

| Page #/BM | Renewal Site Visit Report Text | HH Response |
|---------------------|---|---|
| Pg. 11 (Summary) | <p>The NYSED CSO issued HHLA multiple Notices of Deficiency for areas the CMO is responsible for managing and should be held accountable for in terms of performance. Currently, the school is not in compliance with teacher certification requirements, and this is an area of concern as it impacts state compliance and the professional learning climate in the school. For example, during the parent focus group, concerns about teacher and leader turnover were discussed. While the school design and model are built on an ethos of inclusion and diversity, the evolutionary reality of teacher turnover has impacted the level of diversity among the instructional team. Parents, during the focus group, specifically expressed a desire to see more diversity among the teachers. This is also relevant among the instructional leadership team. In terms of enrollment, HHLA is in its third year of being unable to meet its contractually obligated enrollment, which in SY 2020-2021 was at 64% of maximum approved. In addition, HHLA appears to be in very poor</p> | <p>The CMO takes its responsibilities to support the School quite seriously, and has played a substantial role in addressing and remedying areas of deficiency, and doing so in coordination with school leadership and the Board. In terms of the areas referenced by the CSO, we respectfully note the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Teacher Certification: Recruiting and retaining qualified and high-quality teachers has always been a top priority for our school and CMO. <p>Due to the pandemic and the “great resignation,” hiring and retaining certified teachers has been more challenging than ever due to the increased demands on teachers. The disruption in the teacher workforce is nationwide (see, for example, https://www.frontlineeducation.com/blog/teacher-shortage-2021/, and Washington Post Article - Why are So Many Teachers Thinking of Quitting?).</p> <p>We find ourselves -- along with many other schools -- with substantial vacancies compared to prior years, and with far fewer applicants for open positions. Because of the shifts in staffing, it has been more difficult to monitor and track our progress towards being in compliance with teacher certification, despite our certification audit partnership with the NYC Charter School Center.</p> <p>However, the CMO is implementing a robust certification tracking plan (which was highlighted in our CAP) and which will take a two-pronged approach to support current teachers with individual action plans toward certification and which will also ensure all new staff contracts include a requirement to achieve certification by a designated date.</p> <p>We are actively exploring formalized partnerships with teacher certification programs at Relay and Touro, and also modeling out different approaches to tuition reimbursement to incentivize completion of masters</p> |

financial condition as evidenced by performance on key indicators derived from the school's independently audited financial statements, and for the past two years has had a negative financial composite score.

programs.

- **Recruitment: Diversity and Inclusion-** The school continues to prioritize diversity in our teaching and leadership staff, and has a very diverse staff. As of Mar 1, 2022 the staff make-up is as follows:
 - 41% White
 - 31% Black/African American
 - 14% Hispanic
 - 5% Multi-racial
 - 3% Asian

While this is a top priority, we also acknowledge that the great resignation and the pandemic has limited our pool of viable candidates.

- **Enrollment** - Due to declining charter school enrollment across the city, HHLA, at the guidance of Hebrew Public, has requested to revise substantially downward its maximum enrollment to ensure compliance with NYSED. The School is located in a part of the city (Harlem) which has a substantial concentration of charter schools, but we have become a beacon for families from multiple sending districts, and, for example, provide free busing for families from the Bronx who would not otherwise be able to send their children to our school.
- **Finance** - The school has struggled with a combination of high building expenses and lower than anticipated enrollment, and for these reasons has not met State benchmarks in finance. Hebrew Public and the board have been actively engaged on this, supporting effort that include:
 - 1) Seeking subtenant for excess space
 - 2) Negotiating lower rent payment from landlord
 - 3) Renegotiating underlying construction debt
 - 4) Helping to recruit new families
 - 5) Hebrew Public providing over \$2 million in grant funding to the School since its founding

