the Job Analysis Task Force and the tasks performed by New York State educators. Their judgments are used to ensure that only competencies that are required for performing critical job tasks are included in the test. This analysis provides the link from occupation requirements to the content.

Framework is Published

- The draft framework is posted on the NYSTCE website.
- The draft framework is also shared with New York State teacher preparation programs.
- New York State teacher preparation programs provide feedback, which is incorporated as appropriate. The framework is reviewed by NYSED, revalidated if necessary, and a final framework is published on the NYSTCE website.

Content Validation Survey

- The Content Validation Survey is conducted to verify that the test framework competencies reflect current educational practice in New York State.
- New York State P-12 educators and IHE faculty members are surveyed; results are analyzed; and only those competencies that are found to be important to the job of a New York State educator are eligible to be measured by the examinations.

Stage 2: Item Development

Item Prototypes

- Item prototypes are test questions developed for each competency and serve as models for item bank development.
- Prototypes include multiple-choice and constructed-response questions and are developed by trained item writers with combined expertise in content, bias detection and prevention, editorial development, and basic psychometrics.
- A webinar involving NYSED content experts, P-12 educators and IHE faculty members is conducted to review and validate each prototype question.
- Once Prototypes have been selected, they are reviewed by the Bias Review Committee
 - The Bias Review Committee is comprised of NYSED content experts, P-12 educators and IHE faculty members.
 - The purpose of the Bias Review Committee is to review test items for sensitivity and fairness.
 - The committee confirms that the test questions do not include language or content that might disadvantage or offend an examinee because of her

or his gender, race, nationality, national origin, ethnicity, religion, age, sexual orientation, disability, or cultural, economic, or geographic background.

- The approved Prototypes are reviewed again by the Content Review Committee
 - The Content Review Committee is comprised of NYSED content experts, P-12 educators and IHE faculty members.
 - The Content Review Committee reviews the test questions and discusses recommendations for revisions, replacement or deletion of questions according to the consensus judgements of the committee members.
 - The role of the Content Review Committee is to review test questions for content appropriateness, including alignment to the test framework and standards, accuracy, job-relatedness, and fairness for all candidates.

Development of Items

- An item bank of questions is developed using the approved prototypes as models, the test design, the framework, and any relevant standards.
- The questions are written by trained item writers with combined expertise in content, in bias detection and prevention, in editorial development, and in basic psychometrics.
- Test questions include multiple-choice and constructed-response questions.
- Test questions are reviewed and approved by NYSED content experts and staff prior to review by bias and content review committees.

Item Review Conference

- Bias Review Committee
 - The Bias Review Committee is comprised of NYSED content experts, P-12 educators and IHE faculty members.
 - The purpose of the Bias Review Committee is to review test items for sensitivity and fairness and to help ensure the test materials are fair for all candidates.
 - The committee confirms that the test questions do not include language or content that might disadvantage or offend an examinee because of her or his gender, race, nationality, national origin, ethnicity, religion, age, sexual orientation, disability, or cultural, economic, or geographic background.
- Content Review Committee
 - The Content Review Committee is comprised of NYSED content experts, P-12 educators and IHE faculty members.

- The Content Review Committee reviews the test questions and discusses recommendations for revisions, replacement or deletion of questions according to the consensus judgements of the committee members.
- The role of the Content Review Committee is to review test questions for content appropriateness, including alignment to the test framework and standards, accuracy, job-relatedness, and fair for all candidates.

> Field Testing and Review of Field Test Results

- The test questions that are reviewed by the Bias and Content Review Committees and approved by the State Education Department are field tested using candidates in New York State educator preparation programs.
- Based on the field test results, items are reviewed psychometrically for appropriateness to be included in a future operational test form.

> Develop and Publish Study Guide

- The approved item prototypes with rationales for each test question are used to create a study guide for each field.
- The study guide is reviewed by NYSED content staff and approved by senior management.
- The Study Guide is published on the NYSTCE website.

> Develop and Publish Practice Test

- For high incidence tests, practice tests are designed to simulate the experience of taking a full-length NYSTCE test. All components of the NYSTCE practice tests, including test questions, constructed-response assignments, and test directions, are similar to those that appear on actual NYSTCE test forms.
- All practice test items are reviewed by the Bias Review Committee and Content Review Committee.
- The practice test offers immediate score reporting for multiple-choice questions. After scoring, practice test takers may review each multiple-choice question with its correct response and explanation, as well as view sample responses for the constructed-response assignments.
- \circ The practice test is reviewed by NYSED content experts and approved by senior management.

Stage 3: Test Construction and Implementation

Marker Response Meeting

 After field tested items are scored, the Marker Response Review Conference is conducted with the Content Review Committee. The Committee selects constructed-response candidate papers to serve as models for the purpose of scoring according to rubric criteria.

Test Form Construction

- Each test form is constructed in accordance with the test design and blueprinting specifications in accordance with industry standard psychometrics.
- NYSED staff review the first operational form.

> Operational Test

• Candidates take the operational test to fulfill certification requirements.

Standard Setting Conference

- The purpose of each Standard Setting Committee is to discuss the performance standards and to provide recommendations for cut scores for the NYSTCE exam.
- The committee members engage in a simulated test taking experience to familiarize them with the exam format and test content.
- The committee then uses their professional judgment over the course of several rounds of review to recommend a passing performance standard.
- The committee serves the NYSED in an advisory capacity. The final decision regarding passing performance standard for the New York State Teacher Certification Examinations is determined by the Commissioner of Education, taking into consideration the recommendations from the Standard Setting Committee.

Scores Released

- The constructed-response items are score using industry standard, focused holistic scoring.
- The test questions are scored by NYS certified educators with expertise in the content. The scores participate in orientation and calibration training, which consists of familiarizing scorers with the scoring procedure; orienting them to the scoring rubric; and ensuring that all scorers are oriented to scoring candidate responses consistently, fairly, and in accordance with the rubric. Only after scorers are qualified by a scoring leader are they authorized to begin operational scoring.
- Each candidate response is then scored independently by two scorers. Any discrepancies in scoring are resolved by a third scorer, usually a scoring leader,
- Candidates receive their Individualized Score Report indicating if they passed or failed the test.

- The score report gives the candidate feedback as to their performance on each competency in the framework. This allows candidates who failed the opportunity to concentrate their study efforts on competencies in which they did not perform well before they retake the test.
- The vendor works closely with NYSED to provide guidance regarding the appropriate and psychometrically sound uses of the test scores.
- Candidates scores are also reported to educator preparation institutions and also include appropriate interpretive cautions.