| | | |
|-------------------------|--|---|
| Pg. 11 | Overall, based on classroom observation, ELLs appear to receive service alongside SWDs, which is concerning. | MLL students at Harlem Hebrew do receive a different type of support than SWD. MLL students are pulled into small groups to receive Leveled Literacy Instruction support. MLL teachers also push in to classrooms to support students based on individual need. The amount of minutes of support they receive is based on their last NYSESLAT and NYSITELL scores. SWDs receive either ICT or/and SETSS support. They also receive individual management needs and work towards individual goals as per their IEP. Therefore, the level and type of support that MLL students and SWD receive is very distinct. We regret any logistics or coordination issues that may have led to these supports not being fully observed during the site visit, and welcome the CSO to return to observe them. |
| Pg. 11 | In terms of instructional practices, students receive daily instruction in modern Hebrew by a native language speaker. However, there were no clear details shared by the HHLA instructional team or parents about Hebrew language pathways for students after eighth grade. | <p>All 8th grade graduates are eligible to participate in the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● remote Hebrew classes to maintain their Hebrew language skills via zoom instruction ● the opportunity to join a leadership trip to Israel to further sharpen their language and cultural proficiency - yearly opportunities to participate in workshops and events related to Hebrew and Israel cultural stories ● individualized support in High School choice for options to provide further study <p>Because the above programs are managed by the CMO as network-wide initiatives, and because the school has only graduated one class of 8th graders, it should not be surprising that a limited number of school staff and parents would be aware of the details about them.</p> |
| Pg. 18 (Benchmark 2) | The school serves 40 students identified as ELL. | As of February 22, 2022 - We currently have 50 students classified as MLL at HHLA. |

| | | |
|---------------------------------|---|---|
| <p>Pg. 18 (Benchmark 2)</p> | <p>Further, data related to the percentage of students attaining Hebrew proficiency and/or percentage of ELLs achieving commanding level on the NYSESLAT was not presented.</p> | <p>Over the past two years, due to COVID, very few students opted to come in for NYSESLAT testing. Therefore, we were unable to provide accurate information on how many MLL students attained commanding level. We will be able to accurately provide proficiency information this year as all MLL students will be present in the building for testing.</p> |
| <p>Pg. 19 (Benchmark 2)</p> | <p>Additionally, during an onsite classroom observation, one student with an individualized education plan (IEP) was observed out of his seat and off-task and upon inquiry the observer learned that a paraprofessional who works one-on-one with him was absent, but there was no replacement paraprofessional or push-in SPED-certified teacher working with that student.</p> | <p>Unfortunately, the lack of paraprofessionals is an issue not unique to HHLA. As we know, due to COVID-related issues, paraprofessional agencies have lost a high number of related service professionals (including paras). Whenever a para is absent, we work diligently with the para agency to replace them. We are able to provide emails sent to agencies each time a para is absent (planned or unplanned). More often than not, they are not able to provide us with a replacement paraprofessional due to a staff shortage. When this occurs, in some instances we may not have a staff member available to provide support. We work with the student teacher, SpEd coordinator, and culture team to provide a plan of support for the student (which may include planned breaks, check in/check out systems, providing notice of transitions, previewing schedules, following incentive plans or BIPs, etc.).</p> <p>We would ask that the CSO recognize the uniquely challenging para-staffing and overall staffing challenges stemming from the pandemic; our team has worked extremely hard to ensure that student's IEPs are fully implemented.</p> |
| <p>Pg. 19 (Benchmark 2)</p> | <p>There are concerns about the school's ability to implement management needs of the students as well as behavior intervention plans.</p> | <p>As of the first week of January, we have implemented an incentive plan system with 15 of our highest needs students. This system has been managed by the Director of Special Education serviced and supported by the Special Education Coordinator, Mental Health team at HH, and the Culture team at HH. The system is individually monitored by a designated member of the team and includes three intentional check-ins with the student each day. Each student also receives at risk counseling sessions by a member of the Mental Health Team. These incentive plans were reviewed with the students and their family members. Since</p> |