Sources

- "Alternative Teacher Preparation Program Fact Sheet." (n.d.). Retrieved from: <u>http://www.nysed.gov/college-university-evaluation/alternative-teacher-preparation-program-fact-sheet</u>
- Boyd, D., Lankford, H., Loeb, S., & Wyckoff, J. (2004). "The draw of home: How teachers preferences for proximity disadvantage urban schools." *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 24(1), 113–132.
- Boyd, D., Lankford, H., Loeb, S., Rockoff, J., & Wyckoff, J. (2008). "The narrowing gap in New York City teacher qualifications and its implications for student achievement in highpoverty schools." *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, *27*(4), 793–818.
- "Breaking Through: Shattering the glass ceiling for women leaders." Chiefs for Change. Retrieved from: <u>https://chiefsforchange.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/CFC-</u> <u>WomenLeaders-Final-April-23-2019.pdf</u>
- Brody, L. (2019, August 12). "New Data Show Few New York Teachers of Color in the Pipeline." Retrieved from: <u>https://www.wsj.com/articles/new-data-show-few-new-york-teachers-of-color-in-the-pipeline-11565648552</u>.
- Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.
- Carver-Thomas, D., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2017). Teacher turnover: Why it matters and what we can do about it. *Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute*. Retrieved from: <u>https://www.fcis.org/uploaded/Data_Reports/Teacher_Turnover_REPORT.pdf</u>
- Cherng, H, & Halpin, P. (2016). The Importance of Minority Teachers: Student Perceptions of Minority Versus White Teachers. *Educational Researcher*, Vol. 45, Issue 7. Retrieved from: <u>https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.3102/0013189X16671718</u>
- Cochran-Smith, M., & Zeichner, K. M. (Eds.). (2009). *Studying teacher education: The report of the AERA panel on research and teacher education*. Routledge.
- "Data Brief: Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion." (2017, June). Retrieved from: <u>https://system.suny.edu/media/suny/content-assets/documents/institutional-research/Diversity-Data-Brief-June2017.pdf</u>
- Dee, T.S. (2006). "The why Chromosome: How a teacher's gender affects boys and girls." *Education Next*,6(4). Retrieved from:

https://www.educationnext.org/files/ednext20064 68.pdf

- "The Diverse and Learner-Ready Teachers Initiative." (n.d.). Retrieved from: https://ccsso.org/topics/diverse-and-learner-ready-teachers-initiative
- "Diversity Scholarships & Grants." (n.d.). Retrieved from: https://www.suny.edu/diversity/scholarships-grants/
- Easton-Brooks, D. (2019). *Ethnic matching: Academic success of students of color*. MD: Rowman & Littlefield.
- "Educator Diversity Playbook." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust—New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://seeourtruth-ny.edtrust.org/playbook/</u>
- "The First Frontier of Equity: Improving data transparency, availability & usefulness in teacher preparation to support future teachers...and their students." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://s3-us-east-</u>

2.amazonaws.com/edtrustmain/wp-content/uploads/sites/5/2019/08/12142605/The-First-Frontier-of-Equity.pdf

- Gais, T., Backstrom, B., Malatras, J. & Park, Y.J. (2018). "The State of the New York Teacher Workforce." Albany, NY: Rockefeller Institute of Government. Retrieved from: <u>https://rockinst.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/03/03-22-18-Teacher-Work-Force.pdf</u>
- Garcia, E. & Weiss, E. (2019). "The teacher shortage is real, large and growing, and worse than we thought." Washington, D.C.: Economic Policy Institute. Retrieved from: <u>https://www.epi.org/publication/the-teacher-shortage-is-real-large-and-growing-andworse-than-we-thought-the-first-report-in-the-perfect-storm-in-the-teacher-labormarket-series/</u>
- Georgetown University Center on Education and the Workforce. (2018). "Our separate & unequal public colleges: How public colleges reinforce White racial privilege and marginalize Black and Latino students." Retrieved from: <u>https://1gyhoq479ufd3yna29x7ubjn-wpengine.netdna-ssl.com/wp-</u> <u>content/uploads/SAUStates_FR.pdf</u>
- Gray-Nicolas, N. & Nash, A.M. (2019). "First Things First: Black women situating identity in the first-year educational leadership faculty experience." Presentation to Metropolitan Council for Educational Administration Programs.
- Haddix, M. M. (2015). Cultivating racial and linguistic diversity in literacy teacher education: Teachers like me. Routledge.
- Hansen, M. & Quintero, D. (2018, July 10). "How gender diversity among the teacher workforce affects student learning." Washington, D.C.: Brookings Institute, Brown Center on Education Policy. Retrieved from: <u>https://www.brookings.edu/blog/brown-centerchalkboard/2018/07/10/how-gender-diversity-among-the-teacher-workforce-affectsstudent-learning/</u>
- "Higher Education Opportunity Program (HEOP)." (n.d.). Retrieved from: <u>http://www.nysed.gov/postsecondary-services/higher-education-opportunity-program-heop</u>
- Ingersoll, R.M., and Merrill, E. (2011). "The Status of Teaching as a Profession." from Schools and Society: A sociological approach to education. 4th ed. CA: Pine Forge Press/SAGE Publications. Retrieved from:

https://www.gse.upenn.edu/pdf/rmi/Status%20of%20Teaching%20as%20a%20Professi on%20chapter.pdf

Ingersoll, R., and Strong, M. (2011). "The Impact of Induction and Mentoring Programs for Beginning Teachers: A Critical Review of the Research." *Review of Education Research*, 81(2), 201-233. Retrieved from:

https://repository.upenn.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1127&context=gse_pubs

- Ingersoll, R.M., Merrill, E., Stuckey, D., and Collins, G. (2018). "Seven Trends: The Transformation of the Teaching Force." *CPRE Research Reports.* Retrieved from: <u>https://repository.upenn.edu/cpre_researchreports/108</u>
- Kazis, R. (2016). "MDRC Research on Career Pathways." Retrieved from: <u>https://www.mdrc.org/publication/mdrc-research-career-pathways</u>
- Learning Policy Institute. (2019, August). Recruiting and retaining teachers of color: Current

research and policy examples [Memorandum submitted to New York State Education Department]. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

- Li, X., & Carroll, C. D. (2007). "Characteristics of Minority-Serving Institutions and Minority Undergraduates Enrolled in These Institutions: Postsecondary Education Descriptive Analysis Report (NCES 2008-156)." *National Center for Education Statistics*. Retrieved from: <u>https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED499114.pdf</u>
- Lynn, M. (2006). "Education for the community: Exploring the culturally relevant practices of Black male teachers." *Teachers College Record*, *108*(12), 24-97.
- Johnson, K.M., & Miller, T. (2019, January 30). PRODI-G (Promoting Recruitment Opportunity Diversity Inclusion and Growth) [Memorandum]. Albany, NY: The State University of New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://www.suny.edu/media/suny/content-assets/documents/diversity/MEMOtoSUNYpresidents-PRODI-G.pdf</u>
- Mitchell, C., and Will, M. (2019). "Special Ed. Field pushes for teachers of color." *Education Week*, 39(4).
- The National Center for Suburban Studies at Hofstra University. (2019, March). "Teacher Diversity in Long Island's Public Schools." Retrieved from: https://www.hofstra.edu/pdf/academics/css/teacher-diversity-li-public-schools.pdf
- New York State Education Department. (2014-15). *New York State's Plan to Ensure Equitable Access to the Most Effective Educators.* Retrieved from: http://www.p12.nysed.gov/accountability/T2/pdfs/FINALNYSEquityPlan.pdf
- New York State Education Department. (2017). New York State's Final Every Student Succeeds (ESSA) Plan. Retrieved from:

http://www.nysed.gov/common/nysed/files/programs/essa/nys-essa-plan.pdf

- Pacini-Ketchabaw, V., & Schecter, S. (2002). Engaging the discourse of diversity: Educators' frameworks for working with linguistic and cultural difference. *Contemporary Issues in Early Childhood*, 3(3), 400-414. Retrieved from: <u>https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.2304/ciec.2002.3.3.7</u>
- Park, J. J. (2009). "Are we satisfied?: A look at student satisfaction with diversity at traditionally White institutions." *The Review of Higher Education*, *32*(3), 291-320.
- Partelow, L. (2019, December). "What to make of declining enrollment in teacher preparation programs." Washington, D.C.: Center for American Progress. Retrieved from: <u>https://cdn.americanprogress.org/content/uploads/2019/12/02085956/TeacherPrep-</u> <u>report.pdf</u>
- "Promoting Recruitment, Opportunity, Diversity, Inclusion, and Growth." (n.d.). Retrieved from: <u>https://www.suny.edu/prodig/</u>
- "Rankings of the States 2018 and Estimates of School Statistics 2019." (2019, April). Washington, D.C.: National Education Association. Retrieved from: <u>http://www.nea.org/assets/docs/2019%20Rankings%20and%20Estimates%20Report.pd</u> <u>f</u>
- *The Report and Recommendations of The New York State Task Force on Equity and Excellence in Education.* (1982, February). Albany N.Y.
- Ronfeldt, M., Loeb, S., & Wyckoff, J. 2013. "How teacher turnover harms student achievement." American Educational Research Journal 50 (1): 4–36. Retrieved from: <u>https://cepa.stanford.edu/sites/default/files/4.full_.pdf</u>

- Sedlacek, W.E. (1987). "Black students on White campuses: Twenty years of research." Journal of College Student Personnel, 28(6), 484-495. Retrieved from: <u>http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.895.1821&rep=rep1&type=pdf</u>
- "See Our Truth." (2017). New York, NY: The Education Trust New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://seeourtruth-ny.edtrust.org/wp-content/uploads/sites/9/2017/10/See-Our-Truth.pdf</u>
- Skiba, R. J., Michael, R. S., Nardo, A. C., & Peterson, R. L. (2002). "The color of discipline: Sources of racial and gender disproportionality in school punishment." *The urban review*, 34(4), 317-342. Retrieved from:

https://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1023%2FA%3A1021320817372.pdf

"State Education Department Releases 2014 Cohort High School Graduation Rates." (2019, January 30). Retrieved from: <u>http://www.nysed.gov/news/2019/state-education-</u> <u>department-releases-2014-cohort-high-school-graduation-rates</u>.

- "State Education Department Releases Spring 2019 Grades 3-8 ELA & Math Assessment Results." (2019, August 22). Retrieved from: <u>http://www.nysed.gov/news/2019/state-education-department-releases-spring-2019-grades-3-8-ela-math-assessment-results</u>
- Syracuse City School District. (n.d.). "Strategic Plan." Retrieved from: <u>http://www.syracusecityschools.com/districtpage.cfm?pageid=10710</u>
- "Tackling gaps in access to strong teachers." (2017). New York, NY: The Education Trust New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://edtrust.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/09/Tackling-Gaps-in-Access-to-Strong-Teachers-10.3-17.pdf</u>
- Tavarez, E. (2019). "Marist's Education Department is investing in the future." Retrieved from <u>https://www.marist.edu/-/marist-news-marist-s-education-department-is-investing-in-the-future</u>
- TeachNY Advisory Council. (2016). "Report of Findings and Recommendations. Albany, NY: The State University of New York." Retrieved from: <u>https://www.suny.edu/media/suny/content-assets/documents/teachny/TeachNY-</u> Report 20160518 Final.pdf
- Touré, M. (2019, November 20). "Council members scrutinize faculty, curriculum diversity at CUNY." *PoliticoPro*.
- "Trends in College Pricing 2018." (2018). New York: The College Board. Retrieved from: <u>https://research.collegeboard.org/trends/college-pricing</u>.
- Trower, C.A., and Chait, R.P. (2002, March-April). "Faculty Diversity: Why women and minorities are underrepresented in the professoriate, and fresh ideas to induce needed reform." *Harvard Magazine*, 104(4), 33-37. Retrieved from: http://www.harvardmag.com/pdf/2002/03-pdfs/0302-33.pdf
- Turner, C. S. V., González, J. C., & Wood, J. L. (2008). "Faculty of color in academe: What 20 years of literature tells us." *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education*, 1(3), 139-168.
- "Unpublished 2018-19 teacher turnover data by race/ethnicity." (2019, October). [Unpublished data analysis submitted to the New York State Education Department]. New York, NY: The Education Trust—New York.