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| | | <p>the implementation of this system, which has been followed with fidelity, four students have graduated off the plans and no longer require them as an additional behavioral support. Two students have transferred out of HHLA and the remaining students continue on the plans and have responded positively to them. The Director of Special Education checks in with each team member and student weekly to help support their individual progress.</p> |
| <p>Pg. 19 (Benchmark 2)</p> | <p>SETTS and ENL stand-alone classes were not observed, but it should be noted that SETTS and ENL are provided at the same time using the same staff, which the NYSED Office of Bilingual Education and World Languages does not consider to be effective instruction for ELLS, as ELLs and SWDs have different programmatic needs and may each require differing scaffolds and instructional strategies or content.</p> | <p>MLL groups <u>are</u> held separately from SETSS groups. SETSS groups are based on grade level and the goals outlined in their IEPs. MLLs are grouped together around minutes of service and the goals they are working toward. If students were observed grouped together this was <u>additional</u> support on top of their separate and mandated services. These additional small support groups are part of our network-wide initiative to strengthen small group support to align with our goals.</p> |
| <p>Pg. 21 (Benchmark 3 - Climate Culture and Family Engagement)</p> | <p>NYCDOE CSE 10 reports that it has recognized “some issues with regard to the school’s communication and with parents. Some parents have expressed concerns to the CSE about their interactions with the Harlem Hebrew Language Academy Charter School 2021-2022 school administration. Some parents have indicated feeling dismissed by school staff/leadership and have reported a lack of collaboration by the school.</p> | <p>When any new special education student enrolls at HHLA, The Special Education coordinator (member of the leadership team), reviews their IEP and management needs with their teachers to ensure there is a full understanding of the students needs and services. The SpEd coordinator also reaches out to the students family to introduce themselves and share contact information for themselves and their child’s teacher. Leading up to an IEP meeting, if the school is recommending any changes to a child’s IEP, the SpEd coordinator communicates those recommendations, along with data that was used to make the recommendation, to the student’s family. The family is also informed that these are just recommendations and nothing will be changed without a full team decision at the IEP meeting.</p> <p>If a student's family is interested in communicating with any related service provider, the Special Education coordinator helps to arrange a meeting as soon</p> |

| | | |
|---------------------------------|--|--|
| | | <p>as possible. For any other questions or concerns, the Special Education coordinator always makes themselves available to speak with families within 24 hours of a meeting request.</p> <p>HHLA leadership staff prides themselves on their commitment to partnership and collaboration with all of our families and we believe that together, we can support our students achieve all of their goals.</p> |
| <p>Pg. 22 (Benchmark 3)</p> | <p>In addition to the CSO 2021 Parent and Teacher Surveys, HHLA issued multiple surveys during remote learning to assess the needs of parents and students. During this time, HP offered subsidized childcare for parents and caregivers who needed coverage during quarantine and periods of remote learning. Only 16% of the parent population participated, which is a low response rate, especially given the return to in-person learning. During the 2020-2021 SY, the HHLA team hosted five virtual town hall meetings to solicit feedback from families. The self evaluation report indicates there was an overwhelmingly positive response to these sessions (although no attendance or feedback data was provided), and the school will continue to solicit feedback in numerous ways.</p> | <p>During the 2020-2021 school year, we surveyed our parents more than ever before, and believe there was a possibility of survey/communication “burnout” when it came to the CSO survey as it was administered as the school was preparing to return to in-person hybrid instruction, and a large amount of information was disseminated to facilitate the transition.</p> <p>As shared in our renewal application and during family focus groups, the school was in touch with families constantly through surveys checking on technological and social welfare needs for home learning. Our intent to return survey administered at the end of the year yielded an 88% response rate, which we believe is indicative of a strong relationship with our parent body.</p> |

| | | |
|---------------------------------|---|---|
| <p>Pg. 22 (Benchmark 3)</p> | <p>HP Chief Executive Officer (CEO) expressed reluctance to assess social/emotional learning (SEL) effectiveness based on his belief that research has not validated a credible method for assessing overall effectiveness.</p> | <p>The HP CEO's remark was based on concerns about the paucity of research-validated SEL evaluation tools and outcome measures; our school and network are fully committed to robust SEL program supports and to measures of student engagement.</p> <p>Leaders look at student engagement data such as attendance and discipline as SEL indicators. The Responsive Classroom program has a heavy emphasis on SEL, including the group dynamics aspects thereof. The School's professional team includes social workers and culture staff who are deeply steeped in supporting students' emotional development.</p> <p>Although we do not currently use a formal SEL assessment, we have plans to pilot Satchel Pulse (an online platform that we will be using as an SEL screener and for SEL intervention management). Satchel Pulse consists of both a teacher-facing Universal Screener, as well as a student-facing module. Using the CASEL aligned evidence based framework, staff will use the screening tools to identify student social emotional strengths and needs within the 5 CASEL social and emotional competencies (Self Management, Self Awareness, Social Awareness, Responsible Decision making, and Relationship Skills). When a student is flagged as needing Tier 2-3 support in one of these competencies, staff will be prompted to identify the specific sub-skill the student needs to strengthen.</p> |
| <p>Pg. 28 (Benchmark 7)</p> | <p>According to the roster and information provided by HHLA, there are eight teacher vacancies.</p> | <p>As of February 22,2022, there are only 4 teacher vacancies. (2 of the 4 positions are floaters)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 8th Grade Math ● 8th Grade ELA ● Elementary School Floater ● MS Floater |
| <p>Pg. 28 (Benchmark 7)</p> | <p>HHLA partnered with the HP talent team to enhance the school's hiring process. However, enhancements described: "strong academic preparation,</p> | <p>Understandably, the schools hiring processes were revamped for the 2021-22 hiring season in an effort to attract high quality candidates during the pandemic which has caused many teachers to leave the sector. The hiring process is rooted in six selection criteria that identify a candidate's strengths in the following areas: Belief and Urgency, Lesson Design and Focus, Rigor and Inclusiveness,</p> |