Valenzuela, A. (2017). "Grow Your Own Educator Programs: A review of the literature with an

emphasis on equity-based approaches." San Antonio, TX: Intercultural Development Research Association. Retrieved from: <u>https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED582731.pdf</u>

- Williams, C.L. (1993). *Doing "Women's Work": Men in Nontraditional Occupations.* CA: SAGE Publications.
- Zimpher, N.L. (2017, June 21). SUNY TeachNY Policy on Educator Preparation [Memorandum]. Albany, NY: The State University of New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://www.suny.edu/about/leadership/board-of-</u> <u>trustees/meetings/webcastdocs/SUNY%20TeachNY%20Policy%20on%20Educator%20Pr</u> <u>eparation.pdf</u>

Endnotes

³ Boyd, D., Lankford, H., Loeb, S., & Wyckoff, J. (2005). "The draw of home: How teachers preferences for proximity disadvantage urban schools." *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, *24*(1), 113–132.

⁴ The National Center for Suburban Studies at Hofstra University. (2019, March). "Teacher Diversity in Long Island's Public Schools." Retrieved from: <u>https://www.hofstra.edu/pdf/academics/css/teacher-diversity-li-public-schools.pdf</u>

⁵ "Unpublished 2018-19 teacher turnover data by race/ethnicity." (2019, October). [Unpublished data analysis submitted to the New York State Education Department]. New York, NY: The Education Trust—New York.
 ⁶ The Report and Recommendations of The New York State Task Force on Equity and Excellence in Education. (1982, February). Albany N.Y. pp. 1.

⁷ 8 NYCRR §52.21 (b)(2)(i)(c)

⁸ New York State Education Department. (2014-15). *New York State's Plan to Ensure Equitable Access to the Most Effective Educators*. Retrieved from: <u>http://www.p12.nysed.gov/accountability/T2/pdfs/FINALNYSEquityPlan.pdf</u>

⁹ New York State Education Department. (2017). *New York State's Final Every Student Succeeds (ESSA) Plan.* pp. 144. Retrieved from: <u>http://www.nysed.gov/common/nysed/files/programs/essa/nys-essa-plan.pdf</u>

¹⁰ "The Diverse and Learner-Ready Teachers Initiative." (n.d.). Retrieved from: <u>https://ccsso.org/topics/diverse-and-learner-ready-teachers-initiative</u>

¹¹ See Appendix E: NYSED Educator Diversity Survey for the complete text of the survey

¹² Ed. Law §305 (58)

¹³ Cherng, H., & Halpin, P. (2016). "The importance of minority teachers: Student perceptions of minority versus White teachers." *Educational Researcher*, 45(7). Retrieved from:

https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.3102/0013189X16671718

¹⁴ "See Our Truth." (2017). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://seeourtruth-ny.edtrust.org/</u>

¹⁵ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

¹⁶ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

¹⁷ Easton-Brooks, D. (2019). *Ethnic matching: Academic success of students of color*. MD: Rowman & Littlefield.

¹⁸ Easton-Brooks, D. (2019). *Ethnic matching: Academic success of students of color*. MD: Rowman & Littlefield.

¹⁹ Easton-Brooks, D. (2019). *Ethnic matching: Academic success of students of color*. MD: Rowman & Littlefield.

²⁰ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

²¹ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

Partelow, L. (2019, December). "What to make of declining enrollment in teacher preparation programs." Washington, D.C.: Center for American Progress. Retrieved from:

https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2019/12/03/477311/make-decliningenrollment-teacher-preparation-programs/

TeachNY Advisory Council. (2016). "Report of Findings and Recommendations. Albany, NY: The State University of New York." Retrieved from: <u>https://www.suny.edu/media/suny/content-assets/documents/teachny/TeachNY-Report_20160518_Final.pdf</u>

²² "See Our Truth." (2017). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://seeourtruth-ny.edtrust.org/</u>

Unpublished NYSED Data

¹ Ed. Law §305 (58)

² Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

²³ "See Our Truth." (2017). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://seeourtruth-ny.edtrust.org/</u>

²⁵ Hansen, M. & Quintero, D. (2018, July 10). "How gender diversity among the teacher workforce affects student learning." Washington, D.C.: Brookings Institute, Brown Center on Education Policy. Retrieved from:

https://www.brookings.edu/blog/brown-center-chalkboard/2018/07/10/how-gender-diversity-among-theteacher-workforce-affects-student-learning/

²⁶ Hansen, M. & Quintero, D. (2018, July 10). "How gender diversity among the teacher workforce affects student learning." Washington, D.C.: Brookings Institute, Brown Center on Education Policy. Retrieved from: <u>https://www.brookings.edu/blog/brown-center-chalkboard/2018/07/10/how-gender-diversity-among-the-</u> teacher-workforce-affects-student-learning/

²⁷ Dee, T.S. (2006). "The why Chromosome: How a teacher's gender affects boys and girls." *Education Next*, 6(4). Retrieved from: <u>https://www.educationnext.org/files/ednext20064_68.pdf</u>

²⁸ Ingersoll, R.M., Merrill, E., Stuckey, D., and Collins, G. (2018). "Seven Trends: The Transformation of the Teaching Force." *CPRE Research Reports*. Retrieved from: <u>https://repository.upenn.edu/cpre_researchreports/108</u> Lynn, M. (2006). "Education for the community: Exploring the culturally relevant practices of Black male teachers." *Teachers College Record*, *108*(12), 24-97.

²⁹ Lynn, M. (2006). "Education for the community: Exploring the culturally relevant practices of Black male teachers." *Teachers College Record*, *108*(12), 24-97.

³⁰ See Appendix B: Publicly Available Data

³¹ TeachNY Advisory Council. (2016). "Report of Findings and Recommendations. Albany, NY: The State University of New York." Retrieved from: <u>https://www.suny.edu/media/suny/content-assets/documents/teachny/TeachNY-</u> Report 20160518 Final.pdf

³² NYSED Personnel Master Files

³³ NYSED Personnel Master Files

³⁴ "See Our Truth." (2017). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://seeourtruth-ny.edtrust.org/</u>

³⁵ NYSED Personnel Master Files

³⁶ NYSED Data Site

³⁷ See Appendix D: New York State's BOCES Regions and Regent Districts for a complete list of counties by Regents District

³⁸ Unpublished NYSED Data

³⁹ Unpublished NYSED Data

⁴⁰ "Breaking Through: Shattering the glass ceiling for women leaders." Chiefs for Change. Retrieved from: <u>https://chiefsforchange.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/CFC-WomenLeaders-Final-April-23-2019.pdf</u>

⁴¹ "Breaking Through: Shattering the glass ceiling for women leaders." Chiefs for Change. Retrieved from: <u>https://chiefsforchange.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/CFC-WomenLeaders-Final-April-23-2019.pdf</u>