instructional/operational knowledge and expertise, professional competence, intellectual rigor, appreciation of diversity and emotional maturity,” seem rudimentary. In addition to the above, the report indicates that the candidate screening process now includes a weighting for certified teachers.

Culture of Achievement, Student Progress Towards Mastery and Commitment to Diversity, Equity and Inclusion.

Belief and Urgency

Creates a sense of urgency to drive student achievement and holds self and others personally responsible for the academic success of students.

Lesson Design and Focus

Knows the qualities of good teaching and can speak to best practices regarding unit/lesson planning, academic interventions, and inclusive practices. Holds high-level knowledge of state standards and content.

Rigor and Inclusiveness

Employs a variety of instructional strategies to respond to a variety of levels of mastery.

Culture of Achievement

Creates and maintains a classroom environment where students take ownership of their learning, a love for learning, and resilience in the face of obstacles.

Student Progress Towards Mastery

Demonstrates ability to use questions and tasks to assess student comprehension.

Utilizes effective formal and informal assessments and student achievement data to implement effective instruction.

Commitment to Diversity, Equity and Inclusion

Culturally competent and self-reflective teacher who is sensitive to the challenges students face in their daily lives.

Exhibits a relentless drive to increase educational equity for students in underserved communities

These six criteria are assessed at various times during the hiring process: phone screening, demonstration lesson, feedback cycle and the face to face interview.

| | | |
|---------------------------------|---|--|
| | | <p>The school has deepened its commitment to hiring certified teachers and supporting current staff in completing certification requirements. In order to ensure that the school is in compliance for teacher certification, we plan to continue our partnership with Teach For America and establish new partnerships with Touro College and Relay. While we will continue to look to employ certified staff, if highly talented non-certified candidates are identified, we will work with them to ensure certification is obtained promptly through an individualized certification plan.</p> |
| <p>Pg. 28 (Benchmark 8)</p> | <p>The self-evaluation report references leadership turnover as a challenge, but does not offer any discussion on a strategy to address this issue.</p> | <p>Teacher and leader retention is a top priority and our practice includes developing internal talent to increase retention across teachers and leaders. Over the past year, Emily Carson met routinely with an external leadership coach who specializes in change management and organizational culture. Emily has prioritized developing and maintaining strong relationships with her staff. For example, she met with each HH staff member individually to best support their personal and professional growth while strengthening the school's organizational culture. Emily has also created a number of internal opportunities for staff to grow into leadership positions and develop an internal leadership pipeline that supports in retaining the school's highest performing staff members. Specific examples of this are mentor teacher positions, leading school-wide professional development and supporting network-wide curricular and talent projects outside of their school-based role.</p> <p>Separately, Hebrew Public is currently implementing a strategic retention plan for teachers which will utilize tactics to decrease burn out, provide additional professional development, and offer stipends for taking on additional duties. We believe this plan will help us retain our highest performing staff members and thus strengthen our leadership pipeline in the coming years.</p> <p>Finally, while Head of School turnover has been a challenge at Harlem Hebrew in the past, current Head of School Emily Carson is in her third year in the role.</p> |