⁴² "Breaking Through: Shattering the glass ceiling for women leaders." Chiefs for Change. Retrieved from: <u>https://chiefsforchange.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/CFC-WomenLeaders-Final-April-23-2019.pdf</u>

⁴³ NYSED Personnel Master Files

⁴⁴ Gais, T., Backstrom, B., Malatras, J. & Park, Y.J. (2018). "The State of the New York Teacher Workforce." Albany, NY: Rockefeller Institute of Government. Retrieved from: <u>https://rockinst.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/03/03-</u> 22-18-Teacher-Work-Force.pdf

⁴⁵ Gais, T., Backstrom, B., Malatras, J. & Park, Y.J. (2018). "The State of the New York Teacher Workforce." Albany, NY: Rockefeller Institute of Government. Retrieved from: <u>https://rockinst.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/03/03-</u> 22-18-Teacher-Work-Force.pdf

⁴⁶ NYSED Student and Educator Database

⁴⁷ NYSED Student and Educator Database

²⁴ "See Our Truth." (2017). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://seeourtruth-ny.edtrust.org/</u>

⁴⁸ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁴⁹ NYSED Report Card

⁵⁰ For an overview of the requirements to become a teacher in New York, see Appendix A: Overview of New York's Teacher Preparation and Certification Process

⁵¹ Georgetown University Center on Education and the Workforce. (2018). "Our separate & unequal public colleges: How public colleges reinforce White racial privilege and marginalize Black and Latino students." Retrieved from: <u>https://lgyhoq479ufd3yna29x7ubjn-wpengine.netdna-ssl.com/wp-content/uploads/SAUStates_FR.pdf</u>
 ⁵² Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁵³ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁵⁴ Skiba, R. J., Michael, R. S., Nardo, A. C., & Peterson, R. L. (2002). "The color of discipline: Sources of racial and gender disproportionality in school punishment." *The urban review*, *34*(4), 317-342. Retrieved from: <u>https://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1023%2FA%3A1021320817372.pdf</u>

⁵⁵ Skiba, R. J., Michael, R. S., Nardo, A. C., & Peterson, R. L. (2002). "The color of discipline: Sources of racial and gender disproportionality in school punishment." *The urban review*, *34*(4), 317-342. Retrieved from: <u>https://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1023%2FA%3A1021320817372.pdf</u>

⁵⁶ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁵⁷ TeachNY Advisory Council. (2016). "Report of Findings and Recommendations. Albany, NY: The State University of New York." Retrieved from: <u>https://www.suny.edu/media/suny/content-assets/documents/teachny/TeachNY-Report 20160518 Final.pdf</u>

See also: "See Our Truth." (2017). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: https://seeourtruth-ny.edtrust.org/wp-content/uploads/sites/9/2017/10/See-Our-Truth.pdf

⁵⁸ New York State Education Department. (2017). *New York State's Final Every Student Succeeds (ESSA) Plan.* pp.
 52-3. Retrieved from: <u>http://www.nysed.gov/common/nysed/files/programs/essa/nys-essa-plan.pdf</u>

⁵⁹ Title II Reports

⁶⁰ Partelow, L. (2019, December). "What to make of declining enrollment in teacher preparation programs." Washington, D.C.: Center for American Progress. Retrieved from:

https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2019/12/03/477311/make-decliningenrollment-teacher-preparation-programs/

⁶¹ Gais, T., Backstrom, B., Malatras, J. & Park, Y.J. (2018). "The State of the New York Teacher Workforce." Albany, NY: Rockefeller Institute of Government. Retrieved from: <u>https://rockinst.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/03/03-</u> 22-18-Teacher-Work-Force.pdf

⁶² Title II Reports

⁶³ Title II Reports

⁶⁴ Title II Reports

⁶⁵ Title II Reports

⁶⁶ NYSED Higher Education 2009-2018 Graduation Data. Data are as of 09-04-2019.

⁶⁷ "The First Frontier of Equity: Improving data transparency, availability & usefulness in teacher preparation to support future teachers...and their students." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://newyork.edtrust.org/new-yorks-future-teachers/</u>

⁶⁸ "The First Frontier of Equity: Improving data transparency, availability & usefulness in teacher preparation to support future teachers...and their students." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://newyork.edtrust.org/new-yorks-future-teachers/</u>

⁶⁹ "The First Frontier of Equity: Improving data transparency, availability & usefulness in teacher preparation to support future teachers...and their students." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://newyork.edtrust.org/new-yorks-future-teachers/</u>

⁷⁰ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁷¹ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

Haddix, M. M. (2015). *Cultivating racial and linguistic diversity in literacy teacher education: Teachers like me*. Routledge.

Pacini-Ketchabaw, V., & Schecter, S. (2002). Engaging the discourse of diversity: Educators' frameworks for working with linguistic and cultural difference. *Contemporary Issues in Early Childhood*, *3*(3), 400-414. Retrieved from: https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.2304/ciec.2002.3.3.7

Park, J. J. (2009). "Are we satisfied?: A look at student satisfaction with diversity at traditionally White institutions." *The Review of Higher Education*, *32*(3), 291-320.

"See Our Truth." (2017). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://seeourtruth-ny.edtrust.org/</u>

⁷² Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

Pacini-Ketchabaw, V., & Schecter, S. (2002). Engaging the discourse of diversity: Educators' frameworks for working with linguistic and cultural difference. *Contemporary Issues in Early Childhood*, *3*(3), 400-414. Retrieved from: https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.2304/ciec.2002.3.3.7

Park, J. J. (2009). "Are we satisfied?: A look at student satisfaction with diversity at traditionally White institutions." *The Review of Higher Education*, *32*(3), 291-320.

⁷³ "Trends in College Pricing 2018." (2018). New York: The College Board. Retrieved from: <u>https://research.collegeboard.org/trends/college-pricing</u>.

⁷⁴ "Trends in College Pricing 2018." (2018). New York: The College Board. Retrieved from: https://research.collegeboard.org/trends/college-pricing.

⁷⁵ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁷⁶ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁷⁷ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁷⁸ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

⁷⁹ Partelow, L. (2019, December). "What to make of declining enrollment in teacher preparation programs." Washington, D.C.: Center for American Progress. pp. 1. Retrieved from:

https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2019/12/03/477311/make-decliningenrollment-teacher-preparation-programs/

⁸⁰ Ingersoll, R.M., and Merrill, E. (2011). "The Status of Teaching as a Profession." from *Schools and Society: A sociological approach to education*. 4th ed. CA: Pine Forge Press/SAGE Publications. Retrieved from:

https://www.gse.upenn.edu/pdf/rmi/Status%20of%20Teaching%20as%20a%20Profession%20chapter.pdf Williams, C.L. (1993). *Doing "Women's Work": Men in Nontraditional Occupations*. CA: SAGE Publications.

⁸¹ Johnson, K.M., & Miller, T. (2019, January 30). *PRODI-G (Promoting Recruitment Opportunity Diversity Inclusion and Growth)* [Memorandum]. Albany, NY: The State University of New York. Retrieved from:

https://www.suny.edu/media/suny/content-assets/documents/diversity/MEMOtoSUNYpresidents-PRODI-G.pdf ⁸² Turner, C. S. V., González, J. C., & Wood, J. L. (2008). "Faculty of color in academe: What 20 years of literature tells us." *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education*, 1(3), 139-168.

⁸³ Turner, C. S. V., González, J. C., & Wood, J. L. (2008). "Faculty of color in academe: What 20 years of literature tells us." *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education*, 1(3), 139-168.

⁸⁴ The National Center for Suburban Studies at Hofstra University. (2019, March). "Teacher Diversity in Long Island's Public Schools." pp. 30. Retrieved from: <u>https://www.hofstra.edu/pdf/academics/css/teacher-diversity-li-public-schools.pdf</u>

⁸⁵ Boyd, D., Lankford, H., Loeb, S., & Wyckoff, J. (2005). "The draw of home: How teachers preferences for proximity disadvantage urban schools." *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, *24*(1), 113–132.

⁸⁶ "The First Frontier of Equity: Improving data transparency, availability & usefulness in teacher preparation to support future teachers...and their students." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://newyork.edtrust.org/new-yorks-future-teachers/</u>

⁸⁷ NYSED Personnel Master Files

⁸⁸ NYSED Data Site

⁸⁹ NYSED Student and Educator Database

⁹⁰ Institutions are classified as minority-serving based on one of two separate criteria: (1) legislation, which identifies such accredited institutions as Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCUs) or Tribal Colleges and Universities (TCUs) as minority-serving institutions; or (2) the percentage of minority student enrollment, by which at least 25% of enrollment must be of a specific minority group (Li & Carroll 2007).

⁹¹ Title II Reports

⁹² "The First Frontier of Equity: Improving data transparency, availability & usefulness in teacher preparation to support future teachers...and their students." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://newyork.edtrust.org/new-yorks-future-teachers/</u>

⁹³ The National Center for Suburban Studies at Hofstra University. (2019, March). "Teacher Diversity in Long Island's Public Schools." Retrieved from: <u>https://www.hofstra.edu/pdf/academics/css/teacher-diversity-li-public-schools.pdf</u>

⁹⁴ Unpublished NYSED Data

95 Unpublished NYSED Data

⁹⁶ Ingersoll, R., and Strong, M. (2011). "The Impact of Induction and Mentoring Programs for Beginning Teachers: A Critical Review of the Research." *Review of Education Research*, *81*(2), 201-233. Retrieved from: https://repository.upenn.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1127&context=gse_pubs

⁹⁷ "The First Frontier of Equity: Improving data transparency, availability & usefulness in teacher preparation to support future teachers...and their students." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://newyork.edtrust.org/new-yorks-future-teachers/</u>

⁹⁸ Note that the analysis included only those districts with sufficient race/ethnicity data reported—approximately 50% of all districts, including Buffalo, New York City, and Yonkers. Charter schools were not included.

⁹⁹ "Unpublished 2018-19 teacher turnover data by race/ethnicity." (2019, October). [Unpublished data analysis submitted to the New York State Education Department]. New York, NY: The Education Trust—New York.

¹⁰⁰ "Unpublished 2018-19 teacher turnover data by race/ethnicity." (2019, October). [Unpublished data analysis submitted to the New York State Education Department]. New York, NY: The Education Trust—New York.

¹⁰¹ "Unpublished 2018-19 teacher turnover data by race/ethnicity." (2019, October). [Unpublished data analysis submitted to the New York State Education Department]. New York, NY: The Education Trust—New York.

¹⁰² "Unpublished 2018-19 teacher turnover data by race/ethnicity." (2019, October). [Unpublished data analysis submitted to the New York State Education Department]. New York, NY: The Education Trust—New York.

¹⁰³ Carver-Thomas, D., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2017). Teacher turnover: Why it matters and what we can do about it. *Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute*. Retrieved from:

https://www.fcis.org/uploaded/Data Reports/Teacher Turnover REPORT.pdf

¹⁰⁴ "Rankings of the States 2018 and Estimates of School Statistics 2019." (2019, April). Washington, D.C.: National Education Association. Retrieved from:

http://www.nea.org/assets/docs/2019%20Rankings%20and%20Estimates%20Report.pdf

See also: NEA Interactive Map of Individual Data and Findings from 2017-18

¹⁰⁵ NYSED Personnel Master Files

¹⁰⁶ NYSED Personnel Master Files; NYSED Student and Educator Database

¹⁰⁷ NYSED Personnel Master Files; NYSED Student and Educator Database

¹⁰⁸ Carver-Thomas, D., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2017). Teacher turnover: Why it matters and what we can do about it. *Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute*. pp. 29. Retrieved from:

https://www.fcis.org/uploaded/Data_Reports/Teacher_Turnover_REPORT.pdf

¹⁰⁹ Carver-Thomas, D., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2017). Teacher turnover: Why it matters and what we can do about it. *Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute*. Retrieved from:

https://www.fcis.org/uploaded/Data_Reports/Teacher_Turnover_REPORT.pdf

Ronfeldt, M., Loeb, S., & Wyckoff, J. 2013. "How teacher turnover harms student achievement." American Educational Research Journal 50 (1): 4–36. Retrieved from:

https://cepa.stanford.edu/sites/default/files/4.full .pdf

¹¹⁰ "The First Frontier of Equity: Improving data transparency, availability & usefulness in teacher preparation to support future teachers...and their students." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://newyork.edtrust.org/new-yorks-future-teachers/</u>

¹¹¹ Title II Reports

¹¹² Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

¹¹³ Goldhaber, D., Gross, B., and Player D. (2010). "Teacher career paths, teacher quality, and persistence in the classroom: Are public schools keeping their best?" Working paper. *University of Washington: Center for Education Data & Research (CEDR)*. Retrieved from: <u>http://www.cedr.us/publications.html</u>

¹¹⁴ Ingersoll, R., and Strong, M. (2011). "The Impact of Induction and Mentoring Programs for Beginning Teachers: A Critical Review of the Research." *Review of Education Research, 81*(2), 201-233. Retrieved from: https://repository.upenn.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1127&context=gse_pubs

¹¹⁵ Gray-Nicolas, N. & Nash, A.M. (2019). "First Things First: Black women situating identity in the first-year educational leadership faculty experience." Presentation to Metropolitan Council for Educational Administration Programs.