| | | |
|---------------------------------|--|--|
| <p>Pg. 29 (Benchmark 7)</p> | <p>However, this alignment and clear understanding was not evident during the focus groups with teachers and staff. When asked about the annual or quarterly performance goals and targets, no group or individual provided a clear or aligned SMARTIE goal.</p> | <p>During the site visit we explained that we intentionally had not set specific academic goals / student outcome goals yet as we were finishing the collection of diagnostic data and intended to set goals following that. In a normal school year we would hope to complete most diagnostic assessments in the first two weeks of school. Given that this was the first return to the school building with 100% of our student body since March 2020, we chose to prioritize school-wide routines, procedures, social emotional connections and community building thus delaying the full collection of academic data somewhat. We believe this delay was necessary to setting a strong foundation for the remainder of the school year. We proceeded with our diagnostic data collection in the weeks that followed and then developed the specific performance goals below.</p> <p>For NWEA MAP ELA and Math</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - In each grade the percent of students who are on grade level should grow 8 points in grades K-5 - In each grade in grades 5-8 the percent of students who are on grade level should grow by 4 points <p>F&P:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - For Kindergarten and students on grade level in grades 1-4, students should make at minimum 1 year of growth. <p>While we understand that the CSO site visit team may have felt that goals should be in place, we note that the site visit was conducted on October 13th and 14th.</p> |
| <p>Pg. 33 (Benchmark 9)</p> | <p>During the 2020-2021 SY, the HHLA team hosted five virtual town hall meetings to solicit feedback from families. The self evaluation report indicates there was an overwhelmingly positive response</p> | <p>The school surveyed parents after its June 2021 Town Hall. 88% of families responded to the survey and 18% of survey respondents identified that they would benefit from school/community based support, specifically - academic support due to learning loss, technological needs, food insecurity, child care, and medical/health related concerns, and the need for mental health/trauma support. Using this data as the foundation of our planning for the 21-22 school year,</p> |

| | | |
|--------------------------------------|--|---|
| | <p>to these sessions (although no attendance or feedback data was provided), and the school will continue to solicit feedback in numerous ways.</p> | <p>school teams began outreach and proactive planning to support our students with highest needs.</p> |
| <p>Pg. 34 (Benchmark 10)</p> | <p>HHLA has a history of implementing revisions to its charter without submitting a revision request to the NYSED CSO and/or before receiving NYSED CSO approval for such revisions.</p> | <p>From the school's opening in 2012 through school year 2017, HHLA utilized the established system of submitting revision requests and supporting documents via email. The school had official emails of approval for the majority of the charter revisions proposed prior to 2018. (These approved revisions included changes to the school day length, school assessments and enrollment policy) In the fall of 2021, Karonne Jarrett Watson notified the school that the revision to the school's calendar submitted in 2016 did not obtain official approval 5 years ago. Since the school did not receive a proper follow-up response from NYSED, it understandably believed that the proposed revision had been approved. Once notified, the school adjusted its calendar to include 185 school days for the 2021-2022 and plans to return to 190 school days for the 2022-2023 school year to be in full compliance.</p> <p>Once NYSED implemented the portal, the school follows the revision guidelines when submitting required documentation. We do however, fully acknowledge that we may have implemented our KDEs and organizational chart prior to NYSED CSO approval. Originally and prior to the pandemic, our goal was to pilot these two changes, solicit feedback, and then should the feedback be positive, make a formal revision request. However, due to the challenges with remote learning, community building, and staff accountability needed during the pandemic, we felt it was in the school's best interest to pivot quickly and implement these changes.</p> <p>We believe that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Implementing our KDE's during the pandemic helped to clearly define our shared values for new and returning families and gave us a basis for community building. |

| | | |
|--------------------------|--|--|
| | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Implementing our revised org chart allowed for greater teacher accountability and management in the midst of a remote workforce. |
| Pg. 34 (Benchmark 10) | This section omits SpEd legal compliance. | All of our student IEP meetings are held within a year of their last IEP meeting. All teacher reports for these meetings are submitted to the CSE two weeks prior the meeting, and all student services are provided as per their IEP. If a related support agency is unable to provide a student with a provider, the Committee for Special Education (CSE) will issue a Related Services Authorization (RSA) to the student's family so that they can seek a therapist to provide services to their student. Our SpEd Coordinator supports families in this process if they want to move forward with an out-of-school provider. |
| Pg. 34 (Benchmark 9) | Little was provided regarding a systematic process for evaluating recruitment and outreach strategies. | <p>All student applications include a “How did you hear about us?” question. Responses are aggregated and analyzed by the Network External team to influence the following year’s recruitment efforts. The application with this question is visible here.</p> <p>The External team also assesses efficacy of our outreach by collecting data from social media ad analytics, word of mouth referrals from community based organizations and comparing open house attendance with actualized applications.</p> |