¹¹⁶ Trower, C.A., and Chait, R.P. (2002, March-April). "Faculty Diversity: Why women and minorities are underrepresented in the professoriate, and fresh ideas to induce needed reform." *Harvard Magazine*, 104(4), 33-37. Retrieved from: http://www.harvardmag.com/pdf/2002/03-pdfs/0302-33.pdf

¹¹⁷ Trower, C.A., and Chait, R.P. (2002, March-April). "Faculty Diversity: Why women and minorities are underrepresented in the professoriate, and fresh ideas to induce needed reform." *Harvard Magazine*, 104(4), 33-37. Retrieved from: http://www.harvardmag.com/pdf/2002/03-pdfs/0302-33.pdf

¹¹⁸ New York State Education Department. (2017). *New York State's Final Every Student Succeeds (ESSA) Plan.* Retrieved from: <u>http://www.nysed.gov/common/nysed/files/programs/essa/nys-essa-plan.pdf</u>

¹¹⁹ See Appendix E: NYSED Educator Diversity Survey for a complete copy of the survey questions

¹²⁰ The National Center for Suburban Studies at Hofstra University. (2019, March). "Teacher Diversity in Long Island's Public Schools." Retrieved from: <u>https://www.hofstra.edu/pdf/academics/css/teacher-diversity-li-public-schools.pdf</u>

¹²¹ Zimpher, N.L. (2017, June 21). *SUNY TeachNY Policy on Educator Preparation* [Memorandum]. Albany, NY: The State University of New York. [Emphasis added] Retrieved from: <u>https://www.suny.edu/about/leadership/board-of-trustees/meetings/webcastdocs/SUNY%20TeachNY%20Policy%20on%20Educator%20Preparation.pdf</u>

¹²² Boyd, D., Lankford, H., Loeb, S., & Wyckoff, J. (2005). "The draw of home: How teachers preferences for proximity disadvantage urban schools." *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, *24*(1), 113–132.
¹²³ Kazis, R. (2016). "MDRC Research on Career Pathways." Retrieved from:

https://www.mdrc.org/publication/mdrc-research-career-pathways

¹²⁴ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

Learning Policy Institute. (2019, August). Recruiting and retaining teachers of color: Current research and policy examples [Memorandum submitted to New York State Education Department]. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

See Appendix C: Literature Review and Examples

¹²⁵ Valenzuela, A. (2017). "Grow Your Own Educator Programs: A review of the literature with an emphasis on equity-based approaches." San Antonio, TX: Intercultural Development Research Association. Retrieved from: <u>https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED582731.pdf</u> ¹²⁶ Valenzuela, A. (2017). "Grow Your Own Educator Programs: A review of the literature with an emphasis on equity-based approaches." San Antonio, TX: Intercultural Development Research Association. Retrieved from: <u>https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED582731.pdf</u>

¹²⁷ "Educator Diversity Playbook." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust—New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://seeourtruth-ny.edtrust.org/playbook/</u>

¹²⁸ Tavarez, E. (2019). "Marist's Education Department is investing in the future." Retrieved from https://www.marist.edu/-/marist-news-marist-s-education-department-is-investing-in-the-future
 ¹²⁹ Tavarez, E. (2019). "Marist's Education Department is investing in the future." Retrieved from https://www.marist.edu/-/marist-news-marist-s-education-department-is-investing-in-the-future

¹³⁰ See Appendix A: Overview of New York's Teacher Preparation and Certification Process

¹³¹ See Appendix A: Overview of New York's Teacher Preparation and Certification for information on alternative, IHE-based programs

¹³² Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

Learning Policy Institute. (2019, August). Recruiting and retaining teachers of color: Current research and policy examples [Memorandum submitted to New York State Education Department]. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

See Appendix C: Literature Review and Examples

¹³³ TeachNY Advisory Council. (2016). "Report of Findings and Recommendations. Albany, NY: The State University of New York." Retrieved from: <u>https://www.suny.edu/media/suny/content-assets/documents/teachny/TeachNY-Report_20160518_Final.pdf</u>

¹³⁴ "The First Frontier of Equity: Improving data transparency, availability & usefulness in teacher preparation to support future teachers...and their students." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://newyork.edtrust.org/new-yorks-future-teachers/</u>

¹³⁵ "The First Frontier of Equity: Improving data transparency, availability & usefulness in teacher preparation to support future teachers...and their students." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://newyork.edtrust.org/new-yorks-future-teachers/</u>

¹³⁶ "The First Frontier of Equity: Improving data transparency, availability & usefulness in teacher preparation to support future teachers...and their students." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://newyork.edtrust.org/new-yorks-future-teachers/</u>

¹³⁷ "Diversity Scholarships & Grants." (n.d.). Retrieved from: <u>https://www.suny.edu/diversity/scholarships-grants/</u>
 ¹³⁸ "Higher Education Opportunity Program (HEOP)." (n.d.). Retrieved from <u>http://www.nysed.gov/postsecondary-</u>
 <u>services/higher-education-opportunity-program-heop</u>

¹³⁹ Learning Policy Institute. (2019, August). Recruiting and retaining teachers of color: Current research and policy examples [Memorandum submitted to New York State Education Department]. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

See Appendix C: Literature Review and Examples, Part 2: Promising Practices and State Policy Examples ¹⁴⁰ <u>SUNY Oswego TOC II webpage</u>

¹⁴¹ Learning Policy Institute. (2019, August). Recruiting and retaining teachers of color: Current research and policy examples [Memorandum submitted to New York State Education Department]. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

See Appendix C: Literature Review and Examples, Part 2: Promising Practices and State Policy Examples ¹⁴² The National Center for Suburban Studies at Hofstra University. (2019, March). "Teacher Diversity in Long Island's Public Schools." pp. 30. Retrieved from: <u>https://www.hofstra.edu/pdf/academics/css/teacher-diversity-lipublic-schools.pdf</u>

¹⁴³ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

Learning Policy Institute. (2019, August). Recruiting and retaining teachers of color: Current research and policy examples [Memorandum submitted to New York State Education Department]. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

See Appendix C: Literature Review and Examples

¹⁴⁴ The National Center for Suburban Studies at Hofstra University. (2019, March). "Teacher Diversity in Long Island's Public Schools." pp. 31. Retrieved from: <u>https://www.hofstra.edu/pdf/academics/css/teacher-diversity-li-public-schools.pdf</u>

¹⁴⁵ NYSED's Educator Diversity Survey, 2019

¹⁴⁶ See: Sedlacek, W.E. (1987). "Black students on White campuses: Twenty years of research." *Journal of College Student Personnel, 28*(6), 484-495. Retrieved from:

http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.895.1821&rep=rep1&type=pdf

¹⁴⁷ "Diversity Scholarships & Grants." (n.d.). Retrieved from: <u>https://www.suny.edu/diversity/scholarships-grants/</u>
 ¹⁴⁸ Johnson, K.M., & Miller, T. (2019, January 30). *PRODI-G (Promoting Recruitment Opportunity Diversity Inclusion and Growth)* [Memorandum]. Albany, NY: The State University of New York. Retrieved from:

https://www.suny.edu/media/suny/content-assets/documents/diversity/MEMOtoSUNYpresidents-PRODI-G.pdf ¹⁴⁹ "Promoting Recruitment, Opportunity, Diversity, Inclusion, and Growth." (n.d.). Retrieved from: https://www.suny.edu/prodig/

¹⁵⁰ "Diversity Scholarships & Grants." (n.d.). Retrieved from: <u>https://www.suny.edu/diversity/scholarships-grants/</u>
 ¹⁵¹ "Educator Diversity Playbook." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust—New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://seeourtruth-ny.edtrust.org/playbook/</u>

¹⁵² "Educator Diversity Playbook." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust—New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://seeourtruth-ny.edtrust.org/playbook/</u>

¹⁵³ "Educator Diversity Playbook." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust—New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://seeourtruth-ny.edtrust.org/playbook/</u>

¹⁵⁴ Touré, M. (2019, November 20). "Council members scrutinize faculty, curriculum diversity at CUNY." *PoliticoPro*.

¹⁵⁵ Touré, M. (2019, November 20). "Council members scrutinize faculty, curriculum diversity at CUNY." *PoliticoPro*.

¹⁵⁶ Touré, M. (2019, November 20). "Council members scrutinize faculty, curriculum diversity at CUNY." *PoliticoPro*.

¹⁵⁷ Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). "Diversifying the teaching profession: How to recruit and retain teachers of color." Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

Learning Policy Institute. (2019, August). Recruiting and retaining teachers of color: Current research and policy examples [Memorandum submitted to New York State Education Department]. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

See Appendix C: Literature Review and Examples

¹⁵⁸ Learning Policy Institute. (2019, August). Recruiting and retaining teachers of color: Current research and policy examples [Memorandum submitted to New York State Education Department]. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

See also: New York State Education Department. (2017). *New York State's Final Every Student Succeeds (ESSA) Plan.* Retrieved from: <u>http://www.nysed.gov/common/nysed/files/programs/essa/nys-essa-plan.pdf</u>

¹⁵⁹ Learning Policy Institute. (2019, August). Recruiting and retaining teachers of color: Current research and policy examples [Memorandum submitted to New York State Education Department]. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

See Appendix C: Literature Review and Examples, Part 2: Promising Practices and State Policy Examples ¹⁶⁰ Learning Policy Institute. (2019, August). Recruiting and retaining teachers of color: Current research and policy examples [Memorandum submitted to New York State Education Department]. Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute.

See Appendix C: Literature Review and Examples, Part 2: Promising Practices and State Policy Examples ¹⁶¹ New York State Education Department. (2017). *New York State's Final Every Student Succeeds (ESSA) Plan.* Retrieved from: <u>http://www.nysed.gov/common/nysed/files/programs/essa/nys-essa-plan.pdf</u>

¹⁶² New York State Education Department. (2014-15). *New York State's Plan to Ensure Equitable Access to the Most Effective Educators.* Retrieved from: <u>http://www.p12.nysed.gov/accountability/T2/pdfs/FINALNYSEquityPlan.pdf</u>

¹⁶³ "The First Frontier of Equity: Improving data transparency, availability & usefulness in teacher preparation to support future teachers...and their students." (2019). New York, NY: The Education Trust – New York. Retrieved from: <u>https://newyork.edtrust.org/new-yorks-future-teachers/</u>

¹⁶⁴ Partelow, L. (2019, December). "What to make of declining enrollment in teacher preparation programs." Washington, D.C.: Center for American Progress. Retrieved from:

https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2019/12/03/477311/make-decliningenrollment-teacher-preparation-programs/

¹⁶⁵ Partelow, L. (2019, December). "What to make of declining enrollment in teacher preparation programs." Washington, D.C.: Center for American Progress. Retrieved from:

https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2019/12/03/477311/make-decliningenrollment-teacher-preparation-programs/

¹⁶⁶ Mitchell, C., and Will, M. (2019). "Special Ed. Field pushes for teachers of color." *Education Week*, 39(4). Pp. 9. ¹⁶⁷ Mitchell, C., and Will, M. (2019). "Special Ed. Field pushes for teachers of color." *Education Week*, 39(4). Pp. 9. ¹⁶⁸ Cochran-Smith, M., & Zeichner, K. M. (Eds.). (2009). *Studying teacher education: The report of the AERA panel*

on research and teacher education. Routledge. Pp. 2.

¹⁶⁹ Cochran-Smith, M., & Zeichner, K. M. (Eds.). (2009). *Studying teacher education: The report of the AERA panel on research and teacher education*. Routledge. Pp. 8.

¹⁷⁰ Cochran-Smith, M., & Zeichner, K. M. (Eds.). (2009). *Studying teacher education: The report of the AERA panel on research and teacher education*. Routledge.

¹⁷¹ Cochran-Smith, M., & Zeichner, K. M. (Eds.). (2009). *Studying teacher education: The report of the AERA panel on research and teacher education*. Routledge.

¹⁷² "Alternative Teacher Preparation Program Fact Sheet." (n.d.). Retrieved from: <u>http://www.nysed.gov/college-university-evaluation/alternative-teacher-preparation-program-fact-sheet</u>